

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Thursday, October 7, 2021

WARD(S): 4

TITLE: PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION OF 13 SEPARATE 2-STOREY HOUSES AT 357-375 STEGMAN'S MILL ROAD, IN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed construction of 13 separate 2-storey houses located at 357-375 Stegman's Mill Road in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District, as shown on Attachment 1.

Report Highlights

- The Owner seeks a recommendation for approval to construct 13 separate 2-storey buildings at 357-375 Stegman's Mill Road
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies and objectives of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies and objectives of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed construction of 13 separate 2-storey houses located at 357-375 Stegman's Mill Road under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management.
- b) Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.
- c) The Applicant submit Building Permit stage drawings and specifications to the satisfaction of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and Chief Building Official.

Background

The proposed development will replace 3 existing houses on the combined site with 3 sympathetic ('contributing') houses along Stegman's Mill Road and 13 houses in the interior of the Site that respond to the vernacular design language of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District ('KNHCD').

The 3 existing houses are designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as part of the KNHCD but are not considered to be contributing. The 3 homes were built in the 60s, and the submitted CHIA Report and Addendum (see Attachment 2) identifies them as being "not in keeping with the HCD guidelines".

The proposed 13-house development includes an Italianate building, a Georgian building, and an Ontario Gothic building to be prominently constructed along Stegman's Mill Road, and 10 other Edwardian and Victorian buildings with contemporary details.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan

The following is an analysis of the proposed construction of 13 separate 2-storey houses located at 357-375 Stegman's Mill Road based on the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan guidelines.

5.2.5 FUTURE DEVELOPMENT IN THE DISTRICT

- *To encourage new development that will enhance the heritage character of the District as infill construction on vacant lands and replacement construction or alterations to non-heritage buildings.*

- *To guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within.*

The proposed development includes 3 distinct and true-to-detail buildings located prominently at the streetscape edge of the property along Stegman's Mill Road: they are designed as Georgian, Ontario Gothic, and Italianate architecture with materials and proportions replicating those of the original era. These three buildings are positioned prominently along Stegman's Mill Road as it enters the Kleinburg Village, to define and underscore the heritage values of the village.

The remaining 10 houses are contemporary representations of the Edwardian and Late Victorian styles, with modern construction materials used in heritage applications to maintain a decorum in keeping with the policies of the KNHCD Plan.

6.3 *POLICIES FOR NEW DEVELOPMENT*

New development should complement and enhance the heritage character of the District. New buildings should be sympathetic in siting, scale, material, texture, and general design to the heritage buildings around them.

- *New development should be limited to vacant sites or to sites currently occupied by unsympathetic buildings. Even the most skillfully executed heritage-friendly building cannot replace the value of a real heritage building.*
- *New development within the District should be consistent with the Guidelines in Section 9.5.*

The urban layout of the proposed development presents a contemporary new pocket neighbourhood that is in keeping with the feel and format of the KNHCD. The 13 proposed buildings are set into a topography-driven landscape setting that offers a welcoming flow and defined property boundaries. Staff finds that the contemporary buildings are maintaining the proportions and materials of the chosen architectural styles, whilst respecting the human scale in parallel with current construction standards for heights and volumes. The proposed landscape plan also incorporates a heritage commemoration plaque that further enhances the heritage value of the development.

The proposal includes an Arborist Report (see Attachment 7) and a landscape plan (see Attachment 9) that account for existing mature vegetation and address the proposed construction in a well-crafted scheme.

9.2 *ARCHITECTURAL STYLES*

Architectural style is a term used to refer to the identifying characteristics of construction as it has evolved under the force of changing technology and fashion. In the Guidelines that follow, reference is made to architectural styles for all types of buildings in the

District: existing heritage buildings, existing non-heritage buildings, and new development.

New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a particular style, rather than a hybrid one. Recent developments have tended to use hybrid designs, with inauthentic details and proportions; for larger homes, the French manor or château style (not indigenous to Ontario) has been heavily borrowed from. These kinds of designs are not appropriate for the District.

The chosen architectural styles (Georgian, Edwardian, Ontario Gothic, and Italianate) are recommended by the KNHCD Plan as ‘contributing’ styles to the District. The 3 accurate representation models notwithstanding, the remaining contemporary models employ materials and massing in respectful and proportionate compositions that are in keeping with the policies of the KNHCD Plan as well as with the surrounding vernacular heritage homes of the immediate neighbourhood.

9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW

The overall heritage character of the District is composed of buildings, streetscapes, landscapes, and vistas. This overall character has more significance than any individual building, even if it is one of the finest. Within the design of any individual building, architectural elements contribute to the character of the public realm of the street. Massing, materials, scale, proportions, rhythm, composition, texture, and siting all contribute to the perception of whether or not a building fits its context. Different settings within the district have different characters of siting, landscaping and streetscaping.

