

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Thursday, September 26, 2024

WARD: 1

TITLE: PROPOSED ALTERATIONS TO RESIDENTIAL/COMMERCIAL BUILDING LOCATED AT 10489 ISLINGTON ROAD, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek a recommendation of approval from the Heritage Vaughan Committee to Council regarding the proposed alterations to the residential/commercial building located at 10489 Islington Road, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachments 1-9.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing alterations to the residential/commercial building located at 10489 Islington Road.
- The existing main structure is identified as a contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District (KNHCD) Plan.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan. Staff is recommending approval of the proposal.
- Heritage Vaughan Committee review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend Council approve the proposed alterations to residential/commercial building at 10489 Islington Road under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the Ontario *Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- c) That prior to issuance of Heritage Permit, the applicant enters into a letter of undertaking for the purpose of completion of all landscaping in accordance with the approved plans to the satisfaction of the City;
- d) THAT prior to issuance of Heritage Permit, the applicant applies for a Private Tree Removal to the satisfaction of the City; and
- e) That the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

Background

Excerpt information from the 2017 CHIA (Attachment 2):

Situated at the corner of Islington Avenue and Kellam Street in the Kleinburg village is a large, two-storey Edwardian Classicism house built between 1901 and 1902, a small shop with boomtown front, and a detached garage. The main block of the house was later expanded with an extension, then a large wing, all of which front onto Islington Avenue.

The house at 10489 Islington Avenue is of design or physical value as a relatively early and representative example of an Edwardian Classicism residence and has contextual value as a contributing structure to the Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage Conservation District. Also on the property is a small early 20th century shop with characteristic boomtown front and historical association with Group of Seven painter A.J. Casson, who painted a street scene including the building in 1929. The latter building also has contextual value since it supports the current and historic commercial character of the Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage Conservation District.

A rear extension and addition of a wing to the house have not detracted from its early 20th century appearance including its square plan, two-storey massing, hip roof with pie-ended platform and centre dormer, asymmetrical fenestration, and a prominent, hipped roof open verandah with brick piers. The shop has undergone significant alterations on the interior and around the windows but appears virtually unchanged in form and overall

material from photographs taken in the first half of the 20th century. Centrally located in the Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage Conservation District, the property retains and supports its surrounding village context.

The 2019 CHIA Addendum (Attachment 3) states:

The property includes an existing two-storey Edwardian residence with front verandah ('Building A'); rear wood frame addition and two-storey wing; a small boomtown front shop ('Building B'); and a detached garage.

2081447 Ontario Inc. intends to demolish the rear wood-frame addition, detached garage, and all but the front façade of Building B and construct a two-storey, 566.68 square metre mixed residential and commercial building on Kellam Street, and a one storey brick and glass addition to the Islington Avenue façade. This new work will involve replacing the front verandah on the main block of the house with a two-level verandah extending to the wing, converting some window openings to entrances, and several minor alterations to Building A.

Previous Reports/Authority

Heritage Permit - HP.2014.022.00.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.

Golder's 2017 CHIA (Attachment 2) concluded that the proposed development of the property will directly impact the original sections of Buildings A and B but determined that the scale and design of the proposed development is compatible with the heritage architecture and streetscape of the surrounding buildings and the Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage Conservation District (KNHCD). To mitigate the loss of three façades of Building B, which was found to be in poor physical condition, Golder recommended that the building be preserved by record prior to its partial demolition. In August 2019, Golder completed a draft Heritage Documentation Report (Attachment 4) for Building B and a Heritage Maintenance Plan (Attachment 9) which included a series of recommendations to ensure the property retains its current level of preservation and physical condition.

2.3.5 Alteration & Additions to Contributing Properties

New attached additions to contributing buildings to be designed to complement the design of the original building. Additions are to be subordinate so as not to overwhelm the heritage character of the original building. Any alterations and additions to contributing buildings require a Heritage Impact Assessment as well as a Heritage Permit.

A Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment report was completed in 2017, with an addendum report submitted in 2019, to discuss new work involving the replacement of the front verandah on the main block of the house with a two-level verandah extending to the wing, converting some window openings to entrances, and several minor alterations to Building A.

