

Committee of the Whole (2) Report

DATE: Tuesday, June 16, 2020

WARD(S): 1

TITLE: DEMOLITION OF EXISTING BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION OF IDENTICAL REPLICA BUILDING AT 99 NASHVILLE ROAD, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Bill Kiru, Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the approval of the proposed demolition of the existing two-storey structure, and new construction of a nearly-identical replica two-storey structure for the lands known municipally as 99 Nashville Road, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is seeking approval to demolish an existing two-storey structure, and to construct a new nearly-identical replica two-storey structure located at 99 Nashville Road.
- The existing building is a “contributing structure” but has been confirmed through a structural condition assessment to be in an irreparable condition, thereby posing a structural hazard in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.
- The proposal strives for the new building to replicate its original contributing characteristics and is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan.
- Staff supports approval of the proposal.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council Approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Recommendations

The Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of May 25, 2020 (Item 4, Report No. 3), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 25, 2020, be approved.

Recommendation and Report of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 25, 2020:

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of the existing building and new construction of an architectural replica two-storey building located at 99 Nashville Road under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management.
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.
 1. That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official.

Background

The subject property, municipally known as 99 Nashville Road, is part of a larger development that also incorporates 89 Nashville Road. It is located on the south side of Nashville Road, east of Highway 27 (Attachment 1) within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District within the Village of Kleinburg.

There were three structures on the joint properties: this heavily altered Ontario Gothic Cottage building at 99 Nashville Road, a Georgian house at 89 Nashville Road, and a small barn which straddled the south property line. The current location of the two dwellings is shown on Attachment 4, and the outbuilding is located on southern edge of 99 Nashville Road and is visible along the east side of Highway 27.

The initial state of the dwelling, prior to the Heritage Vaughan presentation in May 2019, was already one of advanced disrepair – but due to repeated vandalism over the course

of several months in 2019, this building has been extensively damaged to a point of irreparable condition, and now poses a structural risk. A complete structural assessment report is included (Attachment 2) as part of this report.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD').

The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the KNHCD guidelines.

As noted previously in this report, the Owner of the property at 89/99 Nashville Road is proposing to replace the existing two-storey building on the property with an architectural replica two-storey building located in the same position as the existing structure, as shown on Attachment 4.

5.1 THE OVERALL GOAL

The overall goal of the Heritage District Plan is to ensure the retention of the District's heritage resources and to guide change so that it contributes to and does not detract from the District's architectural, historical, and contextual character.

The proposed reconstruction adheres to and respects the fundamental goal of the KNHCD by rebuilding the structure to the closest possible details of the original building, thus reinforcing the contributing architectural qualities of the subject property.

5.2.2 HERITAGE BUILDINGS

- 1. To retain and conserve the buildings identified in the Heritage District Plan as having heritage importance to the district.*
- 2. To conserve distinguishing original features, qualities, and character of heritage buildings and to avoid the removal or alteration of any such features.*
- 3. To encourage the corrections of unsympathetic alterations made over the years to heritage buildings.*
- 4. To encourage restoration of heritage buildings based on historical, archival, and pictorial evidence.*
- 5. To encourage continuing use and habitation of heritage buildings in order to maintain their economic viability.*

6. *To promote retention and reuse of heritage buildings and to take exceptional measures to prevent their demolition.*
7. *To encourage interior and exterior maintenance to preserve heritage buildings from damage or destruction from weather or fire.*

The proposed reconstruction accounts for the requirements listed under 5.2.2 *Heritage Buildings* in the KNHCD Plan, by replacing the existing severely damaged building with a reconstruction that can identify with and contribute to the architectural and Cultural Heritage fabric of the KNHCD.

9.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLES

Architectural style is a term used to refer to the identifying characteristics of construction as it has evolved under the force of changing technology and fashion. Before the industrial age, even minor details were custom-made for each building and it would be hard to find even two identical front door designs from the early 19th century. Nonetheless, each period produced buildings that shared a design vocabulary, including elements of massing, composition, proportions, window and door details, and decorative elements. This section shows the principal styles that have appeared in the Kleinburg Nashville community, both heritage styles and more recent ones.

...Additions and alterations to an existing heritage building should be consistent with the style of the original building. New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a particular style, rather than a hybrid one. Recent developments have tended to use hybrid designs, with inauthentic details and proportions; for larger homes, the French manor or château style (not indigenous to Ontario) has been heavily borrowed from. These kinds of designs are not appropriate for the District.

This project bridges the “conservation” aspects of heritage architecture and the new development requirements of constructing within a Heritage Conservation District. The proposed building reinforces the purity of the original architecture of the building from the 1880s by directly replicating the design vocabulary, architectural massing, composition, and window and door details. In addition, it responds to the alterations and new development guidelines by remaining true to the authentic vernacular style of the street and the KNHCD and by maintaining an architectural language and proportions consistent with the original architecture.

9.4.1.1 HISTORICAL CONVERSION

In some cases, a modern building may be altered in a way that gives it the appearance of an older building. A historical conversion should have the integrity of an historical architectural style. This approach means considerably more than sticking on

a few pieces of historical decoration; it may require considerable new construction to achieve an appropriate appearance.

Guidelines:

- *Additions and alterations using the Historical Conversion approach should rely on a local heritage style described in Section 9.2. Use of a style should be consistent in materials, scale, detail, and ornament.*
- *Although most additions should be modest in comparison to the original building, the Historical Conversion approach may call for substantial additions in front of and on top of the existing building.*
- *Additions should avoid destruction of existing mature trees.*

This proposed reconstruction can be viewed as a “historical conversion” from the standpoint of the governing intent of returning the architectural integrity to its initial proportions and aesthetic. The proposed building relies on and conforms to the local heritage style of the original building proper, first, as well as to the “contributing building” characteristics of its immediate surroundings. The added height addresses the contemporary needs to make it a habitable dwelling by current standards.

9.5.3.3 SCALE AND MASSING

New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots. Note: It is recommended in Section 7 that the zoning by-law be amended to recognize the smaller scale of historic village development as contrasted with modern suburban development.

Guidelines:

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the generous side yards typical in the villages. As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1 ½ storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.*

Despite being a new building, the new construction is designed specifically to replicate the previous structure on the subject property. The replication of the building’s characteristics is thorough and consistent; materials, scale, detail and ornament, accurately reflect the qualities of the original style. In particular, windows, doors, trim, and decoration are meticulously and properly detailed.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:

Exterior Finish:

- *Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent*

- *Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather.*
- *Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.*

Exterior Detail: *Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.*

Shopfronts: *Wood frames, glazing bars, and panels with glazed wood doors are preferred. Metal shopfronts, detailed and proportioned to be compatible with heritage shopfronts, are acceptable.*

Roofs: *Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style.*

Doors: *Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*

Flashings: *Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.*

The proposed architectural replica employs building materials that conform to the KNHCD Guidelines, and in some instances exceed the minimum requirements for heritage conservation and restoration identified by the Ministry of Heritage, Sport, Tourism and Culture Industries, by introducing modern components that have improved lifecycle performance qualities over the original materials.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed works conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendation to Committee of the Whole for approval of the proposed demolition of the existing two-storey building and construction of an architectural replica two-storey building on the lot at 99 Nashville Road under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 99 Nashville_Location Map

Attachment 2 – 99 Nashville_Structural Condition Assessment report

Attachment 3 – 99 Nashville_Existing Conditions Photos

Attachment 4 – 99 Nashville_Site Plan

Attachment 5 – 99 Nashville_Colour Renderings

Attachment 6 – 99 Nashville_Elevations

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254

Mauro Peverini, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407