

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, May 24, 2023

WARD: 1

TITLE: DEMOLITION OF A TWO-STOREY DWELLING AND CONSTRUCTION OF A SEMI-DETACHED BUILDING AT 56 WALLACE STREET, AND RENOVATIONS AT 66 WALLACE AND 1 MEMORIAL DRIVE, WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding the proposed demolition of one residential structure and the construction of two semi-detached buildings at 56 Wallace Street, and the renovations of 66 Wallace and 1 Memorial Drive, located in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as shown on Attachment 1.

Report Highlights

- The applicant proposes to demolish the existing dwelling at 56 Wallace Street, and construct a new semi-detached building on site (56A and 56B); create an additional lot with a 3 storey dwelling unit (56C), revise the existing dwelling at 66 Wallace Street with garage access from Wallace Street; and remove the roof and attic of 1 Memorial Hill Drive and construct a second storey on the building.
- The dwelling to be demolished is identified as a non-contributing property in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan (“WHCD Plan”).
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the WHCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the WHCD Plan.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed demolition of one non-contributing building and new construction of two semi-detached buildings at 56 Wallace Street, and proposed renovations at 66 Wallace and 1 Memorial Drive, Woodbridge under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

Background

The applicant is proposing, through Zoning, to reconfigure the property boundaries and make the following site alterations: at 56 Wallace, demolish the existing 2-storey non-contributing building and in its place construct two 3 storey new semi-detached units, create a new lot south of the private laneway and construct a 3 storey dwelling unit; at 66 Wallace, retain and renovate the existing building and relocate the existing driveway to a new street-facing garage (not part of zoning application); and at 1 Memorial Drive, renovate the existing non-contributing ranch-style bungalow to incorporate a new second storey. The proposal also includes the reconfiguration of the laneway to tie to a future consent application and conveying part of it to the City for future development.

The applicant submitted a supporting CHIA (see attachment 2) advising that the proposed changes to this cluster of houses within the WHCD is sensitively designed in accordance with the Guidelines of the WHCD Plan and will, overall, be a positive improvement to this portion of the District. The design of the houses is architecturally sympathetic with the heritage design character of other houses on Wallace Street, and in the instance of the property on Memorial Hill Drive is substantially more sympathetic with the architectural character of the District, while accommodating the automobile into the new buildings to be constructed.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan.

The following is an analysis of the proposed demolition of existing building and new construction located at 56, 66 Wallace Street and 1 Memorial Drive according to the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan ('WHCD') guidelines.

6.1.3 WALLACE STREET

Heritage Attributes:

- 1. A residential street character that is narrow in nature and pedestrian oriented and includes a broad variety of housing types fronting onto Wallace Street.*
- 2. The existing street cross section consists of a R.O.W. of only 12 meters, and a roadway width of 9 meters. This narrow roadway is meant to carry traffic associated with the established low-density residential neighbourhood.*
- 3. Provides pedestrian access to Woodbridge Avenue, from the south. Provides access and views to public open spaces, since most of the street fronts directly onto either Memorial Hill or the North Johnson District Park (part of the Humber River Corridor).*
- 4. In addition to the parkland, front yards provide a significant greenery and tree canopy. Houses on the west side are setback from the street, while houses on the east side are built directly on the property line.*
- 5. Houses are predominantly 2 to 3 storeys in height on Wallace Street.*
- 6. Side yards provide views towards the hillside on the west, and the river valley to the east.*

Guidelines:

- 1. The Street should retain the existing residential character with a single family detached building type and be designed to support a pedestrian streetscape. Where the Official Plan permits, duplexes, triplexes, and quadruplexes may be permitted provided they are carefully designed to appear as single detached dwellings, sensitive to abutting contributing buildings and landscapes, and provided they maintain existing side yard and front yard setbacks, are of a similar building height, and are of a building frontage width which is consistent with adjacent single detached dwellings.*
- 2. Pedestrian connections to and from Woodbridge Avenue and the park system must be protected, maintained and additional opportunities to increase connections should be secured when new development applications are considered. Views and public access to parkland must be protected and enhanced.*
- 3. Consistent setbacks should provide opportunities for landscape on the west side of the street.*

4. *New buildings should be a minimum of 2 floors (8.5 m) high and a maximum of 3 floors (11m).*
5. *Detached residential units must provide a side yard as per zoning with open east-west views.*

Staff finds the proposed combined site alterations to positively address the requirements of the WHCD Plan and the architectural modifications (through demolition/replacement, and renovations) skilfully adapt the site to the current sensibilities of the Heritage District as it matured into a contemporary representation of its day.

