

Committee of the Whole (2) Report

DATE: Tuesday, January 21, 2020

WARD: 1

TITLE: DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION OF A TWO-STOREY HOUSE LOCATED AT 27 LESTER B. PEARSON STREET, NEAR THE CORNER OF NASHVILLE ROAD AND ISLINGTON AVENUE IN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Wendy Law, Deputy City Manager, Administrative Services and City Solicitor

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed demolition of the existing building and new construction of a two-storey dwelling located at 27 Lester B. Pearson Street, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District as shown in Attachments 1 and 2, and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner seeks approval for the demolition of an existing building and the construction of a new two-storey dwelling at 27 Lester B. Pearson Street.
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ("KNHCD Plan").
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff supports approval of the proposal, as it conforms with the policies of the KNHCD Plan.

Recommendations

The Deputy City Manager, Administrative Services and City Solicitor, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of January 15, 2020 (Item 3, Report No. 1), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated January 15, 2020, be approved:

Recommendation and Report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, date January 15, 2020:

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of an existing building and the construction of a new two-storey house at 27 Lester B. Pearson Street under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management.
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act*.
- c) That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official.

Background

The subject property is located directly across the street from a designated heritage house which was the home of Lester B. Pearson's father and where Primer Minister Pearson grew up as a child.

Property ownership records show that the subject property at 27 Lester B. Pearson was originally part of a 200-acre parcel, recorded as Lot 24, Concession 8, Vaughan. Ownership was issued by the Crown to Andrew Mitchell in the 19th century. In March 1848 Andrew Mitchel granted part of Lot 101 from the original land parcel to William Mitchell. The property was re-granted in 1852 by Trustees to John Mehaffy. Mr. Mehaffy transferred ownership in 1855 to Robert Cheffey. City Staff surmise that this larger land parcel had then remained essentially vacant over the century.

Records show that in 1958 a 'designated Sub-division' was established for the property, at which time the present non-heritage residence on today's lot was constructed. The house remained in ownership of the Ireland family until the present owners acquired the lot in 2018 for purposes of redevelopment. A complete Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment report and site history is included as part of this report as Attachment 3.

Previous Reports/Authority

There are no previous reports.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan.

The following is an analysis of the proposed development according the KNHCD Plan.

5.2.5 FUTURE DEVELOPMENT IN THE DISTRICT states:

“To encourage new development that will enhance the heritage character of the District as infill construction on vacant lands and replacement construction or alterations to non-heritage buildings.

To guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within.”

The proposal includes the removal of the existing modest split-level brick building and proposes a replacement with a two-storey Georgian style brick building. The proposed new building is in keeping with the architectural styles within the KNHCD, and the scale and massing is reflective of the contemporary construction scale without overwhelming or dwarfing other properties on the street or within the immediate neighbourhood. A schematic streetscape view is shown in Attachment 5.

6.3 POLICIES FOR NEW DEVELOPMENT states:

“New development should complement and enhance the heritage character of the District. New buildings should be sympathetic in siting, scale, material, texture, and general design to the heritage buildings around them.

New development should be limited to vacant sites or to sites currently occupied by unsympathetic buildings. Even the most skillfully executed heritage-friendly building cannot replace the value of a real heritage building.

New development within the District should be consistent with the Guidelines in Section 9.5.”

The proposed new building complements the architecture of the street by designing a clean line Georgian building centered onto the intersection of Lester B. Pearson Street with Main Street. The proposed new building is sited within the existing canopy of the trees on site, and the chosen material colours compliment the neighbourhood's other properties by adding to the street colour palette. The proposed building elevations and suggested colour palette are shown in Attachment 4.

9.1.1 CONTEXTS states:

“The heritage character of the District includes a variety of historical and geographical contexts. The Guidelines for exterior work in the District necessarily take account of this variety. Existing buildings are either heritage or non-heritage and are treated differently in the Guidelines. The geographical settings also differ, ranging lands. Guidelines for new construction respect these different settings and special attention is given to roadways and natural and agricultural areas.”

9.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLES states:

“Additions and alterations to an existing heritage building should be consistent with the style of the original building. New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a particular style, rather than a hybrid one. Recent developments have tended to use hybrid designs, with inauthentic details and proportions; for larger homes, the French manor or château style (not indigenous to Ontario) has been heavily borrowed from. These kinds of designs are not appropriate for the District.”

The proposed design carefully takes into consideration the topographical features and the existing vegetation of the site and addresses the elevation drop from the crest of the hill by placing the lower-mass double garage adjacent to the existing property so as to visually separate the neighbour from the proposed new building. Additionally, the massing and style of the new building, with symmetrical dormers on the main roof and enlarged dormers on the garage roof, reinforce the simple lines of the Georgian style and compliment the property directly opposite across the street by mirroring the construction elements and form – with matching the number and the position of the dormers on the new building.

9.5.3.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE states:

“Guidelines:

- *Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles*
- *Hybrid designs that mix elements from different historical styles are not appropriate. Historical styles that are not indigenous to the area (such as Tudor or French Manot) are not appropriate*
- *Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style*
- *Research the chosen Architectural Style*
- *Use appropriate materials”*

The proposed building uses one architectural style consistent in mass, form, choice of materials, and proportions with the approved architectural styled of the KNHCD Plan.

9.5.3.3 SCALE AND MASSING states:

“New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots.

Guideline:

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the generous side yards typical in the villages. As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1 ½ storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.”*

The proposed new building is set forward from the existing building's front yard setback without negatively affecting the frontage in relation to the rest of the street. The design respects the side yard separation distances by maintaining a setback similar to that of the existing building and provides an extension to the rear of the property that increases the footprint of the proposed dwelling without negatively impacting the streetscape.

The proposed design also takes into consideration the existing trees and vegetation of the site and proposes a landscape design that is consistent and complementary to the street and the immediate neighbourhood and is in keeping with the Villages landscaping guidelines of the KNHCD Plan. The proposed landscape plan and planting list is shown in Attachment 6.

9.10.2 NON-HERITAGE BUILDINGS states:

“Appropriate Materials:

Exterior Finish: *Use materials compatible with the original design*

Roofs: *Slopes and layouts compatible with the original design*

Doors: *Use materials and designs compatible with the original design*

Windows: *Use windows compatible with the original design”*

All construction materials and colour palette of the proposed design are respectful of the chosen architectural style and are in keeping with the approved materials and colours specified by the KNHCD Plan. The proposed materials samples are shown in Attachment 7.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed dwelling conforms to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan.

Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition of the existing building and the construction of a new two-storey house at 27 Lester B. Pearson Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 27LesterB.Pearson _Location Plan
- Attachment 2 – 27LesterB.Pearson_Site Plan
- Attachment 3 – 27LesterB.Pearson_CHIA
- Attachment 4 – 27LesterB.Pearson_Colour Renderings
- Attachment 5 – 27LesterB.Pearson_Street elevation
- Attachment 6 – 27LesterB.Pearson_Material Palette
- Attachment 7 – 27LesterB.Pearson_Landscape Plan

Prepared by

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813
Nick R. Borcescu, Senior Cultural Planner, Development Planning, ext. 8191
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design/Cultural Services, ext. 8254
Mauro Peverini, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8407