

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE REPORT

DATE: Tuesday, June 04, 2019

WARD(S): 1

**TITLE: RELOCATION AND RESTORATION OF EXISTING BUILT HERITAGE PROPERTIES, DEMOLITION OF ONE EXISTING STRUCTURE AND CONSTRUCTION OF 25 NEW UNITS
89 & 99 NASHVILLE ROAD AND THE FORMER PART LOT OF 10515 R**

FROM: Nick Spensieri, Deputy City Manager, Corporate Services

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward recommendations from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding a Heritage Permit application for the proposed minor relocation of the two existing heritage dwellings located at 89 & 99 Nashville Road, the demolition of an existing accessory building located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District ('KNHCD') Plan and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and the proposed construction of 25 new residential units.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing to restore and relocate 2 contributing heritage dwellings, and construct semi-detached and townhouse units on the site for a total of 27 dwellings on site.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under 42 (1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* ("OHA").
- Staff are recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the KNHCD Plan.

Recommendations

The Deputy City Manager, Corporate Services, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of May 15, 2019 (Item 2, Report No. 2), for consideration:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 15, 2019, be approved.

Background

Recommendation and Report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 15, 2019:

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend approval to Council for the proposed restoration and relocation of two existing heritage dwellings at 89 & 99 Nashville Road.
2. THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend approval to Council for the proposed new construction for 25 new units at 89 & 99 Nashville Road under Section 42 of Ontario Heritage Act, subject to following conditions:
 - a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the Ontario Planning Act or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application; and
 - c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.
 - d) That the applicant continue to work with Cultural Heritage staff during the Site Plan application process in final selection of materials and landscaping details.

The subject properties are municipally known as 89 and 99 Nashville Road and are located on the south side of Nashville Road, east of Regional Road 27 within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District (Attachment 1) and located within the Village of Kleinburg.

There are three structures on the properties; a Georgian house at 89 Nashville Road, an altered Ontario Gothic Cottage building at 99 Nashville Road, and a small barn which straddles the south property line. The current locations of the buildings is shown in Attachment 2 and the outbuilding is located on southern edge of 99 Nashville Road and is visible along the east side of Regional Road 27.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

The applicant has submitted an Official Plan Amendment, a Zoning By-law Amendment, a Draft Plan of Subdivision, and a Site Development Application (Files OP.16.009, Z.16.036, 19T-18V006 and DA.18.028, respectively) with the Development Planning Department. The applicant has appealed the Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendment applications to the Local Planning Appeal Tribunal (LPAT, formerly known as the Ontario Municipal Board) for non-decision. Four pre-hearing conferences have been held regarding the appeals and the hearing will begin on Tuesday, October 8, 2019.

Prior to the hearing, the development applications will be considered by Council at a future Committee of the Whole meeting.

The Proposal requires the minor relocation of two existing heritage dwellings and the demolition of an existing outbuilding

The subject lands of 89 Nashville and 99 Nashville Road each contain a dwelling that is recognized in the KNHCD Plan as a contributing property. Both properties are identified in the 2001 inventory as having cultural heritage value as shown in Attachment 3.

89 Nashville Road is a 1 ½ storey house with a central door and surround and is of a mid 19th century Georgian/Classic Revival style. The foundation under the front part of the house is fieldstone, and appears to be original. The foundation under the salt-box tail appears to be newer. The salt box tail may have been a later alteration, with the original tail being the typical narrow extension with a front-to-back gable roof. The ground floor framing of the front part of the house consists of two large summer beams running front to back on either side of the stair, with large joists running side-to-side. All the framing appears to be original. Although the original inventory entry suggests a 1920's date for the dwelling, it is likely of much earlier construction, between 1850-1870's as implied by the property history and construction.

99 Nashville Road is thought to have been constructed in the 1870's and features a pitched roof, one and half storey Ontario Gothic Cottage style that is oriented towards

towards Regional Road 27 and has been altered over time. This original central entry door has been relocated to the right. The window to the right of the door is the only opening in the building that is probably of its original size and shape. The entire rear portion of the house is a later addition, replacing what would have been a narrower original kitchen tail, probably fitted with a kitchen verandah on one side or another. The exact footprint of the original tail is unknown.

The third-largest structure is located on 99 Nashville Road and is a red 2-storey wood framed barn with insulbrik siding. It is of interest as part of a larger assemblage of a village property, but has no cultural heritage value itself. There was another stone and brick outbuilding towards the rear of the property line, but it appears to have been removed around 2005-2007, and no heritage permit from that time has been identified.

