

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, April 21, 2021

WARD(S): 5

TITLE: RENOVATION OF EXISTING HERITAGE HOUSE, AND REAR
ADDITION AT 7714 YONGE STREET, THORNHILL HERITAGE
CONSERVATION DISTRICT
(REFERRED)

FROM:

Jim Harnum, City Manager

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed adaptive reuse of the existing Heritage house and the proposed new construction of a rear 2-storey addition. The subject property is located at 7714 Yonge Street, in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachments 1 and 2.

Report Highlights

- The Owner seeks a recommendation for approval to renovate the existing dwelling for adaptive reuse, including the partial removal of existing additions and to construct a new rear 2-storey addition located at 7714 Yonge Street
- The existing main dwelling on the subject lands is identified as a contributing property in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies and objectives of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies and objectives of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan

Recommendations

Heritage Vaughan, at its meeting March 24, 2021, recommended the following (Item 3, Report No. 3):

- 1) That consideration of this matter be deferred to the Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting of April 21, 2021, to allow the applicant, staff and noted neighbours to deal with issues raised and report back; and
- 2) That the following comments and Communications were received:
 1. Mr. Azam Khan, Yonge Street, Thornhill and Communication C2, presentation material;
 2. Mr. Michael Scott, Michael Scott Architect Inc., Delaware Avenue, Toronto, on behalf of the applicant;
 3. Karolina and Igor Kataev, Old Jane Street, Thornhill;
 4. Mr. Sonny Goldstein, Elizabeth Street, Thornhill;
 5. Ms. Valerie Burke, Colborne Street, Thornhill and Communication C3, presentation material;
 6. Mr. Adam Birrell, The Society for the Preservation of Historic Thornhill (SPOHT), Royal Orchard Blvd., Thornhill and Communication C4, dated March 24, 2021, and
 7. Mr. Barry Nelson, The Society for the Preservation of Historic Thornhill (SPOHT), Royal Orchard Blvd., Thornhill.

Report of the City Manager, dated March 24, 2021

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed adaptive reuse of the existing dwelling, and the new construction of a rear 2-storey addition located at 7714 Yonge Street under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management.
- b) Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.
- c) The Applicant submit a finalized Stage 1 Conservation Plan to the satisfaction of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to final Site Plan approval.
- d) The Applicant submit Stage 2 Conservation Plan drawings and specifications to the satisfaction of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and Chief Building Officials prior to the issuance of a demolition permit.

- e) The Applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and Chief Building Official.

Background

7714 Yonge Street (also known as the W.D. Stark House) is located along the west side of Yonge Street, one block south of Centre Street in the City of Vaughan, as shown in Attachment 1. The subject property is within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District ('THCD') and is identified as a contributing property.

W.D. Stark House is a single-detached, three-bay, and one-and-one-half storey structure with overall dimensions of 16m by 7.5m, with a wall height in the southeast corner of 4.4m. The building's T-shaped design is oriented with the long façade and central entrance of the East Portion parallel with Yonge Street (north-south).

The earliest built elements are the main Stark House block (the eastern portion of the structure) and the West Wing addition sharing a common stone foundation, both built circa 1853. This combination of main section and 'tail' is typical of mid-19th Century Gothic Revival residences in the Thornhill HCD. Later additions and the present outbuilding structures were added at different times in the 20th century and a full history of the property is available in the supporting Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA), refer to Attachment 2.

To enable the adaptive reuse of the property, the applicant is proposing to remove the existing outbuilding and later additions. The original 1853 house and tail will be preserved and integrated into the proposed development.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan.

The following is an analysis of the proposed adaptive reuse of the existing Heritage building and the construction of a rear 2-storey addition located at 7714 Yonge Street according to the THCD Plan guidelines.

4.2.2 Alterations and Additions to Heritage Buildings

- a) *Conserve the heritage value and heritage attributes of a heritage resource when creating any new addition or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to, and distinguishable from the heritage resource.*

- b) Ensure that any new addition, alteration, or related new construction will not have detrimental impact on the heritage resource if the new work is removed in future.*
- c) Alterations and additions to the heritage resource shall conform with the guidelines found in Section 9.3.*

The proposed redevelopment of the property conserves the original 1853 house and addition. The later additions have been deemed to not be of significant cultural heritage value as supported in the CHIA.

The new addition is sympathetic to the original house and is set back from the original block to provide a clear delineation between the old and new sections. The addition conforms to the guidelines in Section 9.3 of the Thornhill HCD Plan by providing a neutral backdrop that effectively “frame” the 1853 structures.

