

# HERITAGE VAUGHAN REPORT

---

**DATE:** Wednesday, June 10, 2020

**WARD(S):** 1

**TITLE: REPLACEMENT OF WINDOWS AND PAINTING OF THE  
ARTHUR MCNEIL HOUSE, A DESIGNATED PART IV  
PROPERTY AT 10499 ISLINGTON AVENUE, KLEINBURG-  
NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

**FROM:**

Bill Kiru, Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

**ACTION:** FOR INFORMATION

---

**Purpose**

To provide information to the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding the proposed replacement of all windows and painting of the Arthur McNeil House, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*; and, to seek support from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the Recommendation in this report.

**Report Highlights**

- The Owner is proposing to replace all windows and paint the exterior of the Arthur McNeil House, located at 10499 Islington Avenue
- The building is identified as a Designated Property under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and a contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan') under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*
- Heritage Vaughan Committee consideration is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*; City Council approval is not required

**Recommendation**

THAT the presentation from Cultural Heritage staff on the proposed replacement of all windows and painting of the exterior of the Arthur McNeil House located at 10499 Islington Avenue under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act* BE RECEIVED, and the

Owner provide a “scoped Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment report” limited to the architectural value and attributes of the windows (existing and proposed) to support support the simplification of the proposed window pattern.

## **Background**

The house originally constructed on Lot 14 in Concession 6 (see Attachment 1) belonged to Arthur McNeil and his descendants for 150 years, from the early 1830's until 1987. It was first occupied by Arthur (1801-1880), an Irish-born Scottish Presbyterian who immigrated to York County from County Craven about 1820. The recollection of family members placed the acquisition of the farm by Arthur McNeil and his brother, Alexander (1796-1859), circa 1832. A construction date at the time of 1832 may be based on several factors, none as yet substantiated, apart from architectural style.

Following the death of Arthur McNeil in 1880, the residence and farmland were left to his oldest son, Charles McNeil, who farmed Lot 14 alone until 1902. In 1902, Charles McNeil was joined on the homestead by his nephew, Arthur Livingston McNeil (son of Andrew McNeil) and his wife, Elizabeth. Following the death of Charles in 1917, Arthur Livingston McNeil purchased the property from the executors of the estate for \$15,000.

According to land records, after Livingston died, Lot 14 was held by his widow, but occupied by his nephew, Alexander McNeil, his wife and five children. In 1969 Charles, Donald, Catherine, Michael, and Anne McNeil acquired joint ownership of the property. In 1984 and 1987, the remainder of the lot, including the residence was sold, ending over 150 years of continuous occupancy by members of the McNeil family.

In October 1981, the Arthur McNeil House was moved from its original location off Weston Road, south of Rutherford Road, to its current location at the northeast corner of Islington Avenue and Kellam Street in Kleinburg (shown on Attachment 1). This property represents a small portion of Lot 24, Concession 8 and is municipally known as 10499 Islington Avenue. The City of Vaughan designated the property under Part IV S.29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* ('OHA') in 1988, under By-law 39-88 (see Attachment 2). The subject property is also designated under Part V of the of the OHA as part of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and is identified as a significant heritage property.

## **Previous Reports/Authority**

There are no previous reports.

## **Analysis and Options**

The requirement for a Heritage Review of the proposed “maintenance” alterations require the submission of a number of documents including a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (‘CHIA’) generated by an independent third-party heritage professional with no vested interest in the work, and architectural drawings showing existing and proposed extent of alterations. These two documents must work together to describe the vision of the proposal, and to document the intent to preserve the heritage resource. The proposed exterior alterations include new paint on all exterior wall surfaces, and window replacements to replicate existing heritage style windows. These alterations require the consideration of the Heritage Vaughan Committee, as outlined under the OHA.

### **1. Architectural Description (direct excerpt from By-law 39-88)**

The Arthur McNeil House is a 1-1/2-storey horizontal plank structure with clapboard cladding. The simple yet elegant Georgian residence is distinguished by its elaborate entrance and the retention of original sashes in the ground floor windows.

The façade, which now faces west onto Islington Avenue, is functional yet graceful, with a centered door and carefully spaced windows. Ornament, restrained throughout, is concentrated on the entrance. A single-leaf door with four panels is flanked by sidelights with 6-over-4 sliding sashes and plain aprons. The classical entry is distinguished by four moulded pilasters of the Carpenter's Tuscan variety which separate the door and sidelights from one another while simultaneously unifying the whole. The capitals of the pilasters are formed by projections of the moulded cornice. Two double-hung windows with 12-over-12 sashes are symmetrically arranged on each side of the entrance. Simple architrave moulding and plain wooden slip sills define all windows.

