

# Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

---

**DATE:** Wednesday, January 31, 2024

**WARD:** 1

**TITLE:** DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION – SINGLE  
DETACHED DWELLING WITH ATTACHED GARAGE LOCATED  
AT 60 NAPIER STREET, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE  
CONSERVATION DISTRICT

**FROM:**

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

**ACTION:** DECISION

---

**Purpose**

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee's support and recommend to Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed demolition of the existing 'contributing' structure, and the new construction of a detached 2½ storey house with attached 2-car garage at 60 Napier Street, located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachment 1).

**Report Highlights**

- The Owner seeks approval for the demolition of the existing dwelling and proposed construction of a 2½-storey brick clad dwelling with attached 2-car garage located at 60 Napier Street.
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ("KNHCD Plan").
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with all but one of the policies of the KNHCD Plan.

## **Recommendations**

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed development as presented, subject to the following conditions:

- a) that further refinements to building design and material specifications revisions to be aligned with the KNHCD Plan guidelines shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to submission of final Heritage Permit drawings;
- b) that any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application;
- d) that the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and the Chief Building Official;
- e) That prior to the issuance of the heritage permit, the applicant either provide a letter of consent for the removal of Tree#1 from the neighbour at 54 Napier Street or revise the site plan to show tree protection zone for the tree.
- f) that the applicant enters into a Private Tree Removal to the satisfaction of the City.

## **Background**

The subject property at 60 Napier Street has a modest 1½-storey residence with an adjacent 20<sup>th</sup> century detached garage. A previous submission and presentation led to the approval of limited renovations of the existing building including a raising of the clear height of the upper floor and replacing the existing dormers with a more defined double gable façade. That permit did not permit the “above-grade demolition of the heritage resource” as described in the attached CHIA report (see Attachment 2, pg.29) but rather restoration work solely and alterations that retained the existing structure. By contrast, this revised proposal seeks full demolition of the existing structure, and complete replacement with a 2½-storey brick-clad dwelling incorporating a 2-car garage, plus the construction of a rear yard cabana with services connection, and a pool. The scale of the planned residence, combined with the proposed exterior finishes, highlight the heritage connection to this historic village character.

## **Previous Reports/Authority**

[Heritage Vaughan report, 14 September 2022.](#)

## **Analysis and Options**

***All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD.***

The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the KNHCD guidelines.

### **9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW states:**

*“New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style.”*

Cultural Heritage staff support the design of the replacement building as its proposed scale and massing proportions and architectural style are suitable to the area and will enhance the cultural heritage landscape of Kleinburg Village in accordance with KNHCD and Vaughan Official Plan 2010 policies.

### **2.5.1.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE**

*“New construction in the residential villages shall be sympathetic and complementary to the historic built form of neighbouring properties. New buildings shall be designed with local heritage styles in mind. Designs shall not look to re-create but rather incorporate and highlight appropriate features. In particular, windows, doors and trim shall be similarly attenuated and architectural detailing should be visible in spirit but not a direct duplication. Materials shall be of a similar palette those found within the HCD.”*

The proposed Victorian Gothic Revival style design features a brick façade that plays with symmetrical and classical proportions. The covered front entry portico with solid panelled main door and sidelights, and double pilasters enhances the entry to strengthen the chosen architectural style, whilst the pronounced gable at the side elevations, and rear 2<sup>nd</sup> storey walk-out terrace add a touch of grounded detail to this otherwise playful architecture. The proportional double-hung windows contrast the unequal front gables, and the edge quoins similarly contrast the proposed garage door chevrons. The proposed rear cabana, not visible from the street, provides a subdued form that complements and showcases the main dwelling. The Owner has provided a satisfactory architectural drawing set that delineates a house which will contribute positively to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan.

### **2.5.1.3 SCALE AND MASSING**

*“New residential construction in the residential villages shall respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots.”*

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, which is made up of one-storey, two-storey, and three-storey dwellings. The proposed dwelling and attached 2-car garage will be situated in the same area as the existing dwelling. The proposed new height is within the maximum allowable height of the KNHCD and is well-placed between its immediate neighbours. Overall, the proposed building brings a satisfactory massing, proportion, and style that will contribute to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan, as shown on Attachment 4.

#### **4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: WALL MATERIALS**

*“The use of traditional materials and products for any new structure shall be visually compatible with the adjacent historical buildings. Traditional cladding materials in KNHCD include red clay brick, stucco and wood siding. The use of the following materials is not supported: stone and artificial stone (currently being used), vinyl, concrete block and concrete brick, precast or poured concrete, modern stucco, terra cotta, and glazed tile.*

The proposed plans include a satisfactory Materials Palette as shown on Attachment 8. The proposal comprises a suitable integration of light colour brick, dark colour roofing, dark earth tones framing at openings, and accents in cladding and architectural elements (front door; window detailing; garage doors). The owner has been made aware and has also noted that precast elements, PVC and vinyl are to be replaced with materials that are acceptable within the KNHCD – for the final Heritage Permit submission set.

#### **4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: GARAGES AND OUTBUILDINGS**

*“A garage shall be located in such a way that the house not the garage is the focal point of the new construction. Windows and doors shall be compatible with the District character. The use of traditional materials and products such as wood windows and sidings, is always preferred. Non-traditional materials and products (aluminium, cement board) in historical configurations and profiles that provide the appearance of traditional materials may be used. New garage doors shall reflect simple historic doors in a form that is consistent with the historic vernacular architecture of KNHCD.”*

The plan includes a 2-car garage located at the front of the building and slightly recessed from the main façade facing the street. The rear cabana building is located towards the end of the site, is not visible from the street, and is of a massing form and scale much inferior to that of the main building – as if to meld within the rear yard like an ancillary building – this is common in historical designs found throughout the region. The Owner has provided a satisfactory design that will contribute to the overall character of the district.

#### **4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: LANDSCAPE**

*“Landscape features around a building and the overall streetscape like trees, fencing, walkways, driveways, sheds can contribute to the special character of the District and shall be incorporated within the new design. Maintain greenspace by having generous setbacks between buildings and presence of mature trees, in addition to decorative shrubbery, in the front, side, and rear yards. The ratio of greenspace to building mass and the side yard setbacks shall be generally consistent with the character of adjacent properties. New parking areas shall be introduced in a manner that has minimal impact on lawns, gardens, mature vegetation, and the views of the building. Visual impact assessments and other guidelines such as Built Features and Vegetation shall be integrated at an early stage in project planning so that any potential impacts on the heritage value of the cultural landscape can be mitigated or even avoided.”*

The Arborist Report (see Attachment 7) identifies 3 trees to be injured in order to accommodate the proposed construction, the applicant has provided a letter of consent from the neighbour regarding the injured trees. Cultural Heritage is satisfied that the Arborist Report recommendations are conforming to the KNHCD Plan guidelines.

#### **Financial Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

#### **Operational Impact**

There are no operational impacts associated with this report.

#### **Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations**

N/A

#### **Conclusion**

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed demolition of the existing ‘contributing’ structure, and the new construction of a detached 2-1/2 storey house with attached 2-car garage, rear cabana and pool conforms to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposed new construction located at 60 Napier Street – following a revision of construction materials to exclude precast elements, PVC and vinyl as per the KNHCD Plan guidelines – under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

**For more information**, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

**Attachments**

- Attachment 1 – 60Napier\_Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 60Napier\_CHIA
- Attachment 3 – 60Napier\_Site Plan
- Attachment 4 – 60Napier\_House drawings
- Attachment 5 – 60Napier\_Cabana drawings
- Attachment 6 – 60Napier\_3D renderings
- Attachment 7 – 60Napier\_Tree Inventory Protection Plan
- Attachment 8 – 60Napier\_Sample Board

**Prepared by**

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653

Nancy Tuckett, Director of Development Planning, ext. 8529