### **CITY OF VAUGHAN**

### **REPORT NO. 2 OF THE**

### **HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE**

For consideration by the Committee of the Whole of the City of Vaughan on September 17, 2019

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:09 p.m., on May 15, 2019.

Present: Antonella Strangis, Vice-Chair

Sandra Colica

Erica He

Diana A. Hordo Riccardo Orsini Elly Perricciolo Shira Rocklin John Senisi Dave Snider

Staff present: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator

Sharhzad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage

Rose Magnifico, Council/Committee Administrator

The following items were dealt with:

### 1 NEW CONSTRUCTION – THREE-STOREY, 45-UNIT APARTMENT BUILDING LOCATED AT 8010 KIPLING AVENUE, WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 15, 2019, be approved; and

2) That the applicant be requested to alter the design of the façade by recessing the windows and balconies.

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

1) That the deputation of Mr. Kregg Fordyce, KFA Architects and Planning, representing the applicant, was received.

### **Purpose**

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling and two small buildings and the proposed construction of a three-storey, 45-unit residential rental apartment building at 8010 Kipling Avenue, a property located in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as show on Attachments 2,3, and 4.

### **Report Highlights**

- The Owner is proposing to demolish the existing three (3) buildings and to construct a three-storey rental apartment building at 8010 Kipling Avenue.
- The main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan ("Woodbridge HCD Plan").
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Woodbridge HCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the Ontario Heritage Act.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the Woodbridge HCD Plan.

### Recommendations

- 1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of the existing buildings at 8010 Kipling Avenue and new construction of a three (3) storey, 45-unit building on the same property under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
  - Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
  - b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application

under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;

c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

### **Background**

The subject property is located on the west side of Kipling Avenue north of Woodbridge Avenue and William Street in the Woodbridge HCD and is Designated Part V as per the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The property presently holds three structures:

- a) A 1½ storey aluminum clad older residential building at the eastern end of the property. This building fronts onto Kipling Avenue;
- b) a small aluminum shed at the north edge of the lot,
- c) concrete block and adjacent aluminum shed at the west end (rear) of the property.

The western boundary of the property is adjacent to Canadian Pacific Rail property. North of the property is a six-storey apartment building at 8026-8032 Kipling Avenue. To the south of the property is a single-family brick residence.

At this portion of Kipling Avenue, architectural character is a mixture of older, low scaled buildings and newer larger scaled infill buildings with a sidewalk along Kipling Avenue with few trees and some grassed areas between the sidewalk and the street.

The existing buildings at 8010 Kipling are all noted as "non-contributing" buildings within the Woodbridge HCD Plan. As such, demolition can be supported for a new construction proposal that conforms to the Woodbridge HCD Plan.

Policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge HCD Plan apply to all new construction within the Woodbridge HCD. Policies pertain to all aspects of development which include, but are not limited to height, angular planes, massing, design, pedestrian and vehicular circulation, and landscape.

### **Previous Reports/Authority**

Not applicable.

### **Analysis and Options**

The Owner is proposing a three-storey, 45-unit residential rental apartment building at 8010 Kipling Avenue.

Planned redevelopment of the property is to remove the existing buildings on the property and to construct 45 new rental apartment units with a single level of underground parking. The building will visually bridge the scale between an existing single-family residence on the south side of the property and the multi-unit five-storey condominium building on the north side of the property, extending the full depth of the lot with vehicular access to parking at the north of the lot.

The use of red brick, properly scaled fenestration, landscaping and main entrance facing Kipling Avenue add to the compatibility as a transitional structure within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District.

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development according the Woodbridge HCD Plan.

### 5.3 Heritage Character Statement defines:

"The village character and quality of the district should continue to be defined by:

- a mixture of residential, industrial, commercial and public amenities organized in a community-oriented fashion, with main streets, a village core, open space and healthy neighborhoods, all within an accessible and walkable environment;
- lower density-built form along Kipling Avenue with two to three storey building heights and a mixture of uses including residential, industrial, open space and commerce;
- a concentration of increased height and density, and a mixed use-built form at the village nodes of Kipling and Woodbridge Avenue and the valley portion of Woodbridge Avenue (the Woodbridge Core);
- a diversity and mixture of a minimum of 14 different architectural styles throughout the village;
- a variety of building setbacks, typically having deep frontages and side yards;
- a "green" quality where the built form is generally integrated within the natural landscape and topography, with mature trees and tree canopies, creating a park-like development setting and context; "

The proposed plan aligns with the Heritage Character Statement extracts above.

#### **5.3.1.5. Woodbridge is changing and maturing defines:**

"Woodbridge has never stopped changing and never will: new buildings emerge every year and landscapes are frequently renewed. The original Woodbridge village character lingers amidst this change and is reflected in many of its buildings in terms of architecture, scale and density, in some of the monuments and bridges, in its topography and open spaces, and in the pattern of walkable streets and trails."