4.2.6 Use of a Heritage Building

- a) The uses permitted for a heritage building will be governed by the zoning by-law.*
- b) Uses that require minimal or no changes to heritage attributes are supported.*

Although the proposed reuse requires the removal of some portions of the addition and outbuilding structures, the significant heritage attributes of the house and the mature trees in the front yard will be preserved throughout construction, and maintaining the Cultural Heritage character. The proposed adaptive reuse will minimize the changes to the identified heritage attributes of the property.

4.6.4 Commercial Parking Lots

- *Attractive, well-designed parking lots that complement the special character of the District are supported. Parking will not be located in front of buildings.*
- *Parking lots will be appropriately screened. Features such as lighting, signage, and amenities used in parking lots will be consistent in design terms with those selected for use throughout the District.*
- *The consolidation and connection of commercial parking lots, to improve the efficiency and appearance of the parking facilities, is supported due to the collaborative nature and interdependence of the various commercial enterprises on Yonge Street and Centre Street.*
- *The development of underground parking facilities, appropriately located and accessed, is supported.*

As identified in the Site Plan drawing, the current driveway on the south side of the lot is proposed to be retained, widened slightly and modernized to meet current safety and access regulations. As currently proposed, the driveway meets the policies of the Thornhill HCD Plan.

9.1.1 Heritage Styles Residential Buildings

- *Vernacular “Loyalist” Cottage 1800-1850*
- *Neo-Classical 1800-1830*
- *Ontario Gothic Vernacular 1830-1890*

- *Victorian Vernacular*
- *Queen Anne Revival 1885-1900*
- *Vernacular Homestead 1890-1930*
- *Four-square 1900-1920*
- *Edwardian Classic 1900-1920*

The W.D. Stark House is identified as an example of the Ontario Gothic Vernacular style that was popular in 19th century Thornhill and the surrounding area. It supports and maintains the cultural heritage character of the streetscape and District. The proposed addition does not interfere or clash with the style and echoes the form to provide a sympathetic backdrop to the original house.

9.3.7 New Additions to Heritage Buildings Architectural Style

New attached additions to heritage buildings should be designed to complement the design of the original building.

Guidelines:

- *Design additions to maintain the original architectural style of the building. See Section 9.1.*
- *Use authentic detail.*
- *Research the architectural style of the original building.*
- *New additions to heritage buildings should respect the scale of the original building.*
- *Don't design additions to a greater height or scale than the original building.*
- *Don't design additions to predominate over the original building. Usually, additions should be located at the rear of the original building or, if located to the side, be set back from the street frontage of the original building.*
- *Use appropriate materials.*
- *Avoid destruction of existing mature trees.*

The proposed addition respects the original building by using a similar architectonic form and emulating some of the cladding of the original structure. Although it is a taller building at two storeys, it is set back from the existing original house with a new link that will diminish the impact of its height and simply provide a sympathetic backdrop. It does not overwhelm the original house as seen from the sidewalk and thus respects the scale of the original building.

The proposed rear location of the structure is sympathetic in architectural detail by repeating the form and orientation of the original house, complete with a dormer roofline that is oriented north-south as the original house does. The materials chosen reflect, and are sympathetic to, the cladding of the original house. The lower half is brick veneer forming a visual foundation echoing the original's stone foundation, as it references a historic practice of brick, stone and wood materials often used together. The upper level is clad in horizontal Hardie Board, providing visual continuity to the existing heritage

resource. The intermediate hallway ensures that the addition does not significantly impact the integrity of the original structure, and could be removed, if required in the future.

9.5.3.2 Built Form Vision

The objective of the proposed built form for the Yonge Street commercial corridor is to enable the development and insertion of more intense forms of development within the context of existing heritage and complementary buildings. The Thornhill Yonge Street Study, 2005 describes the basic building form:

- *Building massing should reflect a linked series of pavilion type buildings defined by recessed connector building segments. This variety in setback will create certain buildings that have greater emphasis and is somewhat in keeping with the character of a village which would have had independent buildings with sideyards.*
- *Mid-block pavilion building segments should generally occupy 15-20 metres of the street frontage whereas corner pavilion segments should occupy more frontage (25 -30 metres)*
- *The recessed connector building segments should generally occupy 6-15 metres of street frontage, and should be set back from the mandatory streetscape setback an additional 1.5 to 3.0 metres. This additional setback will provide an area of refuge for private landscape enhancements as well as street furniture.*
- *Long, homogenous facades are to be avoided.*
- *Pedestrian “through building” connections from Yonge Street to rear commercial parking areas are desirable especially for any development exceeding 50 metres of continuous building frontage.*
- *Massing and built form should step down to respond to and respect adjacent heritage buildings.*

The proposed adaptive reuse maintains the current setback and will maintain a front yard with landscaping and the existing mature trees will be preserved, thereby maintaining the streetscape character of the THCD.

