CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 25, 2024

Item 1, Report No. 22, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment, by the Council of the City of Vaughan via recorded vote on June 25, 2024:

1. NOTICE OF OBJECTION TO THE NOTICE OF INTENT TO DESIGNATE 30 STEGMAN'S MILL ROAD UNDER PART IV OF THE ONTARIO <u>HERITAGE ACT (REFERRED)</u>

The Committee of the Whole recommends:

- 1) That the proposed designation of 30 Stegman's Mill Road under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, BE REJECTED, and that no restrictions be placed on the property owner with respect to the rejection of the proposed designation;
- 2) That comments from the following speakers be received:
 - 1. Kailey Sutton, McMillan LLP, Bay Street, Toronto;
 - 2. Barry Nelson, Colborne Street, Thornhill;
 - 3. Duessa du Plooy, Thornhill Heritage Society, John Street, Thornhill;
 - 4. Evelin Ellison, Ward One South Thornhill Residents Group Inc. (WOSTRI), Julia Street, Thornhill;
 - 5. Joan Honsberger, Elgin Street, Thornhill; and
 - 6. Valerie Burke, Colborne Street, Thornhill;
- 3) That Communication C4., Confidential Memorandum from the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, and the Deputy City Manager, Legal and Administrative Services and City Solicitor, dated June 3, 2024, be received; and
- 4) That the report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 7, 2024, be received.

Recommendations

Committee of the Whole (1), at its meeting of May 7, 2024, adopted the following recommendations (Item 6, Report No. 17):

- 1) That consideration of this matter be deferred to the June 4, 2024, Committee of the Whole meeting;
- 2) That comments from the following speakers and Communications, be received:
 - 1. Kailey Sutton, Partner, Construction & Infrastructure | Municipal, Land Use Planning & Development, McMillan LLP, Brookfield Place, Bay Street, Toronto, and C5. presentation material;

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 25, 2024

Item 1, CW Report 22 - Page 2

- 2. Valerie Burke, Thornhill Historical Society, Colborne Street, Thornhill, and Communication C4., dated May 5, 2024; and
- 3. Evelin Ellison, President, Ward One South Thornhill Residents Group Inc. (WOSTRI), Julia Street, Thornhill; and
- 3) That Communication C2., from Barry Nelson, Heritage Advocate, and Duessa du Plooy, President, Thornhill Historical Society, dated May 3, 2024, be received.

Recommendations of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 7, 2024:

- That the Notice of Objection to the Notice of Intent to Designate 30 Stegman's Mill Road under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (as shown on Attachment 2) be received;
- 2. That City Council consider the Notice of Objection dated March 28, 2024, and affirm its decision of December 12, 2023, stating its intention to designate the subject property at 30 Stegman's Mill Road under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act;
- 3. That the By-law to designate 30 Stegman's Mill Road under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, which will be prepared in a form satisfactory to the City, be approved and enacted by City Council.



Committee of the Whole (1) Report

DATE: Tuesday, June 4, 2024

WARD: 1

<u>TITLE</u>: NOTICE OF OBJECTION TO THE NOTICE OF INTENT TO DESIGNATE 30 STEGMAN'S MILL ROAD UNDER PART IV OF THE ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT (REFERRED)

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

<u>Purpose</u>

To provide Council with information, analysis, and options regarding the Notice of Objection to the City's Notice of Intent to Designate (NOID), and to recommend to the Committee of the Whole not to withdraw the Notice of Intent to Designate the subject property municipally known as 30 Stegman's Mill Road located on the north side of Stegman's Mill and between Windrush Drive and Kleinburg Summit Drive (as shown on Attachment 1), but to proceed with enacting the By-law to designate The Pierre Berton House at 30 Stegman's Mill Road, Vaughan, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner(s) served a Notice of Objection to the Notice of Intent to Designate 30 Stegman's Mill Road, a 1-storey house previously owned by Pierre and Janet Berton.
- Staff reviewed the objection and provided response and options.
- Staff recommend the City proceed to designate 30 Stegman's Mill Road and approve the Designation By-law under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act.*

Recommendations

Committee of the Whole (1), at its meeting of May 7, 2024, adopted the following recommendations (Item 6, Report No. 17):

- 1) That consideration of this matter be deferred to the June 4, 2024, Committee of the Whole meeting;
- 2) That comments from the following speakers and Communications, be received:
 - 1. Kailey Sutton, Partner, Construction & Infrastructure | Municipal, Land Use Planning & Development, McMillan LLP, Brookfield Place, Bay Street, Toronto, and C5. presentation material;
 - 2. Valerie Burke, Thornhill Historical Society, Colborne Street, Thornhill, and Communication C4., dated May 5, 2024; and
 - 3. Evelin Ellison, President, Ward One South Thornhill Residents Group Inc. (WOSTRI), Julia Street, Thornhill; and
- 3) That Communication C2., from Barry Nelson, Heritage Advocate, and Duessa du Plooy, President, Thornhill Historical Society, dated May 3, 2024, be received.

Recommendations of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated May 7, 2024:

- 1. That the Notice of Objection to the Notice of Intent to Designate 30 Stegman's Mill Road under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachment 2) be received;
- 2. That City Council consider the Notice of Objection dated March 28, 2024, and affirm its decision of December 12, 2023, stating its intention to designate the subject property at 30 Stegman's Mill Road under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*,
- 3. That the By-law to designate 30 Stegman's Mill Road under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, which will be prepared in a form satisfactory to the City, be approved and enacted by City Council.