The proposed plan aligns with the Woodbridge is changing and maturing extracts above.

### **5.3.2.2. Archaeology** states:

"The District includes areas of potential archaeological significance (mostly in proximity to the river)."

The proposed application included a Stage 1&2 Archaeological Assessment (November 2017) for the subject lands. A letter of review and acceptance regarding this report from the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport (March 2018) has been provided by the Owner and satisfies archaeological concerns.

#### 5.3.2.3. Architecture notes:

"Buildings of two to three storey building heights, from different construction periods and uses coexist, side by side, including: residential homes, barns, farmhouses, commercial buildings, institutional and industrial buildings."

The proposed plan of a three (3) storey residential building aligns with the Architecture extract above.

### 5.3.2.4. Scale and height notes:

"Buildings in Woodbridge are primarily of a two to three storey scale and height that is pedestrian friendly and allows ample sun penetration and open views (OPA #240 allows for a concentration of increased height and scale of up to four storeys maximum at the historic commercial nodes of Woodbridge and Kipling Avenue, within the Woodbridge Avenue commercial core). Buildings include: doors and windows facing directly onto the street, creating an animated environment for pedestrians. There are no blank walls."

The development plan of a three (3) storey residential building aligns with the Architecture extracts above.

### 5.3.2.5. Circulation, vehicular access and parking notes:

"Pedestrians can move freely and comfortably on all streets (there are sidewalks on both sides of the street, except for portions of Clarence Street, Wallace Street, William Street and James Street). On-site parking, garages, and parking structures are generally concealed behind or below inhabited buildings."

The proposed plan provides one level of underground parking for 41 vehicles (including 2 Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act parking spaces) and 1 surface parking space. Thus, the proposed plan aligns with the Circulation, vehicular access and parking policy above.

#### 6.1.2 Heritage Attributes (Kipling Avenue North and South) guidelines state:

- "2. New and renovated buildings and landscapes must:
  - conserve and enhance the tree canopy;

- front directly onto Kipling Avenue, and provide a landscaped front yard that contributes to the overall streetscape;
- contribute to the quality and connectivity of the pedestrian environment;
- serve to enhance the overall system of trails, pathways and pedestrian walkways;
- maintain the intimate scale of the street, through the building mass, the length of facades, and the detailing of architecture and landscape architecture;
- be no taller than 3 floors (11 m); and
- conserve and enhance views to the valleys east and west,
- provide a design that is sympathetic with the character of adjacent properties.
- 3. New buildings must have a residential character and should be conducive to a mix of uses, including small-scaled commercial uses.
- 4. All interventions within Kipling Avenue should contribute through structures and/or landscape to the design of significant points of entry and gateways.
- 5. Generally, new buildings should be built to a minimum 3m setback from the front property line or street line, and transition back to the setback line of existing contributing buildings, to maintain the character of the deep front yards."

The applicant has provided a satisfactory Site Plan, Arborist Report and Landscape Plan that will contribute to the overall streetscape. The proposed 45-unit residential rental building is set back 5.67m from the front property line which meets the above guidelines.

The proposed development fronts directly onto Kipling Avenue with landscaping in the form of planter boxes. This is an appropriate style to meet the above policy.

The overall massing and height of the building as it fronts Kipling Avenue is consistent with the proportion of building in the immediate context which meets the above policy.

#### **6.2.5 Approach to Non-Contributing Buildings** states:

"Non-contributing buildings are not to be demolished until such time as a demolition permit has been issued. Additions and alterations to non-contributing buildings can have an impact on contributing buildings and the overall character of Woodbridge. As non-contributing buildings are modified, and as new buildings are built, these should contribute to the heritage character of Woodbridge as a whole, and specifically to the heritage character of adjacent contributing properties. The City of Vaughan may require a Heritage Impact Assessment when it considers that cultural heritage value may exist, or be impacted by any new construction."

The applicant has provided a satisfactory Heritage Impact Assessment shown on Attachment 1. The proposed development aligns with the intent that new buildings have a positive impact on the overall character of Woodbridge.

### 6.2.6 Activities that are Subject to Review states:

- "All matters relating to the City of Vaughan Official Plan, and the regulation of zoning, site plan control, severances, variances, signage, demolitions, and building relocation.
- All municipal public works, such as street lighting, signs, landscaping, tree removal, utility locations and street and infrastructure improvements.
- All activities of the municipal and regional governments."

The property is undergoing a proposed Official Plan and Zoning By-Law amendment:

Current:

Official Plan: Low-Rise Mixed-Use Zoning: R3 Residential Zone

Proposed:

Official Plan: Mid-Rise Mixed-Use

Zoning: RA3 Residential Apartment Zone 3

#### **6.2.8 Appropriate Materials**

"Exterior Finish: Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent, or in some instances brick to match existing conditions.

Exterior Detail: Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings.

