<u>LHC</u>

ATTACHMENT 2 7961 JANE

14 May, 2024

Todd Coles City Clerk City of Vaughan Office of the Clerk 2141 Major Mackenzie Drive West Vaughan, ON L6A 1T1

Sent via email: clerks@vaughan.ca

Re:Notice of Objection for the Proposed Designation of 7961 Jane Street under PartIV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Dear Mr. Coles:

LHC Heritage Planning & Archaeology Inc. ("LHC") has been retained to provide heritage consulting services and advice to Cola Holdings Inc. (the "Owner"), the registered owner of 7961 Jane Street (the "Property").

On 16 April 2024 Municipal Council issued a Notice of Intention to Designate for 7961 Jane Street under Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, R.S.O. 1990, c.O. 18 as amended ("*OHA*"). Please consider this letter as the Owner's objection to the proposed designation of the Property under Part IV Section 29 (5) of the *OHA*.

The Owner understands that the property may have cultural heritage value or interest (CHVI). However, they request that designation of the Property be deferred until LHC can prepare an independent evaluation of the Property and requests the opportunity to work with City heritage staff to confirm the CHVI of the Property and/or refine the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and list of heritage attributes for the Property.

LHC has reviewed the evaluation of the Property under *Ontario Regulation 9/06* (*O. Reg. 9/06*) included in the 31 January 2024 *Heritage Vaughan Committee Report,* its attachments—including the *Statement of Cultural Heritage Value*—and the Notice of Intention to Designate. The reasons for objection include:

• The O. Reg. 9/06 evaluation included in the Heritage Vaughan Committee Report and the

Kingston Office: 837 Princess Street, Suite 400 Kingston, ON K7L 1G8 (1) 613-507-7817 | (1) 833-210-7817 www.lhcheritage.com Toronto Office: 5200 Yonge Street, 2nd Floor North York, ON M2N 5P6 Ottawa Office: 135 Laurier Avenue Ottawa, ON K1P 5J2 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value includes a limited architectural description of the house and limited history of the Property. It does not include analysis on how this information demonstrates that the Property meets criteria from *O. Reg. 9/06.*

- The *O. Reg. 9/06* evaluation indicates that the Property meets criteria 1, 2, 4, 5 and 8 but does not explain how each criteria is met.
 - For criteria 1, the information included does not describe if the house is a rare, unique, representative or early expression of a style, type, expression, material or construction method. The information provided only describes the house as an Edwardian—foursquare—style.
 - For criteria 2, there is no discussion of how the house demonstrates that it displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit. Furthermore, in our professional experience a visit to the building would be required to determine if it demonstrates craftsmanship and there is no evidence that the Property was visited.
 - For criteria 4, the brief history of the property and associated people in the evaluation and *Statement of Cultural Heritage Value* describes early settlers and 19th century history. The history does not clearly describe a **direct association** that is significant. Much of the history presented appears to pre-date construction of the house. It is unclear how the house and current lot configuration are directly connected with this earlier history except that the lot was created out of a larger plot owned by the broader family.

In our experience, a direct association requires the person who lived in or built a house to be significant themselves. A grandfather/grandmother, father/mother, uncle/aunt, son/daughter, etc... who was a significant person or early settler or landowner is not a direct association. The analysis for evaluation should be revised to clearly demonstrate a direct association between the Property and themes, events, beliefs, people, activities, organizations or institutions that are significant to a community.

Regarding the date range associated with the house of 1879-1915; our preliminary research includes a newspaper article on the Smith Farm from 1960 that indicates the house was built in 1934 (newspaper article attached). We also reviewed late 19th and early 20th century census data and Barbara Plander's 1975 report *A Report of Buildings Pre-1900 in the Township of Vaughan* and Kathryn Anderson's 1988 article on "Concession 4, Lot 7, Edgeley: Jacob Smith Family", *Architectural and Historical Reports*, in Vol. III, J-K, prepared by the Town of Vaughan. Information from these sources indicate a 1930s date of construction for the house. Additional research should be completed in an attempt to confirm this.

- For criteria 5, there is no discussion how this Property yields or has the potential to yield information that contributes to a community of culture.
- For criteria 8, the evaluation describes a historical link and physical location of the property. It describes how the Smith family owned the land and built the house.