Background

Pierre Berton made Kleinburg his home for 55 years prior to his death in 2004. Berton was an active member of the Kleinburg community as a supporter of local events, an environmentalist and a champion of the Canadian identity. Pierre Berton received more than 30 literary awards including the Governor-General's Award for Creative Non-Fiction (three times), the Stephen Leacock Medal of Humour and the Gabrielle Leger National Heritage Award. He received two Nellies for his work in broadcasting, two National Newspaper awards and the National History Society's first award for "distinguished achievement in popularizing Canadian history". For his immense contribution to Canadian literature and history, he was awarded more than a dozen honorary degrees, was a member of the Newsman's Hall of Fame and a Companion of the Order of Canada. 30 Stegman's Mill Road was first identified as a potential heritage property in a 1976 Town of Vaughan review of potential heritage properties. City staff research on the subject property has confirmed that the cultural heritage value of 30 Stegman's Mill Road meets the criteria set out under OHA Regulation 9/06 for physical, associative and contextual cultural heritage value. A complete designation report that outlines these values was presented to Heritage Vaughan Committee, recommended to Committee of the Whole, and approved by City Council.

This Report notifies Council of the Notice of Objection from the owner of 30 Stegman's Mill Road to the Notice of Intent to Designate the property and recommends that Council proceed with enacting the by-law to designate 30 Stegman's Mill Road under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act.*

Previous Reports/Authority

<u>Heritage Vaughan Committee report</u> – October 25, 2023 <u>Committee of the Whole report</u> – November 28, 2023 <u>City Council minutes</u> – December 12, 2023

Analysis and Options

On March 28, 2024, the City Clerk received by email (see Attachment 2) a Notice of Objection to the Notice of Intent to Designate the subject property at 30 Stegman's Mill Road, from McMillan LLP on behalf of 2395271 Ontario Inc., the owner of the subject property. Under Section 29(6) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, all objections must be considered by Council, who may choose whether or not to withdraw its Notice of Intent to Designate.

The objection disputes the heritage value of 30 Stegman's Mill Road based on the physical condition of the building and challenges the merits of its architectural style by contesting it. Additionally, the letter laments the advanced state of disrepair of the structure(s) and offers the City certain built elements as donation for retention offsite. No documentation or supporting materials accompany the Notice of Objection letter.

The strongest objection appears to be primarily based around the deteriorated state of the vacant building. The immediate safety concerns for the building were communicated by the property owner to staff during the most recent visit in August 2023. Staff identified a number of programs including apprenticeship and specialized trades workshops, seminars, and other curricula that could make use of the present condition of the site to provide hands-on didactic restoration and conservation activities on site, at no cost to the owner(s) and for the responsible stewardship of this heritage resource. However, addressing the continued deterioration of the building, staff noted that proposed demolition will not be entertained on the basis of its current physical condition as it is an unoccupied building posing no identified safety concerns.

Should Council reaffirm its decision to designate the properties and enact the designation by-law, any future appeals of the designation by-law would be heard by the Ontario Land Tribunal. The Ontario Land Tribunal considers a number of matters, such as the proposed designation of a property as having cultural heritage value or interest, however, according to the Ontario Land Tribunal Appeal Guide:

"The OLT does not hear matters on costs of physical maintenance, repairs, or any proposed work related to the actual condition of the property (or structure), as these are outside the scope of the evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest."

Therefore, any concerns regarding the cost of physical repairs to the building are not relevant to the objection of whether the property is worthy of designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. However, it is important to note that designated properties become eligible for future financial incentives, as well as grant and loan programs at Federal and Provincial level, and potentially at municipal level should Vaughan implement such programs or incentives.

The report and documentation provided by staff for the proposed designation outlined 7 out of the 9 possible criteria under O.Reg. 9/06; the minimum requirement for designation is meeting only 2 criteria. In preparing this response to the Notice of Objection, Cultural Heritage staff – with the assistance of Archives staff – has conducted a more thorough evaluation of the property, and a full assessment of these two points of contention.

DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE

The property has design value or physical value because it	
 is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, 	X
expression, material or construction method	
 displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit 	X
 demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement 	N/A

A detailed assessment report of the Design/Physical Value – the architectural style, its merits, and its importance in the context of the site proper, the surrounding neighbourhood of Windrush Co-operative, and the larger Kleinburg setting – has been prepared and is submitted as Attachment 3. The highlights of the findings identify the building as being of Usonian architecture constructed at the height of the style's influential prominence. Multiple sources are cited as describing the building's features – including video interviews with Pierre Berton himself – reinforcing this specific fact. Staff therefore disagrees with the position presented in the Notice of Objection on this matter, in particular regarding the notion that Usonian architecture "reflected an era twenty years earlier" when in fact Frank Lloyd Wright's majority of *Usonian Automatic* buildings were designed and built between 1948-1956. This building takes its inspiration from a 1948 publication, was designed in 1949, and construction concluded in 1950.

HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
 has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, 	X
organization or institution that is significant to a community	
 yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an 	X
understanding of a community or culture	
 demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builde 	r, X
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

This section is not disputed by the Notice of Objection.

CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
 important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area 	X
 physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings 	X
 a landmark 	N/A

This section is not disputed by the Notice of Objection.

Financial Impact

There are no financial impacts associated with this report.

