

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Thursday, April 11, 2024

WARD: 1

TITLE: PROPOSED 2-STOREY REAR ADDITION TO EXISTING 1 ½-STOREY BUILDING LOCATED AT 10477 ISLINGTON AVE, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee's support and recommend to Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed 2-storey rear addition to the existing 1½ -storey commercial building located at 10477 Islington Ave, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachments 1-6.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing a 2-storey rear addition to the existing 1 ½-storey commercial building at 10477 Islington Ave, where the existing main dwelling is identified as a 'contributing' property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ("KNHCD Plan").
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed works as presented in Option 1 of the CHIA (Attachment 2) with the requested change to remove the proposed wraparound porch, subject to the following conditions:

- a) that further refinements to building design and material specifications revisions to be aligned with the KNHCD Plan guidelines shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to submission of final Heritage Permit drawings;
- b) that any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application; and
- d) that the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and the Chief Building Official.

Background

The subject property consists of a Boomtown-style commercial building, constructed ca.1900, firmly associated with the Shaw family who were prominent Kleinburg merchants. Shaw was a Tinsmith and had opened a Tinsmith shop in 1869 when he and his family moved to Kleinburg. The Shaw family were remembered especially for their Bindertwine Delivery Night, which was a result of farmers needing to come and buy their Bindertwine at a central location. This night began happening around 1891 and evolved into a festival that lasted into the early 1930s. note- Bindertwine Festival was revived in 1967 as a centennial project.

Previous Reports/Authority

Re-zoning application in 2014

Re-cladding/sign work in 2015

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD.

The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the KNHCD guidelines.

2.3.5 Alterations & Additions to Contributing Properties

New attached additions to contributing buildings to be designed to complement the design of the original building. Additions are to be subordinate so as not to overwhelm the heritage character of the original building. Any alterations and addition to contributing buildings require a Heritage Impact Assessment as well as a Heritage Permit.

Two options were proposed for the alteration and addition, found on page 9 of the submitted CHIA. Figure 13, option 1 maintains the existing front wall and porch while adding a wraparound to the porch along the north elevation at the façade; option 2 extends the building and the front facade to the north. While the owner, architect and heritage consultant prefer option 2, staff supports option 1 and recommends the removal of the added wrap porch, as this helps to maintain its historical appearance, including its representation in A.J. Casson from the Group of Seven's painting, "Kleinburg". This falls in line more preferably with the KNHCD as "Additions are to be subordinate so as not to overwhelm the heritage character of the original building".

2.5.2.2 Architectural Style

Historic buildings were a mix of purpose-built commercial structures and house-form residential. Some residential buildings had storefronts added after construction, even at a very early date. Most of the buildings, even purpose-built ones, had gable roofs. New commercial construction shall be sympathetic to and complement its historic built form. New buildings shall be designed with local heritage styles in mind. Designs should not look to re-create but rather incorporate and highlight appropriate features. In particular, windows, doors and trim shall be similarly attenuated and architectural detailing should be visible in spirit but not a direct duplication. Materials shall be of a similar palette to those found within the HCD.

The proposed construction of option 1 is sympathetic to the existing built structure. It compliments and further supports the character of the building as well. The design incorporates features such as the double-paned windows, and wood-siding/cladding. The 'boomtown' appearance is maintained throughout the design, and the materials used reflect the original material palette.

2.5.2.3 Scale and Massing

New commercial construction shall respect local heritage precedents for scale and massing. This includes existing historic and contributing buildings, as well as those that have been lost but are recorded in historical photographs. Heights within the commercial designation generally shall not exceed a maximum building height of 9.5 metres. Heights and building footprints shall be consistent with those found in adjacency within the HCD. Minor variances related to building height will not be supported.

The height of the building is under 9.5m, which is within the parameters of the KNHCD. Option 1 of the proposal is more respectful of the scale and massing of the district and the subject building and does not overwhelm the spacing or the adjacent properties. It is also consistent with the footprints of the buildings adjacent and across from the subject site.

4.2.1.1 Exterior Walls Composition

The elevations of heritage buildings, whether designed by an architect or by a builder using a "pattern book", were usually laid out using geometrical principles and geometrically derived proportions. Knowledge of how heritage buildings were

originally composed can be helpful in designing a new building that will fit well in the heritage context.

