

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, July 19, 2023

WARD: 1

TITLE: PROPOSED NEW DESIGN FOR TWO SEMI-DETACHED HOUSES AT 9846-9850 KEELE STREET, IN THE MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee's approval for the proposed construction of 2 semi-detached dwellings (4 units) fronting onto Keele Street. The proposed development is located in the Maple Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachment 1).

Report Highlights

- The project proposes a new design of two semi-detached dwellings (4-units) at 9846-9850 Keele Street, replacing the previous design approved in 2018.
- Changes to the proposed design do not impact the previously approved site plan that was determined through the OLT appeals process.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed development as presented, subject to the following conditions:

- a) that further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
- b) that any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the

Director of Development Planning;

- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the Ontario Planning Act or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application;
- d) that the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and Chief Building Official; and
- e) that the applicant enter into a Tree Protection Agreement prior to demolition and construction activities on the site.

Background

9846-9850 Keele Street is located on the west side of Keele Street, opposite the intersection of Keele Street and Barhill Road and is adjacent to St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church (9860 Keele Street) as shown on Attachment 1. St. Andrew's Church is a designated under Parts IV and V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* ("OHA").

St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church (9860 Keele Street) purchased the subject property in 1973. The current existing structure on the subject property was built in 1974 to serve as the new manse for St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church after the previous 1859 manse (currently located at the Keele Street and Masters Avenue intersection) was found to be in a poor state of repair. In 2012, St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church applied for, and received approval for, a severance for the manse property known as 9846 Keele Street (Files B016/12 and A139/12) and the property was subsequently sold.

This current Heritage Permit application is related to Official Plan and Zoning By-Law Amendments, Draft Plan of Subdivision and Site Development application Files OP.13.004, Z.13.006, 19T-13V001 and DA.13.038. During the ongoing evaluation of the proposed development, the applicant appealed the development applications to the then Ontario Municipal Board ("OMB") for non-decision. As talks continued during the appeal process, the applicant brought forward a revised proposal to the July 18, 2018 Heritage Vaughan Committee prior to the LPAT settlement hearing on August 7, 2018. The Heritage Vaughan Committee reviewed and recommended that the Heritage Permit be approved.

As a Heritage Permit application, the item was brought forward to the Committee of the Whole on September 17, 2018, through a Hiatus Report and subsequently endorsed by Council.

The LPAT decision was released November 29, 2018 (as shown on Attachment 9) where the development proposal (as shown to the Heritage Vaughan Committee) was approved. Later discussions with City staff departments finalized some elements of the Site Plan, such as waste disposal, to harmonize with the approved Site Plan.

Since 2018, the subject property has been sold to a new owner, who has submitted updated drawings that are required to be reviewed by the Heritage Vaughan Committee and approved by Council, as they differ from what was previously approved. The property is variously known as 9846 Keele Street through the severance and appeals process, and 9850 Keele Street municipally.

Previous Reports/Authority

[Heritage Vaughan July 18, 2018](#)

Analysis and Options

The following is an analysis of the proposed development at 9846-9850 Keele Street according to the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan ('MHCD') guidelines.

All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.

2.4.5 Objectives for New Development

To ensure compatible infill construction that will enhance the District's heritage character and complement the area's village-like, human scale of development, while promoting densities sufficient to secure the District's future economic viability. To guide the design of new development to be sympathetic and compatible with the heritage resources and character of the District while providing for contemporary needs.

The proposed development, consisting of two semi-detached houses, is respectful in architectural style, height, and massing to the principles and guidelines of the MHCD Plan. The overall design is shown in Attachment 4.

4.4 New Residential Buildings

New residential buildings will have respect for and be compatible with the heritage character of the District. Designs for new residential buildings will be based on the patterns and proportions of the 19th century and early 20th century building stock that are currently existing or once existed in the village. Architectural elements, features, and decorations should be in sympathy with those found on heritage buildings.

4.4.1 Design Approach

- a) *The design of new buildings will be products of their own time but should reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District.*
- b) *New residential buildings will complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by being generally the same height, width, and orientation of adjacent buildings; being of similar setback; being of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes.*

- c) *New residential building construction will respect natural landforms, drainage, and existing mature vegetation.*
- d) *Larger new residential buildings will have varied massing, to reflect the varied scale of built environment of the historical village.*
- e) *Historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings has been 1 -1/2 or 2 storeys. The façade height of new residential buildings should be consistent with the façade height of existing buildings. Differences in façade heights between buildings on adjacent properties within the district should be no more than 1 storey. In all instances the height of new buildings shall conform to the provisions of the City's Zoning By-law.*

New residential building construction in the District will conform with the Guidelines found in Section 9.5.2.