89 & 99 Nashville Road together represent four separate lots of Registered Plan 9, created in 1848 and are lots from the original plan of the Village of Kleinburg, as shown in Attachment 5.

The subject properties also include a lot created through severance application B052/14 where a small section of 10515 Regional Road 27 was severed from the main property. At that time, the applicant noted in their Committee of Adjustment application that the severed parcel (Part A) was to be combined with 89 and 99 Nashville Road for a future development application. The combined footprint of the subject properties in its current situation as shown in Attachment 5a.

The applicant has submitted a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) in support of the application. The CHIA outlines the current condition, history, and proposed relocation of the existing heritage dwellings as shown in Attachment 6a. A preliminary conservation plan was also submitted at this time. As the proposal evolved, the applicant has submitted an addendum that addresses these changes and updates the Conservation Plan. Cultural Heritage staff has reviewed the CHIA and Conservation Plan and concur that it meets the criteria of the City of Vaughan's CHIA and Conservation Plan Guidelines.

The planned relocation and restoration of the heritage dwellings also reflect the policy in Section 5.2.2 of the KNHCD Plan for Heritage Buildings states *"to retain and conserve the buildings identified in the Heritage District Plan as having heritage importance to the District"*, as the dwellings known as 89 & 99 Nashville Road are to be restored with new rear additions for intended residential use. This restoration and proposed residential use is consistent with the above policy. Hereafter, the existing Georgian building currently located at 89 Nashville Road will be referred to as 'Unit 5' and the existing Ontario Gothic Cottage building currently located at 99 Nashville Road will be referred to as 'Unit 6'.

Prior to the relocation and restoration of the heritage dwellings known as Units 5 and 6, a letter of credit in the amount of \$100 per square foot is to be obtained from the owner to ensure Units 5 and 6 (89 & 99 Nashville) are preserved and maintained during and after their relocation until their restoration is complete, as facilitated by the Site Plan application process.

The Proposal is for construction of two new semi-detached houses and five new townhouse blocks for a total of 25 new residential units, in addition to the two original dwellings relocated on site

The KNHCD Plan provides several objectives, policies in the District regarding the retainment of heritage buildings, future development and new construction. The following segment of this report reviews the relevant policies of the District in connection to this proposal.

Section 5.2.5 Future Development in the District states *“to encourage new development that will enhance the heritage character of the District as infill construction on vacant lands and replacement construction or alterations to nonheritage buildings”*.

Section 5.2.5 Future Development in the District states *“to guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within”*.

The proposed Site Plan for the subject properties would provide new development that conserves the existing heritage buildings relatively similar to the current siting, and will provide infill construction that is compatible for contemporary needs as shown in Attachment 7.

Section 6.3 Policies for New Development states that *“new development should be limited to vacant sites or to sites currently occupied by unsympathetic buildings. Even the most skillfully executed heritage-friendly building cannot replace the value of a real heritage building”*.

The proposed development will integrate the existing heritage buildings into a new residential development with associated underground parking to be located in the remaining portions of the subject property. The proposed new dwellings are designed in a sympathetic architectural Victorian townhouse style and incorporates underground parking to ensure that landscaping for the development remains sympathetic onto Nashville Road as shown in Attachment 8.

Section 6.5 Policies for the Valley Setting states that *“development and redevelopment in the valleys should respect their heritage character as natural, farming and milling areas”*.

The rear of the property (a portion of 10515 Regional Road 27) is located in the valley lands (as described in Section 2.4.3 of the KNHCD Plan) according to the KNHCD Plan map. However, through the development application process is proposed to be redeveloped and rezoned to residential uses. The proposed mill-inspired design of the exposed parking garage is consistent with the milling history of this area as shown in Attachments 9 and 10.

Section 9.7.2 New Development in the Valleys states to *“use local historical precedent, suitable for the valley landscape, such as mill buildings, farmhouses and rural buildings, or village-like clusters of buildings. See Section 9.1 for Architectural Styles and Details” Or, use modern designs that deliberately fit tightly into the landscape, making use of low profiles, natural materials, bermed walls, planted roofs.”*

The proposed interior units located (approximately) in the Valleys Lands are Edwardian inspired which is consistent with Section 9.2, as shown in Attachment 11.

The 19th Century Mill Building is listed in this policy as a suitable style for larger buildings and it is this inspiration for the townhouse units on the western edge and southern side of the subject property.

Section 9.7.2 New Development in the Valleys states to *“locate parking lots away from roads and screen them from view by generous planting.*

As shown on Attachment 12, parking has been located underground to minimize and screen the impact of parking away from the roads and effectively screen them out of public view. The units will have access to underground parking as shown.