The south elevation, flanking Kellam Street, features one window in the lower storey identical to those on the main facade. In the half-storey, two windows reduced in size and containing two panes per sash, are symmetrically arranged.

On the north elevation, the arrangement of the fenestration is similar to that found on the south except that two windows, with 9-over-4 sashes, are present in both storeys.

The rear (east) elevation is symmetrically arranged with an unadorned door centered in the wall space and, to the left, a window with 12-over-12 sash. Prior to the relocation of the building, the 1-1/2 story wing was removed, although its gable roofline and evidence of two doors, one per storey, remain.

The clapboard siding is anchored by corner boards. An open single-storey, three-sided, wrap verandah, removed in order to transport the building, was replaced and extends to protect the rear elevation. The retention of the upper door on the east elevation serves as a reminder of the location of its former kitchen wing.

The Arthur McNeil House is a fine example of a Georgian farmhouse constructed for a man of community stature. Current plans for restoration will ensure that the early 19th century appearance of the building will be preserved.

Architectural elevations showing existing conditions shown on Attachment 3 (submitted by Owners in May 2011).

## **2. Proposed Renovations**

The building is being renovated for occupancy by a new tenant, after serving as a Starbucks Coffee shop from August 2011 to February 2020. The Owner, in agreement with the new tenants, are proposing to restore the original historic appearance of the building as identified in heritage photographs and exploratory work.

The Owner is proposing to replace all of the existing windows with new slightly simplified muntin pattern windows. The proposed pattern does not match the existing pattern and does not conform to the protection conditions of By-law 39-88 (described in Attachment 2). The proposed window frame colour is ebony.

Additionally, the Owner proposes to paint the building in a shade of white similar to that of the original paint of the house (based on exploratory notes). The existing porch floorboards are also to be painted. Refer to the proposed colours in Attachment 6.

## **3. Review and Comments**

Cultural Heritage staff has reviewed available historical documentation and Owner-provided information and provide the following comments regarding the proposed renovations:

The proposed window replacement must be keeping with the existing window style and therefore should be visually seamless and a functional improvement. Staff does not consider the simplification of the window pattern (as shown on Attachment 5) to be acceptable and note the window muntin pattern must replicate and respect the heritage pattern of the existing windows as required by By-law 39-88. Cultural Heritage staff do not support the proposed change to the window pattern, in the absence of a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment ('CHIA') and architectural drawings. Cultural Heritage staff cannot take on the responsibility of disregarding the Provincial Designation of heritage attributes (replacement of the windows) without third-party professional instructions on the effects of changing the characteristics of defined heritage elements, and without the appropriate architectural drawings.

The casement and trims shall be in keeping with the existing trim and mouldings of the building, as specified on Attachment 4. Staff can support the proposed window trim colour and the mouldings.

Staff also support the proposed paint colours for the house and porch, as the extent of this work is considered to be maintenance work and is compliant with the requirements of the OHA, and the protection levels of By-law 39-88. Staff is of the opinion the exterior paint will not diminish or detract from the heritage value of the building.

### **Financial Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

### **Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations**

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

### **Conclusion**

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed specifications for paint and windows conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan, subject to the Owner providing a “scoped CHIA report” limited to the architectural value and attributes of the windows (existing and proposed) in context of the heritage value of the house, to support the simplification of the window muntin pattern as proposed without causing negative effects on the greater heritage value of the Designated property.

Accordingly, at this time staff can support only the proposed exterior paint alterations to the Arthur McNeil House located at 10499 Islington Avenue under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and accept the technical specifications of the proposed windows but not the proposed muntin pattern as shown on Attachment 5.

**For more information**, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

### **Attachments**

1. Attachment 1 – 10499 Islington – Location Map
2. Attachment 2 – 10499 Islington – By-law 39-88
3. Attachment 3 – 10499 Islington – Existing Building Elevations
4. Attachment 4 – 10499 Islington – Marvin Window Specifications
5. Attachment 5 – 10499 Islington – Proposed Window Pattern
6. Attachment 6 – 10499 Islington – Proposed Paint Colours

### **Prepared by**

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254

Mauro Peverini, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407