

Committee of the Whole (2) Report

DATE: Monday, March 09, 2020

WARD(S): 1

**TITLE: DEMOLITION OF EXISTING BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION
OF IDENTICAL REPLICA BUILDING AT 10513 ISLINGTON
AVENUE NEAR NASHVILLE ROAD, KLEINBURG**

FROM:

Wendy Law, Deputy City Manager, Administrative Services and City Solicitor

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee to approve the proposed demolition of the existing two-storey structure, and new construction of a nearly-identical replica two-storey structure located at 10513 Islington Avenue, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner seeks approval for the demolition of the existing two-storey structure, and new construction of a nearly-identical replica two-storey structure located at 10513 Islington Avenue.
- The existing building was once-contributing, but now is identified as a significantly-altered property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan') in a state that is no longer contributing.
- The proposal strives to reconstruct the new building to return it to its original contributing characteristics and is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council Approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff supports approval of the proposal.

Recommendation

The Deputy City Manager, Administrative Services and City Solicitor, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of February 19, 2020 (Item 1, Report No. 2), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated February 19, 2020, be approved.

Recommendation and Report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated February 19, 2020:

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of the existing building and new construction of an architectural replica two-storey building located at 10513 Islington Avenue under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management.
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.
- c) That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official.

Background

The property is located at the north end of the old village of Kleinburg, on the east side of Islington Avenue, about 40 metres south of the intersection with Nashville Road. The structure on the property, a much-altered Georgian building, was originally constructed between 1858 and 1868, and used as a dwelling/post office/shop. Photographic records of the building, dating from 1880 and 1911, show it in context with the surroundings at the peak of the road.

The front portion of the building retains the basic form of the original, although it has been significantly altered. None of the openings, except perhaps the front door are of the size or shape of the originals. All doors, windows, and cladding are modern replacements in modern materials. The pine board flooring in the front rooms of the ground floor looks like it could be old, but it was installed during the last renovation, according to the previous owner. The basement walls are poured concrete, thus post-dating the original construction. The rear wall has been removed on the ground floor and substantially removed on the second floor. The original tail addition has been

removed, and the present rear addition is relatively recent. A complete Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment report and site history is included as part of this report, as Attachment 2.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD.

The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the KNHCD guidelines.

The Owner of the property at 10513 Islington Avenue is proposing to replace the existing two-storey building on the property with an architectural replica two-storey building located in approximately the same position as the existing structure, as shown on Attachments 4 and 5.

3.2 GUIDING PRINCIPLES

The Ministry of Culture's Architectural Conservation lists Eight Guiding Principles in the Conservation of Historic Properties. These are quoted in full, below:

1. *Respect for Documentary Evidence:* Do not base restoration on conjecture. Conservation work should be based on historic documentation such as historic photographs, drawings and physical evidence.
2. *Respect for Original Location:* Do not move buildings unless there is no other means to save them.
3. *Respect for Historic Material:* Repair/conservé rather than replace building materials and finishes, except where absolutely necessary. Minimal intervention maintains the historical content of the resource.
4. *Respect for Original Fabric:* Repair with like materials. Repair to return the resource to its prior condition, without altering its integrity.
5. *Respect for the Building's History:* Do not restore to one period at the expense of another period. Do not destroy later additions to a house solely to restore to a single time period.
6. *Reversibility:* Alterations should be able to be returned to original conditions. This conserves earlier building design and technique. (e.g. When a new door opening is put into a stone wall, the original stones are numbered, removed and stored, allowing for future restoration.)
7. *Legibility:* New work should be distinguishable from old. Buildings should be recognized as products of their own time, and new additions should not blur the distinction between old and new.

