

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, May 24, 2023

WARD: 2

TITLE: PROPOSED DESIGNATION UNDER PART IV OF THE
ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT OF 82 MONSHEEN DRIVE WARD 2
– VICINITY OF HIGHWAY 7 AND EAST OF ISLINGTON
AVENUE

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee's support and recommend to the Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed designation of the City-owned property municipally known as 82 Monsheen Drive located in the vicinity of Highway 7 and east of Islington Avenue (as shown on Attachment 1).

Report Highlights

- The report proposes the designation of 82 Monsheen Drive, a split-level home on a ravine lot.
- The property holds physical, associated, and contextual cultural heritage value as described in the attached Statement of Cultural Heritage Value.
- The designation of this property meets the policies of the Vaughan Official Plan and the objectives and required criteria outlined in the *Ontario Heritage Act* by the Province of Ontario Regulation 9/06.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed development as presented, subject to following conditions:

1. That the Designation Report for 82 Monsheen Drive be Received.

2. That Council approve the recommendation of the Heritage Vaughan Committee to designate 82 Monsheen Drive in accordance with Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* R.S.O. 1990, c. O.18.
3. That Staff be authorized to publish and serve the Notice of Intention to Designate in accordance with the requirements under; Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* R.S.O 1990, c.O.18 to the Ontario Heritage Trust, the Property Owner (City of Vaughan), and published in the local newspapers.
4. If no objection is served on the City Clerk within 30 days of the date of publication of the Notice of Intention, Council shall pass a by-law designating 82 Monsheen Drive and a copy of the by-law shall be served on the Owner (City of Vaughan) and Ontario Heritage Trust and a notice shall be published in the local newspapers.

Background

The subject property at 82 Monsheen Drive consists of a single, split-level house constructed in 1958 on a ravine lot – part of the greater Woodview Development Housing of the Seneca Heights subdivision. The arrangement on the property is a carefully designed architectural and urbanism composition, from the approach to the considerably set-back building, to the siting and orientation of the structure to achieve maximum impact from the ravine natural backdrop, to the colour palette and use of topography for enhancing or masking architectural features and elements.

Recent staff research on the subject property has confirmed that the cultural heritage value of 82 Monsheen Drive meets the criteria set out under OHA Regulation 9/06 for physical, associative and contextual cultural heritage value. A complete designation report that outlines these values is included herewith.

Previous Reports/Authority

Committee of the Whole, September 13, 2011

https://meetingarchives.vaughan.ca/committee_2011/pdf/CWA0913_31.pdf

Analysis and Options

In June 2019, the *More Homes, More Choice Act*, 2019 (Bill 108) received Royal Assent. Schedule 11 of this Act included amendments to the *Ontario Heritage Act* ('OHA'). The Bill 108 Amendments to the OHA came into force on July 1, 2021, and include a shift in Part IV designations related to certain Planning Act applications. These changes affect Section 29(1.2) of the OHA which now restricts City Council's ability to give notice of its intention to designate a property under the Act to within 90 days after the City Clerk gives notice of a complete application.

The Bill 23, the *More Homes Built Faster Act*, 2022, Amendments to the OHA that came into force on January 1, 2023 mandates the municipalities to remove properties from the heritage register under section 27 if they do not pass a by-law designating the property on the second anniversary of the bill coming into force (January 1, 2025).

In light of this new legislation, it is imperative for City of Vaughan staff to identify cultural heritage properties that are currently Listed under Section 27 of the OHA or identified as a property of interest to be evaluated as a candidate for designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the OHA. The Province has amended O. Reg. 9/06 under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, which establishes nine provincial criteria for determining whether a property is of cultural heritage value or interest if it meets two or more of the nine criteria.

As set out in Vaughan's Official 2010 Plan, the City of Vaughan states that it is the policy of Council to:

6.1.1.1. To recognize and conserve cultural heritage resources, including heritage buildings and structures, Cultural heritage landscapes, and other cultural heritage resources, and to promote the maintenance and development of an appropriate setting within, around and adjacent to all such resources.

6.1.2.6. That the City shall use criteria established by Provincial regulation under the Ontario Heritage Act for determining cultural heritage value or interest and for identifying and evaluating properties for listing in the Heritage register and for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The City may further refine these criteria and provide guidelines for their use through the Vaughan Heritage Conservation Guidelines.

6.1.2.7. Any property worthy of designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act that fulfills one or more of the criteria identified in policy 6.1.2.6 will be considered to possess cultural heritage value.

6.2.1.1. To make full use of the provisions of Provincial legislation, such as the Ontario Heritage Act, Planning Act, Municipal Act and Environmental Assessment Act, to protect and conserve cultural heritage resources in Vaughan.

82 Monsheen Drive has been previously nominated for designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* in 2011, but the designation did not proceed due to some concerns regarding home insurance coverage from the property owner. In 2016, the home was formally Listed under Section 27; however, the recent changes to the *Ontario Heritage Act* only give this property the limited demolition protections for the next 18 months.

