

CITY OF VAUGHAN
REPORT NO. 6 OF THE
HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

***For consideration by the Committee of the Whole
of the City of Vaughan
on December 5, 2018***

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:00 p.m., on October 17, 2018.

Present: Christine Radewych, Vice-Chair
Tony Marziliano, Chair
Robert Brown
Sandra Colica
Nick Pacione
Giacomo Parisi
Pankaj Sandhu
Antonella Strangis
Claudio Travierso
Henry Xu
Staff present: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
Rose Magnifico, Acting Deputy City Clerk

The following items were dealt with:

**1 DEMOLITION OF TWO DETACHED BUILDINGS AND NEW
DEVELOPMENT 9560 AND 9570 KEELE STREET
MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated October 17, 2018, be approved.

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 2) That the following deputations were received:
 1. Mr. Ryan Guetter, Weston Consulting, representing the applicant; and

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

2. Mr. David Eckler, Area, Architects Rasch Eckler Associates Ltd., representing the applicant.

(Note: Due to the Election, this application was dealt with under the delegation by-law)

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding a Heritage Permit application to demolish of the two detached houses municipally known as 9560 and 9570 Keele Street and the proposed new construction of 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units on a common element road on the properties as shown in Attachment #1, located within the Maple Heritage Conservation District ("Maple HCD").

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing to demolish the existing detached dwellings at 9560 and 9570 Keele Street and construct 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units on a common element road.
- Heritage Vaughan Committee review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- That, as per the minutes of the August 15, 2018 Heritage Vaughan Committee minutes, "consideration of this matter was deferred to the September 12, 2018, Heritage Vaughan meeting."

Recommendations

1. THAT the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend to Council the approval of the Heritage Permit application to demolish of the detached dwellings at 9560 and 9570 Keele Street.
2. THAT the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend approval to Council for the proposed new construction of 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units on a common element road under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to following conditions:
 - a) The related Development Applications under the *Planning Act* must receive final approval prior to the issuance of the Heritage Permit. It is understood that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council regarding the issuance of a Heritage Permit do not constitute support for any Development Application under the *Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

- b) Any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- c) That an Arborist Report and Tree Preservation Plan be finalized to the satisfaction of the City; and
- d) That a final materials list be submitted to the City and finalized to the satisfaction of City Urban Design and Cultural Heritage staff.

Background

Location and Heritage Status

The two properties, known municipally as 9560 and 9570 Keele Street, form the lands subject to this application (hereinafter referred to as the "Subject Lands"). The Subject Lands are located on west side of Keele Street, south of Knightswood Avenue, as shown on Attachment #1. The Subject Lands are located within the Residential Village Area of the Maple HCD, and are protected under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* ("OHA"). The Subject Lands are designated "Low-Rise Residential" by Vaughan Official Plan 2010 ("VOP 2010") and are located within a "Community Area" as identified in Schedule 1, the "Urban Structure" of VOP 2010.

This application was first presented to the Heritage Vaughan Committee at the August 15, 2018 meeting for their review. Following the staff report and presentations, the Committee discussed the proposal with the applicant and City staff. However, the Heritage Vaughan Committee expressed their need for more review time and requested that the applicant submit colour renderings in support of their application. The applicant has subsequently supplied Cultural Heritage staff with the renderings as shown in Attachment #11. There is no other new information to consider and there are no alterations in design or materials.

The September Heritage Vaughan meeting was cancelled due to lack of quorum and this application has been brought forward to the October meeting to be reviewed by the Heritage Vaughan Committee prior to the 90 day deadline of November 13, 2018.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

The Proposal requires the demolition of the two existing dwellings

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

The Subject Lands contain two dwellings that are described in the Maple HCD Inventory as shown on Attachment #3. The structure on 9560 Keele Street was built circa 1947 and the Maple HCD Inventory identifies its sympathetic construction and materials and notes that the *“building provides fitting and dignified presence at south end of village.”* The building at 9570 Keele Street is also known to have been built prior to 1954 and is identified as being a “good fit” for Maple, but not identified as strongly sympathetic as the building at 9560 Keele Street. Both entries identify several mature trees as part of the Maple streetscape. However, the structures are not identified as “Heritage Buildings” within 9.3.1 of the Maple HCD Plan. A review of the Subject Lands is included as part of the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (“CHIA”) submitted in support of the application, included as Attachment #5.

