CULTURAL HERITAGE DISTRICT IMPACT ASSESSMENT

14 Napier Street
Vaughan, Ontario, Canada

2 March 2019

prepared by

MW HALL CORPORATION

architecture + planning + urban design
+ heritage conservation
+ real estate development

21 Scollard St., #103
Toronto, ON M5R 1G1
CANADA
416.920.8105
mark@mwhallcorp.com
www.mwhallcorp.com
TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0 INTRODUCTION

2.0 CULTURAL HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT

2.1 History of the property and evolution to date
2.2 Context and setting of the subject property
2.3 Architectural evaluation of the subject property
2.4 Redevelopment proposal for the subject property and potential impacts on identified cultural heritage resources
2.5 Examination of preservation / mitigation options for cultural heritage resources
2.6 Impact of development and mitigating measures – summary

3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

REFERENCES

APPENDICES

1- Vicinity Map, 14 Napier Street, City of Vaughan, Ontario
2- Aerial Photograph of Vicinity of subject property
3- Photographs, 14 Napier Street
4- Photographs of adjacent buildings on Napier Street
5- Vaughan Official Plan map
6- Heritage Conservation District Map, Kleinburg-Nashville
7- Preliminary drawings of planned redevelopment of subject property
8- Curriculum Vitae, Mark Hall, OAA, MRAIC, FAIA, RPP, CAHP
14 Napier Street
Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District
Vaughan, Ontario, Canada
CULTURAL HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT
2 March 2019

1.0 INTRODUCTION TO THE PROPERTY

This Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) follows City of Vaughan Guidelines for Cultural Heritage Impact Assessments, updated February 2017.

The Village of Kleinburg-Nashville is consolidated as part of the City of Vaughan. The property at 14 Napier Street is located east of and outside the historic centre of Kleinburg. It is within the designated heritage district within Vaughan under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act. The property at 14 Napier Street is east of Islington Avenue, on the west side of Napier Street. Napier Street has predominantly two storey newer residences, with some 1 ½ storey heritage houses (see photos in Appendix). 14 Napier Street is a 20th century residence that is to be demolished, and a new residence constructed on the existing site. Design for the planned improvements have been reviewed vis-à-vis Guidelines for the heritage district reflecting issues noted in the Guidelines.

The owner of the property, at the direction of Vaughan Heritage Department staff, and working with R G Consulting Inc, Design Planning Consultants, retained MW HALL CORPORATION, Heritage Conservation Consultants to prepare a truncated Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) of the property to review the planned redevelopment relative to requirements of the Heritage District Plan.

The subject property is owned by:
Matteo Iacovellu
99 Charles Cooper Court
Kleinburg, Ontario
L0J 1C0

Contact information is as follows:
Frank Campoli
JTF Homes Ltd.
T: 416 787 1333
F: 416 787 5436
e: frank.campoli@jtfhomes.ca
2.1 History of the property and evolution to date

The property was purchased by the present owner for purposes of redevelopment. Application for Site Plan approval is currently under review at City of Vaughan to redevelop the property. The existing house and garage are relatively contemporary buildings and are not Listed or Designated except as being within and under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act heritage district.

2.2 Context and setting of the subject property

There are individual heritage buildings in the vicinity of 14 Napier Street, but the majority of the houses on Napier are not individually Designated or Listed structures. The core area of the heritage district is essentially located along Islington Avenue.

There are three 1 ½ storey Victorian era residences with more recent additions at 51, 31 and 9 Napier Street, plus a Georgian styled house at 36 Stegman’s Mill Road at the corner of Napier Street. All other residences on the street are a mixture of more contemporary eras and styles. There are only residential structures on Napier Street.

There no significant or mature trees in the front yard. There are two existing mature trees located on the property line at the southern property line, and one mature tree at the rear property line to the west as indicated on the site plan for the planned improvements. Parks and Forestry Operations department has reviewed and approved the planned redevelopment of the property and issued a permit for the planned changes.

Section 9.2.1 of The Conservation District Study identifies various architectural styles that would be in keeping with the Conservation Study, including the Georgian style. Existing residences on the street are a mixture of 19th and 20th century styles.

2.3 Architectural evaluation of the subject property

The existing later 20th century ranch style house on the property is a single storey structure with low pitch roof, with a two-car garage facing the entrance drive, with stucco and stone exterior. The building would be categorized in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage District Study as ‘Existing Non-Heritage Styles’ Ranch House, 1950-1975.
2.4 Redevelopment proposal for the subject land and potential impacts on identified heritage resources

Planned redevelopment of 14 Napier Street property is to provide a new Georgian style, two-storey residence with a two-car garage entered from the driveway, facing Napier Street. Although the Georgian style typically has a symmetrical façade facing the street, this structure will have a main entry door at the approximate midpoint of the façade, with two bays of windows to the left of the main entry, and three bays, incorporating the garage door at grade to the right side of the main entry, a mansard roof with three dormers, and predominantly red brick cladding with limestone trims at the front façade that generally conform with the Georgian style. While there is a fireplace planned it appears to be gas fired rather than the more typical wood fired, therefore no chimneys planned.

