



COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE REPORT

DATE: Tuesday, June 04, 2019

WARD(S): 1

TITLE: NEW CONSTRUCTION AND DEMOLITION – SINGLE DETACHED DWELLING 14 NAPIER STREET, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Nick Spensieri, Deputy City Manager, Corporate Services

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling, rear yard shed and the proposed construction of a detached two (2) storey dwelling and accessory structure located at 14 Napier Street, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District (KNHCD) Plan and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as shown on Attachments 2, 3 and 4.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing to demolish the existing dwelling and to construct a new detached dwelling and accessory structure (pool house).
- The main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD Plan').
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the KNHCD Plan.

Recommendations

The Deputy City Manager, Corporate Services, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of May 15, 2019 (Item 3, Report No. 2), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 15, 2019, be approved.

Background

Recommendation and Report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 15, 2019:

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of the existing detached dwelling and shed at 14 Napier Street and new construction of a detached dwelling unit and accessory structure (pool house) under Section 42 of Ontario Heritage Act, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the Ontario Planning Act or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
 - c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

The subject property is located on the west side of Napier Street in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and is Designated Part V as per the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The property presently holds one dwelling and one accessory structure (shed).

The Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) submitted in support of the application concludes that the existing dwelling does not have any cultural heritage value as identified in the KNHCD Plan or Regulation 9/06 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Cultural Heritage staff concurs with this assessment. (Attachment #1) Staff find that there are no adverse impacts on the heritage character of the area by the proposed demolition or new construction.

Policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan apply to all new construction within the KNHCD. Policies pertain to all aspects of development which include, but are not limited to height, angular planes, massing, design, pedestrian and vehicular circulation, and landscape.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

The Owner is proposing a two-storey dwelling and accessory building (pool house) at 14 Napier Street.

A Minor Variance application is required for the proposed dwelling, citing setbacks and height non-conformity.

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development according the KNHCD Plan.

Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives – Future Development defines:

“To encourage new development that will enhance the heritage character of the District as infill construction on vacant lands and replacement construction or alterations to non-heritage buildings”.

The proposed new dwelling is the third such replacement construction on a lot that contains a non-heritage building. The existing building dates back to 1974, with various alterations/additions to it up to 1990. The previous building before it dates to 1956.

Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives – Future Development states:

“To guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within”.

The overall proposed design is compatible with the character of the District in terms of architectural style, height, setbacks and massing: it is a clean representation of a Georgian-style two-storey house with a modestly-modern 2-car garage at front but retaining and respecting the purist architectural elements of the Georgian architectural style.

Section 9.5.3.1 – Residential Villages – Site Planning states:

“Site new houses to provide setbacks that contrast with adjacent properties, in order to create the variety characteristics of the village”.

The proposed dwelling is sited to use part of the foundation of the existing house but set closer to the street on the west corner of the site. Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied

that the siting of the proposed dwelling reinforces the variety of setbacks characteristic of the village setting.

Section 9.5.3.2 – Residential Villages – Architectural Style states:

1. *“Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles. See Section 9.2.”*
2. *Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style. See Section 9.2.1”.*

The proposed Georgian style design includes a front red brick façade that plays with the symmetrical aspects and classical proportions by balancing a 2-car garage with a proportional box window extrusion on the ground floor, and subtle decorative Limestone elements and banding on both levels. A limestone covered front entry portico, with solid-panel main door with sidelights enhances the entry. The windows are in keeping with Georgian-style double hung windows with clean line stone sills and framing. The applicant has provided a satisfactory architectural drawings set that delineates a house which will contribute positively to the overall character of the district.

Section 9.5.3.2 – Residential Villages – Scale & Massing states:

“New residential construction in the Residential Villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing.”

The proposed two-storey dwelling and accessory structure (pool house) aligns with local heritage precedents in terms of scale and massing. The proposed height and massing of the dwelling is in keeping with Georgian Neo-Classical styles found in Kleinburg and Vaughan.

Section 9.5.3.2 – Residential Villages – Scale & Massing states:

“A new house should fit in with the scale of its neighbourhood”.

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, which is made up of a variety of one-storey and two-storey dwellings. The proposed dwelling will be sited in the same area as the existing house. The applicant has provided a satisfactory massing, proportions, and style that will contribute to the overall character of the district. Where the proposed building exceeds the allowable maximum height, it is noted that the proportions of the building and the positioning on the site will not constitute a negative impact upon the immediate property, its neighbours, or the larger scale area. (attachment 5, 6, 7)

Section 9.3.8 Outbuildings for Heritage Buildings states:

1. *“Connected garages should minimize their street presence.”*
2. *Use single-bay garage doors, compatible with traditional designs”.*

The plan includes a double garage connected to the main dwelling with placement on the front façade. The two proposed single-bay garage doors align with historical designs similar to those found in Section 9.3.8. showcasing a panelling division of 1/3 over 2/3

so as to reinforce the human scale of the front elevation. The applicant has provided a satisfactory design that will contribute to the overall character of the district.

Section 9.10.1 Heritage Buildings – Appropriate Materials states:

“Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent” or “smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.”

The proposed plans include a satisfactory Materials Palette this is comprised of a suitable integration of red brick with limestone accents, charcoal roofing, garage doors and window detailing. Limestone material is not listed as a material in the appropriate or non-appropriate sections. However, it has a historical precedence in Vaughan. Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that the proposed limestone material is appropriate for the selected style of building. (Attachment #10)

Section 9.5 – The Village Forests states:

“Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees”.

The application includes a satisfactory Tree Inventory and Protection Plan which details the retention of eight (8) trees and removal of one (1) tree on the property. Staff are satisfied that the proposed tree removal and subsequent replacement with four (4) trees adheres to the guidelines and the City of Vaughan’s Council endorsed Tree Protection Protocol. (Attachment #9)

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed demolition and new construction conforms to the policies and guidelines within the KHNCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition and new construction at 14 Napier Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

1. Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA)
2. Aerial Plan
3. Context Plan
4. Site Plan
5. Colour Rendering
6. Floor Plans
7. Building Elevations

8. Pool House
9. Landscape Plan and Details
10. Architectural Materials

Prepared by

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254