

ATTACHMENT 2

10180 PINE VALLEY

STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE

BRIEF DESCRIPTION

ADDRESS: 10180 Pine Valley Drive

LEGAL: Concession 7, Lot 22 R64R3469 Part 2, Part 3

ROLL: 19280003118820000

OVERVIEW

The cultural heritage value of the property known as 10180 Pine Valley Drive meets the criteria set out by the *Ontario Heritage Act* under Province of Ontario Regulation 9/06 for the categories of historical/associative, design/physical and contextual value.

Located on a large residential lot at 10180 Pine Valley Drive, the 'Caretaker's House' for St. Paul's Presbyterian Church is adjacent to the church and graveyard at 10150 Pine Valley Drive, and on a plateau above a tributary of the Humber River. The property includes 1 ½ storey a brick residence with 2 storey rear wing that is setback substantially from the road and is bounded on all sides by tall, mature vegetation.

Name: The Caretaker's House

Date Built: Circa 1914-1924

Address: 10180 Pine Valley Drive

Location: East side of Pine Valley Drive, located north of Major Mackenzie Drive West, and adjacent to St. Paul's Presbyterian Church and Cemetery

Condition: Very good.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

The Caretaker's House is a single-detached, storey-and-a-half and three-bay dwelling with rectangular plan oriented north-south, and a long rear wing running east-west. The red brick walls of the east main block stand on a poured concrete foundation and are laid entirely in stretcher bond on all sides, a bonding technique that is continued in the rear wing.

Over the main block is a side gable roof with projecting eaves and verges, and plain soffit and fascia. The rear wing also has medium gable roof but is punctuated by four lucarnes (two each side) capped by gable roofs and filled with large semi-circular headed windows. On the north end wall of the main block is an external single-stack chimney constructed of glazed white brick, while on the west end wall of the wing is a more robust single stack chimney constructed of red brick.

Fenestration is symmetrical with a door flanked by two windows on the principal east facade of the main block, a ground-level bay window and two second level windows on the south end wall, and the aforementioned lucarnes either side of a central entrance on the south facade of the wing. There is also a ground floor window on this wing facade placed directly beneath the east lucarne. On the wing the windows are casement types with large fixed sash lights that fill the semi-circular heads, while in the main block the openings have segmental arch heads with single-order voussoirs of soldier brick, and single-sash casement windows. All windows have rowlock brick sills.

A hip-roof open verandah covers the entrance and windows on the principal facade, while a closed brick porch with medium front gable roof covers the entrance to the rear wing on the south facade of the wing. A sliding glass door provides access to the interior through the wing's west end wall.

HISTORICAL/ASSOCIATIVE VALUE:

The historical and associative value of 10180 Pine Valley Drive is related to its origins to St. Paul's

Presbyterian Church & Cemetery and the larger Presbyterian community in Vaughan's history.

By-law 133-88, which designates St. Paul's Presbyterian Church, describes the original 7th Line/Upper Corners Presbyterian congregation that was formed as early as 1837 in the area. The original St. Paul's church was built in 1844, then later replaced by the current brick structure in 1888. Along the growth and development of the church, it also was the location of a significant cemetery, with the earliest burial marker from 1840. After the construction of the original wood frame church, in 1849 the church laid out a map of 90 potential cemetery lots.

For several years, the church left the care and upkeep of the cemetery to the families and interested volunteers. However, in the 20th century, there was a series of improvements and redecorations to the Church, and it appears that in this spirit, the caretaker's cottage was built between 1914-1924 in the glebe of St. Paul's under the ministry of Rev. Stanley Robinson, according to the 1944 100th anniversary brochure. The ongoing importance of the cemetery continued when it became a chartered cemetery in 1925.

There is no record of changes to the caretaker's cottage during this time, it remained a 1 ½ storey house with a small kitchen addition in the rear. At this time, there is no existing list of who resided in the caretaker's cottage and how long their tenure was.

In 1969, there was the first consideration of the having the Township take over the management of the cemetery and the church also sold off part of its land for residential use. The handover of the cemetery was finalized in 1971 and the cemetery was no longer under the jurisdiction of the local church.

In 1973, St. Paul's began the process of severing and selling off parcels of the land, and the caretaker's cottage was placed up for sale. It was purchased in 1974 by a local couple, who would live on the property for 8 years before the second private owner purchased the property in 1982. Soon after purchasing the property in 1982, the new owner started making plans for a 2-storey addition to the property which were issued in September 1983.

Cultural heritage staff notes that the 1983 addition takes special care to be sympathetic to the earlier building. The east, north and south elevations remain intact and preserves the view of the house directly facing onto the road. The addition is not taller than the height of the original cottage, uses the same brick bond style and replicates the pitch of the cottage's original dormers. The addition clearly also takes inspiration from St. Paul's church with the addition of Romanesque arched windows that echo the church's own Romanesque windows.

The resulting form of the present cottage honors its longstanding association with St. Paul's with careful architectural choices.

CONTEXTUAL ELEMENTS

The subject building and siting are important in defining, maintaining and supporting the late 19th and early 20th architectural style of Vaughan Township, in a time when the Township was a vibrant rural community. It is also important in visually defining and maintaining the shared streetscape along with St. Paul's Presbyterian Church and the associated cemetery.

SUMMARY OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE

Built between circa, the main block of the house is a small, storey-and-a-half and three-bay residence with medium side gable roof built for the caretaker of St. Paul's Presbyterian Church and graveyard, located immediately to the south. Though overall plain and substantially altered in exterior appearance through the addition of a long rear wing with multiple large windows and lucarnes, the design or physical

value of the house lies with its early 20th century vernacular form. Its historical value is reflected by its connection to the locally significant institution of the Presbyterian Church. Its contextual value comes from its historical, functional, and visual links to St. Paul's and its graveyard, and since it supports the rural institutional character of the area, which has seen continued use by the parish since 1844.

- The heritage attributes that support the design or physical value of the property include the Caretaker's House with:
- Storey and a half massing and side gable roof;
- Three-bay eastern facade with symmetrically placed fenestration of a central door, segmental arch headed windows and end wall bay window; and,
- Red brick construction matching the masonry used for the second St. Paul's Presbyterian Church.
- Heritage attributes of the property that reflect its contextual value include the:
 - Siting of the house on a large rural lot adjacent to St. Paul's Church and graveyard, and on the high ground above a tributary of the Humber River;
 - Substantial setback of the house from the road; and,
 - Property boundaries marked by tall mature trees.

Bibliography and Resources

1. City of Vaughan Archives
2. **A History of Churches in Vaughan Township**
Edited by Patricia Sommerville and Catherine Macfarlane
Vaughan Township Historical Society
1984
3. **CULTURAL HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT**
St. Paul's Presbyterian Church, Graveyard & Caretaker's House
10150 & 10180 Pine Valley Drive
Former Vaughan Township, City of Vaughan, Regional Municipality of York, Ontario
by Golder Associates, 2018
4. **Ontario Land Titles – Historical Books** <https://www.onland.ca/ui/lro/books/search>
Land Registry Records and Instruments for Concession 7, Lot 22
5. **The Presbyterian Church in Canada Archives** <https://presbyterianarchives.ca/>
“St. Paul’s Presbyterian Church, Vaughan 1844-1944” – Special thanks to Kim Arnold, Archivist