

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, January 25, 2023

WARD(S): 4

TITLE: PROPOSED RELOCATION AND RENOVATION OF EXISTING BUILDING PLUS PROPOSED NEW CONSTRUCTION LOCATED AT 8204 KIPLING AVENUE, WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee's support and recommend to the Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed relocation and the renovation of an existing building and proposed new construction at 8204 Kipling Avenue, a property located in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachment 1).

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing the relocation and renovation of an existing building and proposed new construction at 8204 Kipling Avenue
- The existing heritage resource is identified as 'contributing' in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District ('WHCD').
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the WHCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the WHCD Plan.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend Council approve the proposed relocation and renovation of an existing building and proposed new construction at 8204 Kipling Avenue in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
- c) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

Background

This project is an amalgamation of three properties: 8158, 8196 and 8204 Kipling Avenue. These properties are within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District (WHCD) which is designated under the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Part V). As a result of the designation, this application requires review by the Heritage Vaughan Committee.

The Development Area is approximately 3.25 acres in size and currently consists of open grass field (8158 and 8196 Kipling Avenue) with a vacant one-and-a-half storey vernacular Gothic Revival structure constructed circa 1880 known as the “Moody-Darker House” situated on the northeast limit of the property (8204 Kipling Avenue). The Moody-Darker House is considered a “contributing” property within the WHCD.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan.

The following is an analysis of the proposed renovations to the existing building located at 8204 Kipling Avenue according to the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan (‘WHCD’) guidelines.

The Owner is proposing 11 freehold townhouse blocks (3 storeys each) with 128 grade level parking spots, a midrise five storey residential structure behind the townhouse blocks, realignment of Meeting House Road and the relocation and repurposing of a heritage dwelling at 8204 Kipling Avenue.

The proposed redevelopment of the area will contain a mix of three-storey freehold townhouses fronting Kipling Avenue, and the realigned Meeting House Road. In addition, a midrise five-storey residential structure is proposed behind the freehold townhouses. The proposed development plan requires the relocation of the Moody-Darker House to the southern limit of the property. Relocation of the heritage building will allow for the extension of Meeting House Road, the development of the surrounding lands and the retention of the heritage resource. Once in its new location the Moody-Darker House will be subject to rehabilitation to allow for the adaptive reuse as a commercial office.

General

Kipling Avenue should regain and retain its heritage character. New and renovated buildings and landscapes must:

- a) conserve and enhance the tree canopy;*
- b) front directly onto Kipling Avenue, and provide a landscaped front yard that contributes to the overall streetscape;*
- c) contribute to the quality and connectivity of the pedestrian environment;*
- d) serve to enhance the overall system of trails, pathways and pedestrian walkways;*
- e) maintain the intimate scale of the street, through the building mass, the length of facades, and the detailing of architecture and landscape architecture;*
- f) be no taller than 3 floors (11 m); and*
- g) conserve and enhance views to the valleys east and west (page 94. Schedule 19)*
- h) provide a design that is sympathetic with the character of adjacent properties.*

Cultural staff are satisfied with the proposal as it meets and supports the items above as per the Heritage Conservation District guidelines by providing adequate massing and height, a combination of approved materials, and planting.

5.3.2.3 ARCHITECTURE

Buildings of two to three storey building heights, from different construction periods and uses coexist, side by side, including: residential homes, barns, farmhouses, commercial buildings, institutional and industrial buildings.

The proposed redevelopment of the area will contain a mix of three-storey freehold townhouses fronting Kipling Avenue. A midrise five storey residential structure is proposed in the area behind the freehold townhouses. The proposed new builds, along

with the retention and relocation of the Moody-Darker House to the southern limit of the property is consistent with 5.3.2.3 in the WHCD.

6.2.3 Relocation of Contributing Buildings

Buildings and structures located within properties that are listed as contributing to the WHCD Heritage Character should not be relocated and should remain in-situ within their existing context.

A threatened heritage building relocated to the District from another site should generally be compatible in style and type to the existing development patterns in the District.