Operational Impact

There are no operational impacts associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

N/A

Conclusion

Withdrawing the Notice of Intention to Designate would deprive the City of its capacity to enact long-term management, conservation, and legal safeguards for this significant cultural heritage asset, thus failing to meet the legal requirements of sustainable stewardship outlined in municipal and provincial policies. Designation is essential for the City to effectively oversee proposed changes to the heritage attributes of the property through the Heritage Permit process. Without designation, the property is vulnerable to losing its cultural identity and the associated social, heritage, environmental, informational, and aesthetic values. Consequently, staff does not recommend withdrawing the Notice of Intention to Designate as a responsible conservation approach.

Staff finds that, as supported by additional archival documentation, the subject property holds cultural heritage value and meets 7 of the 9 criteria of criteria as set out under the *Ontario Heritage Act* by the Province of Ontario Regulation 9/06 for the minimum two categories of design/physical, historical/associative and contextual value. Accordingly,

staff recommends Council proceed with enacting the By-law to designate The Pierre Berton House at 30 Stegman's Mill Road, Vaughan, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Attachments

- 1. 30 Stegmans Mill Objection_Location Map.
- 2. 30 Stegmans Mill Objection_Notice of Objection.
- 3. 30 Stegmans Mill Objection_Usonian Architecture
- 4. 30 Stegmans Mill Objection_Chronology of Communications.
- 5. Communications from May 7, 2024, Committee of the Whole (1) meeting.

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653. Nancy Tuckett, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8529.



Location Map

LOCATION: 30 Stegman's Mill Road Part of Lot 25, Concession 8



Attachment

DATE: May 7, 2024



Reply to the Attention of
Direct LineKailey Su
416.945Email Address
DateKailey.su
March 28

Kailey Sutton 416.945.8008 Kailey.sutton@mcmillan.ca March 28, 2024

E-MAIL (clerks@vaughan.ca)

Office of the City Clerk, City of Vaughan 2141 Major Mackenzie Drive West Vaughan ON L6A 1T1

Attention: Todd Coles, City Clerk

Dear Mr. Coles:

Re: 30 Stegman's Mill Road (the "Subject Property") Pierre Burton House (the "House") Notice of Intention to Designate Notice of Objection

We represent 2395271 Ontario Inc., the owner of the Subject Property. Please accept this letter as our client's Notice of Objection to the proposed designation of the House as detailed in the Notice of Intent to Designate under the Ontario Heritage Act (the "Act") dated February 28, 2024 ("Notice of Intent").

We understand from our client that, at the time they purchased the Subject Property in 2013, the House was already in a clearly precarious state of decay. Since that time, our client has had to undertake a number of measures to prevent persons from entering the House and sustaining personal injury or further damaging it.

Given the state of disrepair of the House, our client was surprised to receive: (a) the undated heritage report on the House from the City, and (b) the Notice of the Intent. While our client does not dispute that the House has associative value, they disagree with the reasons given for designation, including that the House has purported architectural value as being designed in the Usonian style. Unlike the House, Usonian homes were designed to be simple, affordable structures for middle class families, they lacked garages, and focused on the use of natural, locally sourced materials. They reflected an era twenty years prior to the construction of the House.

The House therefore does not meet the requisite criteria under the Act for designation. Moreover, it is our understanding that the House is not fit for human habitation, is unfortunately not capable of being restored, and the exterior and interior features are not capable of being maintained. As such, it is a candidate for demolition.

McMillan LLP | Brookfield Place, 181 Bay Street, Suite 4400, Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5J 2T3 | t 416.865.7000 | f 416.865.7048 Lawyers | Patent & Trade-mark Agents | Avocats | Agents de brevets et de marques de commerce Vancouver | Calgary | Toronto | Ottawa | Montréal | Hong Kong | mcmillan.ca

mcmillan

Our client would be pleased to donate the chimney or other salvageable materials from the House to the City of Vaughan, the Pierre Burton Heritage Centre or the Pierre Burton Resource Library to keep a record of the House. It would also be willing to discuss other measures with heritage staff to record the history of the Subject Property. It cannot, however, agree to the designation of the House under the Act given its true condition.

Accordingly, we request that City Council exercise its sound judgement and reconsider its intention to designate the House for reasons of cultural heritage value or interest.

Should you have any questions regarding this Notice of Objection or otherwise, please do not hesitate to contact the writer. Please also provide us with notice of when Council will be considering our objection, as we would like to provide oral submissions before Council as well.

Yours truly,

Kailey Sutton

cc. Client

ATTACHMENT 3 30 STEGMAN'S MILL

USONIAN ARCHITECTURE PRINCIPLES

The word *Usonian* appears to have been coined by James Duff Law¹, a Scottish writer who quoted a letter of his own (dated June 18, 1903) that begins "*We of the United States… have no right to use the title 'Americans' when referring to matters pertaining exclusively to ourselves.*" He had proposed "**Usona**" (United States of North America) but preferred the form "**Usonia**".² It was first published as a descriptive term by Frank Lloyd Wright in 1927 when he wrote "*But why this term "America" has become representative as the name of these United States at home and abroad is past recall. Samuel Butler fitted us with a good name. He called us Usonians, and our Nation of combined States, Usonia".³ He further adopted and adapted the term specifically to his vision for the landscape of the country, including the planning of cities and the architecture of buildings. Wright proposed the use of the adjective Usonian to describe the particular New World character of the American landscape as distinct and free of previous architectural conventions.⁴*