However, there is no discussion how this is a historical link to its context. The contextual value discussion describes how "the building reflects their [Smith family] success and hard work in the establishment of a homestead". However, this Property appears to have no tangible remains of a homestead or this early history. There does not appear to be a connection between the house on the Property and any earlier homestead. Furthermore, the context around the Property is significantly changed from that of the 19th and early 20th centuries. Other than the nearby cemetery, nothing of the 19th or early 20th century context or the former rail yard context appears to remain in the area.

Concerns with the list of heritage attributes in the *Statement of Cultural Heritage Value* include:

- The heritage attributes describe broad features instead of specific features that must be retained to conserve cultural heritage value. There is concern that the vague nature of the heritage attributes introduces potential for different interpretation which could make conservation of the heritage attributes and planning for change on the Property challenging.
- Without more detailed information and analysis in the evaluation and a clear statement of if the house is rare, unique, representative or early it is unclear what exactly the heritage attributes are intended to conserve.
- The heritage attributes under the Historical/Associative Value and Contextual Value categories are unclear and are not physical features that contribute to or support the cultural heritage value or interest of the Property.

Concerns with the Notice of Intention to Designate include:

• That the Reasons for Proposed Designation are not the same as the *Statement of Cultural Heritage Value.* Based on this difference it is unclear what details a heritage designation by-law will contain.

In summary, on behalf of the Owner, in our professional opinion additional research, analysis and evaluation should be completed before this Property is considered for designation under Part IV Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The CHVI of the Property should be confirmed and *Statement of Cultural Heritage Value* should be revised to precisely describe heritage attributes of the Property.

Sincerely,

Christienne Uchiyama, MA CAHP

Principal | Manager, Heritage Consulting Services LHC Heritage Planning & Archaeology Inc.

Cc: Owner Nick R. Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner Encl: Notice of Intention to Designate, dated 16 April 2024.

Smith Farm Vaughan 158 Years in Family, The Liberal, Thursday February 4, 1960. Newspaper article by Mona Robertson.



NOTICE OF INTENT TO DESIGNATE UNDER THE ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT

Re: Notice of Intent to Designate 7961 Jane Street pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

INTENT TO DESIGNATE UNDER THE ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT

Please take notice that the Council of the Corporation of the City of Vaughan intends to designate for reasons of cultural heritage value or interest, pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* the property municipally known as <u>**7961 Jane Street**</u> in the City of Vaughan, in the Province of Ontario.

REASONS FOR PROPOSED DESIGNATION

7961 Jane Street is an example of the Foursquare style, also known as American Foursquare, considered a subtype of the Edwardian style. The two-storey red brick structure is set back from the road, and the front elevation faces Jane Street.

7961 Jane Street is associated with the Smith family, who were early settlers in Vaughan around 1799. The property remained in the family for 165 years. When the Smith family ownership came to an end in 1966, it was then taken over by the Canadian National Railway which used the property as part of their large marshalling yard. Originally called the Toronto Yard, it was later renamed in 1975 as the MacMillan Yard, after former president Norman J. MacMillian.

The contextual value of the subject property relates to the building's historical link and physical location on the property. Located on the west half of Lot 7, Concession 4, and set back from the road, the property historically represents a way of life during the time period it was built and connects to the Smith family. The Smith family not only made contributions that supported the development of Vaughan, but they were also early settlers in the area. This building reflects their success and hard work in the establishment of a homestead. It is here that the merit of the house lies, just as much as in the architectural value.

A copy of this Notice of Intent to Designate may be found on the City of Vaughan's Heritage Notice webpage: Heritage Notices | City of Vaughan

A full statement of the Cultural Heritage Value of this property may be obtained through linking to the original <u>Heritage Vaughan</u> report.

ANY PERSON MAY, within thirty (30) days of the first publication of this Notice, send by registered mail or deliver to the Clerk of the Corporation of the City of Vaughan, a notice of objection to the proposed designation together with a statement of the reasons for the objection and all relevant facts, on or before 4:30 p.m. Wednesday May 15, 2024 to be sent by registered mail or dropped off in person to:

Office of the City Clerk, City of Vaughan 2141 Major Mackenzie Drive West Vaughan, ON L6A 1T1

Objections can also be submitted via email at: <u>clerks@vaughan.ca</u> If a notice of objection is received, the Clerk will refer the matter to the City of Vaughan Council for reconsideration.

