

HERITAGE VAUGHAN REPORT

DATE: Wednesday, May 21, 2025

<u>WARD</u>: 1

TITLE:PROPOSED RE-DEVELOPMENT LOCATED AT 8 MAIN ST. IN THE
KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Vince Musacchio, Interim Deputy City Manager, Planning, Growth Management and Housing Delivery

ACTION: DECISION

<u>Purpose</u>

Seeking a recommendation of approval from the Heritage Vaughan Committee to Council for the proposed re-development located at 8 Main St., a property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District which is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (attachment 1).

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing a re-development at 8 Main St., which currently has a non-contributing building in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.
- The proposal is generally consistent with the relevant policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the Ontario Heritage Act.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal following satisfaction from staff of the recommendations in accordance with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Recommendations

- 1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed redevelopment at 8 Main St. under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be

determined at the discretion of the Director of Development and Parks Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;

- b) That the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
- c) That the applicant enters into a letter of undertaking for the purpose of completion of all proposed landscaping including the 12 large canopy deciduous and coniferous trees in accordance with the approved plans to the satisfaction of the City.
- d) That the applicant enters into a Private Tree removal Permit to the satisfaction of the City.

Background

City of Vaughan Cultural Heritage staff began preliminary discussions with Rubinoff Design Group on the subject property's application in August 2024. Preliminary architectural designs were submitted to Cultural Heritage for review in January 2025.

The following is an excerpt from the applicant submitted Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (attachment 2):

"LHC was retained on 23 October 2024 by M5V The Niagara Inc. on behalf of the property owner (the 'Owner') to prepare a scoped Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) for the property located at 8 Main Street (the 'Property') in the City of Vaughan, Ontario (the 'City').

The Property is located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and is designated under Section 41 Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The Property is classified as non-contributing in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. The Owner is proposing to demolish the existing c. 1960 one-storey frame house and three sheds on the Property to facilitate the construction of a new, single detached, two-storey residence and one-and-a-half-storey pool house."

In mid-January 2025, LHC Heritage Planning & Archaeology Inc. contacted City's Cultural Heritage Staff to discuss the proposal. At the end of February 2025, an application was submitted to Cultural Heritage from the applicant to begin the Heritage Vaughan Committee review. Through much correspondence and material submissions, it was noted that there were some deficiencies, specifically in the Arborist Report, which identified Tree 8 as needing to be saved. City Forestry staff and Cultural Heritage staff conducted separate site visits to discuss the above, to which a Tree Impact Report for

Tree 8 was requested to confirm necessity to preserve and was submitted by April 22, 2025.

Previous Reports/Authority

N/A

Analysis and Options

The submitted Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment describes the surroundings of the subject property as follows:

"The Property is located on the northwest side of Main Street to the northwest of the intersection of Main Street and Lester B. Pearson Street. It is in the Kleinburg Village Character Area and the Historic Village Core of Kleinburg near the geographic centre of the KNHCD. The KNHCD is in the City of Vaugan's northwest corner.

The Property is bounded by Main Street to the southeast, 27 Main Street and 110 Nashville Road to the southwest, 21 Bell Court and 10626 Islington Avenue to the northwest, and Lester B. Pearson and Islington Avenue to the northeast."

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Architectural Style

The proposed re-development offers an architectural design representative of the Neoclassical style, which is a historic and contributing style found within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. The main exterior walls will be clad in stucco and the foundation walls are concrete. The proposed house has a truncated high hipped roof with projecting eaves and prefabricated aluminum soffit and eavestrough. This style of roof is not a common style for neoclassical buildings, but it is roofing style found within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan and can be accepted as such.

A dentilled frieze is present along the southeast, northwest, and the southmost parts of the northeast and southwest elevation, and a plain frieze is present along the central and northmost parts of the northeast and southwest elevation. Five non-functional pedimented, gabled dormers are evenly spaced along the southeast roofline. A single stack chimney is offset towards the right (northeast) and rear (northwest) of the house. Four skylights are set into the roof.

The proposal also includes an outbuilding, which will be utilized as a pool house. It is a $1\frac{1}{2}$ -storey building and has a maximum height of 6.4 metres.

Several options for materials and design will need to be considered as the design progresses, such as: the colour of flashing and caulking, the location of downspouts, the use of pot lights, window material and divisions/muntin, door material, flooring used for the portico, the appearance of exposed foundation walls, the location of utility and service equipment, and materials for the pool house. This will need to be identified in the drawings and materials submitted at the Building Permit stage (attachments 3-5).