1. ORIGINS OF STYLE

Frank Lloyd Wright designed and built ±66 structures under the Usonian moniker. In general, this was a readaptation of the Prairie Style of architecture that was prevalent in Wright's earlier architectural practice, which consisted primarily of over-extended roof overhangs, pronounced low horizontality of massing and form, low to the ground to mimic the flat landscape of the Midwest. Although this style lost momentum by 1915, its influence continued well into the 1950s. Meanwhile, Wright "modernized" elements of this style, to be adapted to middle-income family budgets and to "*eliminate, so far as possible, the use of skilled labor*" so as to reduce cost in construction as well as maintenance. He called this modernization "*The Usonian Automatic*"⁵, and relied heavily on local wood, stone, and glass, with flat roof and thick fascia construction with pronounced overhangs, open-plan interiors integrating kitchen-dining-living areas, and with maximum exposure and visual connection to the outdoors. More than 100 additional buildings were designed and constructed in this modernized style between 1934 and 1958, with international influence extending well into the 1990s. The most common characteristics of such buildings include most of the following⁶ elements:

- one storey, horizontal orientation
- □ generally small footprint, around 1500sf (under 150 sq.m)
- no attic; no basement; attached carport or garage

⁴ <u>https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Usonia</u>

¹ James Duff Law, <u>electricscotland.com</u>. Retrieved May 24, 2022.

² Law, James D. (1903). *Here and There in Two Hemispheres*. Lancaster: Home Publishing Co. pp. 111–12n.

³ Wright, Frank Lloyd. Architecture: Selected Writings 1894–1940. p. 100.

⁵ Wright, Frank Lloyd. *The Natural House* (1954)

⁶ https://www.thoughtco.com/usonian-style-home-frank-lloyd-wright-177787

- □ low, simple, usually flat roof
- □ efficient use of interior spaces
- open floor plan using a simple grid pattern, with few interior walls
- □ organic construction, using local materials of wood, stone, and glass
- □ built-in furnishings used as room separators
- □ skylights and clerestory windows
- □ often in rural, wooded settings

2. THE PIERRE BERTON HOUSE

Built in 1950 – near the pinnacle of Wright's Usonian Automatic application in the US – this building was built on the first of 10 equal radiating lot properties in the Windrush Co-operative (completed in 1954), conceived to showcase "*modern architecture houses quite faithful to the example of Frank Lloyd Wright's 'Usonian' houses*".⁷ Pierre and Janet Berton held leadership positions in the co-op for some 50 years from 1954 to 2004, and the co-op was made subject to stringent conditions outlined in "Schedule A" which was an attachment that accompanied each deed. The conditions explicitly state that only one dwelling shall be on each property, all new building and additions should conform to the existing architecture, the dwellings shall only be used for residential purposes (with the exception of studio uses relating to their profession), the parcels cannot be subdivided as the co-op shall be seen as a whole, no boundaries or fences can be erected. In 2005, there was an attempt to subdivide the Berton property, but it was denied due to the conditions in Schedule "A".

As a Canadian variant of the Usonian model⁸, this structure exhibits every one of the common elements of Usonian architecture and style, in pure form. The Bertons noted that the design was inspired by a 1948 Sunset Magazine publication. The building is clad in painted board and batten (that could be assembled by unskilled workers, using nominal dimension lumber that required minimal cuts), and displays a minimalist approach to ornamentation through nearly absent decoration of varnished wood for the window frames, painted wood and galvanized metal. Strong horizontality is reinforced by the use of local flagstone cut and stacked in long and narrow bands, paying homage to Wright's use of stone cut in Roman brick modules. Numerous low retaining walls and stone-clad planters using this stone pattern surround the building and create walkways and sitting areas.

The property is comprised of the main building, a garage facing the main approach to the house – and connected to the main structure by an exposed-structure wood frame supporting

⁷ Cohen, Jean-Louis. (2012). *The Future of Architecture. Since 1889.* London: Phaidon Press Limited.

⁸ Kalman, Harold. A History of Canadian Architecture, Vol 2. Oxford University Press, Ontario, 1994.

translucent panels that create a sheltered walkway – as well as a pool with pool house, two stone outdoor fireplaces, and a sheltered inner courtyard with interlock paving surrounded by shoji screen panels and covered by wood trellis work supported on posts. Further into the gardens there is a train car mounted on a short length of track. The garage is enclosed as adapted to Canadian climate, a necessary revision of the Usonian preference for open carport.

The massing of the building complex is playful but strongly geometric. The house is oriented north-south. Proportional volumes are carved out of – or project outward from – the floor plan to address and engage the man-made surrounding landscape. According to Pierre Berton, all trees and vegetation were meticulously planned and planted to create a landscape evocative of several distinct settings from across Canada, from his various stages of life across the country.⁹ Stone walls cut through the glazing to extend from the interior to the exterior and visually connect the built form to nature outside. Throughout the house, the floor plates act as platforms of livable spaces from which one can enjoy the myriad of wonderful views offered by the surroundings. Large cantilevers, reminiscent in style and intent to elements best recognized at Falling Water, juxtapose the playful articulation of the architectonic blocks against other parts that are embedded strongly into the ground, and others that sit atop of stone tiered terraces or wood decking as one circles around the building.

One striking feature of the design of this building is long overhanging eaves: during the summer months, due to the earth's 23.5° angle, the sun shines "higher" than during the winter, so an overhanging eave will block sunlight during summer months and will allow sunlight during the winter months – a natural air conditioning and heating system. During the winter months, the heat gained during the daylight hours is retained in the house, heating the house throughout the night. Large windows on the southern elevation of the building allow access for sunlight during winter months, as the south side is facing the sun during the winter.