The chosen architectural style of the semi-detached houses takes its cue from the Maple HCD Plan 'contributing' styles. Units 1 and 2 depict the Victorian form, and Units 3 and 4 take inspiration from the Georgian style. The full elevations are shown in Attachment 4.

4.2.1 Conservation of Heritage Buildings

- a) *Repair rather than replace heritage attributes using recognized conservation methods. Respect historical materials and finishes by repairing with like materials.*
- b) *Replace using like material any extensively deteriorated or missing parts of heritage attributes.*
- c) *Correct inappropriate interventions to heritage attributes.*
- d) *Undertake any work required to preserve heritage attributes physically and visually compatible with the heritage resource.*
- e) *Respect documentary evidence. Conservation work should be based on a thorough examination of physical and archival evidence. Where there is insufficient evidence, it may be appropriate to make the design, form, material, and detailing of the new feature or element compatible with the character of the heritage resource as commonly found in the District.*

9.3 Existing Heritage Buildings

9.3.6 Renovations

When a renovation on a heritage building is undertaken, later work that conceals the original design or is unsympathetic to it should be removed.

Guidelines:

- *Incorporate restoration of original work in exterior renovation projects.*
- *Use authentic original materials and methods. For example, when replacing aluminums siding, use wood siding or board and batten.*
- *Replace missing or broken elements, such as gingerbread, spindles, or door and window trims.*
- *Remove items, such as metal fascia and soffits that conceal original architectural detail.*

The subject property does not contain contributing built heritage value. Staff finds that the submitted CHIA (see Attachment 2) conforms to the City of Vaughan's Terms of Reference and provides a valuable history of the property and its connection to St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church and documents the structure sufficiently.

9.5.2 Residential Area

9.5.2.2. Architectural Style

New buildings in the residential areas should reflect the historic built form of their historic neighbours.

Guidelines:

Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles. See Section 9.1.

- *Hybrid designs that mix elements from different historical styles are not appropriate. Historical styles that are not indigenous to the area, such as Tudor or French Manor, are not appropriate.*
- *Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style. See Section 9.2.1.*
- *Research the chosen Architectural Style.*
- *Use appropriate materials. See Section 9.8.*

9.5.2.3 Scale and Massing

New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots. Note: It is recommended in Section 7 that the zoning by-law be amended to recognize the smaller scale of historic village development as contrasted with modern suburban development.

Guidelines:

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the scale and pattern of the historic District.*
- *New houses should be no higher than the highest building on the same block, and no lower than the lowest building on the same block.*
- *As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1½-storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.*
- *Follow the policies in Section 4.4 of this Plan concerning height and depth of buildings and garages.*

The proposed new structures preserve the streetscape scale and pattern of the MHCD. The structures are also scaled and set back on the property to ensure that the views of St. Andrew's Church (a property designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*)

are preserved as shown in Attachment 5. The visual impact to the adjacent contributing property is therefore minimized.

4.5.2 Trees and Shrubs

- a) *Mature trees will be preserved except where removal is necessary due to disease or damage, or to ensure public health and safety, as certified by a professional arborist. Lost trees should be replaced.*
- b) *New trees and shrubs should be hardy, urban tolerant in recognition of harsher environmental conditions, but that express form, canopy, leaf and colour characteristics of native, indigenous trees, where possible. Large, urban-tolerant and long-living character trees are to form the framework of street tree plantings in the area and become a defining characteristic of the area. Where sufficient space does not exist for large trees, smaller ornamentals are preferred to induce a pedestrian scale while providing seasonal interest and colour.*
- c) *Planting should not obscure heritage buildings, but can frame important features. Planting should screen less attractive sites and prospects in the District.*

9.7.1 Planting

No heritage permits are required for planting activities, but voluntary compliance with the guidelines in this Section can help maintain and enhance the natural heritage of the Maple and its valley.

