

# Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

---

**DATE:** Wednesday, March 22, 2023

**WARD:** 1

**TITLE: PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF EXISTING BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION OF SEMI-DETACHED HOUSES AND APARTMENTS AT 9575 KEELE STREET, IN THE MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

**FROM:**

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

**ACTION:** DECISION

---

**Purpose**

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee's support and recommend to the Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed demolition of the existing residential structure, the proposed new construction of 2 semi-detached houses (4 units) fronting onto Keele Street and a three-storey residential apartment building (56 units) connected by one level of underground parking at 9575 Keele Street, located in the Maple Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachment 1).

**Report Highlights**

- The project proposes a new development at 9575 Keele Street, replacing the existing non-contributing structure.
- The project proposes the construction of two semi-detached houses at the streetscape plus a three-storey residential apartment building behind.
- The project proposes the removal of 36 trees, and replanting 23 trees on site.

**Recommendations**

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed development as presented, subject to the following conditions:

- a) that further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
- b) that any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application; and
- d) that the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and the Chief Building Official.

## **Background**

The existing structure at 9575 Keele Street was built circa 1977/78 and is not recognized as a contributing heritage property within the Maple Heritage Conservation District. Although there is no Inventory entry describing the architecture, there are mature trees along Keele Street that contribute to the overall streetscape, especially as the existing structure is set back considerably from the street.

A Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) for the existing building was submitted in support of the application. It documents, providing photos, the elevations and the interior of the building. Cultural Heritage staff has reviewed the CHIA and confirms that it meets the CHIA Terms of Reference requirements.

The applicant proposes to construct a development that provides 2 semi-detached houses along the streetscape, and a three-storey residential apartment building in the rear. The entire development would be connected via an underground parking garage.

## **Previous Reports/Authority**

Not applicable.

## **Analysis and Options**

***All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.***

The following is an analysis of the proposed development at 9575 Keele Street according to the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan ('MHCD') guidelines.

#### **2.4.5 Objectives for New Development**

*To ensure compatible infill construction that will enhance the District's heritage character and complement the area's village-like, human scale of development, while promoting densities sufficient to secure the District's future economic viability. To guide the design of new development to be sympathetic and compatible with the heritage resources and character of the District while providing for contemporary needs.*

The proposed development, consisting of two semi-detached houses and a three-storey residential apartment building behind them is respectful in architectural style and massing to the principles and guidelines of the MHCD Plan. The development format takes its cue from 9589 Keele Street (neighbouring to the north) by proposing the construction of simple residential-scale dwellings at the street, and a three-storey residential apartment building hidden behind it, thus visually mitigating the impact of the overall development on the landscape. This allows the development to seamlessly blend into the Residential Village style of the MHCD.

#### **4.4 New Residential Buildings**

*New residential buildings will have respect for and be compatible with the heritage character of the District. Designs for new residential buildings will be based on the patterns and proportions of the 19th century and early 20th century building stock that are currently existing or once existed in the village. Architectural elements, features, and decorations should be in sympathy with those found on heritage buildings.*

##### **4.4.1 Design Approach**

- a) *The design of new buildings will be products of their own time but should reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District.*
- b) *New residential buildings will complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by being generally the same height, width, and orientation of adjacent buildings; being of similar setback; being of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes.*
- c) *New residential building construction will respect natural landforms, drainage, and existing mature vegetation.*
- d) *Larger new residential buildings will have varied massing, to reflect the varied scale of built environment of the historical village.*
- e) *Historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings has been 1 - 1/2 or 2 storeys. The façade height of new residential buildings should be consistent with the façade height of existing buildings. Differences in façade heights between buildings on adjacent properties within the district should be no more than 1 storey. In all instances the height of new buildings shall conform to the provisions of the City's Zoning By-law.*

*New residential building construction in the District will conform with the Guidelines found in Section 9.5.2.*

The chosen architectural style of the street-fronting semi-detached houses is that of a simple Victorian style characteristic to the District. The three-storey residential apartment building (behind; masked by the houses) is designed in a style prevalent to early 20<sup>th</sup> century apartment buildings and is harmonious with the architectural language of the front facing semi-detached houses.

#### **4.2.1 Conservation of Heritage Buildings**

- a) *Repair rather than replace heritage attributes using recognized conservation methods. Respect historical materials and finishes by repairing with like materials.*
- b) *Replace using like material any extensively deteriorated or missing parts of heritage attributes.*
- c) *Correct inappropriate interventions to heritage attributes.*
- d) *Undertake any work required to preserve heritage attributes physically and visually compatible with the heritage resource.*
- e) *Respect documentary evidence. Conservation work should be based on a thorough examination of physical and archival evidence. Where there is insufficient evidence, it may be appropriate to make the design, form, material, and detailing of the new feature or element compatible with the character of the heritage resource as commonly found in the District.*

### **9.3 Existing Heritage Buildings**

#### **9.3.6 Renovations**

*When a renovation on a heritage building is undertaken, later work that conceals the original design or is unsympathetic to it should be removed.*

##### **Guidelines:**

- *Incorporate restoration of original work in exterior renovation projects.*
- *Use authentic original materials and methods. For example, when replacing aluminums siding, use wood siding or board and batten.*
- *Replace missing or broken elements, such as gingerbread, spindles, or door and window trims.*
- *Remove items, such as metal fascia and soffits that conceal original architectural detail.*

Staff finds that the submitted CHIA and the supporting Heritage Conservation District Conformity Report (HCDC) combined into one document (see Attachment 2) conforms to the City of Vaughan's Terms of Reference and provides ample justification for the choices in architectural design styles, building materials and overall massing on site.

#### **9.5.2 Residential Area**

##### **9.5.2.2. Architectural Style**

*New buildings in the residential areas should reflect the historic built form of their historic neighbours.*

**Guidelines:**

*Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles. See Section 9.1.*

- *Hybrid designs that mix elements from different historical styles are not appropriate. Historical styles that are not indigenous to the area, such as Tudor or French Manor, are not appropriate.*
- *Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style. See Section 9.2.1.*
- *Research the chosen Architectural Style.*
- *Use appropriate materials. See Section 9.8.*

**9.5.2.3 Scale and Massing**

*New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots. Note: It is recommended in Section 7 that the zoning by-law be amended to recognize the smaller scale of historic village development as contrasted with modern suburban development.*

**Guidelines:**

- *New buildings should be designed to preserve the scale and pattern of the historic District.*
- *New houses should be no higher than the highest building on the same block, and no lower than the lowest building on the same block.*
- *As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1½-storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.*
- *Follow the policies in Section 4.4 of this Plan concerning height and depth of buildings and garages.*

The existing structure on the property is identified as non-contributing and is not recognized in the MHCD Study, MHCD Inventory or MHCD Plan. The existing structure has been thoroughly documented through photography and text, submitted as the combined CHIA and HCDC report for heritage records.

The proposed new structures preserve the scale and pattern of the MHCD at the streetscape, by visually presenting the semi-detached houses at the frontage whilst skilfully camouflaging the apartment block from the street's sightline by using the site's topography and the chosen architectural style.

#### **4.5.2 Trees and Shrubs**

- a) *Mature trees will be preserved except where removal is necessary due to disease or damage, or to ensure public health and safety, as certified by a professional arborist. Lost trees should be replaced.*
- b) *New trees and shrubs should be hardy, urban tolerant in recognition of harsher environmental conditions, but that express form, canopy, leaf and colour characteristics of native, indigenous trees, where possible. Large, urban-tolerant and long-living character trees are to form the framework of street tree plantings in the area and become a defining characteristic of the area. Where sufficient space does not exist for large trees, smaller ornamentals are preferred to induce a pedestrian scale while providing seasonal interest and colour.*
- c) *Planting should not obscure heritage buildings, but can frame important features. Planting should screen less attractive sites and prospects in the District.*

#### **9.7.1 Planting**

*No heritage permits are required for planting activities, but voluntary compliance with the guidelines in this Section can help maintain and enhance the natural heritage of the Maple and its valley.*

*Suitable new planting and management of existing flora are a primary means of ensuring the health of the entire ecosystem:*

- *plants contribute to stormwater and groundwater management*
- *erosion control*
- *provide habitat and nutrition for wild fauna*

*Street tree planting on arterial roads should conform with Region of York guidelines. Please refer to 'Tree Planting Design Criteria' within the Region's Road Design Guidelines handbook. In general, street trees should be hardy, salt-tolerant 60 mm caliper balled and burlapped specimens, spaced at 8-12 metres on centre, planted 3 metres from any curb or utility pole and offset 1 metre from any sidewalk and 3 metres from any driveway*

The applicant has submitted an Arborist Report, Landscape Plan, and a Tree Inventory (see Attachments 7, 8, and 9 respectively) in which it is identified that a total of 36 trees must be removed due to conflict with the proposed development or due to poor health. Appropriate compensation both in tree planting on site and cash in lieu will be secured through the site plan application process.

#### **9.8.1 Heritage Buildings Appropriate Materials**

*All construction visible from the exterior requires a Heritage Permit. Visible materials should conform to the following standards:*

- *Exterior Finish: Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent, or in some instances brick to match existing conditions. Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather. Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.*
- *Exterior Detail: Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.*
- *Roofs: Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style. Skylights in the form of cupolas or monitors are acceptable, if appropriate to the style.*
- *Doors: Wood doors and frames, panel construction, may be glazed. Transom windows and paired sidelights. Wood french doors for porch entrances. Single-bay, wood panelled garage doors.*
- *Windows: Wood frames; single or double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*
- *Flashings: Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.*

### **9.8.2 Non-Heritage Buildings Appropriate Materials**

*Exterior Finish: Use materials compatible with the original design.*

*Roofs: Slopes and layouts compatible with the original design.*

*Doors: Use materials and designs compatible with the original design.*

*Windows: Use windows compatible with the original design.*

Staff finds that the Building Materials and specifications board submitted (see Attachment 6) are well-suited to the immediate surroundings of the subject property and are in keeping with the guidelines and requirements of the MHCD Plan.

### **Financial Impact**

There are no Financial Impacts associated with this report.

### **Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations**

There are no Regional impacts or considerations for this application.

### **Conclusion**

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed demolition of the non-contributing existing building and the development consisting of two semi-detached houses plus a three-storey residential apartment building at 9575 Keele Street conforms to the policies and guidelines within the MHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can

support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposed development located at 9575 Keele Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

**For more information**, please contact: Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115.

**Attachments (Draft List)**

- Attachment 1 – 9575Keele\_Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 9575Keele\_CHIA and HCDC Report
- Attachment 3 – 9575Keele\_Site Plan
- Attachment 4 – 9575Keele\_Architectural Drawing Set
- Attachment 5 – 9575Keele\_3D renderings
- Attachment 6 – 9575Keele\_Building Materials
- Attachment 7 – 9575Keele\_Arborist Report
- Attachment 8 – 9575Keele\_Landscape Plan
- Attachment 9 – 9575Keele\_Tree Inventory

**Prepared by**

Katrina Guy, Heritage Coordinator, Development Planning, ext. 8115

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, Development Planning, ext. 8191

Shahzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653