

CITY OF VAUGHAN
REPORT NO. 5 OF THE
HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

***For consideration by the Committee of the Whole
of the City of Vaughan
on September 17, 2018***

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:25 p.m., on August 15, 2018.

Present: Tony Marziliano, Chair
Christine Radewych, Vice - Chair
Robert Brown
Sandra Colica
Nick Pacione
Giacomo Parisi
Pankaj Sandhu
Antonella Strangis
Claudio Travierso

Staff present: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer
Rose Magnifico, Acting Deputy City Clerk

The following items were dealt with:

**1 NEW CONSTRUCTION – DETACHED GARAGE
 8248 KIPLING AVENUE
 WOODBRIIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated August 15, 2018, be approved.

(This recommendation was reported in the September 2018, Hiatus Report.)

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding the proposed construction of a detached garage located at 8248 Kipling Avenue, a

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

property located in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing a new detached garage to be located at 8248 Kipling Avenue.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan (“WHCD Plan”).
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as the new construction conforms with the policies of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan (“WHCD Plan”).

Recommendations

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend approval to Council for the proposed detached garage new construction at 8248 Kipling Avenue under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application; and
 - c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

Background

The subject property is located on the northwest corner of Kipling Avenue and City Park Circle in the WHCD Plan area and is Designated Part V as per the *Ontario Heritage Act* (“OHA”). The existing house on the subject property is constructed in the Queen Anne style circa 1890. The inventory for the Woodbridge HCD identifies this building as a “contributing” building.

Previous Reports/Authority

The Heritage Vaughan Committee previously approved demolition a garage on the subject property as part of the approval of a new development adjacent to the subject property

A previous proposal was recommended for approval at the Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting of March 20, 2013. This proposal included the construction of a new development including townhouse, semi-detached and detached dwellings along Kipling Avenue and the demolition of a garage located at the rear of the subject lands to accommodate the development. The full report is available online at:

https://www.vaughan.ca/council/minutes_agendas/AgendaItems/HV%200320_13_1.pdf

Analysis and Options

The Owner is proposing a detached garage to be located at the rear/interior side yard of the existing building

The proposal is for a new detached garage 26.75 m² in size to be located in the rear/interior side yard of 8248 Kipling Avenue. The garage will be accessed from the existing paved driveway to the north of the existing house. The garage will be set back 1.24 m from the existing house and is 4.05 m in height from the average elevation of the finished grade at the front of the building to the mean height between the eaves and the highest point of the gable roof. The proposed exterior finish is board and batten with cedar shake gable ends, which is consistent with the Queen Anne design of the contributing building. The roof material is asphalt shingles and the proposed door and garage doors will be wood or metal with wood panel facing.

Minor Variances are required to permit the detached garage

The applicant has submitted a Minor Variance application (A122-18) for the proposed garage. The Building Standards Department has confirmed that the following minor variances are required to Zoning By-law 1-88:

1. To permit a minimum interior side yard setback of 0.91 m to the accessory building (garage) whereas 1.2 m is required.
2. To permit a maximum building height to the nearest part of the roof of the accessory building (garage) of 3.3 m whereas 3.0 m is required.

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

3. To permit a maximum building height to the highest point of the roof for the accessory building (garage) of 4.8 m whereas 4.5 m is required.

Cultural Heritage can support the above variances as they do not conflict with the applicable policies of the WHCD Plan. The required By-law relief for the interior side yard setback can be supported as it provides an appropriate separation between the contributing brick building and the proposed new garage. The required By-law relief for the garage height is appropriate as the rear garage will remain subordinate in height to the existing contributing brick building.

The proposed detached garage is consistent with the following relevant sections of the WHCD Plan, with justification provided where the proposal does not meet certain policies in their entirety

Kipling Avenue North Character Area

The subject property is located within the Kipling Avenue North Character Area of the WHCD Plan. The following is an analysis of the applicable WHCD Plan policies:

5.3.2.5. Circulation, vehicular access and parking

“On-site parking, garages, and parking structures are generally concealed behind or below inhabited buildings.”

