

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Tuesday, June 11, 2024 **WARD**: 1

TITLE: LOW-RISE RESIDENTIAL TOWNHOUSE DEVELOPMENT COMPRISED OF 5 TOWNHOUSE BLOCKS LOCATED AT 10398-10402 ISLINGTON AVE, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

<u>Purpose</u>

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding the proposed low-rise residential townhouse development comprised of 5 townhouse blocks located at 10398 and 10402 Islington Ave., a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachments 1-8.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing a low-rise residential townhouse development comprised of 5 townhouse blocks at 10398-10402 Islington Avenue.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan and Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed low-rise residential townhouse development comprised of 5 townhouse blocks at 10398 and 10402 Islington Ave., under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

Background

The project site is an irregular "flag" lot on the west side of Islington Avenue, across from the Kleinburg public school. The project consists of 5 "blocks", Block 1 being closest to the street— remaining blocks numbered sequentially moving up the right side of the driveway and returning on the left side. Block 1 has a strong street presence, set close to the street line on its east façade and visible from the south through the driveway entrance. The other blocks are seen only obliquely through the entrance. Existing and new planting, as well as topography, restricts other views from the public realm.

The design vocabulary for the project is inspired by Georgian architecture, a local precedent style. The revisions made to the elevations are intended to simplify the designs to more closely adhere to precedent details and the district guidelines. In the Heritage Consultant's [Paul Oberst] professional opinion, the proposed development will enhance, rather than detract from the heritage character of the KNHCD as described in the KNHCD Plan.

This information is based on an addendum to the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment and Heritage Conservation District Conformity Report prepared in September 2023 by Robinson Heritage Consulting. It reflects the revisions to the building elevations for the project, made in response to the recommendations made in the Robinson Conformity Report, as well as recommendations made by the Heritage Consultant after consultation with Robinson and with City heritage staff, and after a virtual meeting with City heritage staff and the entire project team.

Previous Reports/Authority

OPA and ZBA applications were initially submitted in 2018, with revised submissions made in September 2023 and February 2024. The third re-submission, made on April 19, 2024, is currently under review by staff and to date, all the major commenting departments/agencies have signed off on the application. Since the initial submission of the OPA and ZBA there have been significant updates to the design, vision, and overall layout of the subject property to ensure that the proposal accurately reflects the planning objectives and desired land use planning vision in the context of applicable policies and regulations.

Analysis and Options

The proposed development seeks to introduce a low-rise residential townhouse development comprised of a total of 5 townhouse blocks. The development proposes 22 freehold townhouse units tied to a common element condo. The total combined gross floor area for the development is 4,298.01 m2 (46,263.39 ft2), which result in a Gross FSI of 0.20 (including the NHS lands to the west), and a Net FSI of 0.9 (development lands only).

The (5) townhouse blocks have been designed to generally follow the "L" shaped development site and to front onto a new private condominium road that provides access to the units. Block 1 fronts onto Islington Avenue, whereas Blocks 2-5 are contained at the rear of the site. Each block contains a driveway and garage extending from the front of the units to the private condominium road, apart from Block 1, which is dual facing given its prominence along Islington Avenue. Block 1 consists of a pitched roof, while Blocks 2-5 contain a flat roof with rooftop amenity terraces. The exterior finish of the parapet and upper level have been designed to incorporate sloping, window treatments, dormers, and building materials that emulate a sloped roof design and the appearance of a 2.5 storey building in conformity with the guidelines.

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development according the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.

4.4.2 Residential Area Scale And Massing

- New residential construction in the residential villages shall respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing and shall not predominate over the existing adjacent buildings.
- New development shall not exceed a building height of 9.5 metres.
- New development shall not be designed to a greater height or scale than the surrounding buildings, it should fit in with the existing streetscape in terms of rhythm, alignment and spacing.