Below is an excerpt of the relevant sections of Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. For the full applicable list of policies and guidelines refer to the <u>Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.</u>

4.4.2 Residential Area

Architectural Styles

• The new construction can be contemporary in their construction and composition but shall be compatible by employing the materials, scale, massing or proportions typically found in the heritage buildings within the Heritage Conservation District.

• Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles in spirit (i.e. massing, scale, and proportions) example Victorian, Georgian but not a direct replica. See Section 2.5.

Roof Form, Materials And Features

• Roof design (both form and overhang) in the District shall be compatible with the historic roof types in the village and the selected building style.

• The use of asphalt shingles, simulated slate in a colour that complements the architecture of the building is acceptable. Traditional shingle colours such as greys, blacks and browns are encouraged as these are commonly used in the District.

Dormer

• Dormers in new construction shall be consistent with the style of the house and shall be consistent with traditional dormer scale and proportions.

Windows

• Windows on new construction shall appear similar in scale, proportion and character to those used traditionally and be consistent with the style of the house.

• New windows for a new development shall use materials such as wood, aluminum, composites, wood clad. Use of Vinyl is not acceptable.

Doors

• Doors on new construction shall visually reflect the historic doors in the District and be consistent with the style of the house.

• Modern doors of compositions and materials that are not consistent with the character of the District shall be avoided.

• On façades that are visible from the street, new doors shall maintain historic proportions and placement patterns typically found in the District.

Wall Materials

• The use of traditional materials and products for any new structure shall be visually compatible with the adjacent historical buildings. Traditional cladding materials in KNHCD include red clay brick, stucco and wood siding.

Brick

• Brick shall be of the standard size, Ontario Size variety (no greater than 2½" by 8½"), and of a traditional local colour and texture. CSR size brick is also acceptable. The use of traditional mortar colour, profile, and texture is encouraged.

• Brick coursing shall reflect traditional local examples with respect to pattern, alignment, and colour.

Wood Siding

• Wood siding: 4" horizontal wood clapboard. 5-6" wide may also be used.

• The use of non-traditional or modern materials such as cement fibre-board, and aluminum, in configurations and profiles that complement the original design, is also acceptable.

Porches and Verandahs

• The traditional porches and verandahs are encouraged as features of new construction in the District.

• The new porch design shall be appropriate to the style of the building and/or district.

Colours

• The use of colours complementary to the character of the contemporary style of architecture, appropriate to the period and style of the building, and compatible with surrounding heritage buildings is considered appropriate.

Foundations

• Foundations on new construction shall be of a height that is appropriate to the historic architectural forms of the District.

• Exposed foundation walls above grade shall appear structural, as in a traditional fieldstone foundation, or cultured stone with a similar appearance. The stone shall be of mixed colours and types representative of locally found fieldstone. The stone shall not be laid in a flagstone pattern resembling modern stone veneering.

4.4.4.1 List of Appropriate Materials

Exterior Finish: Use materials compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Roofs: Slopes and layouts compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Doors: Use materials and designs compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Windows: Use windows compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Scale and Massing

The scale and massing of the proposed house exceeds the houses directly adjacent and immediately surrounding it.

The garage(s) does form part of the front façade, which generally does not conform with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan, although it slightly stepped back from the main façade. The building is proposed to be located with the front facade parallel to the roadway, with a pool house in the rear. The southeast elevation of the proposed house has a maximum height of 9.5 metres, which is in keeping with the guidelines of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. The principle face of the building is set back 9.02 metres from the southeast property line.

New buildings shall be designed to preserve the generous side yards typical in the villages. As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses shall be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. The setback of the proposed house's northeast elevation is 2.84 metres from the northeast property line along Lester B. Pearson St. The setback of the proposed house's southwest elevation is 1.52 metres from the southeast property bordering 27 Main St. These setback distances are considerably narrower than the existing house.

Due to concerns of scale and massing, Cultural Heritage staff conducted a site visit with the property owner and heritage consultants in April 2025. It was important for all parties to witness the varying topography of the subject property, including the surrounding and adjacent dwellings. Specifically, the current dwellings at 24 and 27 Lester B. Pearson St., are similar in massing to the proposed re-development and are located on the south and northeast sides of the subject property. The proposed pool house will have a similar sight line to the current shed-like structure and will be located in roughly the same position.

Following the site visit, Cultural Heritage staff is satisfied that the scale and massing of the proposed re-development will be in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan and look of the general area.