8. Maintenance: *With continuous care, future restoration will not be necessary. With regular upkeep, major conservation projects and their high costs can be avoided.*

The proposed upgraded development of the subject lands takes into account the failed Architectural Conservation principles noted and aims to return the building to a state where it can, once again, be a contributing architectural property within the KNHCD. The proposed reconstruction:

1. respects the documentary evidence (*Principle 1*) basing the rebuild on authentic photographs and site-specific found physical documentation derived from the state of the renovations within the existing building;
2. respects the original location (*Principle 2*), shifting the building only several inches in order to respect the requirements of zoning and accessibility;
3. respects the historical material (*Principle 3 and 4*) by removing the vinyl siding and foam details, and constructing the new building using modern materials that account for the heritage quality of the original building materials;
4. respects the building's history (*Principle 5*) by removing the non-contributing alterations and rear addition, and reconstructing the main building to the original proportions and form as shown in existing documentation from the turn of the last century, and adds a proportionally sympathetic rear extension in continuity;
5. *Principles 6 and 7* do not apply to this proposal;
6. ensures that future restoration will not be necessary (*Principle 8*) by using modern construction materials with longer lifespan.

5.1 THE OVERALL GOAL

The overall goal of the Heritage District Plan is to ensure the retention of the District's heritage resources and to guide change so that it contributes to and does not detract from the District's architectural, historical, and contextual character.

The proposed reconstruction adheres to and respects the fundamental goal of the KNHCD by rebuilding the structure to the closest possible details of the original building, thus reinforcing the contributing architectural qualities of the subject property.

5.2.2 HERITAGE BUILDINGS

1. *To retain and conserve the buildings identified in the Heritage District Plan as having heritage importance to the district.*
2. *To conserve distinguishing original features, qualities, and character of heritage buildings and to avoid the removal or alteration of any such features.*

3. *To encourage the corrections of unsympathetic alterations made over the years to heritage buildings.*
4. *To encourage restoration of heritage buildings based on historical, archival, and pictorial evidence.*
5. *To encourage continuing use and habitation of heritage buildings in order to maintain their economic viability.*
6. *To promote retention and reuse of heritage buildings and to take exceptional measures to prevent their demolition.*
7. *To encourage interior and exterior maintenance to preserve heritage buildings from damage or destruction from weather or fire.*

The proposed reconstruction accounts for the requirements listed under 5.2.2 *Heritage Buildings* in the KNHCD Plan, by replacing the existing heavily-altered building with a reconstruction that can identify with and contribute to the architectural and Cultural Heritage fabric of the KNHCD.

9.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLES

Architectural style is a term used to refer to the identifying characteristics of construction as it has evolved under the force of changing technology and fashion. Before the industrial age, even minor details were custom-made for each building and it would be hard to find even two identical front door designs from the early 19th century. Nonetheless, each period produced buildings that shared a design vocabulary, including elements of massing, composition, proportions, window and door details, and decorative elements. This section shows the principal styles that have appeared in the Kleinburg Nashville community, both heritage styles and more recent ones.

...Additions and alterations to an existing heritage building should be consistent with the style of the original building. New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a particular style, rather than a hybrid one. Recent developments have tended to use hybrid designs, with inauthentic details and proportions; for larger homes, the French manor or château style (not indigenous to Ontario) has been heavily borrowed from. These kinds of designs are not appropriate for the District.

This project bridges the “conservation” aspects of heritage architecture and the new development requirements of constructing within a Heritage Conservation District. The proposed building reinforces the purity of the original architecture of the building from 1880s by cleaning up the design vocabulary, architectural massing, composition, and window and door details. Additionally, it responds to the *alterations* and *new*

development guidelines by remaining true to the authentic vernacular style of the street and the KNHCD and maintaining an architectural language and proportions consistent with the original architecture.

9.4.1.1 HISTORICAL CONVERSION

In some cases, a modern building may be altered in a way that gives it the appearance of an older building. A historical conversion should have the integrity of an historical architectural style. This approach means considerably more than sticking on a few pieces of historical decoration; it may require considerable new construction to achieve an appropriate appearance.

