

Committee of the Whole (2) Report

DATE: Tuesday, June 16, 2020

WARD(S): 2

TITLE: RENOVATION AND ADDITION – SINGLE DETACHED DWELLING REAR AND SIDE ADDITION WITH GARAGE LOCATED AT 32 ABELL AVENUE, WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Bill Kiru, Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee to demolish an existing rear garage, and renovate the existing dwelling including proposed rear and side two-storey addition with attached garage located at 32 Abell Avenue. This property is located in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachments 1 and 2.

Report Highlights

- The Owner seeks a recommendation for approval to demolish the existing detached garage and renovate the existing dwelling including rear and side two-storey addition with attached garage
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a contributing property in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan ('WHCD Plan')
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the WHCD Plan
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the Woodbridge HCD Plan

Recommendations

The Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of May 25, 2020 (Item 7, Report No. 3), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 25, 2020, be approved.

Recommendation and Report of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 25, 2020:

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposal to demolish the existing detached garage and renovate the existing dwelling including a rear and side two-storey addition with attached garage located at 32 Abell Avenue under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, to be determined at the discretion of the Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- c) That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official.

Background

The residential property at 32 Abell Avenue is Designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as part of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District (2009). The subject property includes a detached two-storey dwelling with a one-storey rear addition and a detached one-storey garage structure. According to the WHCD Plan Inventory the house dates to 1900-1925. It is identified as a contributing building within the WHCD Plan.

The dwelling is set-back from the street (with landscaping between the house and the sidewalk) and has a paved driveway on the east side of the property, leading to a separate one-storey garage structure in the rear.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan

The following is an analysis of the proposed development in consideration of the policies in the WHCD Plan.

The Owner of the property at 32 Abell Avenue is proposing to demolish the existing detached garage located towards the rear of the property, renovate the existing two-storey dwelling and construct a two-storey rear and side addition with an incorporated garage as shown on Attachments 4 and 5.

The WHCD Plan includes the following policies:

5.1 OBJECTIVES

The purpose of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District is to:

- 1. Identify, document, maintain and restore the unique heritage village character of Woodbridge.*
- 2. Conserve contributing buildings, landscapes, monuments and streetscapes.*
- 3. Ensure new designs contribute to the Woodbridge heritage character.*
- 4. Manage any development or redevelopment proposed within the district, in a manner that is sensitive and responsive to all aspects necessary to ensure the protection and conservation of the heritage resources, in order to maintain the village character of the Woodbridge District.*
- 5. Ensure individual heritage structures and landscapes are maintained, and new development or redevelopment sensitively integrated, as part of a comprehensive district.*
- 6. Maintain Woodbridge as both a local neighbourhood and a destination for residents of Vaughan and beyond.*
- 7. Support a welcoming, interesting pedestrian environment by encouraging pedestrian amenities and by maintaining human-scaled development and connections to adjacent neighbourhoods.*
- 8. Involve area residents, property and business owners, and interested individuals in the ongoing evolution of the HCD.*

The proposed alterations to the existing contributing dwelling at 32 Abell Avenue are respectful of the guidelines of the WHCD Plan. The alterations conserve the architectural qualities of the existing building and complement it with considerate rear and side addition visually and architecturally subordinate to the main building. The proposed incorporated garage maintains the function of covered site parking area without negatively imposing the structure onto the property.

5.3.2.1 VILLAGE CHARACTER

Woodbridge is experienced as a village, given its:

- *pedestrian scale - people can walk to most places within the District*
- *A mix of uses - people live here and can find a variety of activities within walking distance*
- *scale of buildings - which are generally in good proportion in terms of height to street width*
- *“green” park-like setting - the Humber River and its tributaries are intertwined in the built fabric and generally, buildings are generously spaced and set within a mature landscaped environment*

The scale of the proposed alterations is in good proportion to the immediate neighbouring buildings and the streetscape in general. The proposed attic renovation within the existing dwelling maintains the existing building height does not add to the mass of the original building. The rear and side additions including the garage adequately support the contributing characteristics of the main building without detracting from its architecture.

5.3.2.3 ARCHITECTURE

Buildings of two to three storey building heights, from different construction periods and uses coexist, side by side, including: residential homes, barns, farmhouses, commercial buildings, institutional and industrial buildings.