The interior palette is mainly comprised of varnished wood, flagstone, ceiling tile (white), gypsum wall and carpet. The spaces use of built-ins and wood paneling as room dividers and separators, creating hallways and nooks in an otherwise open plan. Large windows create an almost seamless connection to the exterior from areas of most-public use, whereas the bedrooms offer high-sill windows to maintain privacy and a view to the natural landscape above grade. Throughout the house, the flooring material and pattern changes as if to reinforce the intended use of the spaces – with carpet in the more private areas, wood parquet, stone and slate in other parts of the building, and linoleum in the kitchen and bathrooms.

Most of the glazed areas correspond to the rooms that would benefit the most from the views and natural light, such as the living room, kitchen and dining room, or less public areas such as

⁹ The Invasion of Pierre Berton (1981) - the fifth estate, CBC/Radio-Canada

the bedrooms and the office. The oversized windows – some with low sills and extending to the ceiling – are strategically placed primarily to the west and north, while the southern portion opens to a private patio area. The east elevation was designed with smaller windows starting at a higher sill in order to guard the privacy of the spaces behind, while still providing the opportunity for light and ventilation and a view of the natural foliage canopy.

3. SELECT SITE PHOTOS

The following selection of photos illustrate the merits of the architectural design of the building and its man-made surrounding landscape. All photos were taken by Cultural Heritage staff during site visits in 2012, 2014, and 2023.



examples of extended cantilever (2012)



southern courtyard (2012)

southern courtyard (2023)



various flooring materials (2012)



view of garage (2012)



low stone work and planters (2012)

stone outdoor fireplace (2012)



fireplace and extension of wall (2012)



east partial elevation (2012)

north elevation (2012)

4. SELECT USONIAN EXAMPLES



Trier House, built 1967

Herbert Jacobs House, built 1937



Balter House, Polymath Park, built 1964

Robert Sunday House, built 1957

5. ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING BIBLIOGRAPHY

Caulfield, Jon. (1994). *City Form and Everyday Life: Toronto's gentrification and critical social practice.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Cohen, Jean-Louis. (2012). *The Future of Architecture. Since 1889.* London: Phaidon Press Limited.

Curtis, William J. R. Modern Architecture since 1900. Phaidon Press Limited, London, 1996.

Grant, Jill. (2005). Rethinking the Public Interest as a Planning Concept. Plan (Summer).

Kalman, Harold. *A History of Canadian Architecture, Vol 2.* Oxford University Press, Ontario, 1994.

Keefer, Alec and McLelland, Michael. *Eric Ross Arthur, Conservation in Context*. Toronto Region Architectural Conservancy, Toronto 2001.

Law, James D., electricscotland.com. Retrieved May 24, 2022.

Law, James D. (1903). *Here and There in Two Hemispheres*. Lancaster: Home Publishing Co. pp. 111–12n.

Ontario Homes & Living. A House That Looks To Nature. October 1966, Vol.V, No. 9.

Owram, Doug. Book review of *Pierre Berton: A biography*. Retrieved from <u>http://www.canadashistory.ca/Books/Book-Reviews/Reviews/Pierre-Berton--A-Biography.aspx</u> Collier, Allan *Research Report: The Trend House Program Study of Architecture in Canada*. Bulletin,1995, Volume 20 Issue 2

Philip H. Carter Architect and Planner, Paul Oberst Architect, Nicholas Holman Heritage Consultant, & Harrington and Hoyle Landscape Architects. (2002). *Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District, Volume 1: The study and plan.*

Relph, Edward. (1987). The Corporatisation of Cities. 1945- from *The Modern Urban Landscape*. Baltimore: John Hopkins Press, pp.166-189.

Sabatino, Michelangelo. Canadian Architect. Practical Visions, A recent exhibition at the University of Toronto celebrates the career and contribution of Eric Ross Arthur. Toronto, 2002.

Wright, Frank Lloyd. Architecture: Selected Writings 1894-1940. p. 100.

Wright, Frank Lloyd. The Natural House (1954)

CBC video "Goodbye, Pierre Berton". Retrieved from

http://www.cbc.ca/archives/categories/arts-entertainment/television/television-general/2004-goodbye-pierre-berton.html

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ludwig Mies van der Rohe#Emigration to the United States

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Walter Gropius#After Bauhaus

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Richard Neutra

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/B. C. Binning#Selected Commissions

Canadian Architect: <u>http://www.canadianarchitect.com/news/binning-house/1000206000/</u> <u>http://www.canadianarchitect.com/issues/story.aspx</u>

Canadian Wood Council. *Post and Beam Construction, a Presentation by the Canadian Wood Council, 2010.*

http://www.architecture.uwaterloo.ca/faculty_projects/terri/arch_crs/f06/pdf/Post_Beam_Constr uct.pdf

T.O. Built: http://www.tobuilt.ca/php/companies to buildings.php?search_fd0=2539

Archives of Ontario: http://ao.minisisinc.com/scripts/mwimain.dll/497/1/1?RECLIST

Trend House Chronicles: <u>http://mkurtz.com/trendhouse/index.html</u>

Historic Places of Canada: http://www.historicplaces.ca/en/rep-reg/place-lieu.aspx?id=1769

Toronto Modern: <u>http://robertmoffatt115.wordpress.com/2010/02/24/torontos-timeless-trend-house/</u>

Globe and Mail: <u>http://www.theglobeandmail.com/life/home-and-garden/real-estate/headliners-in-the-1960s-heritage-homes-now/article1936708/</u>

The Invasion of Pierre Berton (1981) - the fifth estate, CBC/Radio-Canada

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Usonia

https://www.thoughtco.com/usonian-style-home-frank-lloyd-wright-177787

ATTACHMENT 4 30 STEGMAN'S MILL

30 Stegman's Mill Road The Chronology of the Property's ownership and City's Communications with Applicant

1948-50 – Pierre and Janet Berton visit Kleinburg and decide to settle there. They join the Windrush Cooperative, created by / with 9 other CBC workers and their families.