Dated at Vaughan this 16th day of April, 2024

Todd Coles, City Clerk

THE LIBERAL, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Thursday, February 4, 1960

MEMBER The Liberal AUDIT . BUREAN LIRCULATION An Independent Weekly: Established 1878 Subscription Rate \$3.50 per year; to United States \$4.50; 10c single copy Member Audit Bureau of Circulations

Member Canadian Weekly Newspapers Association

J. E. SMITH, Editor and Publisher

MONA ROBERTSON, Associate Editor

"Authorized as second class mail, Post Office Department, Ottawa"

Welcome New Hospital

We are glad to know that plans are about to be made for a local hospital.

In an area which boasts of so many churches representative of so many facets of the Christian faith; possessing so many educational assets: the fine high schools, public schools, well-equipped public libraries, a school for retarded children - as well as providing recreational facilities, appreciation and teaching of the arts — it's high time we had a centre of healing in our midst.

Although the dream of a hospital here is not a new one to many, it has taken a great many years to "get to he point".

As far back as 1953 "The Liberal"

ing for Thursday, February 11th, at 8 p.m., in the McConaghy School Auditorium" . . . her reply, which must echo the reaction of hundreds of other mothers in this area, was, "Wonderful news".

We single out this one woman, who is the mother of ten children, because as she said, "I haven't missed a year in hospital since 1944 — for one reason or another. And to have to go miles away from my family and friends to be admitted to a hospital, has made me realize that a hospital in one's own district means the end of loneliness to those hospitalized — it also means hours saved in travelling, for our local doctors".

All those interested in promoting a local hospital and seeing it get off to a good start, should make it a point to attend the February 11th meeting, when a provisional board of directors will be appointed and plans discussed for the early establishment of the hospital. This invitation includes residents of the neighbouring municipalities, Markham, Vaughan and Richmond Hill . . . who will benefit alike from such a worthy and necessary project.

Smith Farm Vaughan 158 Years In Family

by Mona Robertson "At that time Upper Canada — A forest covered land — Which seemed to hold inducements -For a settler it looked grand . . ."

This is part of a poem entitled "Pioneers in My Ancestry", by the late Menno Smith, which found its way to the editorial desk of "The Liberal", following our recent item about the 147 year old Puterbaugh farm in Vaughan Township, and our query, "Can any other family beat this record."

Apparently the Smith family of the 1st Lot, No. 7, the concentration camp, the fir-Concession 4 Vaughan Township, can, for this family moved to this locality, now known as Edgeley, in the year 1801.

In 1799 a bachelor by name of floor was used to store the grain.' John Smith came to Canada from The homely article of family Somerset County, Pennsylvania, life, the grandfather clock, is in-4th of Vaughan, August 1, 1801. family possessions to the new ther Jacob, his wife and eight it the poet says: children, who took over the farm. "That clock has kept on running Some of Jacob Smith's children From that day unto this returned later to Pennsylvania, Excepting only for repairs but four of his sons, and possibly A few days it would miss. two of the daughters remained. Grandfather style it surely is One of the daughters married And a thirty hour kind a Samuel Moyer and went to live A dial to tell the date as well at Vineland, Ontario, and whether Within each month you'll find. or not the former Miss Smith was Makes no mistake when days of a matchmaker or not we do not know, but two or three of her brothers later married girls

Have thirty one in each whom they met at Vineland, In other months just turn the dial in the world. From early Christ-The records we saw said, "they So number one is reached".

month

story of bravery in the face of constant opposition from enemies within and without the Church. Our 20th century has also witnessed fierce persecution of Christians in almost every land outside the Western hemisphere. The gospel, while it has been accepted by many, has been rejected by many more. And whenever the Church has brought its message to bear upon human life and society, it has had to pay a heavy price for doing so.