The Proposal is for 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units on the Subject Lands

The proposed new construction consists of 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units in 6 blocks for a total of 17 units as shown in Attachment #6. The proposed townhouse units are 3-storeys, measuring in height from 8.83 m (Block 1) to 9.34 m (Block 5). Blocks 2 – 4 facing Keele Street measure 9.06m to 9.25m from the established grade at Keele Street.

The applicant has filed an Official Plan Amendment (File OP.15.008), Zoning By-Law Amendment (File Z.15.034), a subdivision application (File 19T-15V014) and Site Development Application (DA.16.116) with the Development Planning Department. The applicant has appealed the Official Plan Amendment, Zoning By-Law Amendment and the Draft Plan Subdivision applications to the Local Planning Appeal Tribunal (LPAT formerly known as the OMB) for non-decision and the appeal is scheduled for a hearing on February 11, 2019.

The Site Development application has not been appealed and remains open. As the Site Development will require the approval of a Heritage Permit under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, this application is to be considered under the Act and the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.

The Proposal is subject to the applicable policies of the Maple HCD Plan

The Subject Lands are located within the Residential Village Area of the Maple HCD, and therefore the following applicable policies have been reviewed in consideration of the proposed development:

Section 4.3.3 – Non-Heritage Buildings – Demolitions

Generally, the demolition of a Non-Heritage building is not supported, if the building is supportive of the overall heritage character of the District.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

Section 4.4.1 Design Approach – New Residential Buildings

- a) *The design of new buildings will be products of their own time, but should reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District.*

The proposed style of the townhouse and semi-detached units is inspired by the Victorian Vernacular style traditionally found in the District. This style has been adapted to be simpler and more restrained to be distinguishable as a product of its own time. The front facing Blocks 2-4 onto Keele Street and the semi-detached Block 5 which faces sideways along Keele Street provide more architectural detail for visual interest and to break up the visual elements of the semi-detached units.

- b) *New residential buildings will complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by: being generally the same height, width, and orientation of adjacent buildings; being of similar setback; being of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes.*

The proposed townhouse units are 3 storeys with a maximum height of 9.34 m which is consistent with the adjacent two-storey dwelling located at 9580 Keele Street. Semi-detached units are proposed along Keele Street (Blocks 2-4,5) with a smaller frontage than the remaining internal blocks (Block 1 and 6). The Keele Street blocks (2 – 4) are oriented towards Keele Street which is consistent with the immediate physical built context.

Block 5 is oriented internal to the Subject Lands, but the side elevation is designed to have the metal roof portion carried over to this facade to create a porch along the Keele Street streetscape. The remaining blocks (Blocks 1 and 6) are oriented towards the internal road, however they are set behind the Keele Street fronting blocks so their orientation is screened from the Keele Street streetscape.

The setback of the units facing Keele Street is greater than the setback of the garage of the dwelling located at 9580 Keele Street, but this setback can be supported as it meets the policy of Section 9.5.2.1 (see below further discussion on setbacks).

The proposed brick materials, asphalt gable and the window and door proportions are consistent with the materials and detailing found on contributing buildings within the Maple HCD.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

- c) *New residential building construction will respect natural landforms, drainage, and existing mature vegetation.*

The proposal will necessitate the removal of two hedges and 24 trees and the replanting a total of 12 new trees. Please see further discussion on plantings in the Cultural Heritage Landscapes section below.

- d) *Larger new residential buildings will have varied massing, to reflect the varied scale of built environment of the historical village.*

The applicant has proposed 3 semi-detached units along Keele Street, to provide an appropriate built form along the public street.