The existing four-square Edwardian building is well flanked by the board-and-batten proposed addition wrapping around the rear and east side of the dwelling and presents a lower total height subordinate to the main building. The proposed addition is architecturally complimentary to the existing house.

6.2.8 APPROPRIATE MATERIALS

Exterior Finish: *Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent, or in some instances brick to match existing conditions.*

Exterior Detail: *Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings.*

Roofs: *Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the architectural style. Skylights in the form of cupolas or monitors are acceptable, if appropriate to the style.*

Doors: *Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed; transom windows and paired sidelights with real glazing bars; wood french doors for porch entrances; single-bay, wood panelled garage doors.*

Windows: *Wood frames; single or double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style; real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars; vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*

Flashings: *Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.*

The proposed dormers on the existing building are proportionally aesthetic to the profile of the existing roof and are a physically and visually compatible renovation of the existing framing. The vertical board-and-batten cladding used for the addition provides a distinctive character and helps to maintain its personality without overwhelming or negatively impacting the masonry on the existing building or the renovated front porch components.

6.3.2 CONTEMPORARY DESIGN

Just as it is the characteristic of the WHCD to contain contributing buildings in at least 12 recognizable styles, contemporary work should be “of its time”. This is consistent with the principles stated in the Venice Charter, Appleton Charter and other charters recognized internationally as a guide for heritage work. This does not mean that new work should be aggressively idiosyncratic, but that it should be neighbourly and fit this “village” context while at the same time representing current design philosophy. Quoting the past can be appropriate. It should, however, avoid blurring the line between real historic “artifacts”, and contemporary elements.

“Contemporary” as a design statement does not simply mean “current”. Current designs with borrowed detailing inappropriately, inconsistently, or incorrectly used, such as pseudo-Victorian detailing, should be avoided.

The existing four-square 1900s Edwardian building maintains its original architecture to sustain the contributing characteristics in the WHCD. The dwelling is further enhanced by the subordinate architectural style of the addition as a more contemporary stand-alone structure “of its time” but does not compete with the architecture of the original building.

6.4.2.1 WOODBRIDGE HCD WALL HEIGHT AND SCALE (GENERAL)

The height and scale of structures has a significant impact on the overall character of a street and district. The height of a structure is noticeable both from: a close distance, where it contributes to the character of the street wall, to the penetration of sunlight, to the views of the context and sky, to wind and microclimatic conditions, and to the experience of pedestrians; and from a greater distance, where it contributes to the skyline and district wide views.

In Woodbridge, the height and scale of buildings has a relatively consistent “Village” character, generally free standing 2-3 storey buildings with the exception of small concentrations of up to 6-storeys in certain locations. This character is established by both historic structures and some of the more recent buildings. Maintaining a relatively uniform height and scale of buildings is a significant aspect of conserving the heritage character of individual properties, of streets, and of the Woodbridge district as a whole.

Heritage Attributes

1. Except for Woodbridge Avenue, buildings are generally 2 to 3-storeys tall.
2. Contributing structures present within limits, a variety of heights and scales. Most often, the heritage attributes of individual buildings include the designed height and its relationship and views within its context.

Guidelines

1. Except where noted, new buildings should be a minimum of 2 floors (8.5 m) and a maximum of 3 floors (11 m).
2. The height of existing contributing buildings should be maintained. New buildings must be sympathetic to, and transition from, the height of adjacent contributing buildings, with a minimum 45° angular plane. (See section 6.5)
3. The height of a building is measured from the average elevation of the finished grade at the front of the building to the highest point of the roof surface for a flat roof and a mansard roof; and to the mean height between the eaves and the highest point of a gable, hip, or a gambrel roof. (See Section 6.5)

The proposed renovation and addition will contribute positively to the streetscape. The building immediately adjacent (to the east) is not a contributing building in the District and therefore, the proposed addition does not impact adjacent properties. The massing and scale of the addition is sympathetic and subordinate to the main building, and together they form a complex of appropriate scale and mass for the streetscape and immediate neighbouring properties, without drawing additional attention to the property or its components.