- New buildings shall be designed to preserve the generous side yards typical in the villages. As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses shall be accommodated without great increases in building frontage into elements that proportionally reflect the adjacent building forms.
- New residential construction shall reflect the typical directional emphasis and building form of the surrounding streetscape. It shall not overwhelm the heritage character of the district.

The proposed development of five townhouse blocks with a total of 22 units does exceed the allowable height for scale and massing within the KNHCD. Block 1 faces Islington Ave. and is visible from the road. It has a total height of 10.97m, while recognizing that an adjustment was made to the height at mid-slope of the roof, being 9.46m.

Revisions have been made to Blocks 2-5. The Georgian Townhouse elevations now have a 2.5 storey appearance with a mansard roof and dormers, differing from the previous 3 storey appearance with flat roof and parapet. The height of the midpoint of the mansard slope is set to 9.47m, which visually respects the policy framework, but actual height to the top of the parapet is 11.5m.

Architectural Styles

- The new construction can be contemporary in their construction and composition but shall be compatible by employing the materials, scale, massing or proportions typically found in the heritage buildings within the Heritage Conservation District.
- Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles in spirit (i.e. massing, scale, and proportions) example Victorian, Georgian but not a direct replica. See Section 2.5.
- A consistent approach to design detail for the chosen style shall be used for all building elements. Hybrid designs that mix elements from different historical styles are not appropriate. Historical styles that are not historically found in the area, such as Tudor or French Manor, are not appropriate.
- In order to reflect a village pattern, adjacent detached buildings shall not be identical.
- Inappropriate "vintage" materials and assemblies that do not belong to the period or chosen style shall not be used.
- Architectural details that reinterpret traditional ones responding to the chosen style are encouraged. Contemporary interpretations of traditional details e.g. new designs for windows and door surrounds can provide visual interest and also convey the fact that the building is new. These contemporary reinterpretations shall be similar in scale and proportions to those used historically.

It is evident that significant changes were made to the architectural drawings in order to adhere to the KNHCD policy of a consistent approach to design detail for the chosen style being used for all building elements. The earlier drawings were mixing elements from different styles while the current design focuses more on the Georgian architectural style, which is approved for use in the KNHCD.

4.4.4.1 List of Appropriate Materials

Exterior Finish: Use materials compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Roofs: Slopes and layouts compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Doors: Use materials and designs compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Windows: Use windows compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Refer to Section 4.2.2 for a list of appropriate materials used in the HCD.

Several revisions have been made to Block 1: the precast molded band has been replaced with monochromatic projecting brick banding; the stone base cladding has been removed (on all elevations); the second storey centre joined window configuration has been separated in to two separately trimmed windows, and the porch posts have been revised to include recessed panels to further echo posts of the front fence posts and doors.

Various revisions have also been made to blocks 2-5. The stone was removed from the front sides and rear of the elevations, making them now uniformly brick with brick skew back lintels. Unnecessary windows, suggested as "blind" windows, have been removed as much as possible from the design. The portico entries were reconfigured to centre the entry door in the portico structure, as well, the portico posts were revised to include recessed panels to further echo posts of the Islington frontage fence posts and doors. The rooftop mechanical enclosures were simplified to reduce visual impact. Staff is satisfied with the revisions to the elevations.

Financial Impact

N/A

Operational Impact

N/A

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied with the proposed work which conforms to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed low-rise residential townhouse development comprised of 5 town house blocks at 10398 and 10402 Islington Avenue, under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152.

Attachments

- 1. 10398-10402 Islington_Location Map.
- 2. 10398-10402 Islington_CHIA.
- 3. 10398-10402 Islington CHIA Addendum.
- 4. 10398-10402 Islington_Site Plan.
- 5. 10398-10402 Islington_Elevations.
- 6. 10398-10402 Islington Rendering.
- 7. 10398-10402 Islington_Landscape Concept.
- 8. 10398-10402 Islington_Building Materials Boards.

Prepared by

Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152.

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653.

Nancy Tuckett, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8529.