Suitable new planting and management of existing flora are a primary means of ensuring the health of the entire ecosystem:

- *plants contribute to stormwater and groundwater management*
- *erosion control*
- *provide habitat and nutrition for wild fauna*

Suitable indigenous species:

- *Sugar Maple, Red Oak, Basswood, Silver Maple, Bitternut, Butternut, White Pine, Hemlock, American Elm, Red Maple, Bur Oak, White Spruce.*

It is recognized that because of the urban environment and site conditions the use of non indigenous species may be suitable for road side planting. These include:

- *Acer platanoides 'Columnare'*
- *Tilia cordata*
- *Aesculus glabra*
- *Quercus alba*
- *Gymnocladus dioicus*
- *Syringa reticulata*
- *Pyrus calleryana*

Unsuitable species:

- *Manitoba Maple*
- *Hawthorn*
- *Black Locust*

- **Buckthorn**
- *Invasive, non native ornamental species, particularly Norway Maple cultivars. Street tree planting on arterial roads should conform with Region of York guidelines. Please refer to 'Tree Planting Design Criteria' within the Region's Road Design Guidelines handbook. In general, street trees should be hardy, salt-tolerant 60 mm caliper balled and burlapped specimens, spaced at 8-12 metres on centre, planted 3 metres from any curb or utility pole and offset 1 metre from any sidewalk and 3 metres from any driveway*

As shown on Attachment 6, the line of Sugar Maples along the south edge of St. Andrew's are to be retained and preserved. The removal of 3 trees (187, 193 and 194) within the development area are required to accommodate the new construction. Four more trees are recommended for removal, but only 2 are within the development area (189 and 190) and are located at the rear of the development. Two other trees A and E are located on the properties to the south (A) and to the north (E) are recommended for removal based on their health and will require the agreement of the respective owners for removal. The submitted Landscape Plan is shown on Attachment 7 and will provide further enhancement of the grounds.



PCC	1	Pyrus calleryana 'Chanticleer'	Chanticleer Pear	70 mm
QRB	2	Quercus rubra	Red Oak	70 mm
TCO	1	Tilia cordata 'Greenspire'	Greenspire Linden	70 mm
DECIDUOUS SHRUBS				
POD	5	Physocarpus opulifolius 'Diablo'	Diablo Purpleleaf Ninebark	80 cm
SBS	18	Spirea bumalda 'Snow Mound'	Snow Mound Spirea	50 cm
SJL	60	Spirea japonica 'Little Princess'	Dwarf Red Spirea	60 cm
SMP	12	Syringa meyeri 'Palibin'	Purple Dwarf Korean Lilac	60 cm

Please note that the applicant is required to enter into a Tree Protection Agreement with the City of Vaughan prior to the site plan agreement.
Please note that the compensation costs and proposed landscape costs are to be secured for in a letter of undertaking

9.8.1 Heritage Buildings Appropriate Materials

All construction visible from the exterior requires a Heritage Permit. Visible materials should conform to the following standards:

- **Exterior Finish:** Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent, or in some instances brick to match existing conditions. Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather. Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.
- **Exterior Detail:** Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.

- Roofs: *Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style. Skylights in the form of cupolas or monitors are acceptable, if appropriate to the style.*
- Doors: *Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed. Transom windows and paired sidelights. Wood french doors for porch entrances. Single-bay, wood panelled garage doors.*
- Windows: *Wood frames; single or double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*
- Flashings: *Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.*

9.8.2 Non-Heritage Buildings Appropriate Materials

Exterior Finish: Use materials compatible with the original design.

Roofs: Slopes and layouts compatible with the original design.

Doors: Use materials and designs compatible with the original design.

Windows: Use windows compatible with the original design.

Staff finds that the submitted Materials and Specification boards submitted as shown in Attachment 8 are in keeping with the guidelines and requirements of the MHCD Plan, as above noted.

Financial Impact

There are no Financial Impacts associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no Regional impacts or considerations for this application.

Operational Impact

There are no operational impacts.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied that the proposed re-design of the 2 semi-detached houses at 9846-9850 Keele conform to the policies and guidelines within the MHCD Plan. Accordingly, Staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposed development located at 9846-9850 Keele Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 9850Keele_Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 9850Keele_CHIA
- Attachment 3 – 9850Keele_Site Plan
- Attachment 4 – 9850Keele_Floor plans and elevations
- Attachment 5 – 9850Keele_3D renderings
- Attachment 6 – 9850Keele_Tree Preservation Plan
- Attachment 7 – 9850Keele_Landscape Plan
- Attachment 8 – 9850Keele_Materials and Colour Palette
- Attachment 9 – 9850Keele_LPAT Oral Decision

Prepared by

- Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext.8115
- Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191
- Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653