Staff has reviewed the proposed relocation and adaptive re-use for the Moody-Darker House at 8204 Kipling and determined it is consistent with Section 6.2.3 in the WHCD as follows:

The **Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment** (CHIA) report recommends that relocation and rehabilitation of the structure is the preferred method of mitigation for this Project (see Attachment 2). Relocation of the structure will allow for the extension of Meeting House Road, the development of the surrounding lands, and the preservation of the heritage resource.

The proposed **Conservation Plan** (see Attachment 3) describes the intent to maintain the structure in a way that exemplifies the c.1880 construction date. The Moody-Darker House is proposed to be rehabilitated in a way that showcases the heritage attributes of the structure and ensures the preservation of the historic structure. All preservation work will be undertaken by qualified persons with previous experience in the preservation and adaptive reuse of heritage structures.

Staff is satisfied with the conclusions of the **Engineering Condition Survey** (see Attachment 4) which finds the structure to be in acceptable condition to carry the residential loads, but not acceptable for commercial loading at the time of the examination.

6.3.2 Contemporary Design

Just as it is the characteristic of the WHCD to contain contributing buildings in at least 12 recognizable styles, contemporary work should be “of its time”... This does not mean that new work should be aggressively idiosyncratic but that it should be neighbourly and fit this “village” context while at the same time representing current design philosophy.

Staff finds that the proposed design submission for the property at 8204 Kipling blends well with the village context, preserving the heritage structure whilst also amassing new construction that adheres to the design philosophy within the WHCD.

6.3.3 Architectural Guidelines

Material Palette

There is a very broad range of materials in today's design palette, but materials proposed for new buildings in the district should include those drawn from ones historically in use in Woodbridge.

This includes brick, stone, traditional stucco; wood siding and trim, glass windows and storefronts, and various metals. The use and placement of these materials in a contemporary composition and their incorporation with other modern materials is critical to the success of the fit of the proposed building in its context. The proportional use of materials, use of extrapolated construction lines (window head, or cornices for example) projected from the surrounding context, careful consideration of colour and texture all add to the success of a composition.

Staff finds the proposed building materials appropriate for the property at 8204 Kipling and determine it is consistent with Section 6.3.3 and upholds the overall intent of the WHCD (see Attachment 8)

Proportions of Parts, Solidity verses Transparency

It is a characteristic of historic buildings of the 19th century to have solid walls with punched windows. This relationship of solid to void makes these buildings less transparent in appearance. It was a characteristic that was based upon technology (the ability to make large windows and to heat space came later, and changed building forms), societal standards for privacy, and architectural tradition. Buildings of many 20th century styles in contrast use large areas of glass and transparency as part of their design philosophy.

For new buildings in this heritage district, the design should take into account the proportions of buildings in the immediate context and consider a design with proportional relationships that will make a good fit.

The proposed design enhances the site's and the District's character defining features by mimicking the appearance, entrance articulations, punch windows and colouring. This, along with a deference to scale, repetition, lines and levels, beam and column, solid and transparency, connects the proposal to the heritage context of the area.

Staff supports the proposed design at 8204 Kipling as being contemporary yet based on studies of the vernacular heritage architectural styles within the district. This design approach conforms to heritage conservation best practices, in accordance with 6.3.3 Architectural guidelines within the WHCD.

6.6.3 Tree Canopy and Vegetation

- 1. Existing natural forest stands or groupings of trees should be conserved.*
- 2. Streetscapes should conserve the existing green canopy and provide new tree planting where none exists, in order to create a continuous tree canopy along the street.*
- 3. Trees on public and private property, having a tree diameter of twenty (20) centimetres or more or having a base diameter of twenty (20) centimetres or more, must be conserved, and the requirements of the City of Vaughan Tree Bylaw 185-2007 must be adhered to.*
- 4. Prior to the issuance of a Heritage Permit, Building Permit or Site Plan approval, a tree conservation plan is required to be submitted and approved by the City.*
- 5. An on-going tree maintenance and replacement strategy should be developed in order to maintain the extensive forest canopy, especially as maturing trees start to show signs of deterioration or stress.*
- 6. The natural setting of the river valleys must be respected and maintained, and an on going planting strategy to protect and enhance the river's edge and banks, and protect the scenic qualities should be established.*
- 7. Existing natural topographical features and remnant landscape forms such as the hills, the old river beds mainly evident within the Clarence Street Character Area and Nort Johnson Park, as well as the forested hillsides of Memorial Hill Park and surrounding the Fairgrounds, that reflect and contribute to the historic landscape and character of Woodbridge, should be preserved and maintained.*
- 8. The forested character should be encouraged to expand within the urban context, within the neighbourhoods and especially along streets or trail routes in order to create a continuous system of open spaces, provide a "soft" transition to the built form and ensure that Woodbridge is continuously planned as "a community within a park setting".*

