CITY OF VAUGHAN

REPORT NO. 4 OF THE

HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

For consideration by the Committee of the Whole of the City of Vaughan on September 17, 2018

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:03 p.m., on July 18, 2018.

- Present: Tony Marziliano, Chair Christine Radewych, Vice - Chair Frank Alaimo Robert Brown Sandra Colica Nick Pacione Giacomo Parisi Antonella Strangis Henry Xu
- Staff present: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer John Britto, Council / Committee Administrator

The following items were dealt with:

1

DEMOLITION OF A DETACHED RESIDENTIAL BUILDING AND NEW DEVELOPMENT 10274, 10286, 10296 KEELE STREET AND PART BLOCK 724, PLAN 65M-2086 PARTS 2, 3 AND 5, PLAN 65R-16511, MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT, DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated July 18, 2018, be approved, subject to the following:
 - a) That the colour scheme replace the yellow brick materials with alternate brown/red brick material, the new colours to be approved by Cultural Heritage staff.

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the following deputations were received:
 - 1. Mr. Keith MacKinnon, KLM Planning Partners Inc., Jardin Drive, Concord, on behalf of the applicant;
 - 2. Mr. Philip Evans, Principal, ERA Architects Inc., Church Street, Toronto, on behalf of the applicant; and
 - 3. Mr. Deni Papetti, Principal Architect, OFFICEARCHITECTURE, Adelaide Street East, Toronto, on behalf of the applicant.

(This recommendation was reported in the September 2018, Hiatus Report.)

<u>Purpose</u>

The purpose of this report is to seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding the demolition of the detached house municipally known as 10286 Keele Street and the proposed new construction of 51 common element townhouse units on the properties municipally known as 10274, 10286 and 10296 Keele Street and including a remnant parcel as shown in Attachment #1 and located within the Maple Heritage Conservation District ("Maple HCD").

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing to demolish the existing detached dwelling at 10286 Keele Street and construct 51 common element townhouse units on four parcels of land.
- Heritage Vaughan Committee review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff recommends approval of the proposal as it conforms with the Maple HCD Plan.

Recommendations

- 1. THAT the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend to Council the approval of the proposed demolition of the detached dwelling at 10286 Keele Street.
- 2. THAT the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend to Council that, subject to final approval of the Development Applications under the *Planning Act*, approval of a Heritage Permit be issued for the proposed

new construction of 51 townhouse units under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to following conditions:

- a) The Development Applications under the *Planning Act* must receive final approval prior to the issuance of the Heritage Permit. It is understood that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council regarding the issuance of a heritage permit do not constitute support for any Development Application under the *Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- b) Any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage; and
- c) That a copy of the final complete Stage 4 Archaeological Assessment ("AA") Report and Commemoration Plan be provided to the satisfaction Cultural Heritage staff prior to the final Heritage Permit release.

<u>Background</u>

Location, Heritage Status, and Policies

Four properties, known municipally as 10274, 10286 & 10296 Keele Street, and a fourth remnant parcel (Part Block 724, Plan 65M-2086 Parts 2, 3 And 5, Plan 65R-16511) form the lands subject to this application (hereinafter referred to as the "Subject Lands"). The Subject Lands are located on the northwest corner of Keele Street and McNaughton Road, as shown in Attachment #1. The Subject Lands are located within the Residential Village Area of the Maple HCD, and are protected under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act ("OHA")*.

The property with the existing built structure at 10286 Keele Street is included in the Maple HCD Inventory as shown on Attachment #2. The structure was built circa 1970 and the Maple HCD Inventory does not identify it as containing significant architectural value. However, the inventory entry however identifies the significant deciduous tree presence as an important component in the north boundary of the Maple HCD.

The balance of the Subject Lands are currently vacant and are also located within the Maple HCD, however are not included in the Maple HCD Inventory. The properties at 10274 and10296 Keele Street previously contained structures which were demolished circa 2006-2007 and in the late 1990's respectively. The remnant

L-shaped parcel contained structures that are clearly visible on the 1978 aerial map, as shown on Attachment #3 and it appears they were demolished after 1988.

A full review of the Subject Lands is included as part of the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment ("CHIA") submitted in support of the application, included as Attachment #4. The CHIA includes a full property history of the Subject Lands and surrounding area, from its early settlement in the early 19th century to the development of the Village of Maple and the evolution of the Subject Lands in this context. Cultural Heritage staff have reviewed the CHIA and concluded that it meets the City of Vaughan CHIA Guidelines. Cultural Heritage staff has no concerns and supports the demolition of the existing structure at 10286 Keele Street.