- The proposed garage will be located slightly behind and to the side of the existing contributing building that fronts onto Kipling Avenue. It will be partially visible from the Kipling Avenue streetscape, but will be set back 19.25 m from Kipling Avenue.
- It is also noted that the garage is located along the side of the rear addition (built in the 1980's) and not the main contributing building.

6.1.2 Kipling Avenue North and South – Guidelines:

“1. Kipling Avenue should regain and retain its heritage character.”

- The proposed garage will not impact the existing heritage character, as the existing contributing building will remain and partially obstruct the view of the proposed garage. In addition, the Queen-Anne inspired design of the proposed garage is in keeping with the architecture and materials of the contributing building, further supporting the heritage character of the streetscape.

Section 6.2.8 Appropriate Materials

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

“Exterior Finish: Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent, or in some instances brick to match existing conditions”.

- The proposed board and batten siding is not listed in the above appropriate materials, but this is a common material used for detached garages along Kipling Avenue (as shown in Attachment #3). Although the exterior material does not match the existing brick of the existing contributing house, this material is a traditional material that will allow the garage to appear as a separate outbuilding to the existing house. The applicant has indicated that the proposed board and batten will be dark red to compliment the red clay brick of the existing contributing building. The proposed garage design is Queen Anne inspired and integrates the cedar gable end of the contributing building. Therefore, Cultural Heritage staff are satisfied with the proposed board and batten material.

“Doors: Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed; transom windows and paired sidelights with real glazing bars; wood french doors for porch entrances; single-bay, wood panelled garage doors.”

- The proposed garage includes one wood door and two wood paneled garage doors.

Section 6.6.3 – Tree Canopy and Vegetation – Guidelines:

“3. Trees on public and private property, having a tree diameter of twenty (20) centimetres or more or having a base diameter of twenty (20) centimetres or more, must be conserved, and the requirements of the City of Vaughan Tree By-law 185-2007 must be adhered to.”

- The proposal does not contemplate the removal of any existing trees on the subject property.

Based on the above analysis, the proposed detached garage conforms with the policies of the WHCD Plan.

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90-day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on July 17, 2018, and must be deliberated upon by October 15, 2018, to meet the 90-day timeline.

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the application to permit a new garage on the property municipally known as 8248 Kipling Avenue and is satisfied that the proposed garage is consistent with the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed new construction under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Subject Property
3. Site Photos
4. Proposed Building Materials and Colours
5. Site Plan, ADM Design Build Inc., May 2018
6. Proposed Garage Elevation, ADM Design Build Inc., May 2018

Prepared by

Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

2

**RESTORATION & REPAIR
9995 KEELE STREET
MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management, dated August 15, 2018, was approved.

Purpose

To seek approval from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for repairs and restoration to the structure located at 9995 Keele Street (“Beaverbrook House”), a property located in the Maple Heritage Conservation District (“MHCD”) and designated under Parts IV and V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The property is owned and maintained by the City of Vaughan.
- The last significant work on the property occurred in 2010.
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Recommendations

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed repairs and renovations at 9995 Keele Street under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to following conditions:
 - a. Any significant changes to the proposal by the Applicant, may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - b. That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Applicant as it relates to the subject application.

Background

9995 Keele Street is located at the southeast corner of Keele Street and Major Mackenzie Drive West as shown on Attachment #1. The brick house structure was built circa 1878-79 and is an example of Georgian Revival which uses red and yellow brick, yellow and sandy stone and wood trim. It is associated with the Noble family, an early founding family in Maple and is the birthplace of William Maxwell Aitken (Lord Beaverbrook).