Guidelines:

- *Additions and alterations using the Historical Conversion approach should rely on a local heritage style described in Section 9.2. Use of a style should be consistent in materials, scale, detail, and ornament.*
- *Although most additions should be modest in comparison to the original building, the Historical Conversion approach may call for substantial additions in front of and on top of the existing building.*
- *Additions should avoid destruction of existing mature trees.*

This proposed reconstruction can be viewed as a “historical conversion” from the standpoint of the governing intent of returning the architectural integrity to its initial proportions and aesthetic. The proposed building relies on and conforms to the local heritage style of the original building proper, first, as well as to the “contributing building” characteristics of its immediate surroundings.

9.5.2.2 ISLINGTON AVENUE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE

Historic building in the Commercial Core New buildings were a mix of purpose-built commercial structures and house-form residential. Some residential buildings had storefronts added after construction, even at a very early date. Most of the buildings, even purpose-built ones, had gable roofs. New construction in the Commercial Core should reflect its historic built form.

Despite being a new building, the reconstruction is designed specifically to replace the identical one on the subject property. The replication of the building’s characteristics is thorough and consistent; materials, scale, detail and ornament, accurately reflect the qualities of the original style. In particular, windows, doors, trim, and decoration are once again be properly detailed.

9.5.2.4 ISLINGTON AVENUE STOREFRONTS

As noted under Architectural Style, above, historic commercial buildings may have been purpose-built or converted from residences. This is typical of a village commercial streetscape and differentiates it from shopping areas in larger towns and cities. As a result, there is a variety of heritage precedents available for the design of new shopfronts.

There are no existing examples of the classic 19th century storefront in Kleinburg, with typical large, high plate-glass windows and bracketed and corniced signband, having a full width porch above the windows. Historical photographs of Kleinburg show that such porches on commercial buildings were very common, to the extent that they defined the commercial character a century ago.

Historical conversions of residential buildings to commercial use often inserted a large window opening, perhaps on only one side of a central door, rather than full width storefront. More recent conversions often leave the original residential window openings in place, if the business doesn't require large display windows.

Guidelines:

- *Storefront design should reflect local historic precedents. Design elements within any chosen precedent should be consistently applied.*
- *Full-width porches are appropriate elements in storefront.*
- *Retractable awnings are appropriate. Rigid awnings are inappropriate.*
- *Use of traditional wood and glass construction for storefronts is encouraged.*
- *If modern materials are used, they should be detailed to replicate traditional designs in scale, proportion and architectural effect. For example, the use of wood trim at jambs, posts, and panels can enhance the heritage effect of standard storefront and glazing systems.*
- *Both Preservation Briefs and Architectural Conservation Notes have information on heritage storefronts. See Section 9.3.2.*

The proposed architectural replica returns the architectural components of the building to their original massing and form. It removes non-conforming building materials that are present on the existing building, and reintroduces the symmetry, proportionality, and linearity of the original architecture.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:

Exterior Finish:

- *Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent*
- *Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather.*
- *Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.*

Exterior Detail: *Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.*

Shopfronts: *Wood frames, glazing bars, and panels with glazed wood doors are preferred. Metal shopfronts, detailed and proportioned to be compatible with heritage shopfronts, are acceptable.*

Roofs: *Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style.*

Doors: *Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*

Flashings: *Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.*

The proposed architectural replica employs building materials that conform to the KNHCD Guidelines, and in some instances exceed the minimum requirements for heritage conservation and restoration as identified by the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sports by introducing modern components that have improved performance qualities over the original materials.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed works conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition of the existing two-storey building and construction of an architectural replica two-storey building on the lot at 10513 Islington Avenue under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 10513 Islington_Location Plan

Attachment 2 – 10513 Islington_CHIA

Attachment 3 – 10513 Islington_Historical Photos

Attachment 4 – 10513 Islington_Site Plan

Attachment 5 – 10513 Islington_Elevations

Attachment 6 – 10513 Islington_Colour Renderings

Attachment 7 – 10513 Islington_Material Palette

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254

Christina Bruce, Acting Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407