

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, December 04, 2019

WARD(S): 2

TITLE: CONSTRUCTION OF A ONE STOREY CONNECTING STRUCTURE BETWEEN TWO EXISTING BUILDINGS, AND 22 NEW PARKING SPOTS AT 249 CLARENCE STREET, VICINITY OF CLARENCE STREET AND MOUNSEY STREET, WOODBRIDGE

FROM:

Jason Schmidt-Shoukri, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee support and recommend to Committee of the Whole approval to permit a 1-storey, 204.93 m² addition to an existing church building located at 249 Clarence Street in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District, and 22 parking spaces.

Report Highlights

- The proposed addition connects the two existing buildings on the site by means of a glass vestibule which will be self-supportive and with no physical intervention to the heritage building.
- The Nathaniel Clarke Wallace House is designated under the *Ontario Heritage Act* (OHA) - Part V and identified as a contributing property in the *Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District* (WHCD).
- The proposed addition is reversible, and the buildings joined by it can be returned to their original condition.
- The application is consistent with the WHCD.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend the Committee of the Whole recommend approval of the proposed one storey addition and 22 additional parking spaces at 249 Clarence Street, subject to the following conditions:

1. Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Deputy City Manager, Planning & Growth Management.
2. That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act*.
3. That the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official.

Background

The subject land is located south-east corner of Clarence Street and Mounsey Street and is in the WHCD and designated as a *Part V* property by the *OHA*. The property presently includes two structures:

- a) A 2-1/2 storey Gothic Revival house built between 1850 and 1875. This building fronts onto Clarence Street; and
- b) a contemporary building that facilitates the Rock Community Church located east of the heritage house.

The property is currently served by 80 parking spaces and abuts wooded areas and a tributary of the Humber River; the Humber River runs just west of the property.

The existing architectural character on Clarence Street is a broad variety of housing styles and types. In addition to Dr. Mclean District Park, large front yards provide for a significant green landscape and mature tree canopy.

Previous Reports/Authority

There are no previous reports.

Analysis and Options

The Owner is seeking to permit a one storey, 204.93 m² addition to an existing church building on the subject lands. The proposed addition will be similar in style to the existing one storey church and will connect the church to the existing 2-1/2 storey caretakers' residence (Nathaniel Clarke Wallace House). The new building will be used for fellowship meetings after worship services.

The proposal includes 22 additional parking spaces to be developed in the southeast portion of the property.

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the WHCD.

The following is an analysis of the proposed development according the WHCD.

Section 6.1.5 – Clarence Street and Park Drive guideline #4 states:

“New buildings should be a minimum of 2 floors (8.5 m) high and a maximum of 3 floors (11 m)”.

- The proposed addition is one-storey (8 metres) in height which is consistent with the above policy. This height is consistent with the existing Rock Community Church and subordinate to the height of the Nathaniel Clarke Wallace House

Section 6.2.1 – Standards and Guidelines for Conservation defines:

“It is the intent of the (sic) WHCD to conserve and restore the heritage resources within the District and prevent their demolition or relocation. The retention of the existing heritage resources is essential to maintaining the village character of Woodbridge.”

One of these approaches, rehabilitation is (per Section 6.2.1) the “action or process of ensuring a continuing use or a compatible contemporary use of a heritage resource (or an individual component) through repair, alterations, or additions, while protecting its heritage value.”

- The addition would connect the existing church building and the heritage house by means of a self-supportive glass vestibule with the least form of intervention by using blue skin in combination with flashing and galvanized steel
- The Nathaniel Clarke Wallace House will continue to be used as a caretaker’s home for the church property which provides a use for the historic place without required changes to its character defining elements
- The new addition and associated vestibule will not destruct or alter character-defining elements of the existing buildings and will be subordinate and distinguishable due to its lesser height and contemporary design

Section 6.2.2 – Conservation Guidelines states:

“To conserve and protect the heritage value of each heritage resource. Do not remove, replace, or substantially alter its intact or repairable heritage attributes”.

As identified in the *Eight Guiding Principles in the Conservation of Built Heritage Properties* referenced in Section 6.2.2 of the WHCD the following 6 of 8 principles apply:

Principle 2 - Respect for the original location

Do not move buildings unless there is no other means to save them. Site is an integral component of a building or structure. Change in site diminishes cultural heritage value considerably.

- Due to its linkage at the rear of the building, the new construction does not impact the overall presence of the building from the Clarence Street streetscape

Principle 3 - Respect for historical material

Repair/conservate - rather than replace building materials and finishes, except where absolutely necessary. Minimal intervention maintains the heritage content of the built resource.

- Per the Conservation Plan for 249 Clarence Street, Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that the appropriate preservation and conservation methodology will be utilized, including repair existing wooden elements beneath the new construction, and preservation of the integrity of the existing facades of the adjoining buildings

Principle 4 - Respect for original fabric

Repair with like materials. Repair to return the resource to its prior condition, without altering its integrity.