4.4.2 Residential Area

Site Planning Guidelines

• New development shall respect the overall setback pattern of the streetscape on which it is proposed. In case the minimum requirement for front yards does not permit this, appropriate variances to the zoning by-laws shall be sought.

• Where there are areas of significant variation in the location of adjacent buildings, the front yard setbacks of new residential infill shall be defined either as the average of the setbacks of the adjoining properties, or where appropriate for historical reasons, aligned with the adjacent heritage buildings.

• New buildings shall generally be located with the front façade parallel to the roadway.

Scale And Massing

• New residential construction in the residential villages shall respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing and shall not predominate over the existing adjacent buildings.

• New development shall not exceed a building height of 9.5 metres.

• New buildings shall be designed to preserve the generous side yards typical in the villages. As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses shall be accommodated without great increases in building frontage.

• In order to ensure that height and massing of new development are compatible, all proposals for new buildings in the District shall include a detailed streetscape elevation of the adjoining structures and features. Corner lots require two streetscapes. If necessary, photographs may also be used.

Garages and Outbuildings

• Garages shall be lower in profile than the principle building and complementary in design and colour.

• A garage shall be located in such a way that the house not the garage is the focal point of the new construction. Below grade garages for single family dwellings is not supported.

Landscape and Tree Protection

Several of the mature deciduous and coniferous trees in the front, side, and rear yards will be removed. This is not in keeping with the policy and guidelines of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan, though the submitted Tree Protection Plan prepared by Lothlorien Garden Consulting (attachments 6-7) offers suggestions. It identifies 21 trees within 6 metres of the property, with 14 of the 21 requiring removals to permit the development of the proposed house and pool house. To restore the loss of trees, City Forestry staff requires 12 large growing trees be planted on the property following construction of the house and pool house. The trees to be planted will be located on the front and to the rear of the proposed development.

Following discussions and assessment with the City's Forestry department, the applicant was directed to retain Tree #8 if possible, so the applicant commenced a Tree Impact Report (attachment 8) conducted for the noted tree.

The tree's condition was re-evaluated from GOOD to FAIR due to structural defects and noted health problems. One of these being a small hollow that was found close to the base of the tree, just below the trunk's main three-stem union. Oozing was noted during the conducted site assessment, which may be an early symptom of a bleeding canker.

Overall, the tree received a risk rating of 'possible,' meaning that severe consequences are possible during an extreme weather event. After reviewing the findings, the City of Vaughan Forestry Department is of the opinion that Tree #8 will not sustain and recover from the effects of the root and crown pruning given the current extent of excavation and build proposed. Taking this into account and reevaluating the structural flaws of the

tree with the extent of decay cavities observed/investigated, Forestry will allow this tree to be included in the tree removal permit application process.

2.9.1 Landscaping Treatment

Existing historical landscapes are to be protected and conserved. Mature trees will be preserved except where removal is necessary due to disease, damage or they pose a risk to public health and safety. Existing vegetation performing a visual screening function shall not be removed.

4.4.2 Residential Area

Landscape

• Landscape features around a building and the overall streetscape like trees, fencing, walkways, driveways, sheds can contribute to the special character of the District and shall be incorporated within the new design.

• Maintain greenspace by having generous setbacks between buildings and presence of mature trees, in addition to decorative shrubbery, in the front, side, and rear yards. The ratio of greenspace to building mass and the side yard setbacks shall be generally consistent with the character of adjacent properties.

• New parking areas shall be introduced in a manner that has minimal impact on lawns, gardens, mature vegetation and the views of the building.

• Visual impact assessments and other guidelines such as Built Features and Vegetation shall be integrated at an early stage in project planning so that any potential impacts on the heritage value of the cultural landscape can be mitigated or even avoided.

4.6.4 Street and Residential Trees

Streetscapes shall conserve the existing green canopy and provide new tree planting where none exists, in order to create a continuous tree canopy along the street.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development and Parks Planning Department is satisfied with the submission. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed re-development at 8 Main St. under the *Ontario Heritage Act* once the recommendations have been completed to the satisfaction of staff. Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.

For more information, please contact: Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152

Attachments

- 1. Location Map
- 2. CHIA Scoped
- 3. Property Plans and Elevations
- 4. Coloured Rendering
- 5. Materials Board
- 6. Arborist Report and Tree Protection Plan
- 7. Post Construction Restoration Plan
- 8. Tree Impact Report for 8 Main Street, Vaughan, Tree 8

Prepared by

Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152

Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8653

Nancy Tuckett, Director of Development and Parks Planning, ext. 8529