

Committee of the Whole (2) Report

DATE: Tuesday, June 16, 2020

WARD(S): 1

**TITLE: DEMOLITION OF EXISTING GARAGE AND CONSTRUCTION OF
A SINGLE DETACHED DWELLING WITH ATTACHED GARAGE
31 NAPIER STREET
KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION
DISTRICT**

FROM:

Bill Kiru, Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the approval of the proposed demolition of a free standing three (3) car garage and construction of a single detached dwelling with attached garage, for the lands known municipally as 31 Napier Street, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as shown on Attachments 1 to 3.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is seeking approval to demolish the free standing three (3) car garage and construct a new single detached dwelling with attached garage located at 31 Napier Street. The existing main dwelling (to remain) is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan')
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan
- Staff recommends approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the KNHCD Plan
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval for the proposal is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*

Recommendations

The Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of May 25, 2020 (Item 5, Report No. 3), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 25, 2020, be approved.

Recommendation and Report of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 25, 2020:

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of a free standing three (3) car garage and construction of a single detached dwelling with an attached garage at 31 Napier Street under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

1. Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Acting Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management.
2. That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any development application under the *Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.
3. That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department.

Background

The subject property municipally known as 31 Napier Street is located east of and outside the historic centre of Kleinburg. The subject lands are located on the east side of Napier Street, opposite the intersection of Kellam Street, and comprise Lots 16, 17 and 18 on Registered Plan 11 (May 25, 1848). The date(s) on which the lots were combined are unknown.

The property contains a Victorian style single detached brick bungalow in very good condition. It features dichromatic brickwork gingerbread detailing and French windows. The existing dwelling will be retained, whereas the separate stand-alone three (3) car garage, built circa 2004, is proposed to be demolished.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development in consideration of the guidelines in the KNHCD Plan

The Subject Lands are proposed to be severed to create one additional lot through a future Consent (Severance) Application to be considered by the Committee of Adjustment. 'Parcel A' (the proposed retained lot), has a lot area of 3296.54m² (0.33 hectares), and contains an existing Victorian brick bungalow dwelling which is to be retained, as shown on Attachment 4. The frontage of the retained lot will be 30.22m. All existing front yard setbacks will remain, and the proposed new side yard setbacks will be 2.29m and 1.50m. A new driveway with associated parking is proposed on the south side of the existing home with complementary landscaping. Shrubs and other soft landscape material will be planted adjacent to the asphalt driveway for border definition.

'Parcel B' will have an area of 1038.04m² (0.10 hectares), will have a lot frontage of 18.3m onto Napier Street and a depth of 59.26m. The proposed front yard setback for the new dwelling is 7.5m and the side-yards are proposed to be 1.5m on each side, as shown on Attachment 4. The lot will back onto a portion of lands belonging to the retained 'Parcel A' to comply with the requirements of the Toronto and Region Conservation Authority ('TRCA'). The garage, built after 2004, is proposed to be demolished and a single new two-storey Georgian style detached dwelling is proposed to be constructed in its place. Access to the new dwelling is proposed from Napier Street at generally the same location as the existing driveway on the site.

5.2.5 FUTURE DEVELOPMENT IN THE DISTRICT

To encourage new development that will enhance the heritage character of the District as infill construction on vacant lands and replacement construction or alterations to non-heritage buildings.

To guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within.

The proposed demolition and new construction adhere to and respect the fundamental goal of the KNHCD by contributing to the architectural and historical qualities of Napier Street while meeting contemporary needs. The new construction complements the mix of architectural styles of the street, and maintains the clarity of built form on separate lots without forcing or altering the established typical density of the street's character.

9.5.3.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE

Guidelines:

- *Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles*

- *Hybrid designs that mix elements from different historical styles are not appropriate. Historical styles that are not indigenous to the area, such as Tudor or French Manot, are not appropriate*
- *Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style*
- *Research the chosen Architectural Style*
- *Use appropriate materials*

Within the vicinity of 31 Napier Street there are three 1 ½-storey Victorian era dwellings with more recent additions at 9, 31, and 51 Napier Street, plus a Georgian styled house at 376 Stegman’s Mill Road. All other residences on the street are a mixture of more contemporary eras and styles.

Cultural Heritage staff support the proposed new construction design for a two-storey Georgian style dwelling in keeping with the KNHCD Plan guidelines. This design features a mansard roof, gable elements with front elevation porthole dormer, small paned windows, symmetrically placed main/front entry, and neoclassical detailing. The proposed punched windows in the brick exterior, windows and roof forms are consistent with the scale and classical design guidelines of Napier Street and the KNHCD Plan.

The two openings adjacent to the front porch provide entry to a two-car garage with single bay doors consistent with the KNHCD Plan guidelines.

A concrete unit paver walkway leading from the street to the front door will serve as a landscaped feature within the front yard. Soft landscaping features include shrubs and perennials, will be added to compliment the new construction and enhance the streetscape.

9.5.3.3 SCALE AND MASSING

New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots.

Guidelines

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the generous side yards typical in the villages. As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1 ½ storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape*
- *For garages, see Section 9.3.7 of the KNHCD Plan*

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, comprised of one and two-storey dwellings. The proposed dwelling and attached garage will be situated in the same area as the existing three (3) car garage. The dwelling design incorporates

satisfactory massing, proportions, style and building materials that will contribute to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan, as shown on Attachments 4-7.

9.9.1 THE VILLAGE FORESTS – OVERVIEW

As noted in preceding sections, the existence of rich mature village forests in Kleinburg and Nashville contribute to the environmental health of the surrounding valley lands and are a significant aspect of the heritage character of the villages. It is recommended, in Section 7.2.5, that a Heritage Tree By-law be enacted to protect mature trees. The Ontario Heritage Act does not require a Heritage Permit for planting or removing trees. The guidelines are offered to assist those who wish to preserve and enhance the historic village character when undertaking landscaping projects.

The Arborist Report includes a satisfactory Tree Inventory and Protection Plan including four trees to be planted. A total of 18 trees were tagged and inventoried on the property. There is one tree beyond the chain-link fence at the rear of the property proposed to be removed, and a second tree was felled during a windstorm and will be removed. Staff are satisfied the proposal adheres to the guidelines and the City of Vaughan's Council endorsed By-law 052-2018 and Tree Protection Protocol. The Arborist Report is included as Attachment 8.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:

Exterior Finish:

- *Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent*
- *Wood clapboard, 4" exposed to the weather*
- *Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding*

Exterior Detail: *Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.*

Roofs: *Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style.*

Doors: *Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*

The proposed dwelling will be clad in red brick and trimmed with natural white horizontal moldings below the front eaves. The window lintels, keystones and apron ornamentation will be constructed of limestone. Cultural Heritage staff support the proposed building materials (shown on Attachment 7) as they meet the requirements of the KNHCD Plan.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied with the proposed dwelling which conforms to the policies and guidelines in the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendation to Committee of the Whole for approval of the proposed demolition of a free standing three (3) car garage and construction of a single detached dwelling with attached garage at 31 Napier Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The proposed dwelling will be constructed on a proposed new lot that is subject to a Consent Application through the Committee of Adjustment.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813.

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 31 Napier_Location Plan
- Attachment 2 – 31 Napier_CHIA
- Attachment 3 – 31 Napier_Historical Photos
- Attachment 4 – 31 Napier_Site Plan
- Attachment 5 – 31 Napier_Elevations
- Attachment 6 – 31 Napier_Colour Renderings
- Attachment 7 – 31 Napier_Material Palette
- Attachment 8 – 31 Napier_Arborist Report

Prepared by

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813
Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254
Mauro Peverini, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407