

Committee of the Whole (2) Report

DATE: Tuesday, June 16, 2020

WARD(S): 1

**TITLE: DEMOLITION OF EXISTING STRUCTURES AND
CONSTRUCTION OF A TWO STOREY SINGLE-FAMILY
DWELLING, ATTACHED GARAGE AND TWO ACCESSORY
BUILDINGS 79 VALLEYVIEW COURT, KLEINBURG-
NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

FROM:

Bill Kiru, Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the approval of the proposed demolition of an existing single detached dwelling and accessory buildings, and the construction of a new two-storey single detached dwelling for the lands known municipally as 79 Valleyview Court, Kleinburg, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The proposed construction also includes an attached garage, underground parking, surface parking, inground pool, cabana and gazebo structure (Attachments 4-7).

Report Highlights

- The Owner is seeking approval to demolish the existing structures and construct a new two-storey single detached dwelling, attached garage, cabana and gazebo at 79 Valleyview Court
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan')
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan
- Staff recommends approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the KNHCD Plan
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval for the proposal is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*

Recommendations

The Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of May 25, 2020 (Item 6, Report No. 3), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 25, 2020, be approved.

Recommendation and Report of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 25, 2020:

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of the existing structures and construction of a two-storey single detached dwelling, attached garage, cabana and gazebo located at 79 Valleyview Court under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

1. Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management.
2. That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any development application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.
3. That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department.

Background

The subject property is located on Valleyview Court which contains 12 existing homes, none of which appear to have any historical value. A majority of the buildings also appear to have been built in the 1970s or later. The subject property is adjacent to a non-regulated property under the KNHCD. Lands to the south and west, including the adjacent properties on Ava Place, Nightfall Court, Northern Pines Boulevard, Sprucewood Trail, as well as the community of new custom homes on the west side of Stevenson Avenue are located outside the KNHCD Plan boundary.

The existing dwelling at 79 Valleyview Court was constructed in the 1970's and is indistinguishable from a typical dwelling of its era. The front elevation of the building includes stone on the first floor and prefinished aluminum siding on the second floor. Second floor windows are rectangular with shutters on each side. The rear (south side) elevation of the dwelling is brick veneer with prefinished aluminum siding on the second

floor and a gable roof. Two second floor windows have prefinished aluminum awnings mounted above them. The three-car garage located on the west side of the dwelling is a combination of brick with stone accents.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development in consideration of the guidelines in the KNHCD Plan

The Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing single detached dwelling and accessory buildings, and to construct a new two-storey single detached dwelling with a five (5) car attached garage, an eight (8) car underground parking structure, surface parking at the front and side of the dwelling, inground pool, cabana and gazebo structure, as shown on Attachments 4-7. The proposed cabana is attached to the main dwelling by a covered walkway and by an underground connection. The existing tennis court is intended to remain.

5.1 THE OVERALL GOAL

The overall goal of the Heritage District Plan is to ensure the retention of the District's heritage resources and to guide change so that it contributes to and does not detract from the District's architectural, historical, and contextual character.

5.2.4 THE VALLEY SETTING

To preserve and enhance the experience of the rural and natural character of the Kleinburg-Nashville setting.

5.2.5 FUTURE DEVELOPMENT IN THE DISTRICT

- *to encourage new development that will enhance the heritage character of the District as infill construction on vacant lands and replacement construction or alterations to non-heritage buildings.*
- *to guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within.*

In consideration of goals 5.1, 5.2.4 and 5.2.5 above, Cultural Heritage staff support the proposal as it enhances the overall natural and built character of the area while providing for contemporary needs.

6.3 POLICIES FOR NEW DEVELOPMENT

New development should complement and enhance the heritage character of the District. New buildings should be sympathetic in siting, scale, material, texture, and general design to the heritage buildings around them.

- *New development should be limited to vacant sites or to sites currently occupied by unsympathetic buildings. Even the most skillfully executed heritage-friendly building cannot replace the value of a real heritage building*
- *New development within the District should be consistent with the Guidelines in Section 9.5*

Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied with the proposed new dwelling as it complements and enhances the heritage character of the area through a variation in massing, and articulation of additions-over-time appearance of the building, inferring a character of architectural evolution. The existing dwelling is identified as a non-contributing / unsympathetic building within the KNHCD Plan.

9.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLES

Architectural style is a term used to refer to the identifying characteristics of construction as it has evolved under the force of changing technology and fashion. Before the industrial age, even minor details were custom-made for each building and it would be hard to find even two identical front door designs from the early 19th century. Nonetheless, each period produced buildings that shared a design vocabulary, including elements of massing, composition, proportions, window and door details, and decorative elements. This section shows the principal styles that have appeared in the Kleinburg Nashville community, both heritage styles and more -recent ones. This section is necessarily brief and does not replace the real research needed for work in the District, as described in Sections 9.3.2 and 9.5.1.

In the Guidelines that follow, reference is made to architectural styles for all types of buildings in the District: existing heritage buildings, existing non-heritage buildings, and new development.

Additions and alterations to an existing heritage building should be consistent with the style of the original building. New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a particular style, rather than a hybrid one. Recent developments have tended to use hybrid designs, with inauthentic details and proportions; for larger homes, the French manor or château style (not indigenous to Ontario) has been heavily borrowed from. These kinds of designs are not appropriate for the District.

This project bridges the “conservation” aspects of heritage architecture and the new development requirements of constructing within a designated Heritage Conservation District. The proposed building reinforces the purity of the original architecture of the vernacular farmstead, most closely building on the purity of design of the “ranch house” from the mid 1930’s.

9.4.1.1 HISTORICAL CONVERSION

In some cases, a modern building may be altered in a way that gives it the appearance of an older building. A historical conversion should have the integrity of an historical architectural style. This approach means considerably more than sticking on a few pieces of historical decoration; it may require considerable new construction to achieve an appropriate appearance.

