

DATE: April 18, 2023

TO: Heritage Vaughan Advisory Committee

FROM: Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike,
 Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage

RE: Heritage Vaughan Advisory Committee, April 19, 2023, Agenda Item #1

DELISTING OF 12330 HIGHWAY 27, A PROPERTY INCLUDED ON THE VAUGHAN HERITAGE INVENTORY AS A LISTED STRUCTURE OF HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE ('LSHS') – (DEFERRED)

Purpose

To provide additional information requested by the Heritage Vaughan Advisory Committee at its meeting on March 22nd, 2023, with respect to the subject matter.

Background

Following Heritage Vaughan Committee’s deferral of the report for delisting of 12330 Highway 27 property (date March 22, 2023) subject to further detailed information about ownership and evaluation, staff conducted extensive research to determine if the property has/had any value under Reg 9/06 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* that may constitute maintaining the property in the register or commemorating the property.

EVALUATION UNDER O.REG 9/06 CRITERIA

Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* establishes nine criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the OHA if it meets two or more of these criteria. The following evaluation tables identify the application of each criterion as “N/A” (not applicable) or “X” (applicable) to the property, with explanatory text below.

1. DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE

The property has design value or physical value because it	
▪ is rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method	N/A
▪ displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	N/A
▪ demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

The subject property contained a stone 1½ storey house and a barn building, estimated to have been built around 1850. The last good quality photograph of the main dwelling on the property (which was destroyed by the fire of March 2009) showed a structure with modest brick flat lintels over the double-hung windows of the ground floor, and symmetrical dormers inset into the roof structure, facing all 4 directions. The front door sat atop a 5-step built-up landing, and had no notable features (such as sidelites, transom, or pillars). No images of the side elevations or the rear of the building have been located.

From this extended research, there appears to have been no surviving notable architectural features. Furthermore, since the fire resulted in the complete destruction of the dwelling, and subsequently the site was cleared of all remaining debris from the fire, there exists no remnants of materials that could be used for commemoration or adaptive reuse, even if there had been any reason found for such commemoration.

2. HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
▪ has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community	N/A
▪ yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture	N/A
▪ demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community	N/A

The subject property was owned by the McTaggart [Mactaggert; different spellings found] family, who bought this land in 1832 and built several houses – this one included. The property was sold to the Hawman Family between 1906-1917 (exact date not found) as the majority of the McTaggart family members moved away from the area – and it was retained until 1998, when ownership was transferred to Cheryl Scott. In turn, she sold the property to the current owners, ALCN Holdings Inc, in 2005. The current owners had applied to delist the property in 2015 (6 years after the catastrophic fire) and at the time, staff agreed to the delisting but never completed the application through Heritage Vaughan.

From this extended research, staff finds no historical or associative values linked to the subject property. The deed's title of ownership does not include any historical figures from the history of Vaughan, and there are no associative activities or events linked to the subject property, noted in any records reviewed by staff.

3. CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
▪ important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	N/A
▪ physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	N/A
▪ a landmark	N/A

The subject property had contained a dwelling that was inhabited until 1945 and then sporadically until the early 1990s; the property was transferred (not sold) to Cheryl Scott in 1998, but no records have been identified that show habitation of the building until its last sale to ALCN Holdings Inc.

From this extended research, staff finds no notable contextual value of the property or its buildings within the larger context of its surroundings. Historical documentation of the previous owners refer to several other brick-clad buildings built on other adjoining lots, the only cultural heritage resource associated with the subject property was the main dwelling, which has been destroyed in 2009, and no additional notable resources are found on the subject property.

Conclusion

Additional research into the details pertaining to the property at 12330 Highway 27, has found no historical/associative or contextual value that would prevent the delisting of this property or warrant commemoration.

Cultural Heritage staff support the Heritage Vaughan Advisory Committee recommendation to Committee of the Whole that the subject property be removed from the LSHS register, as it no longer maintains the criteria for the Listing as a property of architectural, cultural heritage, or contextual significance.

Prepared By

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "A.D. Strike". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style with a horizontal line extending from the end.

Shahrzad Davoudi-Strike
Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage