

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, October 20, 2021

WARD(S): 1

TITLE: CONSTRUCTION OF NEW TOWNHOMES AT 10316 KEELE STREET IN THE MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed construction of a new residential development consisting of four town house blocks with a total of 20 units. The property is located at 10316 Keele Street in the Maple Heritage Conservation District (as shown on Attachment 1) and is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The property was previously reviewed before Heritage Vaughan in 2016
- The property has since been sold to the present owner and a new site plan has been proposed
- The proposed development is in keeping with the Objectives, Policies and Guidelines of the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the proposed development as presented, subject to following conditions:

- a) further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
- b) any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the

Director of Development Planning;

- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application;
- d) that the final wording of the commemoration plaque be reviewed and approved by Cultural Heritage staff prior to final Site Plan approval.

Background

The subject property is designated under Part V of the of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as part of the Maple Heritage Conservation District (MHCD) and is identified as a significant heritage property. It located within the Residential Village area and is therefore subject to the residential policies and guidelines of the MHCD Plan.

In 2015, the subject property began the Site Planning and Zoning By-Law Amendment application process (DA.15.071 and Z.15.029), as well as the Heritage Permit application process under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. On July 20, 2016, the previous application to demolish the existing structure and construct townhouse blocks with a total of 19 units was reviewed by the Heritage Vaughan Committee and staff report and concurred in their recommendation of proposed development.

This proposal was approved by the Vaughan Council Item 23, Report No. 31, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on September 20, 2016.

The approval included the following conditions which still apply:

1. *That Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the proposed demolition under Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act for a single detached dwelling at 10316 Keele Street, subject to the following conditions:*
 - a) *that the property owner recycle the rubblestone from the dwelling foundation into a retaining wall or entry feature on the site;*
 - b) *that the interior woodwork, including the original and/or vintage panelled doors, transom, baseboard, panelled dado or wainscot, moulded door and window trim, and similar components, be examined to determine the potential for salvage and reuse. If it is determined not suitable for reuse in the proposed development, they should first be made available to the City as repair materials for heritage buildings elsewhere in Vaughan;*
 - c) *the examination to determine potential for salvage or reuse shall be done for the original 4 to 6 inch wide, tongue and groove floorboards.*
2. *That Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the elevation design of the*

proposed development subject to following conditions:

- a) further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;*
- b) any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;*
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the Ontario Planning Act or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application;*
- d) that the proponent commemorate the history of the site by developing signage for within the adjacent McNaughton Park;*
- e) that the proponent submit a Tree Inventory/Assessment, and Tree Preservation/Remediation Plan, prepared by licensed arborist which specifically describes and identifies significant cultural heritage trees and existing specific trees for preservation through detailed inventory, evaluation and analysis of the possible impact the proposed development will have on existing trees on and adjacent to the subject property.*

However, after the Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval, the Site Plan was not finalized and was dormant for nearly three years. In August 2019, the property owner submitted an application to demolish the existing heritage structure in accordance with the approved Heritage Permit application of 2016. In February 2020, the new of the property owner has submitted a new Site Plan for review.

Previous Reports/Authority

July 20, 2016 Heritage Vaughan report

https://www.vaughan.ca/council/minutes_agendas/AgendaItems/HV0720_16_2.pdf

Analysis and Options

2.4.5 Objectives for New Development

To ensure compatible infill construction that will enhance the District's heritage character and complement the area's village-like, human scale of development, while promoting densities sufficient to secure the District's future economic viability. To guide the design of new development to be sympathetic and compatible with the heritage resources and character of the District while providing for contemporary needs.

The proposed infill development scale complements the MHCD village. It has the appearance of 2 ½ storey tall townhouse with a mid-roof measurement of 8.6 meters a complete height of 9.5 meters.

4.4 New Residential Buildings

New residential buildings will have respect for and be compatible with the heritage character of the District. Designs for new residential buildings will be based on the patterns and proportions of the 19th century and early 20th century building stock that are currently existing or once existed in the village. Architectural elements, features, and decorations should be in sympathy with those found on heritage buildings.

The proposed development is designed in the Second Empire Style, which is an approved Heritage Style in the MHCD Plan. The proportions and patterns are in keeping with the size and scale of the District.

4.4.1 Design Approach

- a) The design of new buildings will be products of their own time, but should reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District.*
- b) New residential buildings will complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by: being generally the same height, width, and orientation of adjacent buildings; being of similar setback; being of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes.*
- c) New residential building construction will respect natural landforms, drainage, and existing mature vegetation.*
- d) Larger new residential buildings will have varied massing, to reflect the varied scale of built environment of the historical village.*
- e) Historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings has been 1 -1/2 or 2 storeys. The façade height of new residential buildings should be consistent with the façade height of existing buildings. Differences in façade heights between buildings on adjacent properties within the district should be no more than 1 storey. In all instances the height of new buildings shall conform to the provisions of the City's Zoning By-law.*
- f) New residential building construction in the District will conform with the Guidelines found in Section 9.5.2.*

The proposed development is designed in the Second Empire architectural style, but is a product of contemporary time through the material choices, minor details, and interior dimensions that reflect current standard of living. It is also of a similar height, width and orientation as nearby buildings with one townhouse block (Block 3) that sites directly onto Keele Street. Another townhouse of 6 units (Block 2) is sited to face onto the interior of the development, but the Keele facing elevation of this building showcases heritage details.

