

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, September 20, 2023

WARD: 1

**TITLE: PROPOSED DESIGNATION UNDER PART IV OF THE
ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT OF 10180 PINE VALLEY DRIVE
WARD 1 – NORTH OF MAJOR MACKENZIE ON THE WEST
SIDE PINE VALLEY DRIVE**

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee's support and recommend to the Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed designation of the City-owned property municipally known as 10180 Pine Valley Drive located north of Major Mackenzie Drive on the west side of Pine Valley Drive (as shown on Attachment 1).

Report Highlights

- The report proposes the designation of 10180 Pine Valley Drive, a 2-storey brick building.
- The property holds physical, associative, and contextual cultural heritage value as described in the attached Statement of Cultural Heritage Value.
- The designation of this property meets the policies of the Vaughan Official Plan and the objectives and required criteria outlined in the *Ontario Heritage Act* by the Province of Ontario Regulation 9/06

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed development as presented, subject to following conditions:

- a) That the Designation Report for 10180 Pine Valley Drive be Received.

- b) That Council approve the recommendation of the Heritage Vaughan Committee to designate 10180 Pine Valley Drive in accordance with Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* R.S.O. 1990, c. O.18.
- c) That Staff be authorized to publish and serve the Notice of Intention to Designate in accordance with the requirements under; Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* R.S.O 1990, c.O.18 to the Ontario Heritage Trust, the Property Owner (City of Vaughan), and published in the local newspapers.
- d) If no objection is served on the City Clerk within 30 days of the date of publication of the Notice of Intention, Council shall pass a by-law designating 10180 Pine Valley Drive and a copy of the by-law shall be served on the Owner (City of Vaughan) and Ontario Heritage Trust and a notice shall be published in the local newspapers.

Background

Built as a Manse to augment services and assistance to the St. Paul's Presbyterian Church and Cemetery – in existence since 1840, but whose care had been left mainly to the families of the congregation – the Caretaker's Cottage was built in 1914. It remained in that function until after the transfer of the cemetery into the care of the Township (1971) at which time the church started severing and selling parcels of land including this property.

Under private ownership since 1974, the 1-1/2 storey building underwent renovations including a full 2nd storey alteration – but the work was respectful of the original architecture so the building's present form remains true to that of the original design.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

In June 2019, the *More Homes, More Choice Act*, 2019 (Bill 108) received Royal Assent. Schedule 11 of this Act included amendments to the *Ontario Heritage Act* ('OHA'). The Bill 108 Amendments to the OHA came into force on July 1, 2021, and include a shift in Part IV designations related to certain Planning Act applications. These changes affect Section 29(1.2) of the OHA which now restricts City Council's ability to give notice of its intention to designate a property under the Act to within 90 days after the City Clerk gives notice of a complete application.

The Bill 23, the *More Homes Built Faster Act*, 2022, Amendments to the OHA that came into force on January 1, 2023 mandates the municipalities to remove properties from the heritage register under section 27 if they do not pass a by-law designating the property on the second anniversary of the bill coming into force (January 1, 2025).

In light of this new legislation, it is imperative for City of Vaughan staff to identify cultural heritage properties that are currently Listed under Section 27 of the OHA or identified as a property of interest to be evaluated as a candidate for designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the OHA. The Province has amended O. Reg. 9/06 under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, which establishes nine provincial criteria for determining whether a property is of cultural heritage value or interest if it meets two or more of the nine criteria.

As set out in Vaughan's Official 2010 Plan, the City of Vaughan states that it is the policy of Council to:

6.1.1.1. To recognize and conserve cultural heritage resources, including heritage buildings and structures, Cultural heritage landscapes, and other cultural heritage resources, and to promote the maintenance and development of an appropriate setting within, around and adjacent to all such resources.

6.1.2.6. That the City shall use criteria established by Provincial regulation under the Ontario Heritage Act for determining cultural heritage value or interest and for identifying and evaluating properties for listing in the Heritage register and for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The City may further refine these criteria and provide guidelines for their use through the Vaughan Heritage Conservation Guidelines.

6.1.2.7. Any property worthy of designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act that fulfills one or more of the criteria identified in policy 6.1.2.6 will be considered to possess cultural heritage value.

