

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, March 24, 2021

WARD(S): 1

TITLE: REDEVELOPMENT OF HERITAGE PROPERTY AND NEW INFILL DEVELOPMENT LOCATED AT 2291 MAJOR MACKENZIE DRIVE, MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (REFERRED)

FROM:

Jim Harnum, City Manager

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed adaptive reuse of the existing Heritage house and the construction of an attached 3-storey three-unit townhouse development with garages. The property is located at 2291 Major Mackenzie Drive, in the Maple Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachments 1 and 2.

Report Highlights

- The Owner seeks approval to renovate the existing dwelling for adaptive reuse, and to construct an attached 3-storey three-unit townhouse development with garages located at 2291 Major Mackenzie Drive
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a contributing property in the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies and objectives of the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies and objectives of the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan

Recommendations

Heritage Vaughan, at its meeting February 17, 2021, recommended the following (Item 1, Report No. 2):

- 1) That consideration of this matter be deferred to the Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting of March 24, 2021, to allow staff and the applicant to review the architectural expression proposed for the townhouse façade.

Report of the City Manager, dated February 17, 2021

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed redevelopment of the existing dwelling, and the new construction of an attached 3-storey three-unit townhouse development with garages located at 2291 Major Mackenzie Drive under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application; and
- c) That the Applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and Chief Building Official.

Background

The existing designated heritage house is a wood frame Victorian style 2-storey house with a full basement, and rear addition constructed in part from field stone. The house was originally clad with yellow painted lapstrake wood siding; subsequently wire-backed faux yellow brick siding was nailed over the wood siding. None of the original windows, doors, or original interior wood trims or finishes remain. While some original construction materials exist under the new siding, substantial restoration/repair work will be required.

A proposed attached garage will be constructed as part of the adaptive reuse of the building. Planned retention and adaptive reuse of the existing heritage house, combined with new infill development connected to the rear of the heritage house is fully compatible with the heritage district objectives and supporting guidelines.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.

The following is an analysis of the proposed adaptive reuse of the existing Heritage building and the construction of an attached 3-storey three-unit townhouse with garages located at 2291 Major Mackenzie Drive according to the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan guidelines.

2.4.2 OBJECTIVES FOR HERITAGE BUILDINGS

- *To retain and conserve the heritage buildings identified in the District Plan.*
- *To conserve heritage attributes, distinguishing qualities or character of heritage buildings and avoid the removal or alteration of any historic or distinctive architectural feature.*
- *To correct unsympathetic alterations to heritage buildings.*
- *To undertake the restoration of heritage buildings based on a thorough examination of archival and pictorial evidence, physical evidence, and an understanding of the history of the local community.*

The proposed adaptive reuse renovations of the existing heritage building address all the objectives set out in the MHCD Plan guidelines: the unsympathetic cladding and alterations are proposed to be removed, and the building's cladding will be restored. The Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment report (see Attachment 2) identifies how the existing brick, wood, and stucco cladding will be repaired or replaced, to return the building to its original look.

4.2.2 ALTERATIONS AND ADDITIONS TO HERITAGE BUILDINGS

- *Conserve the heritage value and heritage attributes of a heritage resource when creating any new addition or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to, and distinguishable from the heritage resource.*
- *Ensure that any new addition, alteration, or related new construction will not detrimentally impact the heritage resource if the new work is removed in future.*
- *Alterations and additions to the heritage resource shall conform with the Guidelines found in Section 9.3.*

The proposed street elevation shows a full-height masonry firewall between the existing heritage structure and the new construction attached to the south wall. This vertical differentiation between the heritage house and the new construction is a strong statement, both visually as well as architecturally/functionally. It ensures that future alterations to the new addition do not impact the heritage resource. In addition, the new proposed garage door at the heritage house uses a more historic style, whereas the new development garage doors have a more modern look, reinforcing that definition.

4.4.1 DESIGN APPROACH

- *The design of new buildings will be products of their own time but should reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District.*
- *New residential buildings will complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by being generally the same height, width, and orientation of*

adjacent buildings; being of similar setback; being of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes.

- *New residential building construction will respect natural landforms, drainage, and existing mature vegetation.*
- *Larger new residential buildings will have varied massing, to reflect the varied scale of built environment of the historical village.*
- *Historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings have been 1 -1/2 or 2 storeys. The façade height of new residential buildings should be consistent with the façade height of existing buildings. Differences in façade heights between buildings on adjacent properties within the district should be no more than 1 storey. In all instances the height of new buildings shall conform to the provisions of the City's Zoning By-law.*

New residential building construction in the District will conform with the Guidelines found in Section 9.5.2.

The proposed townhouse block addition respects and complements the existing heritage building, by remaining consistent in architectural style and proportions- but presenting a look that is a product of its time in height and volume. The complete building complex is complimentary to the existing streetscape, by providing a subtle visual and architectural infill block between the existing heritage structure and the adjacent mansard-roof development, thus mitigating the height difference between heritage and modern structures on this street block.

9.3.7 NEW ADDITIONS TO HERITAGE BUILDINGS ARCHITECTURAL STYLE

New attached additions to heritage buildings should be designed to complement the design of the original building.

Guidelines:

- *Design additions to maintain the original architectural style of the building.*
- *Use authentic detail.*
- *Research the architectural style of the original building.*
- *Follow the relevant guidelines for new construction in Section 9.5.*

The architectural integration of the existing heritage house to the proposed “rear” townhouse addition is achieved by carefully inserting architectural features that connect the new and old elements with functional components. Specifically the strong firewall separation that is full-height creates the visual disconnect while the incorporation of a new garage door and functional garage within the existing heritage building creates the common architectural link to the repetitive garage door pattern of the proposed townhouse addition. As such, the existing heritage building appears to be a continuous member of the architectural design of the building complex, which retains a strong architectural style but is made up of complementary components of new architecture (the townhouse) and functional program (the new garage).