Exterior walls include foundation walls, structural masonry or log walls, and wood, concrete or steel framing with an exterior cladding such as curtain wall-wall systems⁶. Historic walls were most often solid brick masonry.

III. Wood Siding

The use of wood is an important heritage attribute in historic buildings. Almost all building styles include a version that includes wood siding an exterior cladding material. Historic wood siding is primarily of two types:

- *Horizontal clapboard, with about 4" to the weather &*
- *Vertical board and batten siding.*

The corrugated metal siding on the south side of the existing building will be retained, while the remaining facades will be clad in Hardie fibre-cement board products; adhering to materials identified within the KNHCD. The ground floor, front façade is clad with HardiePanel with HardieTrim batten, which is representative of the current board and batten cladding. The rest is clad with HardiePlank lap siding, which represents the top of the front façade, as well as the rear façade. The chosen material fits in well with the surrounding commercial buildings of the KNHCD.

4.2.1.5 Windows

Windows represent the 'eyes' of a building and most often represent a character-defining element of a historic building. Historically, window designs were governed by mathematical ratios, patterns and existing building traditions. Each building style includes a specific window design. Windows were manufactured out of wood typically, however presence of steel, iron and bronze was also found in different styles, time and places.

The windows of the building are mostly plain and unimpressive, but they fit the unusual 'boomtown' style. The second storey of the front façade has two large, single-paned windows and the south side of the building remains unchanged, with double-paned windows lining the top and bottom. The proposed addition to the north and rear follow suit with double-paned windows lining the top and bottom of the structure. The rear of the building, which is east facing, provides larger double-paned windows, inviting natural light to enter the building. The chosen windows are satisfactory to the KNHCD.

4.2.4.2 New Additions to Heritage Buildings

New attached additions to heritage buildings shall be designed to complement the design and not to overwhelm the heritage character of the original building.

Consideration shall be given to its relationship with the heritage building as well as the historic district. The construction of an exterior addition in an historic building may seem essential for a proposed new use. A new addition shall be proposed only after it is determined that the needs cannot be met on another site or by altering

secondary, non-character-defining interior spaces. For any new proposed addition to an existing heritage building the following general guidelines must be considered:

General Guidelines for New Additions to Heritage Buildings

- If possible, avoid new additions if the needs can be met by altering a secondary non-character-defining space;*
- An addition shall be designed so that the heritage value of the historic place is not impaired and its attributes are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.*
- The addition shall be physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to, and distinguishable from the historic place 29.*
- Apply principles of minimal intervention, compatibility and reversibility regardless of size.*
- Follow the relevant guidelines for new construction for features such as roofs, dormers, foundations, windows, and doors, porches etc.*

For this proposal, we were presented with two options for the design. Option 1 is supported by staff, as it maintains the existing front wall and porch, while adding a wraparound to the porch along the north elevation at the façade. The only change that staff would ask for is the removal of the wrapped porch to better keep in line with the historical narrative and to give the original building autonomy. If it was ever required to be reversed, there should be no major issues.

Option 2 extends the building and the front facade to the north, thus overwhelming the original building and not being subordinate. It potentially devalues the historic attributes, as it makes the building look different from its origin and becomes unrecognizable in comparison to its past. It holds significance in the art world as well, through A.J Casson of the Group of Seven's painting of Kleinburg, where this building is featured. The Group of Seven is also highly tied to the immediate history of the area through the McMichael Canadian Art Gallery, which is just down the road from this building.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Operational Impact

There are no operational impacts associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

N/A

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed work which conforms to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of option 1 of the

proposed 2-storey rear addition to the existing 1 ½ storey at 10477 Islington Ave, ***with the requested change for the removal of the wraparound portion of the porch,*** under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152.

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 10477 Islington_Location Map.
- Attachment 2 – 10477 Islington_CHIA.
- Attachment 3 – 10477 Islington_Architectural Set.
- Attachment 4 – 10477 Islington_Arborist Report.
- Attachment 5 – 10477 Islington_Landscape Set.
- Attachment 6 – 10477 Islington_Material Board.

Prepared by

Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152.
Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.
Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653.
Nancy Tuckett, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8529.