1950-54 – The house is built for the (then) small family with various additions over the years.

2004 - November: Pierre Berton dies

2012 – The Berton family submitted a Severance application (B.017/12) to formally separate their property into 2 lots, which conformed with the previously registered subdivision, with the remaining house on the retained land and the new lot largely comprised of what was identified in the 1949 Plan of Subdivision as "Lot 9". This was granted, and the lot was sold in 2013. At this time, no structure has been built on the property.

In the Fall of 2012, the Berton family (Janet Berton and her children) notified staff of their intent to sell the Berton property and their desire to have the property evaluated so that important heritage elements could be identified and conserved. Cultural Services staff (Heritage Coordinators Daniel Rende & Cecilia Nin Hernandez and Angela Palermo, Cultural Services Manager) conducted a report to research the property and evaluate it to determine what the "main heritage attributes" of the home were. There are several pictures from the staff November site visit at this time. At this time, Cultural Heritage staff suggested that the home was altered over the years and new wings were added, that the main/original core of the building was to remain. Note from 2024: Further research by Cultural Heritage staff has led to a more comprehensive approach, as the additions and changes speak to the changes and growing family of the Bertons.

Spring 2013 – Cultural Services met with the new owners at the front counter and discussed the property. That same day, staff emailed the above and provided a list of architects who have experience with heritage buildings. Staff received an email (forwarded from the Manager of Cultural Services) in response on May 2, 2013 that implied that they fully understood the parameters of the heritage property (what they had to work with and what would be doable). MPAC records report that the sale was registered in November 2013.

2014 – October 7: A member of the Berton family is in the area and sent a note to staff and then MP Deborah Schulte regarding the following: *"The ice storm last winter destroyed a lot*"

trees in the yard, as it did everywhere. There was a broken window by the back door. My husband found the door was left unlocked, so he locked it." Cultural Services/Heritage staff followed up with a request to By-Law staff to investigate the property, which was done on October 23, 2014. A by-law standards order was issued to the owner.

2014 – November 7: An order that was issued on the property to clean up debris, secure the pool, etc was closed after work had been completed.

2014 – November 13: Cultural Heritage staff Daniel Rende (now relocated to Urban Design, Development Planning), Cultural Services Manager Angela Palermo, and Manager of Urban Design Rob Bailey, met with the architects and owners to discuss the property.

2015 – June 18: the owners of 56 Windrush and 30 Stegman's Mill sent a letter to the Fire Chief, requesting a demolition permit inspection of the two buildings due to the fire hazard of two abandoned buildings. Cultural Heritage staff received a letter from the Fire Chief indicating this request and noting "...in a state of disrepair. Numerous windows are broken and there is evidence of illegal entry by trespassers for the purpose of alcohol and possible drug use. During the inspection, it appeared somebody has been using a barbeque starter fluid in the fireplace". The two property sites are adjacent to each other within the Windrush Cooperative. The letter noted that both 56 Windrush and 30 Stegman's Mill were unoccupied and in a state of disrepair. Unoccupied buildings pose a fire hazard risk to Fire and Rescue staff and residents. Cultural Heritage staff responded to the letter and asked to organize a meeting with several City departments to discuss this issue and concern.

2015 – June 23: A PAC meeting for was held 56 Windrush and 30 Stegman's Mills. It proposed 2 new homes that did not comply with the Heritage Conservation District and included a note on the site plan that said "portion of Berton house to be moved and retained" – from further staff notes this referred to the fireplace.

2016 – January 29: The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division was informed that The Mayor's Office had formally requested John MacKenzie (Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management) and Rob Bayley (Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage) attend a meeting with Susan Niczowski (property owner) to discuss 30 Stegman's Mill regarding the heritage issues.

2016 – February 9: The meeting was held, and Cultural Heritage staff (Katrina Guy and Daniel Rende) provided a memo outlining the policies of the KNHCD Plan, the specific Cultural Heritage attributes of the property and the timeline of the property from 2012 until the summer of 2015, including the actions of City staff. A full memo outlining the heritage value of the property and timeline was sent to the Senior Management staff of Development Planning on

February 5, 2016. A follow up inquiry from Robinson Heritage Consultants was received on February 23, 2016, to which Cultural Heritage staff replied with information, Terms of Reference for the CHIA and other requested information.

2016 – April 26: John Mackenzie (Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management) asked Rob Bayley (Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage) to provide a list of Heritage Consultants to the owners of 30 Stegman's Mill Road. Mr. Bayley indicated that he had twice provided such lists and noted that difficulty of retaining a Heritage Consultant was connected with the associated history with Pierre Berton and other associated value.