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

Originally, there were other properties and structures owned by the Noble family to the north of the property, but they were lost to the realignment of Major Mackenzie in the 1960's. Therefore, this is the only remaining structure associated specifically with the Noble family in Maple. Located at the intersection of Keele Street and Major Mackenzie, it is a prominent historic structure in the District that references the crucial four corners as the foundation of the Village of Maple. In 1981 the Beaverbrook House was designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* through By-law #72-81 on the basis of its architectural, contextual and associated heritage values. It was purchased by the Town of Vaughan in 1983.

On the south side of the structure there is a later addition that was in place before 1954 (possibly as early as the 1930's). It is thought that this addition was built when the house became the home to Maple doctors beginning in the 1920's with Dr. W.S. Caldwell, who sold it to Dr. R.A. Bigford in 1933. Dr. Bigford remained in the house, operating his practice until the 1970's and this addition would have likely functioned as the entrance to the practice.

The property is located in the Commercial Core area of the Maple Heritage Conservation District ("Maple HCD") and is considered to be a contributing property to the District.

Previous Heritage Permits

There are two known previous Heritage Permits that were issued for alterations. The first was issued in November 2010 that replaced the doors and columns. A subsequent second permit was issued in 2015 to repair and reinforce the foundation of the property.

Analysis and Options

Proposed Alterations

The proposed alteration and restoration work is to repair the masonry brick on the south façade of the structure. Both the original house and the later addition require this work as the bricks have degraded due to road salt exposure.

The repairs and restoration to south side brick work will incorporate the following materials and work as follows:

- Removal of deteriorated brick cladding and mortar.
- For bricks that require replacement, the contractor in consultation with City Staff, has selected matching bricks of similar colour, size and finish as shown in Attachment #4. The selected replacement brick for the 20th century addition to the house is a Riverdale Smooth with a 1:1:3 lime federal white and brick sand mix mortar. This mortar reflects the typical mix and addition

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

of Portland cement that would have been used at the time of construction of the addition between 1920 and 1954.

- The brick for the original “tail” structure is a Glen-gary brick with a 1:1:6 ratio mortar mix with a buff blend for certain areas. This buff blend reflects the varying historic mortar in colour.

In both sections, the replacement of bricks and refinishing of the mortar work will be finished to match existing, original work.

The relevant policies from the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan include the following:

**9.3.4.2 Masonry Repointing
Guidelines:**

- Repair structural damage before repointing. Structural cracks may be letting in the moisture that is eroding the mortar.
- Do not use power tools to remove old mortar. They can damage the weather-resistant skin of the brick and cause future deterioration of the wall.
- Use lime mortar for repairs and repointing of historic brick. Match the original in formulation, with a cement content no greater than one-twelfth of the dry volume of the mix; the cement must be white portland cement and not grey.
- Do not treat historic brick with silicones or consolidants. They trap water vapour behind the surface of the brick which may damage the face by freezing or leaching of salts.

9.3.5.1 Brickwork

Brick repair should be undertaken using proper heritage materials and methods. If available, salvaged bricks matching the original should be used for replacement material. If new bricks are necessary, they should match the original in size, colour, and finish. The traditional Ontario brick size is still manufactured, but in small quantities, so material may have to be ordered well in advance of the work.

Guidelines:

- Repair structural damage before restoration.
- Use matching bricks for repairs, either salvaged old material or the best modern match in size and colour.

Based on the above analysis, the proposed work is in conformity with the policies of the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on July 26, 2018, and must be deliberated upon by, October 24, 2018, to meet the 90 day timeline.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the application to repair and replace the masonry at 9995 Keele Street. Staff is satisfied that the proposed repairs to the property are consistent with the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan policies. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed alterations, under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Maple HCD Inventory Extract
3. Current Condition
4. Proposed Materials

Prepared by

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**3 DEMOLITION OF TWO DETACHED BUILDINGS AND
NEW DEVELOPMENT
9560 AND 9570 KEELE STREET
MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That consideration of this matter was deferred to the September 12, 2018, Heritage Vaughan meeting; and
- 2) That the following deputations were received:
 1. Mr. Ryan Guetter, Weston Consulting, representing the applicant; and
 2. Mr. David Eckler, Area, Architects Rasch Eckler Associates Ltd., representing the applicant.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee regarding a Heritage Permit application to demolish of the two detached houses municipally known as 9560 and 9570 Keele Street and the proposed new construction of 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units on a common element road on the properties as shown in Attachment #1, located within the Maple Heritage Conservation District ("Maple HCD").

