

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report



DATE: Thursday, April 11, 2024

WARD: 1

TITLE: PROPOSED NEW CONSTRUCTION OF A SINGLE DETACHED DWELLING WITH ATTACHED GARAGE LOCATED AT 51 NAPIER STREET, IN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee’s support and recommend to Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed new construction of a 2-storey house with attached 2-car garage, to replace the previously demolished ‘contributing’ structure at 51 Napier Street, located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachments 1-7).

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing to construct a new dwelling to replace the demolished ‘contributing’ structure at 51 Napier St.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed development as presented, subject to the following conditions:

- a) that further refinements to building design and material specifications revisions to be aligned with the KNHCD Plan guidelines shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to submission of final Heritage Permit drawings;
- b) that any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;

- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application;
- d) that the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and the Chief Building Official; and
- e) that the applicant enters into a letter of undertaking for the purpose of completion of all landscaping in accordance with the approved plans to the satisfaction of the City.

Background

The subject property at 51 Napier Street had a ‘contributing’ 19th century Victorian style residence with an adjacent 20th century detached garage. The proposal submitted in May 2022 was to request a demolition of the existing garage at the rear of the property, and to restore the existing building by raising the clear height of the upper floor (and subsequent construction of a roof identical to existing), and by constructing a new attached garage. Design for the additions was presented to have similar roof pitches compatible with existing Victorian style heritage house. Staff issued a Heritage Permit (HP.2022.011.00) on August 4, 2022. However after approval, the owner proceeded to demolish all built structures on the property and remove some of the landscaping, in June 2023.

Previous Reports/Authority

[Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting agenda for May 18, 2022.](#)

[Committee of the Whole transmittal on June 7, 2022.](#)

[Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting agenda March 27, 2024 \(Item 6\)](#)

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD.

The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the KNHCD guidelines.

9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW

New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style.

Cultural Heritage staff support the design of the replacement building as its proposed scale and massing proportions and architectural style are suitable to the area and will enhance the cultural heritage landscape of Kleinburg Village in accordance with KNHCD and Vaughan Official Plan 2010 policies.

2.5.1.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE

“New construction in the residential villages shall be sympathetic and complementary to the historic built form of neighbouring properties. New buildings shall be designed with local heritage styles in mind. Designs shall

not look to re-create but rather incorporate and highlight appropriate features. In particular, windows, doors and trim shall be similarly attenuated and architectural detailing should be visible in spirit but not a direct duplication. Materials shall be of a similar palette those found within the HCD.”

The proposed Georgian style design features a brick façade that plays with symmetrical and classical proportions. The covered front entry portico with solid panelled main door and double pilasters repetition enhances the entry to strengthen the chosen architectural style, whilst the pronounced gable at the side downplays the double garage and adds a touch of grounded detail by reinforcing the quality of the older function of a coach house. The proportional fenestration carries the repetition of the double pilasters to all floor levels and concludes with the symmetry of the dormers in the gaps between the ground floor columns. Flanking tall chimneys visible from the street successfully act as bookends to the main dwelling that saddles over the much larger dwelling block intersecting it to connect to the garage. The Owner has provided a satisfactory architectural drawing set that delineates a house which will contribute positively to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan.

2.5.1.3 SCALE AND MASSING

“New residential construction in the residential villages shall respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots.”

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, which is made up of one-storey, two-storey, and three-storey dwellings. The proposed dwelling and attached 2-car garage will be situated in the same area as the existing dwelling. The proposed new height is within the maximum allowable height of the KNHCD and is well-placed between its immediate neighbours. Overall, the proposed building brings a satisfactory massing, proportion, and style that will contribute to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan, as shown on Attachment 4.

4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: WALL MATERIALS

“The use of traditional materials and products for any new structure shall be visually compatible with the adjacent historical buildings. Traditional cladding materials in KNHCD include red clay brick, stucco and wood siding. The use of the following materials is not supported: stone and artificial stone (currently being used), vinyl, concrete block and concrete brick, precast or poured concrete, modern stucco, terra cotta, and glazed tile.”

The proposed plans include a satisfactory Materials Palette as shown on Attachment 5. The proposal comprises a suitable integration of light colour brick (with the appearance of fieldstone) complemented with 6” wood clapboard, cedar shake roofing, and elegantly delineated copper accents of the eavestroughs and downpipes.

4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: GARAGES AND OUTBUILDINGS

“A garage shall be located in such a way that the house not the garage is the focal point of the new construction. Windows and doors shall be compatible with the District character. The use of traditional materials and products such as wood windows and sidings, is always preferred. Non-traditional materials and products (aluminium, cement board) in historical configurations and profiles that provide the appearance of traditional materials may be used. New garage doors shall reflect simple historic doors in a form that is consistent with the historic vernacular architecture of KNHCD.”

The plan includes a 2-car garage located at the front of the building and slightly recessed from the main façade facing the street. The rear of the building, not visible from the street, is a more contemporary massing, form, and scale that is adequately inferior to that of the front elevation.

4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: LANDSCAPE

“Landscape features around a building and the overall streetscape like trees, fencing, walkways, driveways, sheds can contribute to the special character of the District and shall be incorporated within the new design. Maintain greenspace by having generous setbacks between buildings and presence of mature trees, in addition to decorative shrubbery, in the front, side, and rear yards. The ratio of greenspace to building mass and the side yard setbacks shall be generally consistent with the character of adjacent properties. New parking areas shall be introduced in a manner that has minimal impact on lawns, gardens, mature vegetation, and the views of the building. Visual impact assessments and other guidelines such as Built Features and Vegetation shall be integrated at an early stage in project planning so that any potential impacts on the heritage value of the cultural landscape can be mitigated or even avoided.”

The Arborist Report (see Attachment 6) identifies 18 trees to be preserved, 12 trees to be removed (of which, 6 had been previously approved for removal under HP.2022.011.00) and 1 tree to be injured in order to accommodate the proposed construction. The report recommends the planting of 19 trees after the completion of the construction, and a Tree Protection Agreement is included with the proposal. Cultural Heritage is satisfied that the Arborist Report recommendations are conforming to the KNHCD Plan guidelines.

4.4.4.1 List of Appropriate Materials

Exterior Finish: Use materials compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Roofs: Slopes and layouts compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Doors: Use materials and designs compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

Windows: Use windows compatible with the nearby contributing buildings which form the heritage context.

The selected materials for the subject property are in-keeping with the requirements of the KNHCD Plan. The proposed building will be clad in variegated light brown stretcher bond brick on a foundation with the appearance of fieldstone. This is complemented by 6” wood clapboard on the dormers and the connecting exposed walls flanking the main elevation. The roof is clad in cedar shakes and accentuated by copper eavestroughs and downpipes. The windows have aluminum frames.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Operational Impact

There are no operational impacts associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

N/A

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed new construction of a detached 2-storey house with attached 2-car garage conforms to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposed new construction located at 51 Napier Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 51Napier-NEW_Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 51Napier-NEW_Scoped CHIA
- Attachment 3 – 51Napier-NEW_Architectural drawings
- Attachment 4 – 51Napier-NEW_3D renderings
- Attachment 5 – 51Napier-NEW_Materials and Samples Board
- Attachment 6 – 51Napier-NEW_Arborist Report
- Attachment 7 – 51Napier-NEW_Landscape Plans

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191
Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653
Nancy Tuckett, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8529