The prominently placed garage door on the front façade of the house is to be a dark grey colour, with three-bay panels at the ground floor approximating the three bays of six-over-six double hung windows at the second floor. The darker garage door will approximate the darker glazing at the second floor. While it is assumed that the windows will be insulated glass, details have not yet identified the sizes of mullions and muntins, which should be 7/16” width simulated divided light, with internal spacers to match the colour of the mullions/muntins. Punched windows, windows and roof forms appear consistent with the Georgian style. Existing historic structures are a part of the concept.

It is our opinion that the scale and general architectural character of the planned replacement residence are generally consistent with most of the architectural character of Napier Street and the Conservation District, an improvement over the original non-heritage house, and generally consistent with heritage district guidelines.
2.5 Examination of preservation/mitigation options for cultural heritage resources

It is our opinion that planned replacement of the existing non-historic styled residential building is compatible with the architectural character of the District and generally in accord with heritage buildings presently within the District.

2.6 Avoidance Mitigation

There are no significant cultural heritage resources to be avoided or affected by the planned improvements/changes to 14 Napier Street. The subject property is within the Designated Heritage District, and therefore is required to respect exiting character of the HCD. Revisions/additions to the existing residence reflect, in general, architectural guidelines for the District.

2.7 Salvage Mitigation

Salvation mitigation is not considered applicable in this case and is not considered. No elements which are likely to be affected by the planned changes to 14 Napier Street have salvage value.

2.8 Historical commemoration

Historical commemoration is not considered applicable in this case and is not considered.
2.9 Impact of development / mitigating measures – summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Potential Negative Impact</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• destruction of any, or part of any, significant attributes or features</td>
<td>no destruction of any part of significant heritage attribute or feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• isolation of a heritage attribute from its surrounding environment, context, or a significant relationship</td>
<td>not applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• a change in land use where the change in use negates the property’s cultural heritage value</td>
<td>not applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• siting, massing, and scale</td>
<td>planned improvements are consistent with the heritage district.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• design that is sympathetic with adjacent properties</td>
<td>building design fits requirements noted to be sympathetic with structures within the heritage district and represent an architectural style at 14 Napier Street more in keeping with the Heritage District.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

Section 2 of the Ontario Planning Act indicates that the City of Vaughan shall have regard to matters of Provincial Interest such as the conservation of features of significant architectural, cultural, historical, archeological, or scientific interest. In addition, Section 3 of the Planning Act requires that the decision of Council shall be consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement (PPS 2014).

Policy 2.6.3 of the PPS requires that “...Planning authorities shall not permit development and site alteration on adjacent lands to protected heritage property except where the proposed development and site alteration has been evaluated and it has been demonstrated that the heritage attributes of the protected heritage property will be conserved.”

“Conserved” means the identification, protection, management and use of built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscapes and archeological resources in a manner that ensures their cultural heritage value or interest is retained under the Ontario Heritage Act.”

The property contains one potential built heritage resource that does not have cultural value or interest under the Ontario Heritage Act, other than being an existing property within the Heritage Conservation District. It is our opinion that the planned improvements to 14 Napier Street are consistent with continuing maintenance of the Kleinburg-Nashville Conservation District and make a positive contribution to maintenance of the District.

This Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment is respectfully submitted by

MW HALL CORPORATION

per: Mark Hall, OAA, MRAIC, FAIA, RPP, CAHP
President
REFERENCES

a) Kleingburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Study and Plan,
b) Ontario Planning Act, Section 2, regarding City Council responsibility for Provincial Interest heritage properties
c) Ontario Planning Act, Section 3, regarding requirement that Council decisions are consistent with Provincial Policy Statement of 2014.
d) Ontario Provincial Policy Statement [PPS 2014] section 2.6.3
e) City of Vaughan Guidelines for Heritage Impact Assessments, 2017 [truncated]

APPENDICES

1- Vicinity Map, 14 Napier Street, City of Vaughan, Ontario
2- Aerial Photograph of Vicinity of subject property
3- Photographs, 14 Napier Street
4- Photographs of adjacent buildings on Napier Street
5- Vaughan Official Plan map
6- Heritage Conservation District Map, Kleingburg-Nashville
7- Preliminary drawings of planned redevelopment of subject property
8- Curriculum Vitae, Mark Hall, OAA, MRAIC, FAIA, RPP, CAHP
3a - View from East, 14 Napier St.
3c- North Elevation, 14 Napier St.
4a- View from East, adjacent to 14 Napier St.
In recognition of the variety of contexts within the District, it is divided into three kinds of elements: the villages, the road links, and the valley lands. The design guidelines for new construction, in Section 9.5 of the Plan, reflect these differing contexts.

Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Study
District Structure

In recognition of the variety of contexts within the District, it is divided into three kinds of elements: the villages, the road links, and the valley lands. The design guidelines for new construction, in Section 9.5 of the Plan, reflect these differing contexts.

Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Study
District Structure


14 Napier Street
7- Preliminary Drawings of Planned Redevelopment
Mark Hall, OAA, MRAIC, RPP, MCIP, FAIA, AICP, CAHP

ACADEMIC + PROFESSIONAL TRAINING
Harvard University, Master of City Planning in Urban Design
US Navy Civil Engineer Corps Officer School, Certificate of Graduation
Construction and Design Management
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Graduate Studies in Planning and Economics
Pratt Institute, Master Degree program studies in Planning and Economics
University of Michigan, Bachelor of Architecture

DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION EXPERIENCE
Mariposa Land Development Company [1438224 Ontario Inc.]
Toronto / Orillia, President
Orchard Point Development Company [1657923 Ontario Inc.]
Orillia, Vice President
MW HALL CORPORATION, Toronto, Toronto, President
Teddington Limited, Toronto,
Development advisor, Planner, Architect
ARCHIPLAN, Los Angeles, Principal/President
DMJM, Los Angeles, Planner
Gruen Associates, Los Angeles, Planner
US NAVY, Civil Engineer Corps, Officer
Apel, Beckert & Becker, Architects, Frankfurt
Green & Savin, Architects, Detroit

CITY DEVELOPMENT / URBAN DESIGN / REAL ESTATE DEVELOPMENT
Mark Hall has directed a number of city development and urban design projects, including waterfront revitalization, commercial, multi-unit residential, industrial facilities and major mixed use projects in both public and private clients/employers. He has worked on staff for public agencies, including real estate development and property management services. He understands the dynamics of city development, the techniques required for successful implementation, and procedural, financial and political requirements. His experience and contributions range throughout Canada, the United States, Europe, Southeast Asia, the Middle East and the Arctic. As a result of his extensive experience in this area, he has been invited to participate in the Regional Urban Design Assistance Team [R/UDAT] programs of the American Institute of Architects, and a program of waterfront renewal in Toronto by the Ontario Professional Planners Institute. He is a Registered Professional Planner in Ontario, member of the Canadian Institute of Planners, and a founding member of the American Institute of Certified Planners. Recently, as president of Mariposa Land Development Company, he designed and built a 54 unit condominium apartment project designed to upgrade the waterfront of historic downtown Orillia, Ontario. The building has spurred a number of revitalization projects in Orillia.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION / ADAPTIVE REUSE
Mr. Hall has developed special interest and expertise in historic preservation and adaptive reuse of historic structures and city districts. He has served as president of the Los Angeles Conservancy, and designed projects combining historic preservation and appropriate adaptive reuse of the properties. He is a member of the Canadian Association of Heritage Professionals. Recently he served as preservation architect on renovations of the RC Harris Water Plan, a designated cultural heritage building in Toronto. He has served as architect for restoration and additions to a number of historic houses in the Annex, Beaches and other areas of central city Toronto, as well as Belleville, Orillia, Mississauga and Brampton, and in Los Angeles and Florida. He frequently works with property developers, municipalities and heritage property owners as consultant regarding historic properties of concern to municipalities in which they are working.

ARCHITECTURE
A licensed architect for over 40 years, Mr. Hall is licensed to practice in Canada and the US. He has been responsible for design and construction of a number of significant projects: mixed use structures, corporate headquarters and industrial facilities, military facilities, multi-unit residential, civic and commercial centres, and seniors housing. He understands the design, construction and real estate development process, as well as management of multi-disciplinary and client concerns for cost effective, efficient, award-winning structures. Many of the structures he has built are the result of implementing more comprehensive master planned developments. For his work in historic preservation, education and community service he was awarded Fellowship in the American Institute of Architects.

COMMUNITY & EDUCATION SERVICE
In addition to professional practice, Mr. Hall has made major commitments to teaching and community service. He taught urban design and city planning at USC, UCLA, Southern California Institute of Architecture [SCI ARC] and Boston Architectural Center. While at Harvard he worked with the Harvard Urban Field Service in Boston’s Chinatown. As an officer in the US NAVY he was awarded a special Commendation Medal for development of a master plan for the NAVY’s Arctic Research Laboratory and the adjacent Inupiat community of Barrow, Alaska. His work has been published in professional journals and has received various awards and honors. He served on the board of directors and later as president of the Southern California chapter of the American Institute of Architects. He was co-chair for the Ontario Professional Planners Institute [OPPI] of a multi-disciplinary design Charette to determine the future of the Metropolitan Toronto waterfront, and later on a committee of the Ontario Association of Architects looking into solutions to urban sprawl. He has served as president of the non-profit Housing Development Resource Centre [HRDC] and as president of Toronto Brigantine, a non-profit organization providing sail training aboard two tall ships in the Great Lakes.