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing to demolish the existing detached dwellings at 9560 and 9570 Keele Street and construct 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units on a common element road.
- Heritage Vaughan Committee review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Recommendations

1. THAT the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend to Council the approval of the Heritage Permit application to demolish of the detached dwellings at 9560 and 9570 Keele Street.
2. THAT the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend approval to Council for the proposed new construction of 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units on a common element road under Section 42 of *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to following conditions:
 - a) The related Development Applications under the *Planning Act* must receive final approval prior to the issuance of the Heritage Permit. It is understood that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council regarding the issuance of a Heritage Permit do not constitute support for any

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

Development Application under the *Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;

- b) Any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- c) That an Arborist Report and Tree Preservation Plan be finalized to the satisfaction of the City; and
- d) That a final materials list be submitted to the City and finalized to the satisfaction of City Urban Design and Cultural Heritage staff.

Background

Location and Heritage Status

The two properties, known municipally as 9560 and 9570 Keele Street, form the lands subject to this application (hereinafter referred to as the "Subject Lands"). The Subject Lands are located on west side of Keele Street, south of Knightswood Avenue, as shown on Attachment #1. The Subject Lands are located within the Residential Village Area of the Maple HCD, and are protected under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* ("OHA"). The Subject Lands are designated "Low-Rise Residential" by Vaughan Official Plan 2010 ("VOP 2010") and are located within a "Community Area" as identified in Schedule 1, the "Urban Structure" of VOP 2010.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

The Proposal requires the demolition of the two existing dwellings

The Subject Lands contain two dwellings that are described in the Maple HCD Inventory as shown on Attachment #3. The structure on 9560 Keele Street was built circa 1947 and the Maple HCD Inventory identifies its sympathetic construction and materials and notes that the "*building provides fitting and dignified presence at south end of village.*" The building at 9570 Keele Street is also known to have been built prior to 1954 and is identified as being a "good fit" for Maple, but not identified as strongly sympathetic as the building at 9560 Keele Street. Both entries identify

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

several mature trees as part of the Maple streetscape. However, the structures are not identified as “Heritage Buildings” within 9.3.1 of the Maple HCD Plan. A review of the Subject Lands is included as part of the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (“CHIA”) submitted in support of the application, included as Attachment #5.

The Proposal is for 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units on the Subject Lands

The proposed new construction consists of 9 townhouse and 8 semi-detached dwelling units in 6 blocks for a total of 17 units as shown in Attachment #6. The proposed townhouse units are 3-storeys, measuring in height from 8.83 m (Block 1) to 9.34 m (Block 5). Blocks 2 – 4 facing Keele Street measure 9.06m to 9.25m from the established grade at Keele Street.

The applicant has filed an Official Plan Amendment (File OP.15.008), Zoning By-Law Amendment (File Z.15.034), a subdivision application (File 19T-15V014) and Site Development Application (DA.16.116) with the Development Planning Department. The applicant has appealed the Official Plan Amendment, Zoning By-Law Amendment and the Draft Plan Subdivision applications to the Local Planning Appeal Tribunal (LPAT formerly known as the OMB) for non-decision and the appeal is scheduled for a hearing on February 11, 2019.

The Site Development application has not been appealed and remains open. As the Site Development will require the approval of a Heritage Permit under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, this application is to be considered under the Act and the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.