Redevelopment of the Subject Lands are required to follow the policies and guidelines for New Development (Section 4.4.1) and New Development for the Residential Area of the Village (Section 9.5.2) in the Maple HCD Plan.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

Proposed New Construction

The proposed new construction consists of 51 common element townhouse units in 12 blocks as shown in Attachment #5. The subject lands are designated "Low-Rise Mixed Use" by Vaughan Official Plan 2010 ("VOP 2010") and are located within a "Community Area" as identified in Schedule 1, the "Urban Structure" of VOP 2010. This designation permits townhouse dwelling units having a maximum building height of 3-storeys and a maximum density (Floor Space Index – FSI) of 1.25 times the area of the lot. The proposed townhouse units are 3-storeys.

The applicant has filed Zoning By-Law Amendment and Site Development Application Files Z.16.044 and DA.16.044 with the Development Planning Department. As stated in the Maple HCD Plan, new buildings are to be products of their own time, but reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District. The proposed new construction includes two different architectural styles: Second Empire and Victorian Vernacular as shown in Attachment #6. Both are recognized heritage styles of the Maple HCD Plan. Cultural Heritage staff notes that the architectural design of the townhouse blocks is simple in form, design and materials and therefore, create a design that is clearly of its time while drawing on the heritage styles of the Maple HCD.

In the context of the Subject Lands, the primary heritage streetscape is on Keele Street and this section of the street is identified in Maple HCD Study and in Maple HCD Plan as a key gateway into the District. Along the Keele Street streetscape, Blocks 2 to 5 are townhouses that alternate between Second Empire style structures

with 4 units and Victorian Vernacular style structures with 3 units. The townhouse blocks along Keele Street are broken up in recognition of the typical massing and scale of the contributing properties located along the west side of Keele Street that are north of Killian Road.

The proposed new construction also features townhouse blocks along McNaughton Road and within the interior of the site. Although the Subject Lands are located entirely within the Maple HCD boundary, the units in Block 1 front onto McNaughton Road, which is not part of the District. McNaughton Road is not discussed within the context of the Maple HCD in either the District Study or the District Plan. The McNaughton Road streetscape consists largely of Block 1, a townhouse consisting of five units in the Second Empire style.

The largest structures within the proposed development are two 6-unit townhouse Blocks that are located within the interior of the development and are designed in a simplified Victorian Vernacular style. 4-unit townhouse Blocks designed in a Second Empire style are located along the western portion of the Subject Lands, adjacent to the City of Vaughan Soccer Field.

The Maple HCD policies require that new residential buildings complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by being: generally the same height, width, and orientation of adjacent buildings; of similar setback; of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes. Cultural Heritage staff notes that this section of Keele Street does not have a significant number of existing built forms. Consequently, the buildings reflect the height and massing of larger structures on Keele Street located on the west side of Keele Street. A full discussion of these issues is included in the Conservation District Conformity Report shown in Attachment #8.

While the Maple HCD Plan states that historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings has been 1½ or 2-storeys, the townhouse structures, particularly the Victorian Vernacular style, are 2½-storeys high and are in keeping with the height of previous developments approved within the District and are within one storey of several contributing heritage properties on Keele Street. However, the grading within the site necessitates that certain units are interpreted under the Zoning By-law to have an increased height. Building height considerations are discussed by the architect in a letter to the City (Attachment #9) and includes the following excerpts here:

"The governing City of Vaughan By-law controlling building height requires that the building height be measured from the average grade established at the front façade of the building to the midpoint of a pitched roof or to the top of a flat roof profile. The above noted project employs this method of building height interpretation to average grade. The dimensions of the individual building block widths are also directly affected by the perceived sense of building height, in part developed out of a result of the incline of the site

topography. This project property has a significant incline in topography from North to South along Keele Street creating a range of building heights along it from a minimum of 10.2 metres to a maximum of 10.5 metres. McNaughton has a more consistent and level grade condition along its length translating into a less varied building height of 11.03 metres. The perception of height increases as the building width grow and the site inclination steepens.

"When establishing building height from grade at the project location, care was taken to balance the width of the individual blocks in proportion to both the precedent context and the inclination of the street. The intent was to create a desirable sectional relationship between the interior main floor living areas and the Keele Street right-of-way sectional profile. This relationship is tied to the average grade determination and adversely affected by a decrease in building height." (sic)

The proposed height of the townhouse units is further supported by the heritage consultant who examined the potential issue and expressed the following opinion in a letter to the City (Attachment #10):

"The proposed buildings are a maximum of two-and-a-half storeys when viewed from Keele Street. The adjacent buildings are two storeys (to the east) and three-and-a-half storeys (to the south-east). The additional height of some of the townhouse blocks has a negligible impact on the cultural heritage value of the Maple Heritage Conservation District." (sic)

The height of the proposed buildings also allows for parking facilities to be located to the rear façade of the townhouses and out of sight for the townhouses along Keele Street and McNaughton Road. Consequently, the building design meets the policy of Section 9.3.8 of the Maple HCD Plan which states that attached garages to new construction be minimized or disguised as much as possible from the main frontage.

