

# Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

---

**DATE:** Wednesday, February 28, 2024

**WARD:** 1

**TITLE: DEMOLITION OF THE EXISTING ONE-AND-A-HALF STOREY DWELLING AND SEPARATE GARAGE BUILDING, NEW CONSTRUCTION OF A TWO-STOREY DWELLING AT 57 NAPIER STREET, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

**FROM:**

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

**ACTION:** DECISION

---

**Purpose**

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee's support and recommend to Committee of the Whole approval of the proposed demolition of the existing one-and-a-half storey dwelling and separate garage building, and the new construction of a two-storey residential building located at 57 Napier St., a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachments 1 to 8.

**Report Highlights**

- The Owner is proposing demolition of the current dwelling and garage, a non-contributing, non-historic property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ("KNHCD Plan") and the construction of a new dwelling at 57 Napier Street.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan. Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.

## **Recommendations**

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed development as presented, subject to the following conditions:

- a) that further refinements to building design and material specifications revisions to be aligned with the KNHCD Plan guidelines shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to submission of final Heritage Permit drawings;
- b) that any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- d) that the Owner submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and the Chief Building Official;
- e) that the Owner enters into a Private Tree Removal to the satisfaction of the City.

## **Background**

The subject property at 57 Napier St. is a Suburban-Victorian inspired (which is a faux style without significant architectural integrity that does not contribute to the character of the HCD), non-contributing residence located within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District. It is 1½ storey with a pitched roof, is clad in board and batten and was built in the 1980s.

A Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) for the existing structure on the property was submitted in support of the application as shown in Attachment 2. It documents the existing structure, providing photos of the elevations. Cultural Heritage staff has reviewed the CHIA and confirms that it meets the CHIA Terms of Reference.

## **Previous Reports/Authority**

Not applicable.

## **Analysis and Options**

**All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development according the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan 2021.**

### **2.5.1 RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT**

*The historical residential villages were laid out with large lots, ranging between a quarter- to a half-acre. Houses were mostly of a modest scale, leaving generous yards on all sides. The use of the yards has changed, and they provide more pleasure and less production now, but to a great extent the original village scale has persisted. Building height, lot coverage, and density are all low. The streetscapes are unified by a canopy of trees, planted in front of, behind, and beside most houses. New development shall respect the overall setback pattern of the streetscape on which it is proposed. New buildings shall generally be located with the front façade parallel to the roadway. In the village setting, setbacks are generally consistent, but not identical.*

Cultural Heritage staff support the design of the replacement building as the proposed scale and massing proportions and architectural style are suitable to the area and will maintain the cultural heritage landscape of Kleinburg Village in accordance with the KNHCD Plan and Vaughan Official Plan 2010 policies.

#### **4.4.2 SCALE AND MASSING**

*New residential construction in the residential villages shall respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. New development shall not exceed a building height of 9.5 metres. New development shall not be designed to a greater height or scale than the surrounding buildings, it should fit in with the existing streetscape in terms of rhythm, alignment and spacing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots.*

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, which is made up of one-storey, two-storey, and three-storey dwellings. The proposed dwelling and attached 2-car garage will be situated in the same area as the existing dwelling. Overall, this dwelling provides a satisfactory massing, proportion, and style that is consistent with the overall character of the KNHCD Plan, as shown on Attachment 4.

#### **4.4.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLES**

*The new construction can be contemporary in their construction and composition but shall be compatible by employing the materials, scale, massing or proportions typically found in the heritage buildings within the Heritage Conservation District. Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles in spirit (i.e., massing, scale, and proportions) example Victorian, Georgian but not a direct replica.*

The proposed Late-Victorian style includes a natural stone, three quarry blend stone foundation beneath a red brick façade that embraces the dark roof and windows, which

are double hung in appearance. The Owner has provided a satisfactory architectural drawing set as shown on Attachment 4 and a 3D colour rendering as shown on Attachment 7 that delineates a house which will contribute positively to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan.

#### **4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: WINDOWS, DOORS, WALL MATERIALS**

*“The use of traditional materials and products for any new structure shall be visually compatible with the adjacent historical buildings. Traditional cladding materials in KNHCD include red clay brick, stucco and wood siding. The use of the following materials is not supported: stone and artificial stone (currently being used), vinyl, concrete block and concrete brick, precast or poured concrete, modern stucco, terra cotta, and glazed tile.”*

The proposed plans include a satisfactory Materials Palette as shown on Attachment 8. The proposal comprises a suitable integration of red brick, dark colour roofing, dark earth tones stone base, and painted scheme with accents at the architectural elements, doors, front door and window detailing. Suggested building materials are satisfactory.

#### **4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: LANDSCAPE**

*“Landscape features around a building and the overall streetscape like trees, fencing, walkways, driveways, sheds can contribute to the special character of the district and shall be incorporated within the new design. Maintain greenspace by having generous setbacks between buildings and presence of Item 2 Page 5 of 6 mature trees, in addition to decorative shrubbery, in the front, side, and rear yards. The ratio of greenspace to building mass and the side yard setbacks shall be generally consistent with the character of adjacent properties. New parking areas shall be introduced in a manner that has minimal impact on lawns, gardens, mature vegetation, and the views of the building. Visual impact assessments and other guidelines such as Built Features and Vegetation shall be integrated at an early stage in project planning so that any potential impacts on the heritage value of the cultural landscape can be mitigated or even avoided.”*

A site inspection and data collection were initiated on November 16, 2023, for all trees that are 20 centimetres in diameter (measured at base and greater) within 6 metres of the subject site. The application includes a satisfactory tree inventory and protection plan. A total of 30 trees were inventoried, with 29 of them that can be preserved and protected with hoarding/fencing. One single tree has been identified for removal and will require a permit, and 5 trees have been identified as to be injured, also requiring permit. The Arborist Report & Tree Inventory Protection Plan is included as Attachment 6.

#### **Financial Impact**

There are no financial impacts associated with this report.

### **Operational Impact**

There are no operational impacts associated with this report.

### **Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations**

There are no broader regional impacts or considerations.

### **Conclusion**

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied with the proposed work which conforms to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan 2021. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition and construction of a new dwelling at 57 Napier Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

**For more information,** Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152.

### **Attachments**

- Attachment 1 – 57 Napier\_Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 57 Napier\_CHIA
- Attachment 3 – 57 Napier\_Survey
- Attachment 4 – 57 Napier\_Architectural Drawings
- Attachment 5 – 57 Napier\_Landscape Plan.
- Attachment 6 – 57 Napier\_Arborist report & Tree Inventory Protection Plan
- Attachment 7 – 57 Napier\_3D Rendering
- Attachment 8 – 57 Napier\_Material Samples

### **Prepared by**

Vanessa Lio, Heritage Specialist, ext. 8152.  
Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.  
Shahzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653.  
Nancy Tuckett, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8529.