

Committee of the Whole (1) Report

DATE: Tuesday, October 5, 2021

WARD(S): ALL

TITLE: CITY OF VAUGHAN TRANSPORTATION DEMAND
MANAGEMENT (TDM) GUIDELINE

FROM:

Haiping Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: FOR INFORMATION

Purpose

To provide an overview of the Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Guideline and inform Council of the proposed improvements to the development review process with respect to TDM, and emerging policy recommendations.

Report Highlights

- The existing process of reviewing and requiring TDM through development applications lacks clarity and consistency for both developers and staff, and the City rarely monitors or tracks the implementation of TDM measures.
- A comprehensive review of background policies, best-practices, and precedents of numerous municipalities was undertaken to understand an approach to TDM that is tailored to the City of Vaughan.
- The TDM Guideline includes a Toolkit and Guideline document that will significantly improve the quality and consistency of TDM measures provided through development as well as a process for staff to track the implementation of TDM measures and monitor success over time for those developments that meet certain thresholds.
- The TDM Guideline process strives to minimize impacts to departmental workload while also respecting the interests of the development community.

Recommendation

1. That the City of Vaughan Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Guideline (2021) and Tool Kit, [Attachments 1 and 2] be received.

Background

The City of Vaughan Transportation Master Plan – A New Path (2012) recommended that the City develop a TDM Guideline recognizing the increasing importance of encouraging sustainable transportation options and managing transportation demand, namely single-occupancy vehicle demand, throughout the City, and particularly within the City's intensification areas. As the City has continued to grow and intensify since the completion of the 2012 Transportation Master Plan, the need for a TDM Guideline has also grown. The TDM Guideline is needed to support staff and better inform the development community that TDM must be critically considered to manage transportation demand as greatly as possible.

The TDM Guideline is one component of the land use and transportation planning framework.

The TDM Guideline will apply to the development applications review process and build on the City's current process of requiring the provision of TDM measures. This may include a range of "hard" and "soft" measures such as bicycle parking, pedestrian facilities, carpool and carshare parking, subsidized transit passes, charged parking, and so on. This may also include improvements to the City's transportation network where appropriate and related to a subject development. The intent of the TDM Guideline is to work directly with the development community to provide these incentives and disincentives at the origin and destination points of any given trip. The City is currently engaged in numerous other transportation planning initiatives that will improve the availability of active transportation and transit within the City's and Region's networks which will connect these origin and destination points.

Previous Reports/Authority

[City of Vaughan Transportation Master Plan – A New Path \(2012\)](#)

Analysis and Options

A review of the existing process of requiring TDM through the development process revealed a lack of consistency and clarity.

Currently the City requires that all development applications proposing 50 or more units or 2,000m² of GFA of office must include a TDM Plan in their submission which details a range of "hard" and "soft" measures that will be provided to residents and/or tenants. The City has encountered numerous applications which do not include a TDM Plan despite these thresholds being satisfied, resulting in multiple submissions and discussion between staff, the applicant, and the transportation consultant. In some instances, the concept or site plan would be in an advanced state and then must be

revised to accommodate these measures which could result in impacts to other aspects of the plan.

In addition to the triggers for providing a TDM Plan, there are also notable inconsistencies in the quality of TDM Plans that the City does receive through the development applications process. While some TDM Plans are of exceptional quality and address all concerns of staff, the majority of TDM Plans are unsatisfactory and require significant revision. In many cases, the TDM Plans are generic and not appropriately tailored to the specific site. Staff in these instances must discuss with the applicant and respective transportation consultant and are often found negotiating for TDM measures that should be incorporated without contest. The inconsistency in quality also requires a significant amount of staff time in reviewing and commenting on multiple rounds of submissions before an acceptable TDM Plan is provided.

The inconsistency in quality of TDM Plans, however, can be partially attributed to the lack of existing guidance or reference provided to applicants and their consultants in completing TDM Plans for development in Vaughan. Staff have detailed preferences and specifications for certain TDM measures which may not be known prior to a submission. Further, applicants must also navigate both the City's and York Region's TDM requirements and process, and there is sometimes confusion created as to which measures are required or coordinated by which municipality.

The policy framework strongly supports incorporating TDM into development, but there are some gaps at the City level.

The current policy framework at all levels provides strong support for TDM and the incorporation of TDM within development. This includes policies and guidance at the Provincial level through the Provincial Policy Statement (2020) and A Place to Grow for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2019), as well as policies and guidance at the York Region level through the York Region Official Plan (2010), Transportation Master Plan (2016 Update), and the York Region Mobility Plan Guidelines.

TDM is also strongly supported by the City through the Vaughan Official Plan and Transportation Master Plan, but there are some gaps in the existing policies with respect to TDM requirements and triggers. In particular, the Official Plan indicates that TDM Plans will be required for developments with 50 multi-family units or greater, and/or 2,000m² of GFA of office. These triggers exclude numerous other forms of development including retail, employment, hotels, and so on. Furthermore, less intensive TDM Plans could prove beneficial for developments below these thresholds depending on the context and specifics of the development.