Cultural Heritage Landscape

The 2005 Maple HCD Inventory entry for 10286 Keele Street identifies that the trees on this property are the most significant contributing element to the Maple streetscape. An arborist report prepared by Beacon Environmental, dated August 2016, identified that most of the existing deciduous trees on site are Manitoba and Norway Maples as shown in Attachment #11. A Basswood tree and a Norway Maple were identified in the south-east corner of the site and will be retained as part of the final landscape. All City and Regionally owned trees are proposed to be retained.

In the context of the existing streetscape, the proposal will feature significantly more built form than currently exists. To mitigate the loss of the existing deciduous trees, the applicant is proposing new trees to be planted along the streets and interior to the site. These plantings include Karpick Maple, Ohio Buck Eye, Crab Apple, Choke Cherry and Lilac as shown on Attachment #12.

The Tree Preservation Plan, the Arborist Report and the Landscape Plan are to be finalized to the satisfaction of the City to reflect the above information, should the related Development Applications be approved.

Archaeology

The subject properties were identified as containing archaeological potential and a Stage 1 Archaeological Assessment was required. Further activities on the subject property identified the presence of a significant historical site and work proceeded according to the Ministry's Standards and Guidelines for Archaeological Sites.

A preliminary Stage 4 Archaeological Assessment report has been submitted and it states that approximately 15,000 artifacts were recovered during excavation. This has been accompanied by a copy of the letter of review and acceptance from the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport ("MTCS") confirming that the properties are now considered to be free of archaeological concern. However, although the properties have been declared to be free of archaeological concerns, the following standard clauses shall apply:

- i) Should archaeological resources be found on the property during construction activities, all work must cease and both the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, and the City of Vaughan's Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division in the Development Planning Department shall be notified immediately.
- *ii)* In the event that human remains are encountered during construction activities, the proponent must immediately cease all construction activities. The proponent shall contact the York Regional Police Department, the Regional Coroner and the Registrar of the Cemeteries Regulation Unit of the Ministry of Consumer and Business Services.

The final, complete Stage 4 Archaeological Assessment report has yet to be submitted to the City. Cultural Heritage staff will require a copy of the complete Stage 4 Archaeological Assessment and the commemoration plan before issuing the final Heritage Permit release for new construction.

<u>Timeline</u>

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the OHA. This application was declared complete on July 12, 2018, and must be deliberated upon by Council by October 10, 2018, to meet the 90-day timeline. If this application is not considered by Council by the 90 day deadline, it is considered to be approved as outlined under the OHA.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage staff have reviewed the Heritage Permit application to demolish the existing structure at 10286 Keele Street and the proposed new construction for the lands known municipally as 10274, 10286 and 10296 Keele Street and a remnant parcel as shown on Attachment #1. Staff recommends that the Heritage Vaughan Committee approve the recommendations in this report, including a recommendation that Council approve a Heritage Permit for the proposed demolition and new construction, subject to the Recommendations in this report.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

Attachments

- 1. Location Map
- 2. Maple Heritage Conservation District Inventory (Excerpt)
- 3. 1978 Aerial Photo
- 4. Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment
- 5. Site Plan
- 6. Renderings
- 7. Elevation Drawings
- 8. Heritage Conservation District Conformity Report
- 9. Letter from Walter Bettio, Architect
- 10. Letter from ERA
- 11. Arborist Report
- 12. Landscape Master Plan

Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115 Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8653 Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

2 RESTORATION & REPAIR DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION – 9846 KEELE STREET <u>MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT</u>

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated July 18, 2018, be approved, subject to the following:
 - a) a covered porch be constructed over both entrances of the north dwelling;
 - b) the shape of the garage door of the south dwelling be revised; and
 - c) the proposed design alterations be approved by Cultural Heritage staff.

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the following deputations were received:
 - 1. Mr. Murray Evans, Evans Planning, Keele Street, Concord, on behalf of the applicant; and
 - 2. Mr. Wayne Harrison, Vice President & Project/Operations Manager, KNYMH Inc., Skyview Drive, Burlington, on behalf of the applicant.

(This recommendation was reported in the September 2018, Hiatus Report.)