6.2.5 Approach to Non-Contributing Buildings

Non-contributing buildings are not to be demolished until such time as a demolition permit has been issued. Additions and alterations to non-contributing buildings can have an impact on contributing buildings and the overall character of Woodbridge. As non-contributing buildings are modified, and as new buildings are built, these should contribute to the heritage character of Woodbridge as a whole, and specifically to the heritage character of adjacent contributing properties.

The City of Vaughan may require a Heritage Impact Assessment when it considers that cultural heritage value may exist or be impacted by any new construction.

All three existing buildings are considered non-contributing by the WHCD Plan. As such, staff finds the proposed demolition acceptable as supported by the proponent's CHIA (see attachment 2), and the proposed replacement and new buildings are in keeping with the contributing architectural styles outlined in the WHCD Plan.

Staff finds the renovations and architectural alterations proposed for the other two buildings are respectful of the WHCD Plan guidelines and present an uncontestable improvement to the character of the buildings and their immediate surroundings.

6.2.8 Appropriate Materials

Exterior Finish: *Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent, or in some instances brick to match existing conditions.*

Exterior Detail: *Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings.*

Roofs: *Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the architectural style. Skylights in the form of cupolas or monitors are acceptable, if appropriate to the style.*

Doors: *Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed; transom windows and paired sidelights with real glazing bars; wood french doors for porch entrances; single-bay, wood panelled garage doors.*

Windows: *Wood frames; single or double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style; real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars; vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*

Flashings: *Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.*

Staff finds the proposed building materials to be used in the design of the three structures (see visuals in attachment 9) are aligned with the WHCD Plan, and have aesthetics individually worked out for each of the individual buildings. The compositions are enhanced by the tasteful combinations of cladding materials that highlight some of the interior functions of the buildings through details on the elevations, and that break up the single-material monotony of the adjacent properties.

6.3 Architectural Guidelines for New Buildings, Additions and Alterations

Within the heritage district new architecture will invariably be constructed. This will occur on vacant sites, as replacement buildings for non-contributing existing structures, or severely deteriorated older buildings.

Entirely new buildings may be proposed:

- where no previous buildings existed or,*
- where original buildings are missing or,*
- where severely deteriorated buildings are removed through no fault of the current owner, or*
- where non-contributing buildings are removed.*

The proposed works are located on three adjoining residential lots, that presently contain three separate non-contributing buildings of no heritage value. The proposed alterations will modify the buildings to convert to contributing architectural styles, thus enhancing the immediate character of the street but also of the greater neighbourhood.

6.3.2 Contemporary Design

Just as it is the characteristic of the Woodbridge HCD to contain contributing buildings in at least 12 recognizable styles, contemporary work should be “of its time”. This is consistent with the principles stated in the Venice Charter, Appleton Charter and other charters recognized internationally as a guide for heritage work. This does not mean that new work should be aggressively idiosyncratic but that it should be neighbourly and fit this “village” context while at the same time representing current design philosophy. Quoting the past can be appropriate. It should, however avoid blurring the line between real historic “artifacts”, and contemporary elements.

“Contemporary” as a design statement does not simply mean “current”. Current designs with borrowed detailing inappropriately, inconsistently, or incorrectly used, such as pseudo-Victorian detailing, should be avoided.

The contemporary design conforms to Section 6.3.2 following the architectural combination of cladding materials on solid walls and punched windows. The front brick façade displays good symmetry and proportion and the subtle detailing of the window mullions shown at the front façade provide a satisfactory glazing-to-wall area.

