

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, January 19, 2022

WARD(S): 5

**TITLE: DEMOLITION OF EXISTING STRUCTURE AND PROPOSED
NEW CONSTRUCTION AT 10 MILL STREET, THORNHILL
HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding the proposed demolition of an existing building and new construction located at 10 Mill Street, a property located in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachment 1.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing the demolition of the existing structure and proposed new construction at 10 Mill Street.
- The existing main dwelling is not identified as a contributing property in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan (“THCD Plan”).
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the THCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the THCD Plan.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the demolition of the existing structure and proposed new construction at 10 Mill Street under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division for review and heritage permit release prior to submission for a Building Permit

Background

The subject property is municipally known as 10 Mill Street and is designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, as part of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District (THCD).

The existing structure is located on the north side of Mill Street west where it meets Old Yonge Street (see Attachment 1). It is an unusual house built circa 1970 and appears as a small, one storey building featuring a cedar shingled neo-Mansard roof with only one side window on the left of the front door. The rest of the modern house consists of 6 split-level floors built into the hill slope. There is also a small shed at street level.

The building is currently vacant.

The lot itself is unusual for the area of Thornhill but all 3 north side properties along Mill Street share a similar topography. The subject property has a trapezoid shape with a lot frontage of 65.61m, 39.62m deep on the west lot line, 59.39m rear lot line, and a 40.62m east lot line at an angle of about 81° to the front. The western side setback of the house is 9.91m, and the front yard setback is 5.45m. The lot slopes downward to the north and east, with a small wedge east of the house providing a parking pad near the street. The elevation of the land at the front of the house is about 0.5m below street level, the back of the house is about 3.5 m below street level and the rear lot line is about 8.5m below street level (see Attachment 2).

Part of the original foundation is to be retained, onto which the applicant proposes to build another structure partially built into the hillside.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

The project proposes a 3 ½ storey house, 2 ½ storeys of which will be visible from the street, with a height of 9.5m. It is to be built in the Georgian style, with an attached two door garage (see Attachment 3).

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the THCD Plan.

9.1.1 Heritage Styles Residential Buildings

- *Vernacular “Loyalist” Cottage 1800-1850*
- *Neo-Classical 1800-1830*
- *Ontario Gothic Vernacular 1830-1890*
- *Victorian Vernacular*
- *Queen Anne Revival 1885-1900*
- *Vernacular Homestead 1890-1930*
- *Four-square 1900-1920*
- *Edwardian Classic 1900-1920*

10 Mill Street is in the 2007 THCD Inventory but is not identified as a contributing heritage property of the THCD. The applicant has submitted a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment as shown in Attachment 4 and attachment 10 in support of the application that outlines the property’s history, likely date of construction, photos of the existing interior, plan and elevation drawings that provide documentation of the existing structure.

9.5.2.2 Architectural Styles

New buildings in the residential areas should reflect the historic built form of their historic neighbours.

Guidelines:

- *Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles.*
- *Hybrid designs that mix elements from different historical styles are not appropriate. Historical styles that are not indigenous to the area, such as Tudor or French Manor, are not appropriate.*
- *Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style.*
- *Research the chosen Architectural Style.*
- *Use appropriate materials.*

The design of the new building reflects a local Georgian heritage style which has long been a popular choice in the THCD area. The height of the proposed structure is confirmed to meet the 9.5m height limit.

9.5.2.3 Scale and Massing

New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots. Note: It is recommended in Section 7.3 that the zoning by-law be amended to recognize the smaller scale of historic village development as contrasted with modern suburban development.

Guidelines:

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the scale and pattern of the historic District.*
- *New houses should be no higher than the highest building on the same block, and no lower than the lowest building on the same block.*
- *As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1½-storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.*
- *Follow the policies in Section 4.2 of the THCD Plan concerning height and depth of buildings and garages.*

The height of the proposed new construction is in scale with the existing heritage resources across the street at 46 Old Yonge Street and 15 Mill Street. The proposed building is wider than typical due to the unique configuration of the lot shape and length. Site topography prevents placement of the garage to the rear of the property and attaching it to the existing construction is the only available solution. It is noted that the attached garage wing is lower than the house which creates a varied massing of the proposed new house and diminishes the effect of the building's height on the streetscape.

9.8.1 Heritage Buildings: Appropriate Materials

Exterior Finish: Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent. Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather. Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.

Exterior Detail: Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.

Roofs: Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style. Skylights in the form of cupolas or monitors are acceptable, if appropriate to the style.

Doors: Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed. Transom windows and paired sidelights. Wood french doors for porch entrances. Single-bay wood panelled garage doors.

Windows: Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.

The proposed materials for the new construction are detailed in the combined Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) and HCD Conformance report that the applicant has also submitted. The proposed materials and finishes are shown in Attachment 5.

The Landscape Plan, as shown on Attachment 8, incorporates aspects of the THCD Plan guidelines 9.5.2 and 9.7 to provide a sympathetic landscape treatment, particularly along the streetscape of Mill Street. This will mitigate the loss of the existing trees and natural shrubbery landscape that currently exists.

The combined effect of the Landscape Plan and the architectural design is shown in the rendered streetscape perspectives of Attachment 9.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed demolition and new construction conforms to the policies and guidelines within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed the works at 10 Mill Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 10Mill_Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 10Mill_Current Survey Plan
- Attachment 3 – 10Mill_Proposed Elevations
- Attachment 4 – 10Mill_Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
- Attachment 5 – 10Mill_Proposed Site Plan
- Attachment 6 – 10Mill_Materials
- Attachment 7 – 10Mill_Arborist Report
- Attachment 8 – 10Mill_Landscape Plan
- Attachment 9 – 10Mill_Rendered Perspectives
- Attachment 10 – 10Mill_CHIA with existing building

Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653

Nancy Tuckett, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8529