Cultural Heritage Division appreciates the efforts to preserve the façade whilst demolishing the back portion of Building B due to its poor physical condition. This portion of Islington Avenue is forever depicted in the painting “Kleinburg” by Group of Seven artist A.J Casson, so by preserving the façade, we preserve the streetscape in the painting as well.

Overall, the addition does not overwhelm the existing heritage structures and does not overtake the front view of the streetscape on Islington. Along Kellam Street, the proposed addition enhances the heritage charm and has a positive impact on the area.

2.5.2.3 Scale and Massing

New commercial construction shall respect local heritage precedents for scale and massing. This includes existing historic and contributing buildings, as well as those that have been lost but are recorded in historical photographs. Heights within the commercial designation generally shall not exceed a maximum building height of 9.5 metres. Heights and building footprints shall be consistent with those found in adjacency within the HCD. Minor variances related to building height will not be supported.

The proposed height for the subject property does exceed the maximum building height of 9.5 metres, measuring in at 10.62 metres to the roof line. After much discussion, staff is satisfied that though slightly taller, the building does not impose its size on the heritage structure. The site line from the front of the heritage building is not distracted by the rear addition as it has been strategically designed to “hide” behind the building.

4.2.4.2 New Additions to Heritage Buildings

New attached additions to heritage buildings shall be designed to complement the design and not to overwhelm the heritage character of the original building. Consideration shall be given to its relationship with the heritage building as well as the historic district.

The construction of an exterior addition in an historic building may seem essential for a proposed new use. A new addition shall be proposed only after it is determined that the needs cannot be met on another site or by altering secondary, non-character defining interior spaces. For any new proposed addition to an existing heritage building the following general guidelines must be considered:

Site Planning

- *Location of the proposed addition is a key consideration for the complementary additions to heritage buildings. Usually, additions shall be located at the rear of the original building or, if located to the side, be set back from the street frontage of the original building.*
- *Additions to heritage buildings on corner lots shall be designed to present a heritage friendly face to the flanking street.*

Scale and Massing

- *Design additions shall not predominate over the original building.*
- *Additions shall not be designed to a greater height or scale than the original building.*
- *An addition shall not be greater in scale than the existing building. If a larger addition is necessary, the use of a lower link connection to the original building is recommended.*

Wall Materials

- *The use of traditional materials and products such as brick, stucco and wood siding are encouraged. Preference shall be given to retaining the material than replacing it.*
- *The use of non-traditional or modern materials such as cement fibreboard, and aluminum, in configurations and profiles that complement the original design, is also acceptable.*
- *Consultation with staff will be required to review the appropriateness of proposed non-traditional materials. Staff will review the material based on criteria such as traditional profile, colour, sheen, colour fastness, durability, and texture.*

The addition is proposed at the rear of the heritage building (which sits on a corner lot). The addition facing Kellam Street presents a heritage-friendly face to the flanking street. Two dormers and two steeply pitched gables adorn the top level of the building, while grey Hardie Panel siding is set to be used for the second floor exterior and the first floor will be faced in red brick veneer similar in colour to the original brick on Building A. All the chosen exterior wall materials (Attachment 5) conform to the guidelines of the KNHCD. The windows on the two top floors are all one over one sash style and the main floor is a mixture of one over one sash and one solid window. Overall, staff are satisfied with these elements of the proposed addition to the heritage property and their adherence to the KNHCD.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Operational Impact

N/A

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied with the proposed work which conforms to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed alterations to the residential/commercial at 10489 Islington Road under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152.

Attachments

1. 10489 Islington Avenue - Location Map
2. 10489 Islington Avenue - 2017 CHIA
3. 10489 Islington Avenue - CHIA 2019 ADDENDUM
4. 10489 Islington Avenue - Heritage Documentation Report
5. 10489 Islington Avenue - Architectural Package
6. 10489 Islington Avenue - Arborist Report
7. 10489 Islington Avenue - Landscape Plan
8. 10489 Islington Avenue - Site Servicing and Grading Plan
9. 10489 Islington Avenue - Heritage Maintenance Plan

Prepared by

Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152.

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Shahzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653.

Nancy Tuckett, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8529.