The Proposal is subject to the applicable policies of the Maple HCD Plan

The Subject Lands are located within the Residential Village Area of the Maple HCD, and therefore the following applicable policies have been reviewed in consideration of the proposed development:

Section 4.3.3 – Non-Heritage Buildings – Demolitions

Generally, the demolition of a Non-Heritage building is not supported, if the building is supportive of the overall heritage character of the District.

Section 4.4.1 Design Approach – New Residential Buildings

- a) *The design of new buildings will be products of their own time, but should reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District.*

The proposed style of the townhouse and semi-detached units is inspired by the Victorian Vernacular style traditionally found in the

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

District. This style has been adapted to be simpler and more restrained to be distinguishable as a product of its own time. The front facing Blocks 2-4 onto Keele Street and the semi-detached Block 5 which faces sideways along Keele Street provide more architectural detail for visual interest and to break up the visual elements of the semi-detached units.

- b) *New residential buildings will complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by: being generally the same height, width, and orientation of adjacent buildings; being of similar setback; being of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes.*

The proposed townhouse units are 3 storeys with a maximum height of 9.34 m which is consistent with the adjacent two-storey dwelling located at 9580 Keele Street. Semi-detached units are proposed along Keele Street (Blocks 2-4,5) with a smaller frontage than the remaining internal blocks (Block 1 and 6). The Keele Street blocks (2 – 4) are oriented towards Keele Street which is consistent with the immediate physical built context.

Block 5 is oriented internal to the Subject Lands, but the side elevation is designed to have the metal roof portion carried over to this facade to create a porch along the Keele Street streetscape. The remaining blocks (Blocks 1 and 6) are oriented towards the internal road, however they are set behind the Keele Street fronting blocks so their orientation is screened from the Keele Street streetscape.

The setback of the units facing Keele Street is greater than the setback of the garage of the dwelling located at 9580 Keele Street, but this setback can be supported as it meets the policy of Section 9.5.2.1 (see below further discussion on setbacks).

The proposed brick materials, asphalt gable and the window and door proportions are consistent with the materials and detailing found on contributing buildings within the Maple HCD.

- c) *New residential building construction will respect natural landforms, drainage, and existing mature vegetation.*

The proposal will necessitate the removal of two hedges and 24 trees and the replanting a total of 12 new trees. Please see further discussion on plantings in the Cultural Heritage Landscapes section below.

- d) *Larger new residential buildings will have varied massing, to reflect the varied scale of built environment of the historical village.*

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

The applicant has proposed 3 semi-detached units along Keele Street, to provide an appropriate built form along the public street.

- e) *Historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings has been 1 - 1/2 or 2 storeys. The façade height of new residential buildings should be consistent with the façade height of existing buildings. Differences in façade heights between buildings on adjacent properties within the district should be no more than 1-storey. In all instances the height of new buildings shall conform to the provisions of the City's Zoning By-law.*

The proposed townhouse units are 3-storeys in height, measuring from 8.83 m (Block 1) to 9.34 m (Block 5) in height. Blocks 2 – 4 facing Keele Street measure 9.06 m to 9.25m from the established grade at Keele Street, according to the HIA and submitted elevations. The proposed height of the development is compatible when compared from the street with the adjacent 2-storey dwelling located at 9580 Keele Street due to differences in the grading along Keele Street (as shown in Attachment #8). The proposed semi-detached units conform to the above policy.

Section 9.5.2.1 Residential Village – Site Planning

- *Site new houses to provide setbacks and frontages that are consistent with the variety of the village pattern.*

The proposed setback of the semi-detached units including the road widening from Keele Street, is greater than garage of the adjacent residential property 9580 Keele Street and the recent development of 9529 Keele Street (as shown in Attachment #5 - Figures 36 and 37 page 55).

Section 9.5.2.2 Residential Area – Architectural Style

- *Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles. See Section 9.1.*

The proposed style of the townhouse and semi-detached dwelling units is inspired by the Victorian Vernacular style depicted in Section 9.1. This style has been adapted to be simpler and more restrained to be distinguishable as a product of its own time.

