

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, November 22, 2023

WARD: 1

**TITLE: DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION – SINGLE
DETACHED DWELLING WITH ATTACHED GARAGE LOCATED
AT 8 LESTER B. PEARSON, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE
HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee’s support and recommend to Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed demolition of the existing ‘non-contributing’ structure, and the new construction of a detached 2½ storey house with detached 2-car garage at 8 Lester B. Pearson, located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachment 1).

Report Highlights

- The Owner seeks approval for the demolition of the existing dwelling and proposed construction of a detached 2-1/2 storey dwelling with detached 2-car garage located at 8 Lester B. Pearson.
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan (“KNHCD Plan”).
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the KNHCD Plan except for Section 3.4 regarding maximum height.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with all but one of the policies of the KNHCD Plan

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed development as presented, subject to the following conditions:

- a) that further refinements to building design including a reduction in height by at least 1.5m, and material specifications revisions to be aligned with the KNHCD Plan guidelines shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to submission of final Heritage Permit drawings;
- b) that any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application;
- d) that the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and the Chief Building Official;
- e) that the applicant enter into a letter of undertaking for the purpose of completion of all landscaping in accordance with the approved plans to the satisfaction of the City; and
- f) that the applicant enters into a Tree Protection Agreement to the satisfaction of the City.

Background

The subject property is located on the west side of Lester B. Pearson, on the corner of Nashville Road. The existing building is considered to be 'non-contributing' due to the extent of alterations and modifications made over the years – the last of which took place in 2012. The existing dwelling is frontally located on the lot with an open lawn and ravine setting to the rear (west). Vehicular access is via an existing curved driveway at the front of the house.

The existing dwelling dates from the c.1950. It has no contextual or architectural value within the context of the KNHCD as outlined in the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment included as Attachment 2.

Previous Reports/Authority

N/A

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD.

The following is an analysis of the proposed development according to the KNHCD guidelines.

9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW states:

“New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style.”

Cultural Heritage staff support the design of the replacement building as its proposed scale and massing proportions and architectural style are suitable to the area and will enhance the cultural heritage landscape of Kleinburg Village in accordance with KNHCD and Vaughan Official Plan 2010 policies.

2.5.1.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE

“New construction in the residential villages shall be sympathetic and complementary to the historic built form of neighbouring properties. New buildings shall be designed with local heritage styles in mind. Designs shall not look to re-create but rather incorporate and highlight appropriate features. In particular, windows, doors and trim shall be similarly attenuated and architectural detailing should be visible in spirit but not a direct duplication. Materials shall be of a similar palette those found within the HCD.”

The proposed strong Georgian style design includes an ashlar-clad stone foundation beneath a red brick façade that plays with symmetrical and classical proportions. The covered front entry portico with solid panelled main door and sidelights enhances the entry to enforce the proposed architectural style, whilst the pronounced gable at the side elevations, and rear covered porch add a touch of grounded detail to an otherwise austere architectural style. The proportional double-hung windows and repeating dormers are in keeping with repetitive cadence of the Georgian style. The Owner has provided a satisfactory architectural drawing set that delineates a house which will contribute positively to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan.

2.5.1.3 SCALE AND MASSING

“New residential construction in the residential villages shall respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots.”

The proposed dwelling is consistent with the surrounding area, which is made up of one-storey, two-storey, and three-storey dwellings. The proposed dwelling and detached 2-car garage will be situated in the same area as the existing dwelling. Although the proposed new height exceeds the maximum allowable height of the

KNHCD by 2.7m, the location of this dwelling in a steep ravine setting and downhill from the adjacent 3-storey structure of its neighbour to the north makes for a satisfactory massing, proportion, and style that will contribute to the overall character of the KNHCD Plan, as shown on Attachment 4.

STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE PROPOSED DESIGN BE REDUCED IN HEIGHT BY AT LEAST 1.5m TO BRING THE BUILDING INTO CLOSER COMPLIANCE WITH THE KNHCD PLAN AND APPLICABLE ZONING.

4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: WALL MATERIALS

“The use of traditional materials and products for any new structure shall be visually compatible with the adjacent historical buildings. Traditional cladding materials in KNHCD include red clay brick, stucco and wood siding. The use of the following materials is not supported: stone and artificial stone (currently being used), vinyl, concrete block and concrete brick, precast or poured concrete, modern stucco, terra cotta, and glazed tile.

The proposed plans include a satisfactory Materials Palette as shown on Attachment 7. The proposal comprises a suitable integration of red brick, dark colour roofing, dark earth tones stone base, and painted scheme with accents at the architectural elements, doors, front door and window detailing. The owner has been made aware and has also noted that all mentions of PVC and vinyl are to be replaced with materials that are acceptable within the KNHCD – for the Heritage Permit submission set.

4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: GARAGES AND OUTBUILDINGS

“A garage shall be located in such a way that the house not the garage is the focal point of the new construction. Windows and doors shall be compatible with the District character. The use of traditional materials and products such as wood windows and sidings, is always preferred. Non-traditional materials and products (aluminium, cement board) in historical configurations and profiles that provide the appearance of traditional materials may be used. New garage doors shall reflect simple historic doors in a form that is consistent with the historic vernacular architecture of KNHCD.”

The plan includes a detached 2-car garage located at the rear (west) of the property and not directly visible from the street. The rear of the building jets out from the plan of the main house as if to appear like an addition to the building – this is common in historical designs found throughout the region. The Owner has provided a satisfactory design that will contribute to the overall character of the district.

4.4.2 RESIDENTIAL AREA: LANDSCAPE

“Landscape features around a building and the overall streetscape like trees, fencing, walkways, driveways, sheds can contribute to the special character of the District and shall be incorporated within the new design. Maintain greenspace by having generous setbacks between buildings and presence of

mature trees, in addition to decorative shrubbery, in the front, side, and rear yards. The ratio of greenspace to building mass and the side yard setbacks shall be generally consistent with the character of adjacent properties. New parking areas shall be introduced in a manner that has minimal impact on lawns, gardens, mature vegetation, and the views of the building. Visual impact assessments and other guidelines such as Built Features and Vegetation shall be integrated at an early stage in project planning so that any potential impacts on the heritage value of the cultural landscape can be mitigated or even avoided.”

An inventory and general health assessment were performed for all trees located on and within six (6) metres of the property line. The application includes a satisfactory Tree Inventory which details the preservation of 14 trees and removal of 12 trees on the property (of which, most are in poor health and are a hazard to the property). A tree Preservation Plan is still required as per the City of Vaughan’s Council endorsed By-law 052-2018 and Tree Protection Protocol. The Arborist Report is included as Attachment 6.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Operational Impact

There are no operational impacts associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

N/A

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed demolition of the existing ‘non-contributing’ structure, and the new construction of a detached 2-1/2 storey house with detached 2-car garage conforms to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposed new construction located at 8 Lester B. Pearson – following a reduction by a minimum 1.5m in proposed building height and revision of construction materials to exclude PVC and vinyl as per the KNHCD Plan guidelines – under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 8 LesterB_Location Map

Attachment 2 – 8 LesterB_Scoped Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment

Attachment 3 – 8 LesterB_Existing conditions

Attachment 4 – 8 LesterB_Proposed architecture
Attachment 5 – 8 LesterB_3D renderings
Attachment 6 – 8 LesterB_Arborist report
Attachment 7 – 8 LesterB_Materials and finishes

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653