- e) *Historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings has been 1 - 1/2 or 2 storeys. The façade height of new residential buildings should be consistent with the façade height of existing buildings. Differences in façade heights between buildings on adjacent properties within the district should be no more than 1-storey. In all instances the height of new buildings shall conform to the provisions of the City's Zoning By-law.*

The proposed townhouse units are 3-storeys in height, measuring from 8.83 m (Block 1) to 9.34 m (Block 5) in height. Blocks 2 – 4 facing Keele Street measure 9.06 m to 9.25m from the established grade at Keele Street, according to the HIA and submitted elevations. The proposed height of the development is compatible when compared from the street with the adjacent 2-storey dwelling located at 9580 Keele Street due to differences in the grading along Keele Street (as shown in Attachment #8). The proposed semi-detached units conform to the above policy.

Section 9.5.2.1 Residential Village – Site Planning

- *Site new houses to provide setbacks and frontages that are consistent with the variety of the village pattern.*

The proposed setback of the semi-detached units including the road widening from Keele Street, is greater than garage of the adjacent residential property 9580 Keele Street and the recent development of 9529 Keele Street (as shown in Attachment #5 - Figures 36 and 37 page 55).

Section 9.5.2.2 Residential Area – Architectural Style

- *Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles. See Section 9.1.*

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

The proposed style of the townhouse and semi-detached dwelling units is inspired by the Victorian Vernacular style depicted in Section 9.1. This style has been adapted to be simpler and more restrained to be distinguishable as a product of its own time.

- *Use appropriate materials. See Section 9.8.*
The proposal includes two separate material schemes for the alternating blocks. The first material package includes 'Old School' Brampton Brick for the main facades and a 'Aurora' Brampton Brick accent. The second package includes 'Crimson' Brampton Brick for the main facades and a 'Canyon' Brampton Brick accent. The window and door materials for all units will be wood or vinyl pending further discussion of the materials list as shown on Attachment #9.

Section 9.5.2.3 Residential Area – Scale and Massing

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the scale and pattern of the historic District.*
The semi-detached units facing Keele Street (Blocks 2 – 5) provide a building scale and pattern consistent with the historic District pattern. The proposed development also provides a transition “between the large estate homes north of the Subject Lands on the west side of Keele Street and the multi-residential apartments on the east side of Keele Street” (HIA).
- *New houses should be no higher than the highest building on the same block, and no lower than the lowest building on the same block.*
As previously stated, the proposed 3-storey (maximum 9.34 m) height is consistent with the adjacent 2-storey dwelling located at 9580 Keele Street, as shown in Attachment #8.
- *As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1½-storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.*
As previously mentioned, the Keele Street facing blocks (Blocks 2 – 5) have been designed as semi-detached dwellings and provide a building scale and pattern consistent with the historic District pattern. Blocks 1 and 6 have larger frontages but both blocks are partially screened behind the Keele Street fronting blocks and therefore do not create a large building frontage along Keele Street, as shown in Attachment #8.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

Cultural Heritage Landscape

The 2005 Maple HCD Inventory entry for 9560 and 9570 Keele Street identifies that the trees on this property are significant contributing elements to the Maple streetscape.

The proposal will preserve 9 of the existing trees on the Subject Lands including the Eastern Black Walnut trees on the south-east corner and the Norway Maple at the front of the property. The proposal will require the removal of two hedges and 24 individual trees.

In the context of the existing streetscape, the proposal will feature significantly more built form than currently exists. To mitigate the loss of the existing deciduous trees, the applicant is proposing new trees to be planted along Keele Street and interior to the site. These plantings include Green Mountain Sugar Maple, Autumn Blaze Maple, Common Hackberry, Skycole Honey Locust Ivory Silk Tree Lilac, Glenleven Linden and Accolade Elm, as shown on Attachment #10.