- *Use appropriate materials. See Section 9.8.*

The proposal includes two separate material schemes for the alternating blocks. The first material package includes 'Old School' Brampton Brick for the main facades and a 'Aurora' Brampton Brick accent. The second package includes 'Crimson' Brampton Brick for the main facades and a

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

‘Canyon’ Brampton Brick accent. The window and door materials for all units will be wood or vinyl pending further discussion of the materials list as shown on Attachment #9.

Section 9.5.2.3 Residential Area – Scale and Massing

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the scale and pattern of the historic District.*

The semi-detached units facing Keele Street (Blocks 2 – 5) provide a building scale and pattern consistent with the historic District pattern. The proposed development also provides a transition “between the large estate homes north of the Subject Lands on the west side of Keele Street and the multi-residential apartments on the east side of Keele Street” (HIA).

- *New houses should be no higher than the highest building on the same block, and no lower than the lowest building on the same block.*

As previously stated, the proposed 3-storey (maximum 9.34 m) height is consistent with the adjacent 2-storey dwelling located at 9580 Keele Street, as shown in Attachment #8.

- *As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1½-storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.*

As previously mentioned, the Keele Street facing blocks (Blocks 2 – 5) have been designed as semi-detached dwellings and provide a building scale and pattern consistent with the historic District pattern. Blocks 1 and 6 have larger frontages but both blocks are partially screened behind the Keele Street fronting blocks and therefore do not create a large building frontage along Keele Street, as shown in Attachment #8.

Cultural Heritage Landscape

The 2005 Maple HCD Inventory entry for 9560 and 9570 Keele Street identifies that the trees on this property are significant contributing elements to the Maple streetscape.

The proposal will preserve 9 of the existing trees on the Subject Lands including the Eastern Black Walnut trees on the south-east corner and the Norway Maple at the front of the property. The proposal will require the removal of two hedges and 24 individual trees.

In the context of the existing streetscape, the proposal will feature significantly more built form than currently exists. To mitigate the loss of the existing deciduous trees, the applicant is proposing new trees to be planted along Keele Street and interior to

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

the site. These plantings include Green Mountain Sugar Maple, Autumn Blaze Maple, Common Hackberry, Skycole Honey Locust Ivory Silk Tree Lilac, Glenleven Linden and Accolade Elm, as shown on Attachment #10.

Archaeology

The properties have been identified as possibly having archaeological potential, the following standard clauses shall be applied to the Site Plan:

- i) *Should archaeological resources be found on the property during construction activities, all work must cease and both the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, and the City of Vaughan's Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division in the Development Planning Department shall be notified immediately.*
- ii) *In the event that human remains are encountered during construction activities, the proponent must immediately cease all construction activities. The proponent shall contact the York Regional Police Department, the Regional Coroner and the Registrar of the Cemeteries Regulation Unit of the Ministry of Consumer and Business Services.*

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the OHA. This application was declared complete on August 15th, 2018, and must be deliberated upon by Council by November 13, 2018, to meet the 90-day timeline. If this application is not considered by Council by the 90 day deadline, it is considered to be approved as outlined under the OHA.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage staff have reviewed the Heritage Permit application to demolish the two existing structures and the proposed new construction for the lands known municipally as at 9560 and 9570 Keele Street. The proposed new construction is generally consistent with the Maple HCD Plan. Staff recommends that the Heritage Vaughan Committee approve the Recommendations in this report, including a Recommendation that Council approve a Heritage Permit for the proposed

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 17, 2018**

demolition and new construction.

For more information, please contact: Rob Bailey, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Site Photos
3. Maple Heritage Conservation District Inventory (Excerpt)
4. 1954 Aerial Photo
5. Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment
6. Site Plan
7. Elevation Drawings
8. Colour Elevation Drawing
9. Materials List
10. Landscape Plan

Prepared by

Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8653
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

The meeting adjourned at 8:26 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tony Marziliano, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Acting Deputy City Clerk