Guidelines:

- *Additions and alterations using the Historical Conversion approach should rely on a local heritage style described in Section 9.2. Use of a style should be consistent in materials, scale, detail, and ornament*
- *Although most additions should be modest in comparison to the original building, the Historical Conversion approach may require substantial additions in front of and on top of the existing building*
- *Additions should be designed to avoid destruction of existing mature trees where feasible*

In reviewing the subject property against Ontario Regulation 9/06 (which outlines the criteria for designation) the following applies:

- The existing buildings do not have design or architectural uniqueness value
- The existing buildings do not have historical value or associative value
- The existing buildings have contextual value limited only to being located within a streetscape that contains several other bungalows with mature and personalized landscape treatment

Cultural Heritage staff has reviewed the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment submitted with the proposal and concurs with the conclusions that there are no historical architectural features in the existing buildings. Cultural Heritage staff conclude the current single detached dwelling does not merit retention for the purpose of historical conservation or conversion.

9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW

The overall heritage character of the District is composed of buildings, streetscapes, landscapes, and vistas. This overall character has more significance than any individual building, even if that building is one of the finest. Within the design of any individual building, architectural elements contribute to the character of the public realm of the street. Massing, materials, scale, proportions, rhythm, composition, texture, and siting all contribute to the perception of whether or not a building fits its context. Different settings within the district have different characters of siting, landscaping and streetscaping.

New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style. Research should be conducted so that the style chosen is executed properly, with suitable proportions, decoration, and detail. The following guidelines, describing the dominant elements that contribute to the

heritage character of the District, are divided according to the principal settings found in the District.

Cultural Heritage staff support the proposed design of the new dwelling, as the architectural style and scale is suitable to the area and will enhance the cultural heritage landscape of the valley setting between the village of Kleinburg and the hamlet of Nashville, in accordance with KNHCD Plan and Vaughan Official Plan 2010 policies.

9.5.3.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE

New construction in the residential villages should reflect the historic built form of its neighbours.

Guidelines

- *Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles*
- *Hybrid designs that mix elements from different historical styles are not appropriate. Historical styles that are not indigenous to the area, such as Tudor or French Manot, are not appropriate*
- *Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style*
- *Research the chosen Architectural Style*
- *Use appropriate materials*

Referencing directly from the KNHCD 9.4.2 Context, the Plan identifies valley developments as being predominantly mid-century one-storey houses, varying in design from strongly modernist to the vernacular “ranch style” which sprang from that modernist example. These developments have definite character and are part of the history of the resettlement of the community. In general, consistent with KNHCD Section 9.4.1.2 Contemporary Alteration, the approach in the preservation of modern architecture is more suitable in these areas.

9.5.3.3 SCALE AND MASSING

New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots.

Guidelines

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the generous side yards typical in the villages. As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1 ½-storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.*
- *For garages, see Section 9.3.7 of the KNHCD Plan.*

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, comprised of one and two-storey dwellings. The proposed massing is smaller than the existing dwelling. The

dwelling includes a satisfactory massing, proportions, and style to contribute to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan, as shown on Attachments 4-7.

9.9.2 The Village Forests – CHARACTER

In Kleinburg, the village forest appears to spring from the surrounding wooded valleys. Trees seem to encroach on the street from the valleys beyond, appearing behind, beside, or between the buildings. Even when the planting is deliberate, the size and density of the trees and shrubbery creates a continuity with the surrounding natural environment. Particularly on the residential streets, the buildings seem to live in forest clearings.

Nashville's surroundings are mostly open lands, so the connection is not to the valley woodlands. But the trees within the village are as large and dense as those in Kleinburg. They connect with the mature trees and rich ecology of the old rural roadsides on Nashville Road and Huntington Road, to the north, south, and west.

Guidelines:

- *Preserve a suitable village forest.*
- *Maintain health of mature indigenous tree by pruning and fertilizing.*
- *Over time, remove unhealthy, invasive and non-indigenous species.*
- *Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees.*

An inventory and general health assessment was performed by a qualified professional arborist for all trees (approximately 165) located on and within six (6) metres of the property line. The Application includes an Arborist Report recommending the preservation of approximately 144 trees and removal of 21 trees on the property. Staff are satisfied with the recommendation of the Arborist Report that the proposed tree removal and subsequent replacement with 39 trees adheres to the guidelines and the City of Vaughan's Council endorsed By-law 052-2018 and Tree Protection Protocol. The Arborist Report is included as Attachment 8.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:

Exterior Detail: *Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.*

Roofs: *Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style.*

Doors: *Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*

The proposed construction materials for the dwelling are in keeping with the architectural style and language of the vernacular “ranch style” having minimal deviations consistent with the *KNHCD, Section 9.4.1.2 Contemporary Alteration* approach to the design. The proposed building materials are shown on Attachment 9.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied that the proposed dwelling conforms to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommending to the Committee of the Whole demolition of the existing single detached dwelling and accessory buildings, and the construction a new two-storey single detached dwelling and attached garage, underground parking, surface parking, inground pool, cabana and gazebo structures at 79 Valleyview Court, under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813.

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 79Valleyview_Location Map
Attachment 2 – 79Valleyview_Aerial Plan
Attachment 3 – 79Valleyview_Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
Attachment 4 – 79Valleyview_Site Plan
Attachment 5 – 79Valleyview_Colour Rendering
Attachment 6 – 79Valleyview_Floor Plans
Attachment 7 – 79Valleyview_Building Elevations
Attachment 8 – 79Valleyview_Arborist Report
Attachment 9 – 79Valleyview_Architectural Materials

Prepared by

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813
Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254
Mauro Peverini, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407