

Committee of the Whole (2) Report

DATE: Wednesday, October 14, 2020

WARD(S): 1

**TITLE: DEMOLITION OF EXISTING STRUCTURES AND
CONSTRUCTION OF A THREE-STOREY MIXED USE BUILDING
WITH UNDERGROUND PARKING AT 10568 ISLINGTON
AVENUE, IN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE
CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

FROM:

Nick Spensieri, Deputy City Manager, Infrastructure Development

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee to approve the application to demolish of the existing principal and secondary dwellings including the detached garage/barn on the subject property; and, for the proposed construction of a 3-storey mixed use development, consisting of 6 ground floor retail units and 16 residential units above, with 32 underground parking spaces on the lands known municipally as 10568 Islington Avenue, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is seeking a recommendation from Heritage Vaughan Committee to approve an application to demolish the existing structures at 10568 Islington Avenue and for a proposed 3-storey mixed-use development, consisting of 6 ground floor retail units and 16 residential units above, with 32 underground parking spaces
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan')
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the KNHCD Plan

Recommendation

The Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of September 16, 2020 (Item 1, Report No. 6), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the report of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated September 16, 2020, be approved subject to the addition of the following:
 - d) That a demolish permit shall not be issued for the property until a building permit has been issued for a new building, in accordance with the Kleinburg Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Recommendation and Report of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated September 16, 2020:

That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend THAT Council approve an application to demolish the existing dwelling, detached garage and a proposed 3-storey mixed-use development, consisting of 6 ground floor retail units and 16 residential units above, with 32 underground parking space at 10568 Islington Avenue under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, to be determined at the discretion of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application; and
- c) That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official.

Background

The subject property at 10568 Islington Avenue in Kleinburg holds three buildings. It is not listed in the Vaughan Heritage Inventory other than as being within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District. The Owner of 10576 Islington Avenue believes the house on the subject property, the building at 10454 Islington Avenue, and the one at 40 Nashville Road were all moved to their present village sites from Howland's Mill where they may have been workers' housing (referenced by Paul Oberst Architect, co-author of the KNHCD Plan). The historical background research described in the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment ('CHIA') notes there was a sequence of

blacksmiths operating on the property for about 50 years, but there is no documentation noting all of the blacksmiths used the same building, or any particular building.

The 1861 census lists a 1-1/2 storey frame house on the property, used as the principal dwelling; it has the general form of vernacular Loyalist cottage, but is much altered and with a large modern 2-storey addition and 1-storey connecting element. Other than the general form, there are no historic features visible on the exterior of the original house. There is a very small 1-storey stucco secondary dwelling of an undetermined date. At the extreme southwest corner of the property is a 3-bay flat-roofed garage, built onto the front of a barn or drive shed.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District PLAN (KNHCD').

The following is an analysis of the proposal to demolish the existing structures at 10568 Islington Avenue and construct 3-storey mixed-use development, consisting of 6 ground floor retail units and 16 residential units above, with 32 underground parking spaces, as shown on Attachments 3 to 7, in consideration of the KNHCD guidelines.

9.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLES

Architectural style is a term used to refer to the identifying characteristics of construction as it has evolved under the force of changing technology and fashion. Before the industrial age, even minor details were custom-made for each building and it would be hard to find even two identical front door designs from the early 19th century. Nonetheless, each period produced buildings that shared a design vocabulary, including elements of massing, composition, proportions, window and door details, and decorative elements. This section shows the principal styles that have appeared in the Kleinburg Nashville community, both heritage styles and more recent ones.

The proposed development is designed in the style of a 19th Century Inn, being one of the approved and recognized styles within the KNHCD Plan. Cultural Heritage staff support the proposed architectural design, as it contributes positively to the overall character of the KNHCD.

9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW

“New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style.”

Cultural Heritage staff support the design of the proposed replacement building as its scale, massing proportions and architectural style are suitable to the area and will enhance the cultural heritage landscape of Islington Avenue in accordance with KNHCD policies (as shown on Attachment 5).

9.5.3.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE

“Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles.”

The proposed “19th Century Inn” style includes a gable roof, attic dormers and a full-length porch along the front façade. Staff are satisfied the proposal is reflective of the 19th Century Inn building style with gable roof, repeating dormers and consistent second-storey balcony walk-outs. In addition, the central 19th Century Inn-style building articulates the massing of the façade with distinguishable building portions. This architectural composition is in keeping with the historical architectural proportions of this building type, thus enhancing and reinforcing the KNHCD Plan attributes.

The main body of the building is clad in brick on the ground floor and the central portion of the second floor, and the balance of the upper storeys are clad in lighter materials of horizontal siding and roof shakes appropriate for this architectural style. All components have adequately sized and geometrically positioned repeating dormers contributing positively to the overall character of the KNHCD (as shown on Attachment 4).

9.7.7.3 MANAGING EXISTING WOODLOTS

The District valleys and human settlement areas are largely dominated by trees found as forest blocks. These forests, the dramatic deep valleys, and the generally modest nature of the built form define the landscape character of the District. The forests range in age from mature, semi mature, and immature. Many of the mature district forests contain trees over 100 years of age. These forests provide beauty, abundant wildlife habitat and nourish and protect soils from wind and water erosion.

The proposed building design maximizes all available space on site and incorporates thoughtful landscaping along the streetscape, within the subject property and along the sides and rear of the development. Parking spaces located at grade are arranged to make optimal use of soft landscape plantings, to increase the site’s naturalized potential and conform to the intent of the KNHCD Plan (as shown on Attachment 7).

9.8.4 ISLINGTON AVENUE COMMERCIAL CORE

The Islington Avenue Commercial Core means the commercially zoned properties within the Kleinburg Village Core, which front on Islington Avenue and Nashville Road. This area contains almost all of the commercial uses in the District, and they comprise a mixture of locally oriented and tourism-oriented businesses. The intent of this Plan is to enhance the quality of the Commercial Core as a pedestrian-friendly village shopping environment.

The proposed building and site design incorporate a pedestrian-friendly and welcoming “podium” including grade level access to the proposed commercial units at the ground floor. Access between the raised level platform and the natural existing grade slope of Islington Avenue is accommodated at the north and south corners of the property, and a separate private elevator to the residential units above (as shown on Attachment 3).

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS

“Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent” or “stucco”.

The proposed development employs a historically acceptable materials palette as shown on Attachment 6. The materials include a suitable integration of red brick, stone veneer, horizontal lap siding, and roof shakes cladding noted as acceptable within the KNHCD Plan.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the demolition of the existing structures and the subject lands proposed 3-storey development conforms to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendation to the Committee of the Whole for approval of the proposed demolition of the existing two buildings and detached garage/barn, and for the proposed construction of a 3-storey mixed use development, consisting of 6 ground-floor retail units and 16 residential units above, with 32 underground parking spaces on the lands known municipally as 10568 Islington Avenue, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 10568Islington_Location Map

Attachment 2 – 10568Islington_Heritage Evaluation of Existing Structures

Attachment 3 – 10568Islington_Context Plan

Attachment 4 – 10568Islington_Rendering
Attachment 5 – 10568Islington_Elevations
Attachment 6 – 10568Islington_Materials Palette
Attachment 7 – 10568Islington_Landscape Plan
Attachment 8 – 10568Islington_Arborist Report

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254

Mauro Peverini, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407

Approved by



Nick Spensieri,
Deputy City Manager,
Infrastructure Development

Reviewed by



Jim Harnum, City Manager