A comprehensive review of the practices of other municipalities throughout North America reveals a more context sensitive approach to TDM for Vaughan.

A review of best practices revealed that the City's current process for requiring and reviewing TDM measures through development applications is being replaced with the use of checklists and/or scorecards. Currently, the City requires that applicants and their consultants provide a list of the TDM measures they propose to provide through their application. Staff then review and comment on the measures they would like to see added and/or removed. In many instances there are multiple rounds of submission negotiating on TDM measures. The checklist or scorecard approach establishes the expectations upfront to applicants, provides some flexibility in selecting the measures which work best for the applicant, and also provides staff a point of reference in understanding which TDM measures are most appropriate depending on type of development, density, location, and etc. The checklists and/or scorecards can be tailored to specific character areas or development typologies where the list of required TDM measures would adapt based on these characteristics. Applicants would then be required to satisfy a minimum score determined by the checklist or scorecard, reducing the amount of negotiation, and ensuring that the appropriate TDM measures are provided for a respective application.

The review of best practices also reveals that there are approaches to monitoring and implementation that could work within the Ontario land use planning framework. Namely that TDM "hard" or physical measures continue to be required as conditions of approval, and that both the "hard" and "soft" or programmatic measures be subject to letter of credit. The use of the letter of credit would apply to developments that meet certain thresholds such as the number of units or amount of commercial GFA and would allow the City to require monitoring surveys and track the implementation and success of TDM. This is currently a critical missing piece to the City's approach to TDM.

Requirements for TDM can be tailored to better reflect the varying landscape of the City and the range of development typologies that the City welcomes.

Understanding that the City presents a varying landscape of urban form ranging from rural and suburban development to high-density transit-oriented development, a one-size fits all approach is not considered optimal for requiring TDM. Understanding this difference, the TDM Guideline will introduce two levels of TDM requirements. Level 1 TDM Plans will be required to satisfy all requirements from the Comprehensive Zoning By-Law (2021) as well as the York Region requirements, as applicable. Level 2 TDM Plans in addition to the Level 1 requirements will be required to provide a more enhanced suite of TDM measures that better reflects the needs of urbanizing and urban areas in the City. This approach also ensures that the TDM requirements are

coordinated with York Region and provides flexibility should the York Region requirements change in the future.

The TDM Guideline proposes to implement triggers for all development typologies that adjust depending on development type, location, and traffic impact. The TDM Guideline includes a series of character areas which are aligned with the four parking character areas established in the City's Comprehensive Zoning By-Law (2021). This will create consistency and coordination with the Comprehensive Zoning By-Law, as well as predictability in expectations from applicants and their transportation consultants. More onerous Level 2 TDM requirements would apply to those areas that are mixed-use in nature, or are intensification areas, while the Level 1 requirements would apply to those areas that are low-density and are not immersed within multi-modal transportation networks.

A TDM Toolkit is recommended to establish clear and consistent TDM requirements for the significant majority of development applications.

The TDM Toolkit (Attachment 1) has been crafted as to require the appropriate TDM measures across the character areas of the City for the majority of development applications, recognizing that some sites will require unique and specially tailored approaches. The TDM Guideline will allow staff to determine at the pre-application stage if the TDM Toolkit should be followed or if the applicant should instead work directly with staff if there are special considerations.

Regardless, the TDM Toolkit is not intended to be implemented dogmatically, recognizing that there needs to be the opportunity for flexibility and discussion between the City and applicants. The TDM Toolkit is intended to establish the expectations of staff and provide guidance to applicants in proposing and implementing their suite of TDM measures. The TDM Guideline and Toolkit will be immersed in the City's policy framework and work together with the Comprehensive Zoning By-Law and forthcoming Official Plan update.

The TDM Toolkit will determine the level of TDM Plan required for a respective development based on the relevant triggers and context of the site. If a Level 1 or basic TDM Plan is required, the Toolkit will take the form of a simple checklist asking applicants to verify that they have satisfied the relevant Zoning By-Law and York Region requirements. If a Level 2 or enhanced TDM Plan is required, the Toolkit will generate a minimum required score based on the characteristics of the development that the applicant will be required to satisfy. Doing so will require applicants to satisfy the basic checklist and select from a suite of pre-selected TDM measures which are individually scored and will accumulate to a final total score.

The approach taken with the TDM Toolkit will ensure that the appropriate TDM measures are being required of the appropriate developments while reducing the amount of negotiation and multiple rounds of submission. The TDM Toolkit establishes clear requirements at the outset and will be supported by the TDM Guideline document (Attachment 2) which will function as a reference document walking applicants and consultants through the process. The TDM Guideline document will also include reference sheets for every TDM measure including guidance on how the measure should be shown or demonstrated at the planning stage, design or programming requirements, staff requirements, and how the measure should be implemented and monitored.

An implementation process is needed to ensure that TDM measures are being provided and are effective.

