

# Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

---

**DATE:** Wednesday, October 25, 2023

**WARD:** 1

**TITLE: PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF EXISTING BUILDING AND  
CONSTRUCTION OF A 3-STOREY MIXED USE BUILDING AT  
10037 KEELE STREET IN THE MAPLE HERITAGE  
CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

**FROM:**

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

**ACTION:** DECISION

---

**Purpose**

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee's support and recommend to the Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed demolition of the existing commercial structure at 10037 Keele Street and the proposed new construction of a 3-storey mixed use building featuring commercial units on the main floor and residential units on the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> floors. The proposed development is located in the Maple Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachment 1).

**Report Highlights**

- The proposed new development replaces the existing non-contributing commercial structure.
- The proposed 3-storey mixed use development will present commercial and residential uses along Keele Street.
- The project proposes to remove 8 trees.

**Recommendations**

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed development as presented, subject to following conditions:

- a) minor refinements to building design including final material specifications shall be submitted for approval to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to Heritage Permit issuance;
- b) any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application; and
- d) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and Chief Building Official.

## **Background**

The existing structure at 10037 Keele Street was built circa 1985 and is recognized as a non-contributing structure within the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan and Inventory.

Although not noted in the Heritage Inventory, staff hereby identifies a mature tree along Keele Street that contributes to the overall streetscape, especially as the existing structure is set back considerably from the curb. There are also existing trees on the adjacent properties east and north of the site, for a total of 20 trees.

A Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) for the existing structure on the property was submitted in support of the application as shown in Attachment 2. It documents the existing structure, providing photos of the elevations. Cultural Heritage staff has reviewed the CHIA and confirms that it meets the CHIA Terms of Reference

The applicant has proposed to construct a development that takes its architectural inspiration from the Vernacular Town Shop form, which combines commercial and residential uses.

## **Previous Reports/Authority**

Not applicable.

## **Analysis and Options**

***All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.***

The following is an analysis of the proposed development at 10037 Keele Street according to the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan ('MHCD') guidelines. The proposed drawings are shown on Attachment 3.

#### **2.4.5 Objectives for New Development**

*To ensure compatible infill construction that will enhance the District's heritage character and complement the area's village-like, human scale of development, while promoting densities sufficient to secure the District's future economic viability. To guide the design of new development to be sympathetic and compatible with the heritage resources and character of the District while providing for contemporary needs.*

The proposed development is designed to reflect the Vernacular Town Shop style, as shown in Section 9.1 of the 2007 Maple HCD Plan. The building in its entirety will provide 3 commercial units on the main floor plus 4 residential units on the second and third floors.

As the proposed new structure is located in the Commercial Core of the Maple HCD, 3-storeys is identified as an appropriate height and the proposed structure will be similar to previously approved mixed used buildings along the north side of Major Mackenzie Drive and the west side of Keele.

#### **4.4 New Residential Buildings**

*New residential buildings will have respect for and be compatible with the heritage character of the District. Designs for new residential buildings will be based on the patterns and proportions of the 19th century and early 20th century building stock that are currently existing or once existed in the village. Architectural elements, features, and decorations should be in sympathy with those found on heritage buildings.*

##### **4.4.1 Design Approach**

- a) *The design of new buildings will be products of their own time but should reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District.*
- b) *New residential buildings will complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by being generally the same height, width, and orientation of adjacent buildings; being of similar setback; being of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes.*
- c) *New residential building construction will respect natural landforms, drainage, and existing mature vegetation.*
- d) *Larger new residential buildings will have varied massing, to reflect the varied scale of built environment of the historical village.*
- e) *Historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings has been 1 - 1/2 or 2 storeys. The façade height of new residential buildings should be consistent with the façade height of existing buildings. Differences in façade heights between buildings on adjacent properties within the district*

*should be no more than 1 storey. In all instances the height of new buildings shall conform to the provisions of the City's Zoning By-law. New residential building construction in the District will conform with the Guidelines found in Section 9.5.2.*

The proposed development is within the Commercial Core of the Maple HCD and therefore the residential use is confined to the second and third floor. By using the Vernacular Town Shop form, staff finds the proposed structure is appropriate for its location and use.

#### **4.2.1 Conservation of Heritage Buildings**

- a) Repair rather than replace heritage attributes using recognized conservation methods. Respect historical materials and finishes by repairing with like materials.*
- b) Replace using like material any extensively deteriorated or missing parts of heritage attributes.*
- c) Correct inappropriate interventions to heritage attributes.*
- d) Undertake any work required to preserve heritage attributes physically and visually compatible with the heritage resource.*
- e) Respect documentary evidence. Conservation work should be based on a thorough examination of physical and archival evidence. Where there is insufficient evidence, it may be appropriate to make the design, form, material, and detailing of the new feature or element compatible with the character of the heritage resource as commonly found in the District.*

### **9.3 Existing Heritage Buildings**

#### **9.3.6 Renovations**

*When a renovation on a heritage building is undertaken, later work that conceals the original design or is unsympathetic to it should be removed.*

**Guidelines:**

- Incorporate restoration of original work in exterior renovation projects.*
- Use authentic original materials and methods. For example, when replacing aluminums siding, use wood siding or board and batten.*
- Replace missing or broken elements, such as gingerbread, spindles, or door and window trims.*
- Remove items, such as metal fascia and soffits that conceal original architectural detail.*

The subject property does not contain a contributing structure, nor are there any other contributing structures on the directly adjacent heritage properties. As the massing is within the Commercial Core District limits, it will not overshadow or dominate over nearby heritage properties.