2016 – August: Cultural Heritage staff provided the retained planner Bob Martindale with information regarding the property. Correspondence with Mr. Martindale continued and there was an in-person meeting in early September 2016, to discuss the research so far. Staff accompanied Mr. Martindale to Property Records and Archives to review materials together.

2016 – November 7: A further meeting was discussed in October 2016, with an invitation for Cultural Heritage staff to visit the property. The site visit was conducted on Monday November 7, 2016 by two members of Cultural Heritage staff (Daniel Rende and Katrina Guy). The site visit confirmed a number of issues and further decay of the house. Cultural Heritage staff expressed these concerns to Rob Bayley (Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage). Staff also received a phone call from another area resident who had heard about the visit, and who expressed concerns regarding the properties. Cultural Heritage staff was advised by Development Management staff to reach out to By-Law Enforcement regarding these concerns, and a Site Visit was then conducted by By-Law Enforcement, with a resulting By-law order.

No further file activity or communication is recorded until 2023.

2023 – July 9: Nick Borcescu (Senior Heritage Planner) was invited to visit the site by Mary Niczowski (property owner of 56 Windrush and sister of Susan, the property owner of 30 Stegman's Mill Road). Site photography was recorded and shared with other City staff; correspondence of highlights of the discussion points was forwarded to the Owner's email following the site visit. offering suggestions for low-cost and no-cost rehabilitation of the buildings and property with assistance from technical schools with hands-on programs.

2023 – July 30: Cultural Heritage received an email regarding the posting of a video on YouTube showing the dilapidated state of 30 Stegman's Mill: <u>SC VD 103 (youtube.com)</u> This was followed up by calls from the Ward Councillor's office and some Kleinburg residents. Cultural Heritage staff (Nick Borcescu and Katrina Guy) reached out to By-Law Enforcement to request a site visit. Subsequent discussion with the Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike (Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage) identified designation under Part IV of the *Ontario* *Heritage Act* would be the most appropriate tool for ensuring proper conservation of the property, beyond what has currently been achieved.

2023 – August: Two other YouTube videos have been created regarding the property: <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RtR2LAVCs6w</u> and an earlier video has also been identified, from November 30, 2022 <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gCmf8O8KbRA</u>

Communications received at the May 7, 2024, Committee of the Whole (1) meeting.

- C2. Barry Nelson, Heritage Advocate, and Duessa du Plooy, President, Thornhill Historical Society, dated May 3, 2024.
- C4. Valerie Burke, Thornhill Historical Society, Colborne Street, Thornhill, dated May 5, 2024.
- C5. Kailey Sutton, McMillan LLP presentation material

Attachment 5: Page 2 of 21

C 2 Communication CW(1) – May 7, 2024 Item No. 6

From: To:	<u>Clerks@vaughan.ca</u> John Britto
Subject:	FW: [External] Reiteration of Support for the Designation of 30 Stegman's Mill Road – Emphasizing the Legacy of Pierre Berton
Date:	Friday, May 3, 2024 8:44:25 AM

From: THS Treasurer <treasurer@thornhillhistoric.org>
Sent: Thursday, May 2, 2024 10:07 PM
To: Nick Borcescu <Nick.Borcescu@vaughan.ca>; Clerks@vaughan.ca; Stephanie Ferreira
<Stephanie.Ferreira@vaughan.ca>
Cc: president@thornhillhistoric.org; Evelin Ellison <thornhillwardone@gmail.com>
Subject: [External] Reiteration of Support for the Designation of 30 Stegman's Mill Road –
Emphasizing the Legacy of Pierre Berton

CAUTION! This is an external email. Verify the sender's email address and carefully examine any links or attachments before clicking. If you believe this may be a phishing email, please use the Phish Alert Button.

To: Todd Coles, City Clerk

May 3rd, 2024

CC: Nick R. Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner; Care of to: Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management; Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator

Subject: Reiteration of Support for the Designation of 30 Stegman's Mill Road – Emphasizing the Legacy of Pierre Berton

Dear Mr. Coles,

In recognition and support of the previously articulated and professionally crafted work provided by both staff reports, as well as the recommendations of Heritage Vaughan, for the designation of 30 Stegman's Mill Road under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, The Thornhill Historical Society wishes to underscore here, the profound significance of Pierre Berton's legacy as a pivotal factor in our advocacy. The inherent value of the Pierre Berton House transcends its architectural and historical merits, embodying the essence of Canadian identity and cultural introspection, as envisioned by Pierre Berton.

Pierre Berton's Vision for Canadian Literature and Heritage

Pierre Berton's distinguished career was not only a testament to his literary genius but also to his unwavering commitment to fostering a deeper understanding and appreciation of Canadian heritage and identity. His works have played a crucial role in broadening the horizons of Canadians, enabling us to view our history and culture through a lens of pride, curiosity, and respect. Berton's desire for future generations of writers to draw inspiration from his residence is emblematic of his dedication to the perpetuation of a uniquely Canadian narrative.

The Berton House as a Beacon of Canadian Cultural Identity

In the context of the current socio-political climate, where Canadian cultural needs and identities are often overshadowed by broader North American trends, the preservation of the Berton House takes on an added significance. It stands as a bastion of Canadian cultural sovereignty, reminding us of the need to cherish and sustain our distinct heritage. The house itself, much like Berton's literary works, invites Canadians to a deeper reflection on what it means to construct and articulate a Canadian identity, particularly in the realm of literature and the arts. Like the Canadian State currently, it requires our concern and investment in rehabilitative action.