North American, at least in name, is a professing Christian community. Nevertheless, persecution of Christians and Christian principles is prevalent among us. Those who seek to hold the life that is in Christ, will meet with opposition. It may not be ing squad, or physical torture, but persecution can come through the cold shoulder, the snub, the sneer, the cynicism of those who resist the uplifting in-

fluence of the Christian life. If we are Christians, we must be ready for anything. Alexander seeking farm land. He searched corporated into the poem too: MacLaren, wrote, "A true Christfor two years, finally taking over brought from Pennsylvania on one ian ought to be a standing rebuke two hundred acres of land on the of the many trips to bring all the to the world, an incarnate conscience." If this is so, then we Then he was joined by his bro- home in Vaughan Township, of must be willing to accept the opposition which will come.

The secret of victory in the midst of persecution, has always been the great example of our Lord, and the power He has given to His people in every age to rise above the opposing force of evil men. The cross was the price Christ paid for allegiance to the Living God. And yet our Lord had victory over that death, because He knew that the will of God is the most important thing

ian martyrs to modern believers.



was receiving "Letters to the Editor" from Mrs. Charles Ratchford, who urged that a hospital was needed in this district — to supply the needs of the growing population. We asked Mrs. Ratchford what her reaction was to the notice in our last issue that "Initial steps have been taken for the founding of a new hospital . . . and preliminary study by municipal leaders and members of the Medical Association has resulted in the calling of a public meet-

Leadership In Research

Over the years, Canada has shown the way to the world in many aspects of medical research. It was here that insulin, the life-blood of the diabetic, was discovered; it was here that important work in the development of the Salk vaccine for poliomyelitis was carried out.

We should be proud that we have, in Canada, doctors and medical scientists who can prove the leadership, inspiration and imagination to the world of medicine.

Today, many of these men and women are engaged in an all-out fight against heart disease. They are fortunate to have at their disposal the facilities of our medical schools which

are among the finest in the world. Already much of their effort has been crowned with success.

Research on heart disease in Canada need know no bounds, unless it is limited by the lack of funds. During this month, the Canadian Heart Fund is conducting a drive to ensure that the research may continue uninterrupted. Funds are needed to meet expenses incidental to the work and to maintain the doctors and medical scientists on fellowships.

All of us have a vital stake in the fight against heart disease. Our support of the Canadian Heart Fund will help our medical scientists to conquer yet another enemy of mankind,

AURORA : Formerly the assistant postmaster at Richmond Hill,

Victor Grisold is Aurora's new postmaster, succeeding George Walker who has retired, due to ill set of farm buildngs. However health.

STUART PAXTON WIRING LINE WORK Electrician

married girls whom they met at Vineland, which was one of their overnight stops on their trips back and forth to Pennsylvania, had for one waking at night and when they went for more sup- wishing to know the time .

plies". Jacob Smith junior remained and light a candle or lamp, all on the original homesite in Vau- one did was to reach from his ghan; Samuel took the west half bed, pull a string - and the clock of Lot 6; Daniel took the East would strike the last hour! half of Lot 6; John, the oldest boy of the family took Lot 5. Concession 5, although records indicate or was it rather the instrument he first farmed Lot 15, Concess- which made Jerry Smith, Menno ion 5 Vaughan Township, where Smith's brother, the grand old most of his children were born. Jacob had a family of eight watchmaker of Richmond Hill. children, like his grandfather, but sons, Abraham and Samuel, div- ice department is taking judo ided the original farmland be-lessons at Newmarket High fore Parliament. tween them, Abraham taking the School weekly - to help them in

farm (in the year 1890) and mov- "walkie-talkie" radio in the gym. ed to Markham. Samuel had a family of two sons and two daughters. Jerry and Menno were the sons; Men-

no remaining on the farm, Jerry moving to Richmond Hill. In 1934 Menno built a house on the corner of the farm where he spent his declining years, his whole life having been lived on the south half of Lot 7 as was his

father's before him. Allan Smith, Menno's son, took over the farm from his father and still resides there, although in 1959 the Canadian National Railway purchased fifty acres of the farm as part of the proposed marshalling yard - which incidentally will follow the pattern of the one in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.

The fifty acres, on which Allan which the settlers built their first none of those original buildings of over 150 years ago remain to-

day - yet there are traces of old land marks such as a cellar over which the old log house stood; the black soil where the old outdoor bake-oven had been; the indent in the hill used for breaking admired. We want to be popular. flax, to make the linen for their Persecution for our faith seems

suffering for their faith, this has Menno Smith went on to exbeen the underlying conviction, plain through his poetry about a which has kept men true to remarkable attachment this clock Christ.