The materials and palettes for the proposed new construction is shown on Attachment 13 and is in keeping with the proposed architectural styles.

Proposed Landscaping

The proposed scale of alteration and development on the subject property will result in the existing trees on site to be removed to accommodate the underground parking. Compensation planting will be required in accordance with City’s Tree Protection Protocol and new tree planting will be mandated through the development process. In

anticipation of the Site Plan application moving forward, there will be further work done in landscaping and possible retention of views.

The following are landscape policies applicable to this site.

Section 9.7.2 New Development in the Valleys states to *“minimize changes to landform; minimize removal of native topsoil; minimize non-permeable paving”*.

As shown in Attachment 14 b, the subject site will be undergoing significant alteration and reconstruction in landscaping and hardscaping to accommodate underground parking. Further to the changes regarding this property, the applicant proposes to replant and use non-permeable paving. Additional details are to be determined through the Site Plan application process.

Section 9.7.4 Preserving the Natural Experience states *“if existing vegetation provides such screening, do not remove it”*.

The existing trees adjacent to subject property are proposed to be maintained and protected.

Section 9.7.7 of the KNHCD Plan on Plantings lists a number of invasive plant species to avoid. The submitted Landscape Plan (Planting Plan) does not include any of the invasive plant species listed in this section outlined in Section 9.7.7 of the KNHCD Plan

Section 9.7.6 Exterior Lighting states to *“minimize exterior lighting in the valleys and on the ridgelines”*.

Section 9.7.6 Exterior Lighting states to *“prevent the spread of light beyond where it is required, by screening with suitable planting”*.

The lighting plan proposes that the majority of lighting to be interior within the courtyard which will minimize visible lighting outside of the development.

Timeline

This Application is subject to the 90-day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This Application was declared complete on May 6, 2019, and must be deliberated upon by August 4, 2019, to meet the 90-day timeline.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the application for the proposed relocation of the two existing heritage dwellings and the demolition of an existing accessory building designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and the proposed construction of 2 semi-detached and 21 new townhouse units located within the KNHCD Plan for relocation and restoration of existing structure, demolition of an accessory structure and construction of new units and is satisfied that the proposal is consistent with the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed new construction under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the recommendations in this report.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Subject Properties
3. KNHCD Inventory Excerpts
4. Streetview of 89 & 99 Nashville Road, 10515 Regional Road 27
5. Site Plan
 - a. Historic Site Plan
 - b. Current Site Plan
6. Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) & Conservation Plan
 - a. Original Report
 - b. CHIA & CP Addendum
7. Proposed Site Plan
8. Proposed Elevation Along Nashville Road (North Side of Subject Site)
 - a. Proposed Elevations North and South
 - b. Proposed Elevations Units 1-4
 - c. Proposed Elevations Units 5 & 6 (89 & 99 Nashville Road)
 - d. Proposed Elevations Units 7-8
9. Proposed Elevations Along Regional Road 27
 - a. Regional Road 27 Elevations 9 - 18
 - b. Regional Road 27 Units 9, 10,12,14,16
 - c. Regional Road 27 Units 11, 13, 15,17

- d. Regional Road 27 Unit 18
- 10. Proposed Elevations for South Side (formerly part of 10515 Regional Road 27)
 - a. Units 19, 21
 - b. Units 20, 22
- 11. Proposed Elevations East Side
 - a. Units 23-27
 - b. Units 23, 24, 26
 - c. Units 25, 27
- 12. Site Sections
 - a. Units 1-4, 5, 6, 7-8
 - b. Units 19-27
 - c. Heritage Units (89 & 99 Nashville Road) Proposed Floor Plan
 - d. North and East Sections
 - e. South and West
- 13. Material Samples and Palettes
 - a. Units 9-22 (Along Regional Road 27 and South Section
 - b. Units 1 & 2, foundation & mill “wall” of Units 9-22
 - c. Mill Wall Units 9-22 Sample A
 - d. Mill Wall Units 9-22 Sample B
 - e. 89 Nashville Road
 - f. 99 Nashville Road
- 14. Landscapes Drawings and References
 - a. Coversheet & Information
 - b. Landscape Planting Elevations
 - c. Landscape Hardscape Plan
 - d. Landscape Planting Plan
 - e. Planting Palette
 - f. Hardscape Palette
- 15. Site Grading Plan
- 16. Coloured Renderings
 - a. Nashville Road
 - b. Nashville Road and Regional Road 27
 - c. Highway & Interior of Site
 - d. South, East and West Elevations

Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Nick Borcescu, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8191

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254