**Roofs:** Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the architectural style. Skylights in the form of cupolas or monitors are acceptable, if appropriate to the style.

**Doors:** Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed; transom windows and paired sidelights with real glazing bars; wood french doors for porch entrances; single-bay, wood panelled garage doors.

**Windows:** Wood frames; single or double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style; real glazing bars, or high quality simulated glazing bars; vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7."

The applicant has provided a satisfactory Architectural Materials and Colour Rendering shown on Attachments 5 and 11 that will contribute to the overall character of the district.

### **6.3 Architectural Guidelines for New Buildings, Additions and Alterations** states:

"Within the heritage district new architecture will invariably be constructed. This will occur on vacant sites, as replacement buildings for non-contributing existing structures, or severely deteriorated older buildings.

Entirely new buildings may be proposed:

- where no previous buildings existed or,
- where original buildings are missing or,
- where severely deteriorated buildings are removed through no fault of the current owner, or
- where noncontributing buildings are removed.

The intention in creating designs for new buildings should not be to create a false or fake historic building. Instead the objective must be to create a sensitive well-designed new structure 'of its time' that is compatible with the character of the district and its immediate context."

The applicant has provided a satisfactory Site Plan, architectural massing, and building design that will contribute to the overall character of the district.

#### **6.3.2 Contemporary Design** states:

"Just as it is the characteristic of the Woodbridge HCD to contain contributing buildings in at least 12 recognizable styles, contemporary work should be 'of its time'".

The applicant has provided a satisfactory Site Plan, building form and style that will contribute to the overall character of the district.

#### 6.3.3 Architectural Guidelines states:

Material Palette: "There is a very broad range of materials in today's design palette, but materials proposed for new buildings in the district should include those drawn from ones historically in use in Woodbridge. This includes brick, stone, traditional stucco; wood siding and trim, glass windows and storefronts, and various metals. The use and placement of these materials in a contemporary composition and their incorporation with other modern materials is critical to the success of the fit of the proposed building in its context. The proportional use of materials, use of extrapolated construction lines (window head, or cornices for example) projected from the surrounding context, careful consideration of colour and texture all add to the success of a composition."

The applicant has provided a satisfactory Materials Palette that is comprised of a suitable integration of red and yellow masonry which is reflective of the area; complementary charcoal aluminum cladding, galvanized steel and glass is complementary to the overall character of the district.

### **Proportions of Parts** states:

"For new buildings in this heritage district, the design should take into account the proportions of buildings in the immediate context and consider a design with proportional relationships that will make a good fit."

The proposed development presents a height and scale relationship appropriate to the adjacent heritage home and transitions adequately to the higher five (5) storey

condominium building north of the property. The applicant has provided a satisfactory architectural massing and form that is in keeping with the overall character of the district.

### **Detailing** states:

"For new buildings in the Woodbridge Heritage District, the detailing of the work should again refer to the nature of the immediate context and the attributes of the Character Area in which it is to be placed."

The development includes a contemporary take on traditional characteristics such as solid brick walls with punched out windows; double hung vertical two (2) over two (2) windows that are present in the adjacent 8006 Kipling Avenue. The applicant has provided a satisfactory massing, proportions, and style that will contribute to the overall character of the district.

#### 6.4.1 Street Wall Setbacks states:

- 1. New buildings must be sympathetic to the setbacks of adjacent contributing buildings.
- 2. When new buildings are located adjacent to existing contributing buildings that are set back from the property or street line, new buildings should transition back to the setback line of existing contributing buildings in order to maintain open views and vantage points from the street to the contributing buildings.
- 3. Existing contributing buildings should retain their historic setbacks, and create front landscaped courtyards built on the "green" character of Woodbridge's streetscapes.
- 4. Except where noted, new buildings must follow the City of Vaughan Zoning Bylaw in regard to side yards, back yards, interior yards and exterior yards.
- 5. All buildings must have active uses facing the street. No building shall have a blank wall facing a street or public space.

The applicant has provided a design which includes satisfactory setbacks that are behind the required 45-degree angular plan from the front corner of 8006 Kipling Avenue and are in keeping with the overall surrounding context and massing of the district.

#### **6.4.1.3 Kipling Avenue North and South requires:**

"New development should be set back a minimum of three metres from the property line and a maximum of 4.5 metres to maintain the deep setback character of contributing buildings and allow for landscaped front yards.

Where heritage contributing buildings are located on either side of a new development site and are set further back from the 3.0m minimum building setback line; the setback for the development site will be the average of the front yard setbacks of the two properties on either side."

The applicant has provided a satisfactory Site Plan and streetscape rapport that will contribute to the overall streetscape. The proposed 45-unit residential rental

building is set back 5.67m from the front property line which meets the above guidelines.