The visually recessed garage doors, the raised entrance doors and evenly distributed window pattern, help the design harmoniously combine the proportion of parts through projection.

6.4.2.1 WOODBRIDGE HCD WALL HEIGHT AND SCALE (GENERAL)

The height and scale of structures has a significant impact on the overall character of a street and district.

The height of a structure is noticeable both from: a close distance, where it contributes to the character of the street wall, to the penetration of sunlight, to the views of the context and sky, to wind and microclimatic conditions, and to the experience of pedestrians; and from a greater distance, where it contributes to the skyline and district wide views.

In Woodbridge, the height and scale of buildings has a relatively consistent “Village” character, generally free standing 2-3 storey buildings with the exception of small concentrations of up to 6 storeys in certain locations. This character is established by both historic structures and some of the more recent buildings. Maintaining a relatively uniform height and scale of buildings is a significant aspect of conserving the heritage character of individual properties, of streets, and of the Woodbridge district as a whole.

Guidelines

- 1. Except where noted, new buildings should be a minimum of 2 floors (8.5 m) and a maximum of 3 floors (11 m).*
- 2. The height of existing contributing buildings should be maintained. New buildings must be sympathetic to, and transition from, the height of adjacent contributing buildings, with a minimum 45° angular plane. (See section 6.5)*
- 3. The height of a building is measured from the average elevation of the finished grade at the front of the building to the highest point of the roof surface for a flat roof and a mansard roof; and to the mean height between the eaves and the highest point of a gable, hip, or a gambrel roof. (See Section 6.5)*

All three buildings that are part of this application conform in height and massing to the requirements and allowable limits set out by the WHCD Plan. In particular, the new construction at 56 Wallace Street north of the driveway has a mid-roof height of 9.9m, whereas the new construction south of the driveway has a mid-roof height of 9.8m measured from average grade. Lastly, the renovated building at 1 Memorial Drive has a mid-roof height of only 7.7m above average grade – keeping it within the proportions of a ranch-style architectural volume despite the introduction of the new second storey.

6.6.3 TREE CANOPY AND VEGETATION

- 1. Existing natural forest stands or groupings of trees should be conserved.*

2. *Streetscapes should conserve the existing green canopy and provide new tree planting where none exists, in order to create a continuous tree canopy along the street.*
3. *Trees on public and private property, having a tree diameter of twenty (20) centimetres or more or having a base diameter of twenty (20) centimetres or more, must be conserved, and the requirements of the City of Vaughan Tree Bylaw 185-2007 must be adhered to.*
4. *Prior to the issuance of a Heritage Permit, Building Permit or Site Plan approval, a tree conservation plan is required to be submitted and approved by the City.*
5. *An on-going tree maintenance and replacement strategy should be developed in order to maintain the extensive forest canopy, especially as maturing trees start to show signs of deterioration or stress.*

The proponent submitted an Arborist Report accompanied by a Tree Preservation Plan and a Landscape Plan. Staff notes that a tree inventory was conducted and reviewed in the context of the proposed site plan. The findings of the study indicate a total of 57 trees on and within six metres of the subject property. The removal of 27 trees will be required to accommodate the proposed development, and 38 replacement trees will be required. All other trees can be saved provided appropriate tree protection measures are installed prior to the development.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Operational Impact

There are no Operational Impacts associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed project conforms to the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the demolition and new construction at 56 Wallace Street, and proposed renovations at 66 Wallace Street and 1 Memorial Drive under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Attachments

- Attachment 1 - 56-66Wallace_Location Map
- Attachment 2 - 56-66Wallace_CHIA
- Attachment 3 - 56-66Wallace_Survey
- Attachment 4 - 56-66Wallace_existing conditions drawings
- Attachment 5 - 56-66Wallace_Proposed architectural drawings
- Attachment 6 - 56-66Wallace_Arborist Report
- Attachment 7 - 56-66Wallace_Tree Inventory
- Attachment 8 - 56-66Wallace_Landscape Plan
- Attachment 9 - 56-66Wallace_3D renderings
- Attachment 10 - 56-66Wallace_Materials Samples

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191.

Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653.