In addition, the proposed addition respects the adjacent heritage property to the north in form and massing. The heritage property to the north (7716-7724 Yonge Street) is a 19th century commercial block that is directly adjacent to the existing sidewalk. The proposed addition of 7714 Yonge Street will not impact or overwhelm this structure as the addition is located at the rear of the existing setback of house, as shown in Attachment 8. This Attachment provides a rendering of the subject property in context with massing forms of the neighboring properties.

9.7.1 Planting

No heritage permits are required for planting activities, but voluntary compliance with the guidelines in this Section can help maintain and enhance the natural heritage of Thornhill and its valleys. Suitable new planting and management of existing flora are a primary means of ensuring the health of the entire ecosystem: plants contribute to stormwater and groundwater management, erosion control, and provide habitat and nutrition for wild fauna.

Guidelines:

- *Maintain health of mature indigenous tree by pruning and fertilizing, and by preventing intrusion that may damage the root systems.*
- *Over time, remove unhealthy, invasive and non-indigenous species.*
- *Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees.*
- *Suitable indigenous species:*
- *Sugar Maple, Red Oak, Basswood, Silver Maple, Bitternut, Butternut, White Pine, Hemlock, American Elm, Red Maple, Bur Oak, White Spruce.*
- *Suitable salt-tolerant species (for roadside planting):*
- *Little Leaf Linden, Serviceberry, Freeman Maple, Bur Oak, Red Oak, Kentucky Coffee Tree.*
- *Unsuitable species:*
- *Manitoba Maple, Hawthorn, Black Locust, and Buckthorn tend to be invasive.*
- *Ornamental species, particularly Norway Maple cultivars, are extremely invasive.*

The proposal conserves mature trees located on the subject lands along the east side of the property (the front elevation), along the north side of the property and on the west side of the property (rear) which abuts the residential neighbourhood. The proposed landscaping as outlined in the Arborist Report (see Attachment 9) is in keeping with the Policies of the Thornhill HCD Plan.

9.8.1 Heritage Buildings***Appropriate Materials***

Exterior Finish: Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent. Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather. Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.

Exterior Detail: Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.

Shopfronts: Wood frames, glazing bars, and panels with glazed wood doors are preferred.

Metal shopfronts, detailed and proportioned to be compatible with heritage shopfronts, are acceptable.

Roofs: Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style. Skylights in the form of cupolas or monitors are acceptable, if appropriate to the style.

Doors: Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed. Transom windows and paired sidelights. Wood french doors for porch entrances. Single-bay wood panelled garage doors.

Windows: Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.

Flashings: Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.

The proposed adaptive reuse will restore the original structure and tail addition on the property. A Conservation Plan has not yet been submitted as part of the Building Permit application process.

Cultural Heritage staff has, in light of the extenuating circumstances, proposed that a Stage 1 Conservation Plan be submitted to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to final approval of the Site Plan application (DA.14.009). In addition, a Stage 2 Conservation Plan package of drawings must be submitted to the satisfaction of Cultural Heritage staff and Building Department staff as part of a complete demolition application under the Ontario Building Code Act. It is staff's opinion these conditions, in addition to the standard final review of materials prior to Building Permit issuance, will sufficiently protect the built heritage resource.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed heritage site redevelopment and related works conform to the policies and objectives within the THCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed adaptive reuse of the existing Heritage building and the construction of a rear 2-storey addition located at 7714 Yonge Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 7714Yonge_Location Map
Attachment 2 – 7714Yonge_Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
Attachment 3 – 7714Yonge_CHIA Staff Memo
Attachment 4 – 7714Yonge_Site Plan (Current and Proposed)
Attachment 5 – 7714Yonge_Floor Plans
Attachment 6 – 7714Yonge_Elevations
Attachment 7 – 7714Yonge_Renderings
Attachment 8 – 7714Yonge_Materials
Attachment 9 – 7714Yonge_Arborist Report
Attachment 10 – 7714Yonge_Letter from Alexander Planning
Attachment 11 – Communication C2 from March 24, 2021 Heritage Vaughan Meeting
Attachment 12 – Communication C3 from March 24, 2021 Heritage Vaughan Meeting
Attachment 13 – Communication C4 from March 24, 2021 Heritage Vaughan Meeting

Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254

Bill Kiru, Acting Director of Development Planning, ext. 8633