9.3.7 NEW ADDITIONS TO HERITAGE BUILDINGS SCALE

New additions to heritage buildings should respect the scale of the original building.

Guidelines:

- *Don't design additions to a greater height or scale than the original building.*
- *Don't design additions to predominate over the original building. Usually, additions should be located at the rear of the original building or, if located to the side, be set back from the street frontage of the original building.*
- *Use appropriate materials. See Section 9.8.*
- *Avoid destruction of existing mature trees.*

Further to the above "Architectural Style" paragraph: the architectural composition of the new townhouse addition respects the contextual proportions of the existing heritage house but displays heights and volumes addressing current new construction industry standards (interior floor heights and room dimensions). It creates a building complex that is proportionally representative of the architectural style of the heritage building. Although the addition is significantly taller than the heritage structure, this height difference does not dominate or create the perception of dwarfing the heritage building- but rather it creates a hierarchical height connection between the heritage building and the adjacent development to the south, as shown on Attachment 5 (Elevations) and Attachment 6 (Renderings).

9.5.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA**9.5.2.3 SCALE AND MASSING**

New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots. Note: It is recommended in Section 7 that the zoning by-law be amended to recognize the smaller scale of historic village development as contrasted with modern suburban development.

Guidelines:

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the scale and pattern of the historic District.*
- *New houses should be no higher than the highest building on the same block, and no lower than the lowest building on the same block.*
- *As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1½-storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.*
- *Follow the policies in Section 4.4 of this Plan concerning height and depth of buildings and garages.*

Conforming to Section 7 but also addressing this section, the proposed finished complex is an amalgamation of heritage and current architecture of different heights but comprehensive massing and volume. The proposed townhouse addition maintains the architectural style and scale of the heritage building, and the proposed garage attached

to the heritage building addresses the modern architectural function of the new townhouse addition.

9.5.3.2 OBJECTIVES FOR GUIDELINES FOR NEW DEVELOPMENT

Overall Objectives

- *Preserve existing heritage buildings.*
- *Ensure that new development respects and enhances existing heritage character and resources.*
- *Respect the historic residential areas.*
- *Develop a pedestrian-friendly commercial environment.*
- *The policies and guidelines for new development in the Commercial Core are suitable for all commercial sites within the district.*

Building/Street Relationship

In order to create a commercially viable pedestrian environment, it should be the aim of new development to enhance the sense of security for pedestrians.

Guidelines:

- *The use of on-street parking, grassed boulevards, co-operative connected parking arrangements and access, and connected pathways and open spaces between and at the rear of buildings are all supported in site planning of new developments.*
- *Entrances shall face the principal street. Corner entrances are encouraged for corner lots. Principal entrances will be flush with the sidewalk and will comply with the Ontario Building Code and the Ontarians with Disabilities Act in their design.*

The planned redevelopment respects and preserves the heritage character of the village by returning a portion of the streetscape to pedestrian friendly and contextually integrating this development with the new housing development underway to the east and south of this parcel. The proposal provides a modern development that meets demand for intensification within the Maple Heritage Conservation District without demolition, removal or relocation of an existing heritage resource (building) and enhances the view of the original heritage building from the street and public walkways in the neighbourhood.

9.8.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS

All construction visible from the exterior requires a Heritage Permit. Visible materials should conform to the following standards:

Exterior Finish: *Concrete block; calcite or concrete brick. Textured, clinker, or wire cut brick, except where their use is consistent with existing conditions. Precast concrete panels or cast-in-place concrete. Prefabricated metal or plastic siding. Stone or ceramic tile facing. “Rustic” clapboard or “rustic” board and batten siding; wood shake siding.*

Exterior Detail: *Prefinished metal fascias and soffits. “Stock” suburban pre-manufactured shutters, railings, and trims. Unfinished pressure-treated wood decks, porches, railings, and trim. Shopfronts: Standard metal shopfronts and pre-finished metal spandrel material. Frameless tempered glass shopfronts.*

Roofs: *Slopes or layouts not suitable to the architectural style. Non-traditional metal roofing such as pre-finished or corrugated metal. Modern skylights, when facing the street.*

Doors: *“Stock” suburban door assemblies. Flush doors. Sidelites on one side only. Aluminum storm and screen doors. Sliding patio doors. Double-bay, slab, or metal garage doors. Generic or Stock stained glass window assemblies for doorlites and sidelites.*

Staff supports the material palette of the proposed building complex, which is accurately representative of the architectural style of the heritage building. By combining brick, stucco, wood, and stone in the proposed townhouse addition, the connection between existing and new construction is strengthened while maintaining an aspect of continuity in function and design. However, the material colours and style of the two construction eras reinforce that age distinction despite maintaining the architectural style language.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed heritage site redevelopment and related works conform to the policies and guidelines within the MHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed adaptive reuse of the existing Heritage building and the construction of an attached 3-storey three-unit townhouse development with garages located at 2291 Major Mackenzie Drive under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 2291MajorMac_Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 2291MajorMac_Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
- Attachment 3 – 2291MajorMac_Site Plan
- Attachment 4 – 2291MajorMac_Floor Plans
- Attachment 5 – 2291MajorMac_Elevations
- Attachment 6 – 2291MajorMac_Renderings
- Attachment 7 – 2291MajorMac_materials
- Attachment 8 – 2291MajorMac_Landscape Plans

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254

Bill Kiru, Acting Director of Development Planning, ext. 8633