Archaeology

The properties have been identified as possibly having archaeological potential, the following standard clauses shall be applied to the Site Plan:

- i) *Should archaeological resources be found on the property during construction activities, all work must cease and both the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, and the City of Vaughan's Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division in the Development Planning Department shall be notified immediately.*
- ii) *In the event that human remains are encountered during construction activities, the proponent must immediately cease all construction activities. The proponent shall contact the York Regional Police Department, the Regional Coroner and the Registrar of the Cemeteries Regulation Unit of the Ministry of Consumer and Business Services.*

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the OHA. This application was declared complete on August 15th, 2018, and must be deliberated upon by Council by November 13, 2018, to meet the 90-day timeline. If this application is not considered by Council by the 90 day deadline, it is considered to be approved as outlined under the OHA.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage staff have reviewed the Heritage Permit application to demolish the two existing structures and the proposed new construction for the lands known municipally as at 9560 and 9570 Keele Street. The proposed new construction is generally consistent with the Maple HCD Plan. Staff recommends that the Heritage Vaughan Committee approve the Recommendations in this report, including a Recommendation that Council approve a Heritage Permit for the proposed demolition and new construction.

For more information, please contact: Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Site Photos
3. Maple Heritage Conservation District Inventory (Excerpt)
4. 1954 Aerial Photo
5. Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment
6. Site Plan
7. Elevation Drawings
8. Colour Elevation Drawing
9. Materials List
10. Landscape Plan
11. Colour Renderings

Prepared by

Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8653

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

/CM

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**2 NEW CONSTRUCTION – SINGLE DETACHED DWELLING
75 VALLEY ROAD, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE
 CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated October 17, 2018, was approved.

Purpose

To seek approval from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding the proposed construction of a second-storey addition to the existing one-storey detached dwelling located at 75 Valley Road, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing a new second-storey addition to the existing dwelling.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan').
- Heritage Vaughan approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff are recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the KNHCD Plan.

Recommendations

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan approve the Heritage Permit application for the proposed addition to the existing dwelling at 75 Valley Road under Section 42 of Ontario Heritage Act, subject to the following conditions:
 - a. Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - b. The applicant obtain final approval of the Site Development File DA.18.032 under the Planning Act;

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

- c. That Heritage Vaughan Committee's recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the Ontario Planning Act or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application; and
- d. That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

Background

The subject property is municipally known as 75 Valley Road and is located on the east side of Valley Road, north of Stegman's Mill Road (attachment #1).

The property previously contained a one-storey dwelling originally designed in the Usonian style. This property is part of a small mid-20th century subdivision of homes known as the Windrush Co-operative. The building was built circa 1949 as a one storey home with an attached two car garage. The original owner was Allan D. Hogg, an engineer with Ontario Hydro and one of the founding directors of the Windrush Co-operative. There are no original construction drawings available and only two photographs that give an idea of the original building design.

The Usonian style was designed with open interior spaces, large windows, flat roofs, and a desire to bring the natural environment into the home. As described in the submitted Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA), in late 1984, prior to the creation of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District, the house was significantly modified with the addition of a peaked roof and skylights. This transformed the house into a style reminiscent of a typical suburban bungalow. Later the two internal garages were converted to living space and small windows installed in place of the garage doors.

The owner proceeded with the construction of a second-storey addition in the original Usonian style of the house without the benefit of Cultural Heritage review or approval, or City of Vaughan and Toronto Region Conservation Authority permits. The owner intended to reverse the earlier unsympathetic alterations and return the house to the original Usonian style, including the addition of the flat roof and the relocation of the garage to the original location. A Stop Work Order was issued by the City of Vaughan on November 10, 2016.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

The Owner is proposing a second storey addition and alterations to the existing dwelling on the subject property

The Owner has submitted a Site Development Application to facilitate a second storey addition to an existing single-detached dwelling. The proposed work includes the following:

- Removing of the mid-1980's pitched roof and the remnants original flat roof structure; replacement with a new flat roof with generous overhangs and deep fascia to restore the original design
- Re-framing of the original exterior walls up to 9' from their original 8'
- Re-framing of the interior walls up to 9', from their original 8'
- Removing some interior walls to modernize the interior layout with open concept floor plan
- Creating a new second floor
- Re-using the original stone floor finish on the main floor
- Removing the original circa 1949 stone fireplace and building a new fireplace in its location
- Re-introducing the garage in its original location