### **9.5.3. Commercial Core Policies**

The proposed development is in keeping with Commercial Core Policies outlined in the 2007 MHCD Plan in Section 9.5.3.1-9. The proposed structure uses an appropriate building form of the Vernacular Township for its combination of commercial and residential uses. Its proposed height of 3 storeys (11.662 m) is within height allowance of the Commercial Core, and it meets the ratio required for first storey commercial units and the current contemporary ceiling heights within the residential units as outlined in Sections 9.5.3.6 & 9.5.3.8 in the 2007 MHCD Plan.

At street level, the massing of the building is staggered to break up the frontage along Keele Street, as is recommended in the MHCD Plan 9.5.3.5. and is shown on Attachment 4. The proposed site plan addresses the surrounding urban fabric, demonstrated by how the proposed structure will be situated on the site, facing onto both Keele Street and onto a fragment of Richmond Street.

### **4.5.2 Trees and Shrubs**

- a) *Mature trees will be preserved except where removal is necessary due to disease or damage, or to ensure public health and safety, as certified by a professional arborist. Lost trees should be replaced.*
- b) *New trees and shrubs should be hardy, urban tolerant in recognition of harsher environmental conditions, but that express form, canopy, leaf and colour characteristics of native, indigenous trees, where possible. Large, urban-tolerant and long-living character trees are to form the framework of street tree plantings in the area and become a defining characteristic of the area. Where sufficient space does not exist for large trees, smaller ornamentals are preferred to induce a pedestrian scale while providing seasonal interest and colour.*
- c) *Planting should not obscure heritage buildings, but can frame important features. Planting should screen less attractive sites and prospects in the District.*

### **9.7.1 Planting**

*No heritage permits are required for planting activities, but voluntary compliance with the guidelines in this Section can help maintain and enhance the natural heritage of the Maple and its valley.*

*Suitable new planting and management of existing flora are a primary means of ensuring the health of the entire ecosystem:*

- *plants contribute to stormwater and groundwater management*
- *erosion control*
- *provide habitat and nutrition for wild fauna*

*Street tree planting on arterial roads should conform with Region of York guidelines. Please refer to 'Tree Planting Design Criteria' within the Region's Road Design Guidelines handbook. In general, street trees should be hardy,*

*salt-tolerant 60 mm caliper balled and burlapped specimens, spaced at 8-12 metres on centre, planted 3 metres from any curb or utility pole and offset 1 metre from any sidewalk and 3 metres from any driveway*

The subject property currently contains 20 identified trees, according to the Arborist report, as shown on Attachment 5. Of these 20 trees, 8 trees are to be retained, 8 to be removed to allow for the construction and the 4 remaining trees are in danger to be injured and removal may be later recommended. At this time, there will be compensation of 7 trees.

Final landscape arrangements have not yet been finalized and will be settled as part of the Site Plan execution.

### **9.8.1 Heritage Buildings Appropriate Materials**

*All construction visible from the exterior requires a Heritage Permit. Visible materials should conform to the following standards:*

- *Exterior Finish: Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent, or in some instances brick to match existing conditions. Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather. Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.*
- *Exterior Detail: Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.*
- *Roofs: Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style. Skylights in the form of cupolas or monitors are acceptable, if appropriate to the style.*
- *Doors: Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed. Transom windows and paired sidelights. Wood french doors for porch entrances. Single-bay, wood panelled garage doors.*
- *Windows: Wood frames; single or double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*
- *Flashings: Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.*

### **9.8.2 Non-Heritage Buildings Appropriate Materials**

*Exterior Finish: Use materials compatible with the original design.*

*Roofs: Slopes and layouts compatible with the original design.*

*Doors: Use materials and designs compatible with the original design.*

*Windows: Use windows compatible with the original design.*

Referring back to Attachment 3, the proposed materials of brick and ceramic finishes is appropriate to the MHCD Plan. Originally, the application suggested a buff yellow brick, which is a colour that did exist historically in the village area. However, it was suggested that a more-red shade of brick would be more in keeping with the guidelines of the HCD Plan. To accommodate, the applicant has submitted a sample of possible brick colours (see Attachment 6) from which Cultural Heritage staff recommends using either Sample G or Sample H as they are colours that do not appear prematurely weathered.

### ***Compliance with Maple Core HCD 2023***

The proposed development was initially submitted in 2021 as part of a Zoning By-law Amendment and Site Plan application (Z.21.029 & DA.21.034) and was reviewed under the 2007 Maple HCD Plan. In February 2023, the Maple Core HCD (020-2023) was passed by Vaughan Council. Cultural Heritage staff notes that in addition to being in compliance with the 2007 MHCD Plan, the proposed development is in compliance with Section 4.5 of the Maple Core HCD outlining the policies for new development in the District.

### **Financial Impact**

There are no Financial Impacts associated with this proposal.

### **Operational Impact**

There are no Operational Impacts associated with this proposal.

### **Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations**

There are no Regional impacts or considerations for this application.

### **Conclusion**

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed demolition of the non-contributing structure and the proposed construction of a 3-storey commercial-residential building at 10037 Keele Street conform to the policies and guidelines of the MHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposed development located at 10037 Keele Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

**For more information**, please contact: Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

### **Attachments**

- Attachment 1 – 10037Keele\_Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 10037Keele\_CHIA
- Attachment 3 - 10037Keele\_Architectural Drawings
- Attachment 4 – 10037Keele\_Proposed\_Site Plan

Attachment 5 – 10037Keele\_Arborist Report  
Attachment 6 – 10037Keele\_Brick Colours  
Attachment 7 – 10037Keele\_3D renderings and materials board

**Prepared by**

Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Shahzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653.