

Committee of the Whole (2) Report

DATE: Tuesday, November 10, 2020

WARD(S): 1

**TITLE: DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION – SINGLE
DETACHED DWELLING WITH ATTACHED GARAGE LOCATED
AT 45 NAPIER STREET, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE
CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

FROM:

Nick Spensieri, Deputy City Manager, Infrastructure Development

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling and detached garage and the construction of a detached 2-storey dwelling with underground parking and an attached garage, a pool and a cabana located at 45 Napier Street, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachments 1 and 2.

Report Highlights

- The Owner seeks approval to demolition the existing dwelling and garage, and construct a detached 2-storey dwelling with underground parking and an attached garage, a pool and a cabana located at 45 Napier Street
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan')
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the KNHCD Plan

Recommendation

The Deputy City Manager, Infrastructure Development, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of October 21, 2020 (Item 1, Report No. 7), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the report of the Deputy City Manager, Infrastructure Development, dated October 21, 2020, be approved.

Recommendation and Report of the Deputy City Manager, Infrastructure Development, dated October 21, 2020:

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling, detached garage and the construction of a detached 2-storey dwelling with underground parking and an attached garage, a pool and a cabana located at 45 Napier Street under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- c) That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official; and
- d) A demolition permit for the removal of the existing building and detached garage shall not be issued until a Building Permit has been obtained for the construction of the proposed 2-storey dwelling with underground parking and attached garage in accordance with the KNHCD Plan.

Background

In the Village of Kleinburg, early lots, including 45 Napier, were surveyed and established as lots for residential use but remained undeveloped until the 21st century. A survey of the subject lot in 1848 shows Lot 15 as one of a series of subdivided lots at the northern end of a 'Street' heading north from the 'Road' labelled "to Stegman's Mill", overlooking the East Humber River leading to the Mill Pond for Stegman's Sawmill Pond further north. The subdivision of the lands is noted on the survey as 'Plan of the Village Plot Mount Vernon, Vaughan'. The lot changed ownership a few times for the next 100 years until 2015 when the lot was sold to Dan Marc Investments. A survey of the

property dated March 31, 2015 shows a 1-storey brick dwelling on the property. In 2017 the lot was resold to Willowgate Holdings Limited for redevelopment.

The existing house on the property is a later 20th century ranch style single storey structure with red masonry brick exterior, a low pitch asphalt shingle roof and a 2-car garage facing the entrance drive. The building is categorized in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan as 'Existing Non-Heritage Styles' Ranch House, 1950-1975. The building is presently boarded up and not occupied. There are no significant cultural heritage resources to be avoided or affected by the planned improvements/changes to 45 Napier Street.

There are few individual heritage buildings in the vicinity of 45 Napier Street, but the majority of the houses on Napier are not individually Designated or Listed structures. The lot at 45 Napier Street slopes downward to the east towards the adjacent valley and Stegman's Mill Road. There is existing tall, mature vegetation located on both sides of Stegman's Mill Road in this area that effectively blocks any views of residences located uphill, along Napier Street. There are existing mature evergreen trees on the property located at the side property lines proposed to be removed as part of the redevelopment.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD.

The following is an analysis of the proposed development of a new 2-storey brick clad dwelling with underground parking, attached garage, pool, and a cabana at 45 Napier Street according to the KNHCD guidelines.

9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW states:

"New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style."

Cultural Heritage staff support the design of the replacement building as its proposed scale, massing, proportions and architectural style are compatible for the area. The proposed design will enhance the cultural heritage landscape of the village of Kleinburg in accordance with KNHCD and Vaughan Official Plan 2010 policies, by positioning this recognized architectural style onto a street that is rich with other great examples of heritage styles dominant within the original Kleinburg Village.

9.5.3.1 – RESIDENTIAL VILLAGES – SITE PLANNING states:

"Site new houses to provide setbacks that contrast with adjacent properties, in order to create the variety characteristics of the village".

The proposed dwelling is sited (Attachment 3) to use part of the foundation of the existing house but set closer to the street on the south east corner of the site. Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that the siting of the proposed dwelling reinforces the variety of setbacks characteristic of the village setting.

9.5.3.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE states:

“Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles.”

The proposed Regency Grand Cottage design shown on Attachment 4 conforms to Section 9.5.3.1 with its subtle detailing. The design follows the architectural style front that implies symmetry and classical proportion by balancing the second storey bay window over the garage with a proportional bay window on the ground floor. The painted wood portico with solid-wood main door combined with sidelights enhances the entry. The mullions shown at the front façade double hung windows meet the Regency style being six over six double hung windows. The Owner has provided a satisfactory architectural drawing set to delineates a house which will contribute positively to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan.

9.5.3.2 – Residential Villages – Scale & Massing states:

“A new house should fit in with the scale of its neighbourhood”.

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, which is made up of a variety of 1-storey and 2-storey dwellings. The proposed dwelling will be sited in the same general location as the existing house. The applicant has provided a satisfactory massing, proportions, and style that will contribute to the overall character of the district. The proposed two-storey dwelling and accessory structure (cabana) aligns with local heritage precedents in terms of scale and massing as shown on Attachments 4 and 5 and will contribute to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan.

9.3.8 OUTBUILDINGS FOR HERITAGE BUILDINGS states:

1. *“Connected garages should minimize their street presence.*
2. *Use single-bay garage doors, compatible with traditional designs”.*

The plan includes a double garage connected to the main dwelling with placement on the front façade. The two proposed single-bay garage doors align with historical designs similar to those found in Section 9.3.8 showcasing a paneling division of 1/3 over 2/3 so as to reinforce the human scale of the front elevation. The applicant has provided a satisfactory design contributing to the overall character of the district.

Section 9.5 – The Village Forests states:

“Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees”.

The application includes a satisfactory Tree Inventory and Protection Plan report which details the retention of twelve (12) trees and removal of six (6) trees on the property. Staff are satisfied that the proposed tree removal and subsequent replacement with twenty (20) trees adheres to the guidelines and the City of Vaughan’s Council enacted

Tree Protection By-law 052-2018. The Arborist Report is included as Attachment 8, entitled Tree Inventory & Protection Plan.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:

“Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent; cut stone for trim in brick buildings, slate or simulated slate roofing; painted decorative trim...”

The submission package includes a satisfactory material palette (Attachment 9) comprised of a suitable integration of smooth brick with limestone accents, slate roofing, wood painted trim and details. Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that the proposed material is appropriate for the selected style of building.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed 2-storey dwelling and related works conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition of the existing 1-storey dwelling and construction of a detached 2-storey dwelling with underground parking and an attached garage, a pool and a cabana located at 45 Napier Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Attachments

- Attachment 1-45Napier_Location Map
- Attachment 2-45Napier_Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
- Attachment 3-45Napier_Site Plan
- Attachment 4-45Napier_Elevations
- Attachment 5-45Napier_Sections
- Attachment 6-45Napier_Landscape Plan
- Attachment 7-45Napier_Tree Protection Plan
- Attachment 8-45Napier_Tree Inventory & Protection Plan
- Attachment 9-45Napier_Materials Board

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254
Mauro Peverini, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407

Approved by

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Nick Spensieri', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Nick Spensieri, Deputy City
Manager, Infrastructure
Development

Reviewed by

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Jim Harnum', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Jim Harnum, City Manager