The applicant has noted that the proposed materials have been selected to respect the original building, in particular:

- Original stone will remain, and new stone has been sourced to match the original stone
- New stone will be laid beside and above the original stone to create a seamless transition between the two materials
- New siding will be Western Red Cedar installed horizontally as per the original building
- New larger windows have been sourced, which retain the same character and proportions of the original windows oriented to maximize views of the river and valley similar to the previous windows

Minor Variances are required to permit the proposed alterations

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

The applicant has submitted a Minor Variance application (A122-18) for the proposed garage. The Building Standards Department has confirmed that the following minor variances are required to Zoning By-law 1-88:

1. To permit the existing dwelling to encroach into the OS1 Zone, whereas a building or structure is not permitted within the OS1 Zone boundary.
2. To permit an exterior side yard setback of 4.31m and 6.91m, whereas an exterior side yard setback of 7.5m is required.
3. To permit an exterior side yard setback of 3.11m to the canopy projection, whereas an exterior side yard setback of 7.0m is required to the canopy projection.

Cultural Heritage staff can support the above variances as they do not conflict with the applicable policies of the KNHCD Plan.

The proposed alterations are consistent with the following relevant sections of the KNHCD Plan, with justification provided where the proposal does not meet certain policies in their entirety.

Objectives for Heritage Buildings

Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives – Heritage Buildings

“Retain and conserve the buildings identified in the Heritage District Plan as having heritage importance to the District”.

- The subject property is not noted as a “contributing property” in Section 2.6.2 of the KNHCD Plan, but the submitted CHIA does note that the property has architectural, contextual and historical value and is a candidate for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Therefore, the policies for Heritage Buildings in the KNHCD Plan will be applied as the CHIA has determined that the original building has greater cultural heritage significance than the KNHCD Plan identified.

Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives – Heritage Buildings

“Conserve distinguishing original features, qualities and character of heritage buildings and to avoid the removal or alteration of any such features”.

- The original distinguishing features of the Usonian-style house were the flat rooflines with varying heights and angles. The proposed addition will reinstate the flat roofline and horizontal banding between the first and second storeys and will therefore provide varying horizontal heights.

Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives – Heritage Buildings

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

“Encourage the corrections of unsympathetic alterations made over the years to heritage buildings”.

- The proposal will relocate the front garage and correct the later alteration of a pitched roof.

Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives – Heritage Buildings

“Encourage restoration of heritage buildings based on historical, archival, and pictorial evidence”.

- The garage placement and flat roof are consistent with the original building features as seen in the archival photos provided in the CHIA.

Additions to Heritage Buildings

Section 9.4.2 – Contexts

“The Windrush development off of Stegman’s Mill Road, the development on Cedar Valley Crescent and Valleyview Court, and the development on Bell Court are predominantly of mid-century one-storey houses, varying in design from strongly modernist to the vernacular “ranch-style” which sprang from that modernist example. These developments each have a definite character, and are part of the history of the re-settlement of the community. In general, the Contemporary Alteration approach is more suitable in these areas”.

- Therefore, the policies of Section 9.4.1.2 – Contemporary Alterations, will be reviewed against the development proposal.

Section 9.4.1.2 – Contemporary Alterations

“Additions and alterations using the Contemporary Alteration approach should respect, and be consistent with, the original design of the building”.

- The proposed building addition is consistent with the original Usonian style of the building.

Section 9.4.1.2 – Contemporary Alterations

“The Guidelines in Section 9.3.4 [9.3.7] for additions to heritage buildings apply, in terms of siting, scale and location of additions”.

- Please see the following discussion on Section 9.3.7.

Section 9.4.1.2 – Contemporary Alterations

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

“Many modern buildings are old enough to have already undergone renovations, which may not be in character with either the original design, or historic precedent. In such cases, the design of further new work should restore the architectural consistency of the whole”.

- The existing pitched roof and garage relocation are not consistent with the character of the original design. The proposed addition will reinstate the garage location and introduces a flat roof, which restores the architectural consistency of the whole.

Section 9.4.1.2 – Contemporary Alterations

“In some cases, modern buildings predominantly feature materials that are out of keeping with the local vernacular heritage, such as tile or artificial stone veneer, and tile or simulated tile roofing. Replacement of these materials with more sympathetic ones, when renovations are being undertaken, is encouraged”.

- The existing stone veneer and wood panelling are consistent with the local vernacular heritage for the Usonian style. The existing asphalt hipped roof is to be replaced with a flat wood roof, which is consistent with the local vernacular heritage for the Usonian style.

Section 9.3.7 – New Additions to Heritage Buildings

“Design additions to maintain the original Architectural Style of the building. See Section 9.2.”

- As previously stated, the proposed building addition is consistent with the original Usonian style of the building.

Section 9.3.7 – New Additions to Heritage Buildings

“Use authentic detail. See Section 9.2.1”.

- The proposed Modernist/Usonian style is an “Existing Non-Heritage Style” noted in Section 9.2.2. The proposed addition has been reviewed against the policies of Section 9.2.2 for the “Modern Movement” style to determine that the proposal uses authentic details for the Modernist/Usonian style:
 - Section 9.2.2 – Existing Non-Heritage Styles, states that the Modern Movement style elements are as follows:
 - One – storey, very informal plan. Each area of the house expressed in plan and elevation.
 - Fits into landscape, with floor levels following contours of the lot.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

- *Main entrance often on the side.*
 - *Strong horizontal emphasis.*
 - *Flat roofs with large overhangs, sometimes extremely so. Roofs overlap and vary in height.*
 - *Very large chimney.*
 - *Natural materials: fieldstone, brick and wood.*
 - *Large glass areas: inside and outside “flow together”.*
- The proposed addition creates a two-storey height and utilizes the existing footprint and layout of the building. Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that the two-storey addition is complimentary to the character of the original building and the overall District character.
 - The horizontal banding between the two storeys provides a variation in floor heights that fits within the context of the subject property.
 - The main entrance of the original building is placed off to the side on the main façade and will not be relocated as part of this proposal. Therefore, this detail is being conserved.
 - The proposed roof design has a very strong horizontal element through the horizontal banding, as well as the horizontal banding between the first and second storeys.
 - The horizontal banding between the two storeys gives a visual appearance of overlapping roof heights reflective of the Usonian style.
 - The existing chimney is proposed to be relocated to approximately the same location. Therefore, this detail is being conserved.
 - The proposed stone, the wood panelling and wood roof are natural materials consistent with the original building materials.
 - The proposed addition includes a variation of windows of different sizes that is consistent with the original building.

Section 9.3.7 – New Additions to Heritage Buildings

“Research the Architectural Style of the original building. See Section 10 for useful research sources”.

- The submitted CHIA provides archival photos (1980’s) of the original building, which best shows the original design of the building. These photos are used as the basis for the above comments.

Section 9.3.7 – New Additions to Heritage Buildings

“Follow the relevant guidelines for new construction in Section 9.5”.

- Please see the following discussion on relevant policies of Section 9.5.

Section 9.5.4 – Valley Outliers

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

“As described in Section 1.4, the resettling of Kleinburg as a rural retreat in the postwar years represented a second pioneer era. During the first two decades of this era, the consciously modern ideas of the ‘Natural House’, as espoused by architects like Frank Lloyd Wright, were quite influential. These ideas lost some of their edge as they filtered down to builders’ houses, but many significant aspects were retained: a horizontal emphasis, an open-plan that opened to nature (the patio door became ubiquitous), large lots when affordable, mature trees if present, and a landscaping attitude that sought to place the house in a natural or naturalized setting. Developments using these ideas are no longer produced, and these areas have their own neighbourhood characters, which merit preservation.”

- The proposed second-storey addition is in keeping with the style of the original house. The ideas behind the Valley developments i.e. a horizontal emphasis, an open-plan that opened to nature, large lots, mature trees, and a landscaping attitude that sought to place the house in a natural or naturalized setting, are not being negatively impacted by the proposed addition.

Section 9.3.7 – New Additions to Heritage Buildings

“Don’t design additions to a greater height or scale than the original building”.

- The proposed addition produces a greater height (two storeys) than the original one storey dwelling. Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that the horizontal banding between the first and second storeys visually breaks up the massing of the two-storey building.
- Additionally, Section 5.2.5 should be considered, which states that an objective of the KNHCD Plan is “to guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within”.
- Cultural Heritage staff have determined the proposed addition is complimentary to the District character.

Section 9.3.7 – New Additions to Heritage Buildings

“Don’t design additions to predominate over the original building. Usually, additions should be located at the rear of the original building or, if located to the side, be set back from the street frontage of the original building”.

- Please see above comments.

Materials

Section 9.3.7 – New Additions to Heritage Buildings

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

“Use appropriate materials. See Section 9.10.”

- As previously discussed, the proposed stone veneer, wood siding and wood roof are consistent with the natural materials used in Usonian style dwellings and with the original building materials.

Landscaping

Section 9.3.7 – New Additions to Heritage Buildings

“Avoid destruction of existing mature trees. See Section 9.9”.

- No trees are required or proposed for removal for the addition. The Arborist Report identified that tree No. 31 is dead and will be removed.

Timeline

This Application is subject to the 90-day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This Application was declared complete on October 3, 2018 and must be deliberated upon by January 1, 2019, to meet the 90-day timeline.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the Application to permit a the proposed second storey addition on the property municipally known as 75 Valley Road and is satisfied that the proposed addition is consistent with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed alteration under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the recommendations in this report.

For more information, please contact: Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

1. Location Map

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

2. Subject Property
3. Site Photos
4. Architectural Drawings, Fausto Cortese Architects, September 12, 2018
5. Proposed Material Details and Coloured Rendering, September 12, 2018
6. Arborist Report, Heartwood Tree Care, April 15, 2018
7. Tree Protection Plan, Gunnell Engineering Ltd., April 14, 2018
8. Heritage Impact Assessment, Strickland Mateljan Design Associates, April 18, 2018

Prepared by

Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8653

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

/CM

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**3 NEW CONSTRUCTION – DETACHED GARAGE
49 NASHVILLE ROAD, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE
 CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated October 17, 2018, be approved; and
- 2) That the applicant be requested to include the following in the proposal for the detached garage:
 - a. appropriate architectural window treatment on the west wall;
 - b. the windows be 4 X 4 to match those of the house; and
 - c. additional landscaping.

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the deputation of Mr. Lucas Cocomello, Schiller Engineering, Royal Windsor Drive, Mississauga, representing the applicant, was received.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

(Note: Due to the Election, this application was dealt with under the delegation by-law)

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding the proposed construction of a detached garage located at 49 Nashville Road, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing a detached garage located at 49 Nashville Road.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan').
- Heritage Vaughan consideration and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff are recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the KNHCD Plan.

Recommendations

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend approval to Council for the proposed detached garage at 49 Nashville Road under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) That a Landscape Plan and Tree Protection Plan depicting the Tree Protection Zone of remaining trees be submitted to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to the approval of a Heritage Permit;
 - b) All Tree Protection Barriers specified on the Tree Protection Plan shall be monitored on a weekly basis by a certified arborist until all site activities including landscaping are complete;
 - c) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application; and

- c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

Background

The subject property is municipally known as 49 Nashville and is located on the south side of Nashville Road, adjacent to the Kleinburg Cemetery to the west (Attachment #1).

The subject property currently contains an existing two-storey wood-clad dwelling. Previous Cultural Heritage staff review of the property determined that the dwelling varies in age from the early 20th century to the mid-20th century, as the front gable portion dates from the 1920's – 1930's and the east portion of the house dates from the mid-20th century due to the concrete block foundation. Renovations to the main dwelling were approved at the Heritage Vaughan meeting on September 16, 2009. These renovations included new wood cladding, roofing, the addition of front and rear porches and the removal of the existing attached garage.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not available.