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the demolition and new construction located at 9846 Keele Street, a property located in the Maple Heritage Conservation District ("MHCD") and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act.*

Report Highlights

- The property formerly belonged to St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church.
- The proposed new works include the demolition of the 1974 detached dwelling on the property and the construction of 2 semi-detached houses.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Recommendations

- 1. THAT the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend to Council the approval of the proposed demolition of the detached dwelling municipally known as 9846 Keele Street.
- 2. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend to Council that, subject to final approval of the Development Application under the *Planning Act*, approval of a Heritage Permit be issued for the proposed new construction under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to following conditions:
 - a) The Development Application under the *Planning Act* must receive final approval before the issuance of the Heritage Permit. It is acknowledged that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council regarding the issuance of a Heritage Permit do not constitute support for any Development Application under the *Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
 - b) Any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage; and
 - c) That the revised Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment ("CHRIA") be completed to the satisfaction of Cultural Heritage staff prior to the issuance of the Heritage Permit.

Background

9846 Keele Street is located on the west side of Keele Street, opposite the intersection of Keele Street and Barhill Road and is adjacent to 9860 Keele Street, St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church as shown on Attachment #1. St. Andrew's Church is a designated under Parts IV and V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* ("OHA").

St. Andrews's Presbyterian Church (9860 Keele Street) purchased the subject property in 1973. The current existing structure on the subject property was built in 1974 to be the new manse for St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church after the previous 1859 manse (located around what is now known as Keele Street and Masters Avenue) was found to be in a poor state of repair. In 2012, St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church applied for and received approval for a severance for the manse property known as 9846 Keele Street (Files B.016.12 and A139-12) and the property was subsequently sold.

Analysis and Options

Proposed Alterations

The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing structure to facilitate new construction on the site. The subject property is included in the Maple Heritage Conservation District (" Maple HCD") Inventory in 2005 as shown in Attachment #2 and the entry does not identify the structure as having cultural heritage or sympathetic value but notes the numerous mature trees on the property.

This application is related to Official Plan and Zoning By-Law Amendment, Draft Plan of Subdivision and Site Development planning application Files OP.13.004, Z.13.006, 19T-13V001 and DA.13.038. The initial submission on the subject property was for 10 townhouse units. During the ongoing evaluation of the proposed development the applicant in 2015 appealed the development applications to the then Ontario Municipal Board ("OMB") for non-decision. Since that time, the applicant has revised their proposal to the current proposal for two semi-detached houses (4 units). At this time, the file remains before the Local Planning Area Tribunal ("LPAT", formerly the OMB), and a settlement hearing is scheduled for August 7, 2018.

The applicant has submitted a Cultural Heritage Resources Impact Assessment ("CHRIA") in support of the application. Cultural Heritage staff has reviewed the report and has requested that the CHRIA be revised to include background information regarding previous ownership of the property and confirmation as to when it ceased being used as a manse by the Presbyterian Church and to include the revised elevation drawings. The re-submission of the CHRIA is to be completed to the satisfaction of Cultural Heritage staff prior to the issuance of the Heritage Permit.

The proposed new construction consists of 2 semi-detached houses (4 units) as shown in Attachment #3. The two structures will have a significant front yard setback in order preserve the views of St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church from the south and to avoid injuring the sugar maples along the southern boundary of 9860 Keele Street. This is consistent with the Vaughan Official Plan policy 6.2.2.9 regarding development of properties adjacent to Part IV and V properties.

The proposed semi-detached houses are designed in two separate heritage styles as identified in the Maple HCD Plan and Guidelines. Units 1 and 2 are proposed to be constructed in the Victorian Vernacular style. The main material is red brick with siding at the rear. The trim will have a contrasting colour. The entrance to the garage, while fronting onto Keele Street, is slightly recessed to minimize its presence. Each unit has a front porch that is in keeping with the Victorian Vernacular style.

Units 3 and 4 are located along the northern side of the property, adjacent to St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church and are proposed to be constructed in the Georgian style. The proposed design emphasizes typical Georgian style elements such as a

symmetrical front elevation and low gable roof with side elevation. In this style, the garage entrances are slightly recessed under segmental arches, similar to laneway entrances that were typical in Georgian houses from the first half of the 19th century in buildings that were shared dwellings such as the semi-detached style.

<u>Timeline</u>

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on July 13, 2018, and must be deliberated upon by October 11, 2018, to meet the 90 day timeline.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the application to demolish the existing dwelling and the new construction at 9846 Keele Street. Staff is satisfied that the proposed new construction is consistent with the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan. Staff recommends that the Heritage Vaughan Committee approve the Recommendations in this report, including a recommendation that Council approve a Heritage Permit for the proposed demolition and new construction under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

Attachments

- 1. Location Map
- 2. Maple HCD Inventory Excerpt
- 3. Proposed Site Plan
- 4. Proposed Elevation Drawings and Floor Plans (Units 1, 2, 3 & 4)
- 5. Arborist Report
- 6. Coloured Streetscape Elevations

Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813 Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8653 Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tony Marziliano, Chair

Report Prepared by: John Britto, Council/Committee Administrator