Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Monday, May 25, 2020 **WARD(S):** 1

TITLE: DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION – SINGLE DETACHED DWELLING AND DETACHED GARAGE LOCATED AT 645 NASHVILLE ROAD, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:
Bill Kiru, Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee support and recommend to Committee of the Whole the approval of the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling and detached garage, and new construction of a two-storey dwelling with a detached garage for the lands known municipally as 645 Nashville Road, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is seeking approval to demolish an existing dwelling and detached garage and the proposed construction of a new detached two-storey dwelling and detached garage located at 645 Nashville Road.
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ("KNHCD Plan").
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the KNHCD Plan.

Recommendations

That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend THAT Council approve the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling, detached garage and new construction of a detached two-storey dwelling located at 645 Nashville Road under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management;

b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application; and

c) That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official.

Background

The property known municipally as 645 Nashville Road was historically located within the western half of Lot 25, Concession 9 West of Yonge Street in the former Township of Vaughan. The crown patent for the western half of Lot 25, Concession 9 West of Yonge was granted to the Canada Company in 1832. The 100-acre property was sold to William Tedder Sr. in 1839, a farmer who was born in England, who built a farmhouse on the western edge of the lot near modern-day Huntingdon Road. Nashville Road has already been constructed on the eastern edge of the lot. Between 1871 and 1892, William Tedder Sr. and his wife granted small parts of the lot to the Toronto Grey Bruce Railway and parts to other members of the Tedder family, including his son William Tedder Jr. The 1878 Illustrated County Atlas shows William Tedder (though it is not clear which one) as the owner of the lot. The aforementioned Toronto Grey Bruce Railway is depicted through the middle of the lot. Kleinburg Station is depicted on the map as well.

Thomas Tedder, the executor of William Tedder Sr.'s estate, sold 87 acres of the lot to James H. Barons in 1909. The *1911 Census* notes that Barons was a farmer. Barons owned the property until 1950 when he passed it to his son, Russell E. Barons. The land was then subdivided in 1952 (Plan 4258). The subject property, Lot 8, changed hands several times in the mid-1950s before Henry and Iva Paul became the owners in 1955 and lived on the property until 1990. From aerial photographs, it can be assumed that the house on the subject property was built between 1955 and 1962, soon after the Paul family took ownership of the property in the mid-1950s.

The residential building at 645 Nashville Road is a one-storey structure on a concrete block foundation with an asphalt shingled-clad hip and valley roof with front facing gable, clad in white and red brick with vinyl siding beneath the gable. There is also a one-storey garage addition on the west elevation clad in vinyl siding.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District PLAN (KNHCD').

The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the KNHCD guidelines.

As previously noted in this report, the Owner of the property at 645 Nashville Road is proposing to replace the existing dwelling and detached garage with a two-storey brick-and-stone clad house located in approximately the same position as the existing main structure, and a 3-car detached garage as shown on Attachment 3.

9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW *states:*
"New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style."

Cultural Heritage staff support the design of the replacement building as its proposed scale and massing proportions and architectural style are suitable to the area and will enhance the cultural heritage landscape of Nashville Road between the village of Kleinburg and the hamlet of Nashville in accordance with KNHCD and Vaughan Official Plan 2010 policies.

9.5.3.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE *states:*
"Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles."

The proposed Loyalist Cottage style design presents a solid main body of the house flanked by two apparent additions (to each side): one housing a residential dwelling space and the other comprised of the three-car garage as two distinctly separate architectural bodies set back from the line of the front elevation of the "main building". This architectural composition is in keeping with the historical progression of additions to a typical stone cottage, thus enhancing and reinforcing the Heritage Conservation District attributes.

The main body of the house is clad in heavy stone, as is prevalent for this architectural style, whilst the two flanking additions are clad in a more dainty and appropriate brick

sitting on a stone foundation. All components have adequately sized and geometrically-positioned dormers, which contribute positively to the overall character of the KNHCD.

9.5.3.2 – Residential Villages – Scale & Massing *states:*
"A new house should fit in with the scale of its neighbourhood".

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, which is made up of one-storey and two-storey dwellings. The proposed dwelling and semi-detached garage will be situated in the same area as the existing dwelling and garage. The Owner has provided a satisfactory massing, proportions, and style that will contribute to the overall character of the KNHCD, as shown on Attachment 4.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:
"Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent" or "stucco".

The proposed project employs a historically acceptable Materials Palette as shown on Attachment 6. The proposal comprises a suitable integration of red brick, stone veneer, garage doors, front door and window detailing noted as acceptable within the KNHCD.

9.3.8 Outbuildings for Heritage Buildings *states:*
"Use single-bay garage doors, compatible with traditional designs".

The plan includes a semi-detached three-car garage set back in two stages from the main body's front wall line. The proposed single-bay garage doors align with historical designs like those found in Section 9.3.8 of the KNHCD Plan guidelines. The Owner has provided a satisfactory design that will contribute to the overall character of the district.

9.9.1 THE VILLAGE FORESTS – OVERVIEW
"Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees".

An inventory and general health assessment were performed for all trees located on and within six (6) metres of the property line. The application includes a satisfactory Tree Inventory and Protection Plan. Staff are satisfied the proposal adheres to the guidelines and the City of Vaughan's Council endorsed By-law 052-2018 and Tree Protection Protocol. The Arborist Report is included as Attachment 8.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed works conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendation to Committee of the Whole for approval of the proposed demolition of the existing single storey dwelling and detached garage and proposed new construction of a two-storey dwelling and 3-car semi-detached garage on the lot at 645 Nashville Road under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 645Nashville_Location Map
Attachment 2 – 645Nashville_Cultural Heritage Impact Statement
Attachment 3 – 645Nashville_Site Plan
Attachment 4 – 645Nashville_Renderings
Attachment 5 – 645Nashville_Elevations
Attachment 6 – 645Nashville_Architectural Materials Board
Attachment 7 – 645Nashville_Landscape Plan
Attachment 8 – 645Nashville_Arborist Report

Prepared by

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813
Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254
Mauro Peverini, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407