

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, February 17, 2021

WARD(S): 1

**TITLE: DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION – SINGLE
DETACHED DWELLING WITH ATTACHED GARAGE LOCATED
AT 10432 ISLINGTON AVENUE, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE
HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

FROM:

Jim Harnum, City Manager

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling and detached garage and the construction of a new commercial-residential development. The proposed development consists of a 3-storey building with 2 levels of underground parking and a detached 3-storey additional building. The property is located at 10432 Islington Avenue, in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachments 1 and 2.

Report Highlights

- The Owner seeks approval to demolish the existing dwelling and detached garage, and construct a new commercial-residential development consisting of a 3-storey building with 2 levels of underground parking and a detached 3-storey additional building at 10432 Islington Avenue
- The existing dwelling and detached garage are identified as a non-contributing architecture in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies and objectives of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies and objectives of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling and detached garage and the construction of a commercial-residential development consisting of a 3-storey building with 2 storeys of underground parking and a detached 3-storey additional building, located at 10432 Islington Avenue, under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- c) That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official; and
- d) A demolition permit for the removal of the existing building and detached garage shall not be issued until a Building Permit has been obtained for the construction of the proposed commercial-residential development consisting of a 3-storey building with 2 storeys of underground parking and a detached 3-storey additional building in accordance with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Background

The subject property has two existing distinct built structures, both considered non-contributing architecture within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan').

The south building is a one-storey ranch-style house dating from around 1970. The exterior wall finish is a textured red coloured low crenelated (upper and lower concrete coping sections, similar to a castle) brick wall, with a pitched roof. The building is set well back from Islington Avenue.

There are various window types, including bottom sliders under fixed upper panes, which replaced larger original sliding sashes. A wide brick chimney projects from a low-pitched roof at the south end. Gable ends are clad in vertical aluminum siding. Soffits are clad in stained wood. Gutters and downspouts are conventional modern aluminum profiles. The existing asphalt shingle roof has been replaced with a red tile roof to match the adjacent north building.

The north building, constructed around 1950, is a painted brick garage with three overhead doors and pitched roof, with a walk-out basement area to the west. It is set well back from Islington Avenue. All three original overhead doors have been replaced by new glazed aluminum overhead doors. The opening for the overhead door furthest north has been raised to accommodate a taller overhead door (6 panels high).

The original asphalt shingles have been replaced with textured roof tiles with aluminum soffits, gutters and downspouts. The exterior walls original brick veneer finish has been covered in stucco. The rear or west side of the building is 2-storeys with two glazed overhead doors on the lower level and three aluminum windows on the upper level. There is a brick chimney located in the centre of the rear wall of the building.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the KNHCD Plan.

The following is an analysis of the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling and detached garage and the new construction of a commercial-residential development consisting of a 3-storey building with 2 levels of underground parking and a detached 3-storey additional building, located at 10432 Islington Avenue according to the KNHCD guidelines.

6.3 POLICIES FOR NEW DEVELOPMENT

New development should complement and enhance the heritage character of the District. New buildings should be sympathetic in siting, scale, material, texture, and general design to the heritage buildings around them.

- *New development should be limited to vacant sites or to sites currently occupied by unsympathetic buildings. Even the most skillfully executed heritage-friendly building cannot replace the value of a real heritage building*
- *New development within the District should be consistent with the Guidelines in Section 9.5*

The proposed new construction replaces two non-contributing buildings on the subject property. Staff finds that the overall architectural composition of the proposed buildings is in keeping with the commercial and residential architectural styles prevalent in the KNHCD. In addition, the proposed building presents a functional and playful streetscape elevation that engages with its immediate surroundings.

9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW

The overall heritage character of the District is composed of buildings, streetscapes, landscapes, and vistas. This overall character has more significance than any individual building, even if it is one of the finest. Within the design of any individual building, architectural elements contribute to the character of the public realm of the

street. Massing, materials, scale, proportions, rhythm, composition, texture, and siting all contribute to the perception of whether or not a building fits its context. Different settings within the district have different characters of siting, landscaping and streetscaping.

New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style. Research should be conducted so that the style chosen is executed properly, with suitable proportions, decoration, and detail. The following guidelines, describing the dominant elements that contribute to the heritage character of the District, are divided according to the principal settings found in the District.

The proposed architectural style for the new construction is respectful of the materials and design language of the chosen architectural style and conforms with the requirements of the KNHCD Plan. The proposed development employs heights and volumes consistent with new current construction industry standards, yet the appearance maintains the look and feel of the village commercial architecture setting. In particular, the rhythm of the façade projects the aesthetic of individuality as small lateral scale and a vertical composition as if to suggest infill architecture interventions.