New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style. Research should be conducted so that the style chosen is executed properly, with suitable proportions, decoration, and detail. The following guidelines, describing the dominant elements that contribute to the heritage character of the District, are divided according to the principal settings found in the District.

The new non-contributing 10 buildings are sympathetic in all architectural aspects and components to the immediate neighbourhood, as well as to the KNHCD at large. Two buildings (Unit 4 and Unit 5) have a preset design whereas the remaining 8 units (Unit 1-3 and 9-13 respectively) are presented as options to the prospective buyers to choose between 5 different architectural compositions and variations in the interior plans (see Attachment 4).

Unit 4 is a Victorian style building with a heavy-set stone base and brick cladding; two symmetric dormers flank the Victorian sharp peak roof that emphasizes the entry. The fenestration is simple, with equally dimensioned double-hung window units that repeat in patterns of double or triple. The two garage doors are proportionately scaled to the building and do not overwhelm the front elevation – and a suggested lateral addition over the second garage door completes the architectural composition with a heritage feel of alteration-to-existing that occurs throughout the KNHCD.

Unit 5 is a complex Edwardian composition comprised of a wide 4-window main body (further subdivided into equal 2-window halves, one of them proud of the main façade and roof) and a reduced 3-window lateral body separated from the main body by a tall entry unit capped with a heritage shed-roof dormer dressed in detailed pilasters and paneling. Contemporary stone base with brick cladding upper level, and large cementitious panels with adequately scaled separations complete this composition in a playful but cohesive building. Lateral roof dormers are offered as optional loft space.

The remaining units (1, 2, 3, 9, 10, 11, 12, and 13 respectively) are offered options between 4 versions of the Edwardian model, or a contemporary take on the Georgian model (Front Elevation ‘C’) consisting of a tall and simple main body with stone-clad base, corner, and entry unit, and a reduced scale lateral body comprised of two elements dividing the elevation into 1/3 and 2/3 proportions, and housing the garage doors under a porch roof. The walk-out Juliette balcony over part of the front entry adds a welcome contemporary touch to this otherwise formal style.

The other 4 Edwardian models have two variations: ‘D’ and ‘E’ models showcase a large main body building with porch roof at the ground floor and a defined entry block culminating in a dormer. From the main body, two equal and nearly identical projections flank the entry unit: the difference is at the ground floor, with one consisting of a 3-panel window whereas the other has a garage door. Front Elevation ‘D’ is more visually rooted to the site by means of heavy masonry cladding of the ground floor; by contracts, Front Elevation ‘E’ is significantly lighter visually, being clad only in brick and employing a lightly arched front entry roof.

Models ‘A’ and ‘B’ are two new variations on the Unit 5 model, only these units swap the 3:2:2 pattern of windows to retain the larger window on the half of the larger building body, also incorporating the entry – and then play with the locations of the remaining double window and dormer/peak combination on the remaining area of the façade. The garage doors remain sheltered under the wide porch roof, and the visual weight of the building is carried by the stone cladding of option ‘A’ versus the pronounced columns and heavy-set masonry framing of the ground floor window of option ‘B’.

Please refer to Attachment 4 for all elevations and details.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:

Exterior Finish:

- ☐ Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent
- ☐ Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather.
- ☐ Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.

Exterior Detail: Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.

Roofs: Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style.

Doors: Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.

Flashings: Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.

The choice in building materials (please refer to Attachment 6) is respectful of each chosen architectural style and is in keeping with the requirements of the KNHCD Plan. Some of the proposed building designs have a heavy set raised stone foundation cladding aligned with the sill of the ground floor windows – which is a traditional construction style; a few options continue the stone cladding for the entire ground floor, making the upper floor brick veneer seem lighter and more refined. The other options are fully clad in brick veneer, also a traditional and common cladding for all chosen architectural styles.

The integration of contemporary materials (Hardie board, standing seam metal, glazed railings) are tastefully combined with traditional construction materials in a thoughtful palette – and the colour variations and combinations are well planned. In addition, the proposed window frames reflect the heritage feel but are contemporary technology and design (refer to Attachment 11).

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed works conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed construction of 13 separate 2-storey buildings at 357-375 Stegman's Mill Road connection under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Attachments

- Attachment 1 - 357-375Stegman_Location Map
- Attachment 2 - 357-375Stegman_CHIA
- Attachment 3 - 357-375Stegman_Site Plan
- Attachment 4 - 357-375StegmanElevations
- Attachment 5 - 357-375Stegman_renderings
- Attachment 6 - 357-375Stegman_Colour Schedule
- Attachment 7 - 357-375Stegman_Arborist Report
- Attachment 8 - 357-375Stegman_Tree Protection Plan
- Attachment 9 - 357-375Stegman_Landscape Plan
- Attachment 10 - 357-375Stegman_Heritage Plaque
- Attachment 11 - 357-375Stegman_Windows

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191