### **6.4.2 Street Wall Height and Scale and 6.4.2.1 Woodbridge HCD (General)** notes:

"In Woodbridge, the height and scale of buildings has a relatively consistent "Village" character, generally free standing 2-3 storey buildings with the exception of small concentrations of up to 6 storeys in certain locations."

The proposed development is three (3) storeys which aligns with the above policy.

### 6.5 Transitions of New Buildings in Relation to Heritage Resources states:

"ii. Conservation of Heritage Character: New development must be sympathetic to this character and must develop in a way that does not detract, hide from view, or impose in a negative way, on existing heritage contributing resources, as per the following height and setback guidelines.

v. Front yard Setback Guidelines: New buildings must be sympathetic to the setbacks of adjacent contributing buildings. When new buildings are located adjacent to existing contributing buildings that are set back from the property or street line, new buildings should transition back to the setback line of existing contributing buildings in order to maintain open views and vantage points from the street to the contributing buildings.

Where heritage contributing buildings are located on either side of a new development site, and are set further back from either a zero building setback line along Woodbridge Avenue, or a 3.0m minimum building setback line along Kipling Avenue; the setback for the development site will be the average of the front yard setbacks of the two properties on either side.

Where heritage contributing buildings are set further back from either a zero building setback line along Woodbridge Avenue, or a 3.0m minimum building setback line along Kipling Avenue, any new development adjacent to the heritage contributing building must be set back, at a minimum, to a line measured at 45 degrees from the front corner of the existing heritage contributing building."

The applicant has provided a satisfactory Site Plan and street setting which meets the above guidelines for the district.

#### 6.6.3 Tree Canopy and Vegetation states:

"Streetscapes should conserve the existing green canopy and provide new tree planting where none exists, in order to create a continuous tree canopy along the street.

Trees on public and private property, having a tree diameter of twenty (20) centimetres or more or having a base diameter of twenty (20) centimetres or more, must be conserved, and the requirements of the City of Vaughan Tree Bylaw 185-2007 (Amended to 052-2018) must be adhered to.

Prior to the issuance of a Heritage Permit, Building Permit or Site Plan approval, a tree conservation plan is required to be submitted and approved by the City. An on-going tree maintenance and replacement strategy should be developed in order to maintain the extensive forest canopy, especially as maturing trees start to show signs of deterioration or stress.

The forested character should be encouraged to expand within the urban context, within the neighbourhoods and especially along streets or trail routes in order to create a continuous system of open spaces, provide a "soft" transition to the built form and ensure that Woodbridge is continuously planned as 'a community within a park setting'."

The applicant has provided a satisfactory Site Plan, Arborist Report and Landscape Plan which includes an acceptable tree replacement strategy of multi-stem trees and shrubs on the landscape buffer at the entrance; planting beds and shrubs on the north and west side of the property.

### 6.7.1 Roads, Curbs, Sidewalks and Streetscape states:

"Kipling Avenue - Should have a continuous planting of street trees on either side of the street and incorporate existing mature trees."

The Landscape Plan suggests a continuity of soft landscape material at street edge as well as perimeter definition, which provides a satisfactory Site Plan and Landscape Plan that will contribute to the overall streetscape.

### 6.7.6 Parking states

"On-site parking, including structured parking should not be visible from the street or from public spaces. Parking areas should be concealed and buffered with buildings with active uses.

The proposed development meets the above policy as a masonry wall with stepped landscape feature over the front facade disguises the underground parking functions behind, and brings the massing and structure within a human proportion and scale.

### **Financial Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

### **Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations**

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

### **Conclusion**

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed demolition and new construction conforms to

the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition and new construction at 8010 Kipling Avenue under the Ontario Heritage Act.

**For more information,** please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

### **Attachments**

- 1. Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
- 2. Context Plan
- 3. Aerial Plan
- 4. Site Plan
- 5. Colour Rendering
- 6. Parking Plan Level 1
- 7. Ground Floor Plan
- 8. Level 2 & 3 Floor Plan
- 9. Street Elevation
- 10. North, South & West Elevations
- 11. Architectural Materials
- 12. Landscape Plan

### Prepared by

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813 Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191 Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

/CM

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

2 RELOCATION AND RESTORATION OF EXISTING BUILT HERITAGE PROPERTIES, DEMOLITION OF ONE EXISTING STRUCTURE AND CONSTRUCTION OF 25 NEW UNITS

89 & 99 NASHVILLE ROAD AND THE FORMER PART LOT OF 10515 REGIONAL ROAD 27 – KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE

CONSERVATION DISTRICT

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 15, 2019, be approved.

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the following deputants, representing the applicant, was received:
  - 1. Mr. Alfred Casati, Rafael & Bigauskas Architects;
  - 2. Mr. Paul Oberst, Paul Oberst Architect;
  - 3. Mr. Phillip Carter, Phillip H. carter Architect; and
  - 4. Mr. Yurij M. Pelech, Bessant Pelech Associates Inc.