6.5 TRANSITIONS OF NEW BUILDINGS IN RELATION TO HERITAGE RESOURCES

Key to the WHCD is, first, conserving the structures and landscapes that contribute to the HCD's heritage character, and second, managing the introduction of new structures and landscapes in such a way that they harmonize with contributing buildings and contribute to the district's heritage character. The following guidelines, as established in the WHCD Study, shall be used to assist in the process of achieving the proper transition of building scales, heights and presence in order to create a harmonious relationship between new structures and landscapes with contributing properties within the Heritage District.

1. Conservation of Heritage Resources

- Buildings and structures listed as 'contributing' in the WHCD may not be demolished or moved
- The City of Vaughan may require a CHIA when it considers that cultural heritage value may exist, or be affected by any new construction

2. Conservation of Heritage Character

Contributing buildings display a variety of setbacks and side yard conditions, reflecting the different construction periods and original use.

- *New development must be sympathetic to this character and must develop in a way that does not detract, hide from view, or impose in a negative way, on existing heritage contributing resources, as per the following height and setback guidelines*

3. Height Guidelines

The height of contributing buildings should be maintained.

- *The setback requirement to adjacent contributing heritage buildings must be at least half the building height. This transition pertains to the back and side yards of a contributing building,*
- *New buildings must transition from the height of adjacent contributing buildings with a minimum 45° angular plane, starting from the existing height of the contributing building. The height of a contributing building is measured from the average elevation of the finished grade at the front of the building to the highest point of the roof surface for a flat roof and a mansard roof; and to the mean height between the eaves and highest point of a gable, hip, or a gambrel roof, (see the following Diagram B).*

4. Side Yard and Backyard Setback Guidelines

- *New buildings must have a side yard, and backyard setback from contributing buildings a distance equivalent to half the height of the contributing building, (see the following Diagram C)*
- *Consideration may be given to the construction of new buildings, and additions to contributing buildings, joining with contributing buildings only when:*
 - *new construction is located in the parts of the contributing building that is not visible from the street or from a public space;*
 - *new construction is setback from the street frontage of the contributing building, to maintain open views and vantage points from the street to the contributing buildings and to support the unique heritage character of the street;*
 - *the parts of the contributing building that will be enclosed or hidden from view by the new construction, do not contain significant heritage attributes, and the three-dimensional form of contributing buildings can be maintained; and*
 - *new construction is of a good architectural quality and contributes to the district's heritage character, (see Diagram D).*

5. Front Yard Setback Guidelines

- *The historic setbacks of contributing buildings should be maintained and contributing buildings should not be relocated to a new setback line. New buildings must be sympathetic to the setbacks of adjacent contributing buildings*
- *When new buildings are located adjacent to existing contributing buildings that are set back from the property or street line, new buildings should transition back to the setback line of existing contributing buildings in order to maintain open views and vantage points from the street to the contributing buildings*

6. Guidelines for Properties Adjacent to an HCD

- *Properties adjacent to an HCD boundary should be considered under Part IV review and should be considered as an “immediate adjacency” to the heritage boundary*
- *Adjacent properties should be respectful in terms of character defined within the HCD boundary*
- *As per the Provincial Policy Statement - the Ontario Toolkit - properties located adjacent to an HCD boundary and especially properties within the valley lands, need to create a proper transition to adjacent HCD properties and integrate with the heritage open space system*

The proposed renovation and addition protect and conserve the attributes of the original construction as a Heritage Resource within the WHCD, as noted by the CHIA submitted in support of this application. The proposed work is sympathetic to the characteristics of the original building, maintaining its qualities of a contributing property within the WHCD. The proposed height of the rear and side addition are subordinate to the existing building, respecting the height guidelines of the WHCD Plan. The side addition is set back from the front line of the existing building, further preserving the contributing building characteristics.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed alterations to the existing dwelling conform to the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition of the existing detached garage, renovation of the existing two-storey dwelling and the construction of a rear and side two-storey addition with an incorporated garage on the property at 32 Abell Avenue under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

1. Attachment 1 – 32Abell – Location Map
2. Attachment 2 – 32Abell – CHIA
3. Attachment 3 – 32Abell – Site Plan
4. Attachment 4 – 32Abell – Floor Plans
5. Attachment 5 – 32Abell – Elevations
6. Attachment 6 – 32Abell – Rendering
7. Attachment 7 – 32Abell – Materials Palette

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254

Mauro Peverini, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407