If our witness to Christ, leads us to suffer wrong at the hands there was no need to strike a flint of friends, relatives or outsiders. let us not run away from it but accept it, ever remembering that courageous, uncomprising witness to Christ, has always won Could this clock have been the the day. product of the late Jerry Smith,

WOULD RETAIN CAPITAL PUNISHMENT man of watchmaking, and a noted Dear Mister Editor:-

As a reader of your paper

would like to express my views three of his sons died young. Two NEWMARKET : The whole pol- on the question of the death sentence in Canada which is now be-

I certainly think the death sennorth part and Samuel the south their police work. They keep up tence should not be done away 100 acres. Later Abraham sold his with the despatches office with a with.

Some say that to take a life is

sacred, and this may be so, but what about the life the murderer takes.

The Bible says, "an eye for an eye" and again it says" he Facts that sheddeth the blood of man, so shall he shed his own blood. So what are we to believe?

It is the right of everybody and to write to their Member of Parliament and express an opinior Faith on this controversial subject.

I do not agree with the present system of paying the penalty The Gas Chamber might be ad opted, and we could have a cen-

THE LIFE COURAGEOUS tral place for executions. The teachings of the Beati-Under the present system the tudes ends on a high note of Cabinet do consider and review challenge. Our Lord says, "Bless- all cases and can commute the ed are ye, when men shall re- death sentence where deemed advile you, and persecute you, and visable. Please write to your still resides, includes the area on shall say all manner of evil a- M. P. at Ottawa and give your gainst you falsely, rejoice ex- views. No postage is required on ceedingly and be glad, for great the letter. Ex-Warden

is your reward in heaven." This is a very hard saying If we examine our own minds, we realize that we do not want persecution or oppression because of our faith. We want the very opposite. We want to be liked and

By Calvin H. Chambers



"BATTLE FLAME"

Please note: Thurs., Fri., last complete show, 8.30 p.m. Sat. continuous from 6 p.m.

and think it should be altered. PLEASE NOTE SAT. MATINEE 2 P.M. ONLY

"SURRENDER HELL!"

plus

The Little Rascals in "Let's Eat"

Mon, Tues., Wed. - February 8, 9, 10



TOWN OF RICHMOND HILL PUBLIC NOTICE NATIONAL HEALTH WEEK" January 31st to February 6th, 1960

Whereas the Health League of Canada, in cooperation with Health and Educational Authorities

3 of ti H k p li M M	 Inroughout Canada, has set aside the week of January Ist, as National Health Week; and Whereas this annual crusade for health is worthy if the support of all citizens: I, therefore, as Mayor of Richmond Hill, declare his week as "National Health Week" in Richmond Iill, and urge everyone to give all-out support to ocal health authorities and make this nation, this rovince and this town a healthier place in which to ve. Iayor's Office, K. W. TOMLIN, Iunicipal Offices, Richmond Hill Mayor anuary 30th, 1960 	Phone TUrner 4-2881 Phone TUrner 4-2881 CANADIAN CANCER SOCIETY Richmond Hill & District Onti For information call Richmond Hill TU. 4-1229 TU. 4-4821 AV. 5-4825 Thornhill AV. 5-1603 AV. 5-1743 ALpine 7-2650 AV. 5-2406 Unionville 239	too difficult for us to bear. Perhaps, the reason for our re- luctance to accept persecution, "for Christ's sake and the Gos- pel," is that the Christian faith has been presented to us as a re- ligion of escape. We have been told that to accept Christ we shall have joy and peace, that life's problems will be solved, that we will be successful in our undertakings. The Bible does not warrant such a naive and unreal- istic approach to the Christian Faith. Never did our Lord promise His disciples an easy time of it. The Gospels and the Acts of the Apostles are full of illustrations of early Christian persecution. Church history tells a wonderful	THE BIG HIT OF TH NEW YEAR MOVES OV THE SCREEN'S MOST GORGEOUS FEMALE AT HER BOLDEST, BECKONING BEST! BRIGITTE BRARDOOT	
	MEASURE IT! We will send our man to your home to measure your floor exactly. WE PAD IT! Mothproof padding for added comfort and softness	DOMS CARPETED WAL Market And	A Weave	<section-header><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></section-header>	SE