#### **Purpose**

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding a Heritage Permit application for the proposed minor relocation of the two existing heritage dwellings located at 89 & 99 Nashville Road, the demolition of an existing accessory building located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District ('KNHCD') Plan and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and the proposed construction of 25 new residential units.

### **Report Highlights**

- The Owner is proposing to restore and relocate 2 contributing heritage dwellings, and construct semi-detached and townhouse units on the site for a total of 27 dwellings on site.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under 42 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act ("OHA").
- Staff are recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the KNHCD Plan.

### **Recommendations**

- THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend approval to Council for the proposed restoration and relocation of two existing heritage dwellings at 89 & 99 Nashville Road.
- 2. THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend approval to Council for the proposed new construction for 25 new units at 89 & 99 Nashville Road under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to following conditions:
  - a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be

- determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application; and
- c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.
- d) That the applicant continue to work with Cultural Heritage staff during the Site Plan application process in final selection of materials and landscaping details.

### **Background**

The subject properties are municipally known as 89 and 99 Nashville Road and are located on the south side of Nashville Road, east of Regional Road 27 within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District (Attachment 1) and located within the Village of Kleinburg.

There are three structures on the properties; a Georgian house at 89 Nashville Road, an altered Ontario Gothic Cottage building at 99 Nashville Road, and a small barn which straddles the south property line. The current locations of the buildings is shown in Attachment 2 and the outbuilding is located on southern edge of 99 Nashville Road and is visible along the east side of Regional Road 27.

### PreviousReports/Authority

Not applicable.

### **Analysis and Options**

The applicant has submitted an Official Plan Amendment, a Zoning By-law Amendment, a Draft Plan of Subdivision, and a Site Development Application (Files OP.16.009, Z.16.036, 19T-18V006 and DA.18.028, respectively) with the Development Planning Department. The applicant has appealed the Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendment applications to the Local Planning Appeal Tribunal (LPAT, formerly known as the Ontario Municipal Board) for non-decision. Four prehearing conferences have been held regarding the appeals and the hearing will begin on Tuesday, October 8, 2019.

Prior to the hearing, the development applications will be considered by Council at a future Committee of the Whole meeting.

### The Proposal requires the minor relocation of two existing heritage dwellings and the demolition of an existing outbuilding

The subject lands of 89 Nashville and 99 Nashville Road each contain a dwelling that is recognized in the KNHCD Plan as a contributing property. Both properties are identified in the 2001 inventory as having cultural heritage value as shown in Attachment 3.

89 Nashville Road is a 1 ½ storey house with a central door and surround and is of a mid 19<sup>th</sup> century Georgian/Classic Revival style. The foundation under the front part of the house is fieldstone, and appears to be original. The foundation under the salt-box tail appears to be newer. The salt box tail may have been a later alteration, with the original tail being the typical narrow extension with a front-to-back gable roof. The ground floor framing of the front part of the house consists of two large summer beams running front to back on either side of the stair, with large joists running side-to-side. All the framing appears to be original. Although the original inventory entry suggests a 1920's date for the dwelling, it is likely of much earlier construction, between 1850-1870's as implied by the property history and construction.

99 Nashville Road is thought to have been constructed in the 1870's and features a pitched roof, one and half storey Ontario Gothic Cottage style that is oriented towards towards Regional Road 27 and has been altered over time. This original central entry door has been relocated to the right. The window to the right of the door is the only opening in the building that is probably of its original size and shape. The entire rear portion of the house is a later addition, replacing what would have been a narrower original kitchen tail, probably fitted with a kitchen verandah on one side or another. The exact footprint of the original tail is unknown.

The third-largest structure is located on 99 Nashville Road and is a red 2-storey wood framed barn with insulbrik siding. It is of interest as part of a larger assemblage of a village property, but has no cultural heritage value itself. There was another stone and brick outbuilding towards the rear of the property line, but it appears to have been removed around 2005-2007, and no heritage permit from that time has been identified.

89 & 99 Nashville Road together represent four separate lots of Registered Plan 9, created in 1848 and are lots from the original plan of the Village of Kleinburg, as shown in Attachment 5.

The subject properties also include a lot created through severance application B052/14 where a small section of 10515 Regional Road 27 was severed from the main property. At that time, the applicant noted in their Committee of Adjustment application that the severed parcel (Part A) was to be combined with 89 and 99 Nashville Road for a future development application. The combined footprint of the subject properties in its current situation as shown in Attachment 5a.

The applicant has submitted a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) in support of the application. The CHIA outlines the current condition, history, and proposed relocation of the existing heritage dwellings as shown in Attachment 6a. A preliminary conservation plan was also submitted at this time. As the proposal evolved, the applicant has submitted an addendum that addresses these changes and updates the Conservation Plan. Cultural Heritage staff has reviewed the CHIA and Conservation Plan and concur that it meets the criteria of the City of Vaughan's CHIA and Conservation Plan Guidelines.