There are presently 100 trees on or within six metres of the property. Tree resources exist in the form of landscaped-trees and naturally occurring trees. The removal of 79 trees (78 on-property and one City-owned tree) is required to accommodate the proposed development. The preservation of the remaining 21 trees is proposed through appropriate tree protection measures (see Attachments 9 and 10). The City of Vaughan requires replacement for any by-law protected tree removal. In total, 71 replacement trees are required as compensation of the proposed tree removals.

The proposed landscape plan for the area around the Moody-Darker House enhances the heritage character of the structure. The cluster of trees creates a soft transition to the built heritage structure per Guideline 6.6.3.8 (see Attachment 9).

Staff finds the proposed tree inventory (see Attachment 10) and preservation plan for the property at 8204 Kipling is consistent with Section 6.6.3 and upholds the overall intent of the WHCD.

6.4.1.3 Kipling Avenue North and South

New development should be set back a minimum of three metres from the property line and a maximum of 4.5 metres to maintain the deep setback character of contributing buildings and allow for landscaped front yards.

Staff recommend reviewing the proposed setback to reflect the three-metre requirement as per the WHCD guidelines.

6.7.1 ROADS, CURBS, SIDEWALKS AND STREETSCAPE

Several of the roads within Woodbridge are significant in defining the heritage character of Woodbridge and contribute in terms of function and layout as per the following descriptions:

- Kipling Avenue – the Heritage Avenue*
- Woodbridge Avenue – the Commercial Main Street*
- Meeting House Road – the Valley Drive*
- Clarence Avenue – the Park Drive*
- William and James Street, Wallace Street – Key Neighbourhood Scale Roads*
- Neighbourhood Streets*

Meeting House Road, Clarence Street, Woodbridge Avenue and Kipling Avenue together form a “Heritage Loop” – a key circulatory route within Woodbridge, connecting the Woodbridge Core to the western neighbourhoods and to Kipling Avenue. These streets are defined by the majority of the heritage fabric that characterizes Woodbridge and are used as a neighbourhood walking trail.

Heritage Attributes

1. ***Kipling Avenue** is the main north south route through Woodbridge and can be defined as a “picturesque heritage avenue” that strongly supports the village qualities of Woodbridge, having a high percentage of 2-3 storey individual heritage contributing buildings that are generously spaced with deep front yards and varying setbacks, and a mature tree canopy for the most part. The avenue has a 20 metre right-of-way with generous sidewalks and some areas of mature remnant forest trees.*
2. ***Meeting House Road** is the “valley drive” of Woodbridge reflecting the natural topography characteristic of the valley lands, connecting the ridge of Kipling Avenue to the valley setting of Clarence Street. Meeting House Road is one of the “greenest” streets of the area, reflecting a significant amount of the mature forest landscape and providing views of the valley and the rolling hills. Meeting House Road also has a 20 metre right-of-way, including two travel lanes, and generous sidewalks and setbacks.*

Guidelines

1. Kipling Avenue

- a. *Should have a continuous planting of street trees on either side of the street and incorporate existing mature trees.*
- b. *Should have a continuous sidewalk on both sides of the street and should be set back from the roadway and buffered by a green planting edge where possible.*
- c. *Special paving materials should be used at key intersections and pedestrian oriented nodes.*
- d. *The street cross section should be maintained as a three to four lane roadway and allow for various modes of transit such as buses and bicycles, as well as on street parking.*
- e. *Properties with extensive front yards should remain transparent to the street and should be enhanced with gardens allowing for additional tree planting and landscaping.*
- f. *Dedicated left hand and right hand turn lanes should be avoided with the exception of the Kipling Avenue and Woodbridge Avenue intersection.*

