

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, November 30, 2022

WARD(S): 1

TITLE: PARTIAL DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION OF A TWO-STOREY HOUSE LOCATED AT 27 MAIN STREET IN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee support and recommend to Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed partial demolition, with rear portion of dwelling retained, a new front with partial second storey added, and garage increased at 27 Main Street, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachment 1).

Report Highlights

- The Owner is proposing partial demolition, renovation, second storey addition and increase of garage at 27 Main Street, Kleinburg.
- The existing main dwelling is identified as a non-contributing property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan (“KNHCD Plan”).
- The proposal is consistent with the relevant policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.
- Heritage Vaughan review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- Staff is recommending approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the proposed development as presented, subject to following conditions:

- a) further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
- b) any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application.
- d) That the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and Chief Building Official.

Background

Many of the buildings on Main Street tend to be post-war, predominantly in the one-storey ranch style. The planting is mature, and the road profile is rural.

The subject property located at 27 Main Street, Kleinburg, consists of a one storey ranch-style residence with a partial basement, constructed in the 1960's, with various additions over the years. The building has a series of pitched shingle roofs with vertical board and batten siding, with single glazed windows in wooden frames. There is an existing artificial stone fireplace near the main entrance. An addition to the east of the entrance is composed of artificial stone base and wood windows, with a single vehicle garage. There are wooden decks at the north and west sides of the building with views to the valley below. The property does not have heritage value per the KNHCD Guidelines.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

The proposed works at 27 Main Street consists of a combination of retaining part of the existing home and adding a new two-storey addition along the front – with exterior and interior

renovations to the existing home and a new addition with various level flat roofs, and an outdoor terrace on the second floor.

The proposed architecture is reminiscent of the Usonian homes of Frank Lloyd Wright, which include the characteristics of flat roofs, large overhangs, natural lighting through vertical and clerestory windows, and natural materials.

A two-vehicle garage replaces the single vehicle garage at the southeast corner of the building. The existing deck of the original home is to be retained, with new railings added.

All new development must conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. The following is an analysis of the proposed development according the KNHCD Plan.

9.1.1 CONTEXTS

The heritage character of the District includes a variety of historical and geographical contexts. The Guidelines for exterior work in the District necessarily take account of this variety. Existing buildings are either heritage or non-heritage and are treated differently in the Guidelines. The geographical settings also differ, ranging lands. Guidelines for new construction respect these different settings and special attention is given to roadways and natural and agricultural areas.

The proposed new building complements the architecture of the street by introducing a clean-line contemporary building. The proposed structure will be sited within the existing canopy of trees on site, and the chosen natural material colours complement the neighbourhood's existing mix of residential styles and the village forest. The proposed elevations (shown in Attachment 5) and suggested colour palette (shown in Attachment 6) are in-keeping with the neighbourhood vernacular.

9.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLES

Architectural style is a term used to refer to the identifying characteristics of construction as it has evolved under the force of changing technology and fashion. Before the industrial age, even minor details were custom-made for each building and it would be hard to find even two identical front door designs from the early 19th century. Nonetheless, each period produced buildings that shared a design vocabulary, including elements of massing, composition, proportions, window and door details, and decorative elements. This section shows the principal styles that have appeared in the Kleinburg Nashville community, both heritage styles and more -recent ones, This section is necessarily brief and does not

replace the real research needed for work in the District, as described in Section 9.3.2 and 9.5.1.

In the Guidelines that follow, reference is made to architectural styles for all types of buildings in the District: existing heritage buildings, existing non-heritage buildings, and new development

Additions and alterations to an existing heritage building should be consistent with the style of the original building. New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a particular style, rather than a hybrid one. Recent developments have tended to use hybrid designs, with inauthentic details and proportions; for larger homes, the French manor or château style (not indigenous to Ontario) has been heavily borrowed from. These kinds of designs are not appropriate for the District.

9.5.3.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE

Guidelines:

- Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles.*
- Hybrid designs that mix elements from different historical styles are not appropriate. Historical styles that are not indigenous to the area, such as Tudor or French Manot, are not appropriate.*
- Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style.*
- Research the chosen Architectural Style.*
- Use appropriate materials.*

The proposed architectural design is identified in the KNHCD as Usonian, a Modern Movement emphasizing long horizontal banding and an intent of visual embedding of the structure into its surrounding landscape. Exterior materials include rough-cut stone, horizontal wood siding and metal facias at the horizontal roof lines which are a characteristic of this architectural style. The massing, form, choice of materials and proportions are reflective of the contemporary construction scale without overwhelming or dwarfing other properties on the street or within the immediate neighbourhood.

9.5.3.3 SCALE AND MASSING *states:*

“New residential construction in the residential villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing. In almost every case, new construction will be replacement houses on existing built lots.

Guideline:

- New buildings should be designed to preserve the generous side yards typical in the villages. As far as possible, modern requirements for larger houses should be*

accommodated without great increases in building frontage. For example, an existing 1 ½ storey house could be replaced by a 2-storey house with a plan that included an extension to the rear. This might double the floor area without affecting the scale of the streetscape.

The proposed building footprint fundamentally does not change, with only a slight extension towards the area near the proposed driveway – and therefore does not affect the building frontage or side yard. The design respects the existing side yard setbacks by maintaining the line similar to that of the existing building. The second storey addition increases the footprint of the proposed dwelling while presenting a pleasing façade facing the street.

9.9.2 CHARACTER

In Kleinburg, the village forest appears to spring from the surrounding wooded valleys. Trees seem to encroach on the street from the valleys beyond, appearing behind, beside, or between the buildings. Even when the planting is deliberate, the size and density of the trees and shrubbery creates a continuity with the surrounding natural environment. Particularly on the residential streets, the buildings seem to live in forest clearings.

Nashville's surroundings are mostly open lands, so the connection is not to the valley woodlands. But the trees within the village are as large and dense as those in Kleinburg. They connect with the mature trees and rich ecology of the old rural roadsides on Nashville Road and Huntington Road, to the north, south, and west.

Guidelines:

- Preserve a suitable village forest.*
- Maintain health of mature indigenous tree by pruning and fertilizing.*
- Over time, remove unhealthy, invasive and non-indigenous species.*
- Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees.*

The proposed design also takes into consideration the existing trees and vegetation of the site and proposes a landscape design that is consistent and complementary to the street and the immediate neighbourhood and is in keeping with the Village's landscaping guidelines of the KNHCD Plan. The proposed landscape plan and planting list are shown in Attachment 7.

Financial Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no broader Regional impacts or considerations.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed partial demolition and new two-storey construction on the subject property conforms to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposal for 27 Main Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 27Main_Location Plan
- Attachment 2 – 27Main_CHIA
- Attachment 3 – 27Main_Site Plan
- Attachment 4 – 27Main_Architectural Set
- Attachment 5 – 27Main_3D Renderings
- Attachment 6 – 27Main_Material Palette
- Attachment 7 – 27Main_Landscape Plan
- Attachment 8 – 27Main_Arborist Reports

Prepared by

Wendy Whitfield Ferguson, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Shahzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653