The planned relocation and restoration of the heritage dwellings also reflect the policy in Section 5.2.2 of the KNHCD Plan for Heritage Buildings states "to retain and conserve the buildings identified in the Heritage District Plan as having heritage importance to the District", as the dwellings known as 89 & 99 Nashville Road are to be restored with new rear additions for intended residential use. This restoration and proposed residential use is consistent with the above policy. Hereafter, the existing Georgian building currently located at 89 Nashville Road will be referred to as 'Unit 5' and the existing Ontario Gothic Cottage building currently located at 99 Nashville Road will be referred to as 'Unit 6'.

Prior to the relocation and restoration of the heritage dwellings known as Units 5 and 6, a letter of credit in the amount of \$100 per square foot is to be obtained from the owner to ensure Units 5 and 6 (89 & 99 Nashville) are preserved and maintained during and after their relocation until their restoration is complete, as facilitated by the Site Plan application process.

The Proposal is for construction of two new semi-detached houses and five new townhouse blocks for a total of 25 new residential units, in addition to the two original dwellings relocated on site

The KNHCD Plan provides several objectives, policies in the District regarding the retainment of heritage buildings, future development and new construction. The following segment of this report reviews the relevant policies of the District in connection to this proposal.

**Section 5.2.5 Future Development in the District** states "to encourage new development that will enhance the heritage character of the District as infill construction on vacant lands and replacement construction or alterations to nonheritage buildings".

**Section 5.2.5 Future Development in the District** states "to guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within".

The proposed Site Plan for the subject properties would provide new development that conserves the existing heritage buildings relatively similar to the current siting, and will provide infill construction that is compatible for contemporary needs as shown in Attachment 7.

**Section 6.3 Policies for New Development** states that "new development should be limited to vacant sites or to sites currently occupied by unsympathetic buildings. Even the most skillfully executed heritage-friendly building cannot replace the value of a real heritage building".

The proposed development will integrate the existing heritage buildings into a new residential development with associated underground parking to be located in the remaining portions of the subject property. The proposed new dwellings are designed in a sympathetic architectural Victorian townhouse style and incorporates underground parking to ensure that landscaping for the development remains sympathetic onto Nashville Road as shown in Attachment 8.

**Section 6.5 Policies for the Valley Setting** states that "development and redevelopment in the valleys should respect their heritage character as natural, farming and milling areas".

The rear of the property (a portion of 10515 Regional Road 27) is located in the valley lands (as described in Section 2.4.3 of the KNHCD Plan) according to the KNHCD Plan map. However, through the development application process is proposed to be redeveloped and rezoned to residential uses. The proposed millinspired design of the exposed parking garage is consistent with the milling history of this area as shown in Attachments 9 and 10.

**Section 9.7.2 New Development in the Valleys** states to "use local historical precedent, suitable for the valley landscape, such as mill buildings, farmhouses and rural buildings, or village-like clusters of buildings. See Section 9.1 for Architectural

Styles and Details" Or, use modern designs that deliberately fit tightly into the landscape, making use of low profiles, natural materials, bermed walls, planted roofs."

The proposed interior units located (approximately) in the Valleys Lands are Edwardian inspired which is consistent with Section 9.2, as shown in Attachment 11.

The 19<sup>th</sup> Century Mill Building is listed in this policy as a suitable style for larger buildings and it is this inspiration for the townhouse units on the western edge and southern side of the subject property.

**Section 9.7.2 New Development in the Valleys** states to "locate parking lots away from roads and screen them from view by generous planting.

As shown on Attachment 12, parking has been located underground to minimize and screen the impact of parking away from the roads and effectively screen them out of public view. The units will have access to underground parking as shown.

The materials and palettes for the proposed new construction is shown on Attachment 13 and is in keeping with the proposed architectural styles.

### **Proposed Landscaping**

The proposed scale of alteration and development on the subject property will result in the existing trees on site to be removed to accommodate the underground parking. Compensation planting will be required in accordance with City's Tree Protection Protocol and new tree planting will be mandated though the development process. In anticipation of the Site Plan application moving forward, there will be further work done in landscaping and possible retention of views.

The following are landscape policies applicable to this site.

**Section 9.7.2 New Development in the Valleys** states to "minimize changes to landform; minimize removal of native topsoil; minimize non-permeable paving".

As shown in Attachment 14 b, the subject site will be undergoing significant alteration and reconstruction in landscaping and hardscaping to accommodate underground parking. Further to the changes regarding this property, the applicant proposes to replant and use non-permeable paving. Additional details are to be determined through the Site Plan application process.

**Section 9.7.4 Preserving the Natural Experience** states "if existing vegetation provides such screening, do not remove it".

The existing trees adjacent to subject property are proposed to be maintained and protected.