- The addition retains the original wooden threshold which is above grade. As part of the construction of the addition, the existing wooden threshold of the church will be repaired in accordance with *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada -Section 4.5.2, Guidelines for Wood and Wood Products*

Principle 6 - Reversibility

Alterations should be able to be returned to original conditions. This conserves earlier building design and technique.

- Staff recommend that an interior ramp or other accessible means of transfer from one building to another be reversible and the original wooden threshold be preserved
- The proposed addition is reversible and therefore any “alterations” can be returned to their original condition

Principle 7- Legibility

New work should be distinguishable from old. Buildings or structures should be recognized as products of their own time, and new additions should not blur the distinction between old and new.

- The new addition does not “blur the distinction between old and new” and is distinguishable from the Nathaniel Clarke Wallace House

Principle 8 - Maintenance

With continuous care, future restoration will not be necessary. With regular upkeep, major conservation projects and their high costs can be avoided.

- In 2015, a heritage application was submitted for the subject property by Shawn Choi (C.Y. Lee Architect Inc.) for a proposed alteration to the house (HP.2015-028-00) in conjunction with a building permit issued on March 2, 2016 (Permit No. 15-0003887). This permit included replacing damaged bricks and repointing masonry with lime mortar. All new bricks were matched in size and colour with existing brick (Ibstock bricks, “Heritage Red Blend” and “Leicester Multi-cream Stock”/ “Ontario Size”). The porch was removed and reconstructed. The balcony was repaired and restored. Window openings and frames were repaired and reinforced with wood storm windows. All alterations were completed in compliance with the policies and guidelines of the WHCD
- Proven dedication to the preservation and conservation of the structure by the Owner as noted above, along with the proposed conservation plan for the property is supported by Cultural Heritage staff

Section 6.3.3 - Material Palette notes:

“Materials proposed for new buildings or additions should include those drawn from ones historically used in Woodbridge. The proportional use of material, use of extrapolated construction lines projected from the surrounding context, careful consideration of colour and texture all add to the success of a composition.”

- Cultural Heritage staff have reviewed the material palette, which follows the palette of the church and are satisfied that the materials will support and enhance submission for the property at 249 Clarence Street and determines that it is compliant with Sections 6.3.3 of the WHCD

Section 6.6.3 (Tree Canopy and Vegetation) and 6.7.6 (Parking) of the WHCD states:

“Prior to the issuance of a Heritage Permit, Building Permit or Site Plan approval, a tree conservation plan is required to be submitted and approved by the City.

On-site parking, including structured parking should not be visible from the street or from public spaces. Parking areas should be concealed and buffered with buildings with active uses.”

- Cultural Heritage staff have reviewed the proposed parking addition(s) and confirm that the proposal meets the 6.7.6 (Parking) requirements
- The Landscape Plan notes the removal of 9 of 136 trees on the property, with a satisfactory replacement plan. Cultural Heritage staff determine the Landscape Plan

is compliant with the City of Vaughan's *Tree Protection By-Law 052-2018* and Section 6.6.3 of the WHCD

Standard archaeological conditions will apply to the subject lands

The subject property lies in an area identified as a being of high archaeological potential in the City's database of archaeological resources. An archaeological assessment will not be required; however, the Owner is advised that the following standard clauses apply:

- a) Should archaeological resources be found on the property during construction activities, all work must cease, and both the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport and the City of Vaughan's Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division shall be notified immediately.
- b) In the event that human remains are encountered during construction activities, the Owner must immediately cease all construction activities and shall contact the York Regional Police Department, the Regional Coroner and the Registrar of Cemeteries at the Ministry of Consumer Services.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied that the proposed addition linking the existing buildings on the subject lands is respectful of the existing architecture of the two adjoining structures – more specifically, it is respectful of the heritage aspects of the historic Nathaniel Clarke Wallace House (1870). The proposed design integrates the connection between the buildings with an addition that does not physically impact or alter the fabric of the two existing buildings. The proposed addition can be removed without any impact to the materials or architecture of the existing buildings.

The proposed additional 22 parking spots do not affect or negatively impact the existing landscape fabric of the subject property and will provide an improved amenity for visitors and staff.

Accordingly, Cultural Heritage staff can recommend that the Heritage Vaughan Committee approve the proposed addition and parking spaces.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, Development Planning, ext. 8813

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 249 Clarence_Context Plan
Attachment 2 – 249 Clarence_Location Plan
Attachment 3 – 249 Clarence_Site Plan
Attachment 4 – 249 Clarence_CHIA and Conservation Plan
Attachment 5 – 249 Clarence_Colour Rendering
Attachment 6 – 249 Clarence_North, South & West Elevations
Attachment 7 – 249 Clarence_Material Palette
Attachment 8 – 249 Clarence_Landscape Plan

Prepared by

Nick R. Borcescu, Senior Cultural Planner, Development Planning, ext. 8191
Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813