Analysis and Options

The Owner is proposing a detached garage in the front yard

The Owner is proposing a new detached garage to be located in the front yard of 49 Nashville Road. The proposed garage is 62.14 m in area, resulting in 3.19% lot coverage. The proposed garage and existing dwelling will result in a total lot coverage of 9.3%. The garage will be 4.14 m in height and will be set back 16.06 m from the front lot line. The garage will be oriented towards the east lot line and the internal driveway with 3 separate single-bay garage doors. The proposed garage will be wood clapboard siding to match the main dwelling and include wood double-hung windows and one wood-paneled access door on the south elevation.

The proposal includes the slight reconfiguration of the existing driveway and will require the removal of one White Spruce tree. The submitted Arborist Report confirms that one tree replacement will be necessary for the tree removal required for this development. A Landscape Plan showing the species and location of this replacement tree must be submitted to the

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to the approval of a Heritage Permit. A Tree Protection Plan showing Tree Protection Zone (TPZ) for the remaining trees is required.

No Minor Variances are required to permit the proposed new construction

The applicant has confirmed with the Building Standards Department that no variances will be required for this proposal.

The proposed garage is consistent with the following relevant sections of the KNHCD Plan, with justification provided where the proposal does not meet certain policies in their entirety.

Outbuildings for Heritage Buildings

Section 9.3.8 Outbuildings for Heritage Buildings

“New garages should respect traditional siting as separate rear outbuildings.”

- The proposed garage is located at the front of the property but is set off to the side of the main dwelling and is a separate outbuilding.

“Connected garages should minimize their street presence. For example, a garage may be turned so that the doors face a side lot line, or it may be set well back from the main frontage, with the connection to the main building disguised or hidden.”

- The proposed garage faces the east side lot line and the internal driveway. The proposed garage is placed in front of the main dwelling, and is set back 16.05 m from the front lot line. The north elevation of the proposed garage is designed with window openings and light fixtures that are consistent with the main dwelling. Based on these design considerations, Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that the proposed garage will not have a negative impact on the subject property or the character of the District.

“Design garages to traditional outbuilding forms, with gable roofs, and frame or brick construction.”

- The proposed garage is a frame construction with a gable roof, designed to reflect the style of the main dwelling. Therefore, this policy has been met.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

“Use single bay garage doors, compatible with traditional designs. Suitably designed overhead doors are now widely available. The doors shown above are manufactured in the City of Vaughan.”

- The proposed single bay garage doors are designed in a traditional style as shown in Section 9.3.8 of the KNHCD Plan. Therefore, this policy has been met.

“Other outbuildings, such as garden and storage sheds, should be of traditional wood construction when visible from the street.”

- The proposed garage will be visible from the street and will be of a traditional wood construction. Therefore, this policy has been met.

Materials

Section 9.10.1 Heritage Buildings – Appropriate Materials

“Exterior Finish: Wood clapboard, 4” to the weather.

Roofs: Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour.

Doors: Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed. Single-bay wood panelled garage doors.

Windows: Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style.”

- The proposed wood clapboard siding, wood windows, wood doors and wood shingles are appropriate materials as per the above policies.

Timeline

This Application is subject to the 90-day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This Application was declared complete on October 3, 2018 and must be deliberated upon by January 1, 2019 to meet the 90-day timeline.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 5, 2018**

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the proposal for a detached garage on the property municipally known as 49 Nashville Road and is satisfied the proposal is consistent with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed alteration under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the recommendations in this report.

For more information, please contact: Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Subject Property
3. Site Photos
4. Site Plan, Schiller Engineering Ltd., August 2018
5. Elevations, Schiller Engineering Ltd., June 2018
6. Arborist Report, Arborist Group, September 5, 2018

Prepared by

Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813
Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8653
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

/CM

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

The meeting adjourned at 8:21 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Christine Radewych, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Acting Deputy City Clerk