Section 9.7.7 of the KNHCD Plan on Plantings lists a number of invasive plant species to avoid. The submitted Landscape Plan (Planting Plan) does not include any of the invasive plant species listed in this section outlined in Section 9.7.7 of the KNHCD Plan

**Section 9.7.6 Exterior Lighting** states to "minimize exterior lighting in the valleys and on the ridgelines".

**Section 9.7.6 Exterior Lighting** states to "prevent the spread of light beyond where it is required, by screening with suitable planting".

The lighting plan proposes that the majority of lighting to be interior within the courtyard which will minimize visible lighting outside of the development.

### **Timeline**

This Application is subject to the 90-day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This Application was declared complete on May 6, 2019, and must be deliberated upon by August 4, 2019, to meet the 90-day timeline.

#### **Financial Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

#### **Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations**

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

#### Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the application for the proposed relocation of the two existing heritage dwellings and the demolition of an existing accessory building designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and the proposed construction of 2 semi-detached and 21 new townhouse units located within the KNHCD Plan for relocation and restoration of existing structure, demolition of an accessory structure and construction of new units and is satisfied that the proposal is consistent with the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed new construction under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the recommendations in this report.

**For more information,** please contact: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

#### **Attachments**

- Location Map
- 2. Subject Properties
- KNHCD Inventory Excerpts
- 4. Streetview of 89 & 99 Nashville Road, 10515 Regional Road 27
- Site Plan
  - a. Historic Site Plan
  - b. Current Site Plan
- 6. Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) & Conservation Plan
  - a. Original Report
  - b. CHIA & CP Addendum
- 7. Proposed Site Plan
- 8. Proposed Elevation Along Nashville Road (North Side of Subject Site)
  - a. Proposed Elevations North and South
  - b. Proposed Elevations Units 1-4
  - c. Proposed Elevations Units 5 & 6 (89 & 99 Nashville Road)
  - d. Proposed Elevations Units 7-8
- 9. Proposed Elevations Along Regional Road 27
  - a. Regional Road 27 Elevations 9 18
  - b. Regional Road 27 Units 9, 10,12,14,16
  - c. Regional Road 27 Units 11, 13, 15,17
  - d. Regional Road 27 Unit 18
- 10. Proposed Elevations for South Side (formerly part of 10515 Regional Road27)
  - a. Units 19, 21
  - b. Units 20, 22
- 11. Proposed Elevations East Side
  - a. Units 23-27
  - b. Units 23, 24, 26
  - c. Units 25, 27
- Site Sections
  - a. Units 1-4, 5, 6, 7-8
  - b. Units 19-27
  - c. Heritage Units (89 & 99 Nashville Road) Proposed Floor Plan
  - d. North and East Sections
  - e. South and West
- 13. Material Samples and Palettes
  - a. Units 9-22 (Along Regional Road 27 and South Section

- b. Units 1 & 2, foundation & mill "wall" of Units 9-22
- c. Mill Wall Units 9-22 Sample A
- d. Mill Wall Units 9-22 Sample B
- e. 89 Nashville Road
- f. 99 Nashville Road
- 14. Landscapes Drawings and References
  - a. Coversheet & Information
  - b. Landscape Planting Elevations
  - c. Landscape Hardscape Plan
  - d. Landscape Planting Plan
  - e. Planting Palette
  - f. Hardscape Palette
- 15. Site Grading Plan
- 16. Coloured Renderings
  - a. Nashville Road
  - b. Nashville Road and Regional Road 27
  - c. Highway & Interior of Site
  - d. South, East and West Elevations

### Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115
Nick Borcescu, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8191
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

/CM

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

# 3 NEW CONSTRUCTION AND DEMOLITION – SINGLE DETACHED DWELLING 14 NAPIER STREET KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 15, 2019, be approved.

#### **Purpose**

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling, rear yard shed and the proposed construction of a detached two (2) storey dwelling and accessory structure located at 14 Napier Street, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District (KNHCD) Plan and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act as* shown on Attachments 2, 3 and 4.

### **Report Highlights**

- The Owner is proposing to demolish the existing dwelling and to construct a new detached dwelling and accessory structure (pool house).
- The main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan').
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the KNHCD Plan.

### **Recommendations**

- 1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of the existing detached dwelling and shed at 14 Napier Street and new construction of a detached dwelling unit and accessory structure (pool house) under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
  - Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
  - b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the Ontario Planning Act or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
  - c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

### **Background**

The subject property is located on the west side of Napier Street in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and is Designated Part V as per the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The property presently holds one dwelling and one accessory structure (shed).

The Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) submitted in support of the application concludes that the existing dwelling does not have any cultural heritage value as identified in the KNHCD Plan or Regulation 9/06 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Cultural Heritage staff concurs with this assessment. (Attachment #1) Staff find that there are no adverse impacts on the heritage character of the area by the proposed demolition or new construction.

Policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan apply to all new construction within the KNHCD. Policies pertain to all aspects of development which include, but are not limited to height, angular planes, massing, design, pedestrian and vehicular circulation, and landscape.

### Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

#### **Analysis and Options**

The Owner is proposing a two-storey dwelling and accessory building (pool house) at 14 Napier Street.

A Minor Variance application is required for the proposed dwelling, citing setbacks and height non-conformity.

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development according the KNHCD Plan.

**Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives – Future Development** defines: "To encourage new development that will enhance the heritage character of the District as infill construction on vacant lands and replacement construction or alterations to non-heritage buildings".

The proposed new dwelling is the third such replacement construction on a lot that contains a non-heritage building. The existing building dates back to 1974, with various alterations/additions to it up to 1990. The previous building before it dates to 1956.

### Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives – Future Development states:

"To guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within".

The overall proposed design is compatible with the character of the District in terms of architectural style, height, setbacks and massing: it is a clean representation of a Georgian-style two-storey house with a modestly-modern 2-car garage at front but retaining and respecting the purist architectural elements of the Georgian architectural style.

### Section 9.5.3.1 – Residential Villages – Site Planning states:

"Site new houses to provide setbacks that contrast with adjacent properties, in order to create the variety characteristics of the village".

The proposed dwelling is sited to use part of the foundation of the existing house but set closer to the street on the west corner of the site. Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that the siting of the proposed dwelling reinforces the variety of setbacks characteristic of the village setting.

### Section 9.5.3.2 – Residential Villages – Architectural Style states:

- 1. "Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles. See Section 9.2.
- 2. Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style. See Section 9.2.1".

The proposed Georgian style design includes a front red brick façade that plays with the symmetrical aspects and classical proportions by balancing a 2-car garage with a proportional box window extrusion on the ground floor, and subtle decorative Limestone elements and banding on both levels. A limestone covered front entry portico, with solid-panel main door with sidelights enhances the entry. The windows are in keeping with Georgian-style double hung windows with clean line stone sills and framing. The applicant has provided a satisfactory architectural drawings set that delineates a house which will contribute positively to the overall character of the district.

### **Section 9.5.3.2 – Residential Villages – Scale & Massing states:**

"New residential construction in the Residential Villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing."

The proposed two-storey dwelling and accessory structure (pool house) aligns with local heritage precedents in terms of scale and massing. The proposed height and massing of the dwelling is in keeping with Georgian Neo-Classical styles found in Kleinburg and Vaughan.

### **Section 9.5.3.2 – Residential Villages – Scale & Massing states:**

"A new house should fit in with the scale of its neighbourhood".

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, which is made up of a variety of one-storey and two-storey dwellings. The proposed dwelling will be sited in the same area as the existing house. The applicant has provided a satisfactory massing, proportions, and style that will contribute to the overall character of the district. Where the proposed building exceeds the allowable maximum height, it is noted that the proportions of the building and the positioning on the site will not constitute a negative impact upon the immediate property, its neighbours, or the larger scale area. (attachment 5, 6, 7)

### Section 9.3.8 Outbuildings for Heritage Buildings states:

- 1. "Connected garages should minimize their street presence.
- 2. Use single-bay garage doors, compatible with traditional designs".

The plan includes a double garage connected to the main dwelling with placement on the front façade. The two proposed single-bay garage doors align with historical designs similar to those found in Section 9.3.8. showcasing a panelling division of 1/3 over 2/3 so as to reinforce the human scale of the front elevation. The applicant has provided a satisfactory design that will contribute to the overall character of the district.

### **Section 9.10.1 Heritage Buildings – Appropriate Materials** states:

"Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent" or "smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding."

The proposed plans include a satisfactory Materials Palette this is comprised of a suitable integration of red brick with limestone accents, charcoal roofing, garage doors and window detailing. Limestone material is not listed as a material in the appropriate or non-appropriate sections. However, it has a historical precedence in Vaughan. Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that the proposed limestone material is appropriate for the selected style of building. (Attachment #10)

### Section 9.5 – The Village Forests states:

"Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees".

The application includes a satisfactory Tree Inventory and Protection Plan which details the retention of eight (8) trees and removal of one (1) tree on the property. Staff are satisfied that the proposed tree removal and subsequent replacement with four (4) trees adheres to the guidelines and the City of Vaughan's Council endorsed Tree Protection Protocol. (Attachment #9)

### **Financial Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

### **Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations**

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

### **Conclusion**

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed demolition and new construction conforms to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition and new construction at 14 Napier Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

**For more information,** please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

### **Attachments**

- 1. Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA)
- 2. Aerial Plan
- 3. Context Plan
- 4. Site Plan
- 5. Colour Rendering
- 6. Floor Plans
- 7. Building Elevations
- 8. Pool House
- 9. Landscape Plan and Details
- 10. Architectural Materials

### Prepared by

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813 Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191 Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

/CM

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

The meeting adjourned at 9:06 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Antonella Strangis, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator