

Committee of the Whole Report

DATE: Tuesday, May 07, 2019 **WARD(S):** 2

**TITLE: NEW CONSTRUCTION -TWO STOREY
ADDITION 169 CLARENCE STREET
WOODBIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

FROM:

Nick Spensieri, Deputy City Manager, Corporate Services

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To forward a recommendation from Heritage Vaughan Committee for the demolition of a detached garage and the construction of a two-storey addition to the existing one and a half-storey detached dwelling located at 169 Clarence Street, a property located in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing to demolish an existing detached garage and construct a two-storey addition to an existing one and a half-storey dwelling located at 169 Clarence Street.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan (“WHCD Plan”).
- Heritage Vaughan approval is required under the Ontario Heritage Act (“OHA”).
- Staff are recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the WHCD Plan.

Recommendations

The Deputy City Manager, Corporate Services, on behalf of Heritage Vaughan forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of March 20, 2019 (Item 4, Report No. 1, for consideration:

1. That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated March 20, 2019, be approved;
2. That the style and proportion of the window over the garage of the proposed extension be match the dormer of the original structure; and
3. That the colour of the garage door be more reflective of the colours of the original building.

Background

Recommendation and Report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated March 20, 2019:

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend approval to Council for the proposed demolition of the existing garage and a two-storey addition to the existing dwelling at 169 Clarence Street under Section 42 of Ontario Heritage Act, subject to the following conditions:
2.
 - a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - c) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application; and
 - d) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

The subject property is municipally known as 169 Clarence Street and is located on the east side of Clarence Street and north of Meeting House Road, as shown in Attachment 1.

The existing building is identified as a contributing property in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District ('WHCD') Plan. The WHCD Plan Inventory identifies the existing building as being built from 1925-1950, in the 1940's Cottage Style, as shown in Attachment 3, and notes that it is "largely original".

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

The Owner is proposing to demolish the existing detached one-storey garage and build a new two-storey addition containing a garage.

Currently, the garage is a small detached one-storey garage as shown in Attachment 4. The applicant is proposing a tandem garage with a new second-storey level connected to the existing dwelling as shown in Attachment 8. The proposal requires the demolition of the existing storage shed at the north east corner of the back yard. The proposed rooflines and second-storey dormers have been designed to complement the existing building form and features. The new addition is proposed to be set back from the front of house, roughly in line where the setback of the existing garage and with the existing architectural elements of the house being left intact and viewed in its current state. The proposed materiality for the addition utilizes shingles and brick that will be matched as close as possible to the existing material, creating a smooth transition from the existing dwelling to the proposed addition.

The proposed new construction is consistent with the following relevant sections of the WHCD Plan, with justification provided where the proposal does not meet certain polices in their entirety.

6.2.1 Standards and Guidelines for Conservation

“Rehabilitation: The action or process of ensuring a continuing use or a compatible contemporary use of a heritage resource (or an individual component) through repair, alterations, or additions, while protecting its heritage value. This can include replacing missing historic features either as an accurate replica of the feature or may be a new design that is compatible with the style, era, and character of the heritage resource”.

- The proposed addition will allow for the continued use of the contributing building while protecting its built heritage value of the original home in the 1940's Cottage Style.

Section 6.1.5 – Clarence Street and Park Drive Heritage Attributes

“1. The Street should retain the existing residential character with a single family detached building type and be designed to support a pedestrian streetscape”.

- The proposed addition will not impact the existing residential character, as the existing single family detached building type will remain and the two-storey addition is set to the side and behind the existing building and appears secondary to the main dwelling as shown in Attachments 6 and 7. The additional building height is mitigated by the placement of this addition at the rear of the property, with the

proposed preservation of existing trees that will buffer this proposed addition from Clarence Street.

“4. New buildings should be a minimum of 2 floors (8.5 m) high and a maximum of 3 floors (11 m)”.

- The proposed addition is 2 floors and 8.3 m in height. This proposed height is consistent with the allowable building height as per the above policy. It is noted that the proposed addition is greater in height than the existing building, however Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that this additional height is mitigated by the rear/side placement of the proposed addition.
- A streetscape rendering (Attachment 10) illustrating the impact of the proposed addition on the overall streetscape has been submitted by the applicant. Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied that this streetscape rendering demonstrates that the side/rear addition contextually fits with the adjacent scale and building massing and will not negatively impact the existing contributing building or the residential character of Clarence Street.

“5. Detached residential units must provide a side yard as per zoning with open east-west views”.

- The Building Standards Department had the following comment, *“A minimum interior side yard setback of 0.6 metres is required to the shed of 2.4 m high, 5.98m², whereas a setback of 0.14 metres is shown on Drawing A3”*. However, the applicant will be relocating the shed indicated on the site plan to another location in consultation with the Building Standards Department. Therefore, no minor variances will be required to the side yard setback. Further, the shed itself has no bearing on the design or function of the proposed garage addition.

Section 6.4.2 – Street Wall Height and Scale

“The height of a building is measured from the average elevation of the finished grade at the front of the building to the highest point of the roof surface for a flat roof and a mansard roof; and to the mean height between the eaves and the highest point of a gable, hip, or a gambrel roof”.

- The proposed roof height has been correctly measured as per the above definition, resulting in a proposed height of 8.3 m.

Section 5.3.2.5 – Circulation, Vehicular Access and Parking

“On-site parking, garages, and parking structures are generally concealed behind or below inhabited buildings.”

- The proposed garage forms part of the ground level of the 2-storey addition proposed to be located to the rear side of the existing contributing building that fronts onto Clarence Street. The garage will be visible from Clarence Street, with the additional building height being mitigated by the placement of the addition, and the preservation of existing trees that will buffer this proposed addition from Clarence Street. Further, the existing garage is also currently visible from Clarence Street.

Materials

Section 6.3.3 Architectural Guidelines – Material Pallet

“There is a very broad range of materials in today’s design palette, but materials proposed for new buildings in the district should include those drawn from ones historically in use in Woodbridge. This includes brick, stone, traditional stucco; wood siding and trim, glass windows and storefronts, and various metals”.

- The proposed architectural style and materials as shown on Attachments 7 and 8 are consistent with those of the original building. The placement of the proposed stone foundation line and brick materials are consistent with the material placement of the existing house.

Section 6.2.8 – Appropriate Materials

Doors: Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed; transom windows and paired sidelights with real glazing bars; wood french doors for porch entrances; single-bay, wood panelled garage doors.

- The proposed garage door will be wood paneled.

All exterior materials are shown in Attachments 7 and 8.

Landscaping

Section 6.6.3 – Tree Canopy and Vegetation – Guidelines

“3. Trees on public and private property, having a tree diameter of twenty (20) centimeters or more or having a base diameter of twenty (20) centimetres or more, must be conserved, and the requirements of the City of Vaughan Tree Bylaw 052-2018 must be adhered to.”

- The submitted Arborist Report as shown on Attachment 9 confirms that the existing trees on the property will not be removed and will be protected in accordance with City of Vaughan requirements.

Timeline

This Application is subject to the 90-day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This Application was declared complete on February 27, 2019, and must be deliberated upon by May 28, 2019, to meet the 90-day timeline.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the Application to permit a two-storey addition to the existing dwelling on the property municipally known as 169 Clarence Street and is satisfied that the proposal is consistent with the WHCD Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed alterations under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the recommendations in this report.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Subject Property
3. Site Photos
4. Existing Level Plans
 - a. Ground Floor
 - b. Main Floor
 - c. Second Floor
5. Proposed Site Plan
6. Proposed Level Plans
 - a. Ground Floor
 - b. Main Floor
 - c. Second Floor
 - d. Roof Plan
7. Elevation Drawings
 - a. Existing and Proposed Western Elevation
 - b. Existing and Proposed Southern Elevation
 - c. Existing and Proposed Eastern Elevation
 - d. Existing and Proposed Northern Elevation

- e.
- 8. Materials
- 9. Arborist Report
- 10. Proposed Addition Streetscape

Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Shahzad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8653

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254