9.8.4 ISLINGTON AVENUE COMMERCIAL CORE

The Islington Avenue Commercial Core means the commercially zoned properties within the Kleinburg Village Core, which front on Islington Avenue and Nashville Road. This area contains almost all of the commercial uses in the District, and they comprise a mixture of locally oriented and tourism-oriented businesses. Tourism generates cyclical parking loads, varying by season and day of the week, and the road allowance has been called on to provide overflow parking spaces above those provided on-site by the commercial uses. In addition, modern requirements call for amenities and equipment that were not present in the historical village. The design of road allowance presents special challenges if it is to preserve and enhance the heritage character of the Commercial Core. The intent of this Plan is to enhance the quality of the Commercial Core as a pedestrian-friendly village shopping environment.

Principles

Early 20th-century photographs of the District show streetscapes very different from today's. An accurate 'historical reproduction' of Kleinburg Village would exclude automobiles, paving, lighting, highway signs, bollards, and benches. It's obvious that a lively commercial district requires all of these things, some of them- because they enable and enhance public use and commercial activity in the village core, many of them because regulations and standards govern the design of traffic systems, lighting levels, and so on. There is an inherent historical ambiguity in a Heritage District that

must be dealt with in the evaluation of the design of these modern installations. The following principles apply to such an evaluation:

- 1. Accept the automotive streetscape: As the list of modern artifacts above shows, the automobile and its infrastructure account for much of the visible non-heritage installations in the District. There is a built-in division of the streetscape in its historical aspect: it is inescapably modern from curb to curb. Modern accessories like waste receptacles and street lighting should be placed near to the curb, where they form a transition band between the heritage experience of the buildings and the modern experience of the roadway.*
- 2. Don't accentuate non-heritage installations: Human perception is very good at filtering out unimportant and repetitive information. The modern enthusiasm for heritage has produced a host of "old-fashioned" products. Many of these are poorly executed and overly fussy. As a result, they call undeserved attention to themselves and the attention, thus directed, detects the fraud. Often, a very plain modern item will fade into the recesses of perception and be less intrusive than a deliberately "historical" version.*
- 3. Maintain historical integrity: Even when they don't represent an accurate reconstruction, it is important to choose "historical" items in the context of history. For example, the street lighting of 1890 can't be reconstructed because there was none. The designer should bear in mind that Kleinburg and Nashville were modest villages and ask, if the village HAD installed early lighting, what sort of fixtures would have been chosen?" They would have been simple and functional and would not have had the ornate qualities of lighting for a big-city promenade.*

Rather than masking the integration of automobile access and parking requirements on site with the architecture of the building, the design actually embraces and welcomes the requirement through heritage vocabulary form and function: the arched access to the ramp leading to the underground parking structure and the lower level of the site is directly reminiscent of a coach house design. The box window, above the arch, is juxtaposed against the recessed lateral façade that creates a balcony on two levels and is referenced in the horizontal plank siding so as to maintain the consistent material language.

Roof dormers are positioned in a comfortable visual repetition and are dressed in siding as if to detach them from the building through use of a lighter material than the brick of the main structure. End details at the roof, reminiscent of English chimneys, draw attention to the roof and create the illusion of a properly proportioned human-scale smaller country house rather than a typical three-storey commercial building. Lastly, the metal awning and commercial trim at grade speaks of the adaptive reuse of otherwise-residential properties within the District and helps formally differentiate the public realm from the private realm of the upper floors.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:

Exterior Finish: Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent; Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather; Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.

Exterior Detail: Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.

Shopfronts: Wood frames, glazing bars, and panels with glazed wood doors are preferred. Metal shopfronts, detailed and proportioned to be compatible with heritage shopfronts, are acceptable.

Roofs: Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style.

Doors: Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.

Flashings: Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.

Staff finds that the material palette of the proposed design is in direct keeping with the chosen architectural style and is contextually complementary to the adjacent properties and to the neighbourhood at large. The combination of brick and metal framing (and shutters) speak to the commercial aspect and function of the building, while the box window detail, the nearly invisible balcony railing, the window keystones, and the roof frieze dentils speak to the character of an affluent heritage home of its time. The proposed windows present a muntin pattern accurate with the architectural style along the visible streetscape elevations, while the more private two sides of the building play with large fenestration as if to introduce industrial loft interventions into an otherwise classical residential Victorian building.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed commercial-residential development and underground parking conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling and detached garage and the construction of a 3-storey building with

2-storeys of underground parking and a detached 3-storey additional building, located at 10432 Islington Avenue under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Attachments

Attachment 1-10432Islington_Location Map
Attachment 2-10432Islington_Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
Attachment 3-10432Islington_Site Plan
Attachment 4-10432Islington_Floor plans
Attachment 5-10432Islington_Elevations
Attachment 6-10432Islington_Rendering
Attachment 7-10432Islington_Materials
Attachment 8-10432Islington_Landscape Plan
Attachment 9-10432Islington_Arborist Report

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254
Bill Kiru, Acting Director of Development Planning, ext. 8633