6.2.1.1. To make full use of the provisions of Provincial legislation, such as the Ontario Heritage Act, Planning Act, Municipal Act and Environmental Assessment Act, to protect and conserve cultural heritage resources in Vaughan.

Regarding the insurance of designated heritage properties, the position of the Province of Ontario and the Insurance Bureau of Canada both clarify that heritage designation alone should not restrict access to insurance or cause an increase:

<https://www.ontario.ca/page/heritage-properties-and-insurance>
<http://www.ibc.ca/on/home/heritage-properties>

Following a thorough re-examination of archival documentation, staff finds that the subject property holds cultural heritage value and meets the criteria set out under the *Ontario Heritage Act* by the Province of Ontario Regulation 9/06 for the categories of design/physical, historical/associative and contextual value.

Designation Comments

ADDRESS: 10180 Pine Valley Drive

LEGAL: Concession 7, Lot 22 R64R3469 Part 2, Part 3

ROLL: 19280003118820000

EVALUATION UNDER O.REG 9/06 CRITERIA

Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* establishes nine criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the OHA if it meets two or more of these criteria. The following evaluation tables identify the application of each criterion as “N/A” (not applicable) or “X” (applicable) to the property, with explanatory text below.

The tables below give an overview of significant cultural heritage value of 6181 Major Mackenzie Drive. The Statement of Cultural Heritage Value (see attachment 2) provides a full description of the property’s cultural heritage attributes for evaluation purposes.

1. DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE

The property has design value or physical value because it	
▪ is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method	X
▪ displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	X
▪ demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

10180 Pine Valley Drive showcases a simplified Romanesque-inspired cottage, originally built in 1914 as a 1-1/2 storey building clad in brick and sitting on poured concrete foundation. It is a rectangular plan with two chimneys, presenting a hip roof open verandah on the principal façade, and a closed brick porch at the rear. The fenestration is similar to that of the church, with arched Romanesque-style windows; and the masonry cladding uses units matching those of the Church building. Lastly, the new rear addition (1984) respects the massing and style of the original building, and uses complementing brick to match the original as well as to pay homage to the Church.

2. HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
▪ has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community	X
▪ yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture	X
▪ demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community	N/A

The Manse (‘caretaker’s cottage’) at 10180 Pine Valley Drive, built in 1914, is a purpose-built structure that maintained direct associative value to the Church and Cemetery for which it was intended. This house is an example of the understated domestic Romanesque style, constructed as a sympathetic complement to the new Church that replaced the original.

This building and its inhabitants remained in the service of the Church and the Cemetery – and by extension, the congregation and community at large – between 1914 and 1974 at which time it was sold into private ownership. Despite a modest alteration, the building’s presence remains unaltered on the property and maintains its physical association with St. Paul’s Presbyterian Church.

3. CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
▪ important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	X
▪ physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	X
▪ a landmark	N/A

10180 Pine Valley Drive, as a building and site, are important in defining, maintaining and supporting the late 19th and early 20th architectural style of Vaughan Township, in response to a time when the Township grew out of a vibrant rural community. It is visually defining and maintaining the shared streetscape along with St. Paul’s Presbyterian Church and the associated cemetery, and retains the original landscape and site layout, with mature trees demarcating the property lines.

Financial Impact

There are no Financial Impacts associated with this report.

Operational Impact

Not applicable.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no Regional impacts or considerations for this application.

Conclusion

Staff finds that, as examined from archival documentation, the subject property holds cultural heritage value and meets the required criteria as set out under the *Ontario Heritage Act* by the Province of Ontario Regulation 9/06 for the categories of design/physical, historical/associative and contextual value.

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed designation of 10180 Pine Valley Drive conforms to the policies of the Vaughan Official Plan and the objectives and criteria of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposed designation of 10180 Pine Valley Drive under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Aminata Shaw, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813.

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 10180PineValley_Location Map

Attachment 2 – 10180PineValley_Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

- Attachment 3 – 10180PineValley_CHIA 2018
- Attachment 4 – 10180PineValley_St. Paul's reference file
- Attachment 5 – 10180PineValley_land titles
- Attachment 6 – 10180PineValley_Building photos

Prepared by

Aminata Shaw, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813.

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653