Currently the City does not monitor the implementation of TDM measures, nor monitors their effectiveness over time. The TDM Guideline recommends an implementation and monitoring strategy which involves the use of letters of credit for sites that meet certain criteria (number of residential units and/or non-residential GFA). In these circumstances, a letter of credit will be held in the amount of the delivery of the TDM measures in addition to conducting two monitoring surveys. Staff will require a basic report which includes evidence that the TDM measures have and continue to be provided on-site (can be in the form of photographs) as well as the completion of a travel survey using a template that will be provided by staff to the owners. Staff will require that these follow-up reports be provided at full occupancy, and one to two years following full occupancy. The letter of credit will be released once satisfied.

The proposed monitoring and implement strategy follows the best-practices of other municipalities in the Greater Toronto Area. The City has also employed this strategy for a handful of sites in the past and staff are generally familiar with the approach. Efforts have been made to simplify the monitoring process as to not excessively burden owners or other internal City departments. The monitoring of TDM will largely be the responsibility of the Development Engineering Department and the City of Vaughan TDM Coordinator. The outlined approach works to provide staff an indication that TDM measures are being provided, as well as a resource to monitor if TDM measures are effective over time. Such data will allow staff to adjust TDM requirements and better arrange for TDM during the development approvals process. The outlined approach also addresses some limitations of the Ontario planning framework which presents limited opportunity to monitor and track TDM measures post-development.

TDM practices and the recommendations of the TDM Guideline are supported by stakeholders and the development community.

Stakeholder consultation consisted of two meetings with internal City departments and relevant external agencies including York Region, York Region Transit, Toronto Transit Commission, and pointA (SmartCommute). Stakeholders all indicated support for the proposed TDM Guideline and approach. Staff will continue to work with York Region to ensure coordination with York Region TDM requirements through the development application process. The TDM Toolkit has been crafted to consider York Region requirements.

In addition to the relevant internal departments and external agencies, staff also held numerous meetings and interviews with prominent developers in the City. Developers that were interviewed targeted a mix of input from varying perspectives including both high- and low-rise development, and residential and commercial development. Interviews and meetings with developers aimed to understand opinions on TDM and how TDM can be better practiced in Vaughan while balancing the concerns and wishes of the development community. Developers indicated general support for TDM in Vaughan and for the City's proposed approach. Understandably, developers expressed that incentives should be provided in return for providing enhanced TDM measures through development, namely reducing parking requirements.

Resultantly, staff have incorporated calculations into the TDM Toolkit which determine a reasonable potential parking reduction in exchange for the provision of TDM measures. These calculated reductions are to provide a reference to both staff and developers as to the amount of parking they could expect to reduce in their applications through providing TDM measures. Staff will work with the developers to determine the appropriateness of such a parking reduction and the details of the proposed TDM measures to support the parking reduction. The parking reductions have been carefully considered based on the updated minimum parking rates of the Comprehensive Zoning By-Law and recent trends in development applications across the City. It is important to note that the parking reductions determined through the TDM Toolkit are for reference and meant to assist with determining an appropriate reduction. The justification of the parking reduction still lies with the applicant and it will remain at the discretion of staff to support the parking reduction or to request additional TDM or justification.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications as part of this report. The implementation of the TDM Guideline and the review of development applications from the perspective of TDM will continue to be the responsibility of the City's TDM Coordinator.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

City staff have worked with York Region, York Region Transit (YRT), the Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) and pointA (SmartCommute) in developing the TDM Guideline. The City will be responsible for overseeing the application and implementation of the TDM Guideline with respect to the “hard” and “soft” TDM measures that will be the responsibility of the City. There are no notable changes proposed to the existing practices of York Region with respect to the review of TDM measures on City of Vaughan development applications. York Region will continue to be responsible for overseeing the delivery of TDM measures that are covered by the York Region TDM related Development Charges. The City will continue to assist York Region with the coordination of other TDM measures that may be of mutual interest. There are no impacts anticipated at a Regional level and the various external stakeholders have indicated their support for the TDM Guideline.

Conclusion

The City of Vaughan TDM Guideline will be an important tool to assist developers and staff in requiring, reviewing and implementing TDM measures through development applications. The ultimate goal of the TDM Guideline is to improve the opportunities provided to residents and employees in the City to travel by modes of transportation that are alternate to driving alone. The TDM Guideline will work to establish clear and consistent requirements for developments that are appropriate to the individual context of each development application. Resultantly, development applications will be expected to provide suitable TDM initiatives that will encourage a reduction in single-occupancy vehicle usage as greatly as possible. The TDM Guideline has been coordinated with internal City departments and external agencies, as well as key members of the development community. Development Transportation Engineering staff will work to implement the TDM Guideline and begin including its requirements as part of the development review process, similar to other technical guidelines.

For more information, please contact: Frank Suppa, Director, Development Engineering, x8255.

Attachments

1. TDM Toolkit.
2. TDM Guideline.

Prepared by

Paul Grove, Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Coordinator, Development Transportation Engineering, x8857.

Samar Saadi Nejad, Manager, Development Transportation Engineering, x8253.

Approved by

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Haiqing'.

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager,
Planning & Growth Management

Reviewed by

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Nick Spensieri'.

Nick Spensieri, City Manager