Addressing Indifference with Cultural Empathy

The challenges posed by indifference and insensitivity towards our cultural distinctiveness underscore the importance of preserving symbols of our heritage. The Berton House, through its association with Pierre and Janet Berton, serves as a physical and metaphorical space for nurturing a sense of cultural empathy and awareness. By safeguarding and advocating for rehabilitation of this property, we not only honour the Bertons' legacy but also reinforce the value of Canadian stories, perspectives, and identities in shaping our collective consciousness.

Conclusion and Appeal for Support

Therefore, we emphatically reiterate our support for the designation of 30 Stegman's Mill Road, advocating for its conservation as a sanctuary for future writers and as a source of inspiration for all Canadians. The Thornhill Historical Society is keenly aware of the potential of the Berton House to foster a renewed engagement with Canadian heritage and identity, especially in times when such engagement is most needed.

We appeal to the City Council to recognize the intrinsic value of the Berton House in the broader narrative of Canadian culture and to proceed with its designation. In doing so, we commit ourselves to preserving a legacy that has, and will continue to, inspire countless Canadians to explore, understand, and articulate our rich and diverse heritage.

Thank you for considering our perspectives on this matter. We remain committed to contributing to the dialogue surrounding the preservation of our shared cultural heritage.

Yours sincerely,

Barry Nelson Heritage Advocate The Thornhill Historical Society

Reviewed and Authorized by the THS Board of Directors representing our members. Duessa du Plooy President <u>president@thornhillhistoric.org</u> Thornhill Historical Society <u>thornhillhistoric.org</u>

Attachment 5: Page 4 of 21

From:	<u>Clerks@vaughan.ca</u>
To:	John Britto
Subject:	FW: [External] Item 6.6 Committee of the Whole - 30 Stegman's Road - May 7, 2024
Date:	Monday, May 6, 2024 8:26:04 AM

From: Valerie Burke

Sent: Sunday, May 5, 2024 8:46 PM

To: Clerks@vaughan.ca

Cc: Nick Borcescu <Nick.Borcescu@vaughan.ca>; Katrina Guy <Katrina.Guy@vaughan.ca>; Haiqing Xu <Haiqing.Xu@vaughan.ca>

Subject: [External] Item 6.6 Committee of the Whole - 30 Stegman's Road - May 7, 2024

CAUTION! This is an external email. Verify the sender's email address and carefully examine any links or attachments before clicking. If you believe this may be a phishing email, please use the Phish Alert Button.

To: Todd Coles, City Clerk

CC: Nick R. Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner; Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator

Re: Committee of the Whole - Item 6.6 - Notice of Objection To The Notice of Intent to Designate 30 Stegman's Road Under Part IV of The Ontario Heritage Act

I strongly support staff's recommendation to designate 30 Stegman's Road, former home of Pierre and Janet Berton, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act!

The designation of this property meets the policies of the Vaughan Official Plan and the objectives and required criteria outlined in the Ontario Heritage Act by the Province of Ontario Regulation 9/0. The Statement of Cultural Heritage Value demonstrates that this significant property has physical, associated, and contextual cultural heritage value.

Pierre Berton is among Canada's best-known writers, an iconic Canadian. He was particularly well regarded as a serious popularizer of Canadian History.

As the report indicates "Staff identified a number of programs including apprenticeship and specialized trades workshops, seminars, and other curricula that could make use of the present condition of the site to provide hands-on didactic restoration and conservation activities on site, at no cost to the owner(s) and for the responsible stewardship of this heritage resource."

Please designate this property. Protect an extraordinary Canadian cultural asset for present and future generations.

Sincerely Valerie Burke

C 5 Communication









ATTACHMENT 5 30 STEGMAN'S MILL





Attachment 5: Page 7 of 21



Attachment 5: Page 8 of 21





Attachment 5: Page 9 of 21













Attachment 5: Page 15 of 21



Vaughan Fire & Rescue Service 2141 Major Mackenzie Drive, Vaughan, Ontario L6A 1T1 Tel 905-832-8585 x6301 Fire Chief Larry Bentley Email: larry.bentley@vaughan.ca



June 18, 2015

Susan Niczowski • PRESIDENT 334 Rowntree Dairy Road, Woodbridge, ON L4L 8H2

Susan,

Re: Demolition Permit Inspection

In response to your request for a demolition permit inspection of two structures in Kleinburg located at 56 Windrush Road and 30 Stegman's Mill Road, Vaughan Fire and Resce have inspected both locations and report the following:

56 Windrush Road:

The building appears to be unoccupied and is in a state of disrepair. Numerous windows are broken and there is evidence of illegal entry by trespassers for the purpose of alcohol and possible drug use. During the inspection, there was aslo evidence of smoking materials in the structure. The basement has approximately 30cm of standing water. Abandoned structures create a safety risk to the persons using the structure for parties, fire hazard to the community, the neighboring residences and firefighting staff.

30 Stegman's Mill Road:

The building appears to be unoccupied and in a state of disrepair. Numerous windows are broken and there is evidence of illegal entry by trespassers for the purpose of alcohol and possible drug use. During the inspection, it appeared somebody has been using a barbeque starter fluid in the fire place. Abandoned structures create a safety risk to the persons using the structure for parties, fire hazard to the community, the neighboring residences and firefighting staff.

It is the opinion of the VFRS that both abandoned properties present a fire hazard to the community.

At the conclusion of our inspection, the Captain advised the property owner of their responsibility to ensure the property is secured and to check the sites regularly.

Larry Bentley Fire Chief