Regarding the insurance of designated heritage properties, the position of the Province of Ontario and the Insurance Bureau of Canada both clarify that heritage designation alone should not restrict access to insurance or cause an increase:

<https://www.ontario.ca/page/heritage-properties-and-insurance>
<http://www.ibc.ca/on/home/heritage-properties>

Following a thorough re-examination of archival documentation, staff finds that the subject property holds cultural heritage value and meets the criteria set out under the *Ontario Heritage Act* by the Province of Ontario Regulation 9/06 for the categories of design/physical, historical/associative and contextual value.

Designation Comments

ADDRESS: 82 Monsheen Drive
 LEGAL: PLAN RP5081, Lot 9
 ROLL: 1928000432354000000

EVALUATION UNDER O.REG 9/06 CRITERIA

Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* establishes nine criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the OHA if it meets two or more of these criteria. The following evaluation tables identify the application of each criterion as “N/A” (not applicable) or “X” (applicable) to the property, with explanatory text below.

The tables below give an overview of significant cultural heritage value of 82 Monsheen Drive. The Statement of Cultural Heritage Value (see attachment 2) provides a full description of the property’s cultural heritage attributes for evaluation purposes.

1. DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE

The property has design value or physical value because it	
▪ is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method	X
▪ displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	X
▪ demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

82 Monsheen Drive is a unique representative example of the Canadian (domestic) modernist style with west coast influences. This variant style was built in the 1950’s by architect Stanley Barclay and his partners Eric Arthur, William Fleury and Andre Stern in Toronto and the GTA area. It displays a high degree of architectural stylistic design, artistic merit and a unique quality in craftsmanship reflecting the era of its design and construction.

Specific architectural elements include:

- The building’s siting, building envelope, structure, original finish materials and built-in furniture
- The properties of each material are showcased for their intrinsic beauty and detailing is minimalistic and devoid of any historic reference to a past style. The carefully selected composition is made up of materials assigned to each architectural element (that results in contrasting surfaces), smooth, earthy and varied textures are character defining features of the style.
- The smooth surfaces enhance the sensation by the visitor of the concept of “infinity in space” and the natural material surfaces such as brick, stone and

wood, with the aid of the large glass surfaces, connect the architecture and the visitor with the natural surroundings.

2. HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
▪ has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community	X
▪ yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture	X
▪ demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community	X

82 Monsheen Drive, built in 1958, has the potential to yield information that contributes to the understanding of a community. This house is an excellent example of the domestic modernist style, constructed in response to a flow of ideas particular to their time and place ('genus loci'; and also 'vernacular') as they formed part of a unique and marked time for architectural ideas. It demonstrates and reflects the work of and ideas of architect Stanley Bennett Barclay, partner in practice of Eric Arthur in their firm Fleury, Arthur, Barclay and Stern (1949-1965).

This firm produced work that is indicative of a unique set of architectural principles that reflected modernist ideals born from the International Style of the early 20th century in Europe and North America. This style would be meshed with the unique conditions of the Canadian weather, natural landscape, and culture, to develop a domestic variant of the modernist style, uniquely and clearly expressed in the structure, site, and the combination of both.

3. CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
▪ important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	X
▪ physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	X
▪ a landmark	N/A

82 Monsheen Drive has contextual value as a surviving and exemplary example within the Seneca Heights subdivision development, also known as the Woodview Housing Development, consisting of Monsheen Drive, Tayok Drive and Wigwoss Drive, and defined by the natural wooded areas, hills and premier lots backing on the Humber River ravine built in the 1950's.

Seneca Heights was considered an ideal location to realize many of the goals of modernism, and vacant lots were purchased by modernists, including prominent architect Stanley Bennett Barclay, who designed, built and lived in the home at 82 Monsheen Drive in 1958. As a result of the collaborative vision for Seneca Heights, the subject area developed into a unique modernist landscape composed of small, 1 to 2 storey, architecturally unique modernist residential homes on large, wooded lots. Many

of the original houses in area have since been either demolished or altered, the subject property represents one of only a few intact remaining Modernist structures.

The subject property is also physically, functionally and visually linked to its location on the Humber River ravine. Because of the fluidity and importance of the connection between the interior and exterior of the subject building to its natural surroundings, the subject building is linked to its exact location.

Financial Impact

There are no Financial Impacts associated with this report.

Operational Impact

Not applicable.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no Regional impacts or considerations for this application.

Conclusion

Staff finds that, as examined from archival documentation, the subject property holds cultural heritage value and meets the required criteria as set out under the *Ontario Heritage Act* by the Province of Ontario Regulation 9/06 for the categories of design/physical, historical/associative and contextual value.

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed designation of 82 Monsheen Drive conforms to the policies of the Vaughan Official Plan and the objectives and criteria of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposed designation of 82 Monsheen Drive under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

Attachments

Attachment 1 – 82Monsheen_Location Map

Attachment 2 – 82Monsheen_Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Attachment 3 – 82Monsheen_publications

Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Shahzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653.