9.1 Architectural Styles

New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a particular style, rather than a hybrid of many styles.

9.5 New Development

Guidelines:

- ❑ *New buildings should reflect a suitable local heritage style. Use of a style should be consistent in materials, scale, detail, and ornament.*

The proposed development consists of 4 blocks of townhouses (20 units), all in the Second Empire style. While each block is Second Empire in style, they are each unique in the choice of colour and design details.

9.5.2 Residential Area Overview

- ❑ *Generous lot sizes and modest house sizes, compared to historic urban development or recent suburban development;*
- ❑ *A variety of front-yard setbacks;*
- ❑ *The generous presence of mature trees, in addition to decorative shrubbery, in the front, side, and rear yards.*

The townhouse blocks themselves are modest in terms of height and are set back from the property line at distances varying between 2.75 meters to 4.48 meters. Respecting the existing right-of-way, the appearance of setback is further distanced an additional 7.93 meters from the sidewalk and roadway.

9.5.2 Residential Area**9.5.2.3 Scale and Massing**

New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots. Note: It is recommended in Section 7 that the zoning by-law be amended to recognize the smaller scale of historic village development as contrasted with modern suburban development.

Guidelines:

- ❑ *New buildings should be designed to preserve the scale and pattern of the historic District.*
- ❑ *New houses should be no higher than the highest building on the same block, and no lower than the lowest building on the same block.*
- ❑ *As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1½-storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.*

The proposed development is in keeping with the existing northern blocks heights of the MHCD on Keele Street. The building identified on plan as Block 3 at the street elevation hides its parking at the rear, and the building identified on plan as Block 2 showcases a playful street-facing elevation with detailed architectural elements and height changes. As a streetscape composition, the two buildings preserve and enhance the overall scale and pattern of dwellings in the District.

9.3.8 Outbuildings for Heritage Buildings.

Traditionally, garages or stables were built as separate rear outbuildings with gable roofs.

Guidelines:

- ☐ *Work on existing heritage outbuildings should retain or restore original design features.*
- ☐ *New garages should respect traditional siting as separate rear outbuildings, if possible.*
- ☐ *Garages should be designed with single bays, and doors should reflect historic designs. There are now a wide range of heritage-compatible doors available from many manufacturers.*
- ☐ *Connected garages should minimize their street presence. For example, a garage may be turned so that the doors face a side lot line, or it may be set well back from the main frontage, with the connection to the main building disguised or hidden.*
- ☐ *Design garages to traditional outbuilding forms, with gable roofs, and frame or brick construction.*

The garages are located at the rear of Block 3 and accessible from the entrance of the other townhouse blocks. As Blocks 1, 2 and 4 face onto the interior of the site, the garages are not visible from the street.

Regarding the former conditions of approval, Cultural Heritage staff can confirm the following:

- 1) The rubblestone foundation of the previous house is to be recycled into the entry feature of the development
- 2) The commemoration plaque has been relocated from McNaughton Park to the Entry Gate feature of the property and Cultural Heritage staff is in concurrence with this move. Final wording is to be confirmed by Cultural Heritage staff.
- 3) As stated in the updated CHIA that was submitted in support of the application that the interior features such as the wainscot, beading and floorboards were not salvageable for re-use.

9.7.1 Planting

No heritage permits are required for planting activities, but voluntary compliance with the guidelines in this Section can help maintain and enhance the natural heritage of the Maple and its valley. Suitable new planting and management of existing flora are a primary means of ensuring the health of the entire ecosystem: plants contribute to stormwater and groundwater management, erosion control, and provide habitat and nutrition for wild fauna.

Guidelines:

- ☐ *Maintain health of mature indigenous tree by pruning and fertilizing.*

- ☐ *Over time, remove unhealthy, invasive and non-indigenous species.*
- ☐ *Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees.*
- ☐ *Protect and preserve mature trees during construction.*

Prior to the Heritage Vaughan review in 2016, there were several trees identified throughout the property. After the Heritage Permit approval, several trees located in the middle of the property were removed. Trees located around the perimeter of the property were retained.

The updated Tree Inventory and Preservation Plan (see Attachment 9) recommends the removal of 46 trees, and the planting of 51 replacement trees to recreate the boundary treelines around the property. Tree protection will be required to accommodate the proposed development, as discussed in the Tree Inventory and Preservation Plan.

Financial Impact

There are no Financial Impacts associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no Regional impacts or considerations for this application.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed development and related landscape conform to the policies and guidelines within the MHCD Plan. While the proposal does require the removal of almost all trees within the property, including the remaining boundary trees, the proposed landscape plan intent is to recreate these boundaries. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed development located at 10316 Keele Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 10316Keele – Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 10316Keele – CHIA
- Attachment 3 – 10316Keele – Site Plan
- Attachment 4 – 10316Keele – Floor Plans & Elevations
- Attachment 5 – 10316Keele – Materials and Finishes
- Attachment 6 – 10316Keele – Hardscape Features, including Entry Gate
- Attachment 7 – 10316Keele – Tree Protection Plan
- Attachment 8 – 10316Keele – Arborist Report

Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653