2. Woodbridge Avenue

- a. *Should continue to function as a mixed use commercial street and promenade with commercial animation at grade.*
- b. *The street section should reflect a more formal landscape treatment and tree planting design that responds to at-grade retail amenities such as building shade canopies, café furnishings and ease of pedestrian movement. The sidewalks should have special paving to enhance the identity of the commercial core, and gateway treatments at the Kipling Avenue and Woodbridge intersection.*
- c. *The sidewalks should be primarily hard surfaced to accommodate pedestrian traffic and there should be continuous sidewalk on both sides of the street.*
- d. *Should have a continuous enhanced paving treatment and palette of furnishings such as special lighting standards and benches that demarcate it as a “special street” and enhances the identity of the Woodbridge Core.*
- e. *Should accommodate on street parking where possible.*

3. Meeting House Road

- a. *Should be maintained as the main connection to the valley from Kipling Avenue with a continuous planting of street trees set within a green planting edge.*
- b. *Additional tree planting should be encouraged on private property to contribute to the green canopy of the street.*
- c. *Views down to the valley from the top of the hill should be maintained and remain unobstructed.*

Meeting House Road, Clarence Street, Park Drive, William Street, James Street, and Wallace Street are unique and share different characteristics to that of Kipling Avenue and Woodbridge Avenue. These streets have strictly residential “street walls” intermixed with open space frontages, have small scale intimate street cross-sections, are less formal in streetscaping characteristics, have more “soft” landscaping qualities because of their relation to the river valley landscape and topography, and have a discontinuous double sided sidewalk condition. All buildings are single free standing structures of varying setbacks that seem to be “engulfed” in the forest landscape.

All of these streets have a single sided sidewalk cross-section for at least half of their street lengths, (see Schedule 18: Pedestrian and Bicycle Networks), and in all cases, have a relationship to the Humber River valley landscape. A change in sidewalk condition usually occurs where the river corridor meets the street edge. These streets are some of the oldest in Woodbridge’s street pattern and the single sided sidewalk attribute should be maintained as it reflects the remnant village character.

All new streets within the District should have a continuous double sided sidewalk condition.

Staff agrees with the proposed plan of 31 street trees and a double-sided sidewalk set back from the roadways and buffered by a green planting edge, as satisfactorily meeting the guidelines of 6.7.1. The proposed extension of Meeting House Road has less formal streetscaping characteristics and “soft” landscaping qualities which also meets the 6.7.1 guidelines.

6.4.2.1 WHCD Wall Height and Scale

Maintaining a relatively uniform height and scale of buildings is a significant aspect of conserving the heritage character of individual properties, of streets, and of the Woodbridge district as a whole.

- 1. Except where noted, new buildings should be a minimum of 2 floors (8.5 m) and a maximum of 3 floors (11 m).*
- 2. The height of existing contributing buildings should be maintained. New buildings must be sympathetic to, and transition from, the height of adjacent contributing buildings, with a minimum 45° angular plane. (See section 6.5)*

Staff finds the wall height and scale for proposed development to be consistent with Section 6.4.2.1.1 and 6.4.2.1.2 and upholds the overall intent of the WHCD (see Attachment 6). The proposed five-storey block is sufficiently masked, both visually and geographically, so as not to overwhelm or impose itself onto the surrounding structures, thereby successfully blending within the site’s buildings and tree canopies and disappearing from direct view from the perimeter streetscapes (see Attachment 7).

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed project conforms to the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the relocation and adaptive reuse of the heritage resource at 8204 Kipling Avenue, realignment of Meeting House Road and the proposed construction of 11 freehold townhouse blocks (3 storeys each) with 128 grade level parking spots plus a midrise five storey residential structure behind the townhouse blocks, under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 8204Kipling_Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 8204Kipling_Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
- Attachment 3 – 8204Kipling_Conservation Plan
- Attachment 4 – 8204Kipling_Engineering Condition Survey
- Attachment 5 – 8204Kipling_Site Plans
- Attachment 6 – 8204Kipling_Architectural Drawings
- Attachment 7 – 8204Kipling_3D Renderings
- Attachment 8 – 8204Kipling_Materials and Specifications
- Attachment 9 – 8204Kipling_Landscape Plans
- Attachment 10 – 8204Kipling_Tree Inventory and Preservation Plan Report

Prepared by

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Shahzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653