

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, September 14, 2022

WARD(S): 1

TITLE: PROPOSED RENOVATIONS OF EXISTING BUILDING AT 60
NAPIER STREET IN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE
CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek Heritage Vaughan Committee support and recommend to the Committee of the Whole approval for the proposed renovations consisting of raising the upper floor ceiling height (and new roof) and the construction of a new rear addition at 60 Napier Street, a property located in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as shown on Attachment 1).

Report Highlights

- The proposal consists of a complete interior renovation, a raising of the ceiling clearance on the upper floor, and a rear addition
- The existing building is considered 'contributing'
- The proposed construction is in keeping with the Objectives, Policies and Guidelines of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan
- Heritage Vaughan Committee review and Council approval is required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*
- Staff supports approval of the proposal as it conforms with the policies of the KNHCD Plan

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the proposed development as presented, subject to following conditions:

- a) further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
- b) any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application.
- d) That the applicant submits Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division and Chief Building Official.

Background

The subject property at 60 Napier Street has a modest 1-1/2 storey residence with an adjacent 20th century detached garage. The proposal calls for extensive renovation of the existing building including a raising of the clear height of the upper floor and replacing the existing dormers with a more defined double gable façade. The scale of the planned residence, combined with roof dormers, front porch window formats and proposed exterior finishes reflect this high demand for heritage connection to this historic village character.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

The following is an analysis of the proposed renovations to the existing building located at 60 Napier Street according to the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD') guidelines.

9.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLES

Architectural style is a term used to refer to the identifying characteristics of construction as it has evolved under the force of changing technology and fashion. Before the industrial age, even minor details were custom-made for each building, and it would be hard to find even two identical front door designs from the early 19th century. Nonetheless, each period produced buildings that shared a design vocabulary, including elements of massing, composition, proportions, window and door details, and decorative elements. This section shows the principal styles that have appeared in the Kleinburg-Nashville community, both heritage styles and more recent ones. This section

is necessarily brief and does not replace the real research needed for work in the District, as described in Section 9.3.2 and 9.5.1.

Additions and alterations to an existing heritage building should be consistent with the style of the original building. New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a particular style, rather than a hybrid one. Recent developments have tended to use hybrid designs, with inauthentic details and proportions; for larger homes, the French manor or château style (not indigenous to Ontario) has been heavily borrowed from. These kinds of designs are not appropriate for the District.

The proposed lofty upper floor renovation and rear addition respect the existing architecture of the building and add elements that are part of the language of this architectural style. The proposed finished building will look significantly more developed than the existing building.

9.3.6 RENOVATIONS

When a renovation on a heritage building is undertaken, it should be part of the renovation to remove later work that conceals the original design or is unsympathetic to it. Research should be undertaken, and the design of new work should restore the principal architectural features of the original building.

Guidelines:

- ☐ *Incorporate restoration of original work in exterior renovation projects.*
- ☐ *Use authentic original materials and methods. For example, when replacing aluminum siding, use wood siding or board and batten.*
- ☐ *Replace missing or broken elements, such as gingerbread, spindles, or door and window trims.*
- ☐ *Remove items, such as metal fascia and soffits that conceal original architectural detail.*

The proposed interior renovations modify the plan layout to one that is more functional than the current one. The proposed raised height of the upper floor and replacement of the existing dormers with well-pronounced gables are in keeping with the proportions of the existing building as well as those of the immediate neighbours on both sides. The defined front entry that maintains the existing building's components whilst adding a well-proportioned low roof element, and the proposed rear addition maintain the architectural style language through materials, form, mass, and scale, and do not conceal or undermine any of the existing details of the building.

9.4.1.2 CONTEMPORARY ALTERATION

In some cases, a modern building may be altered in a way that respects and complements its original design. As in every era, modern buildings vary in architectural

quality, and some modern homes in the district are quite outstanding. Interest in preservation of the modern architectural heritage is growing, and good modern design deserves the same respect as good design of the 19th century.

Guidelines:

- ☐ *Additions and alterations using the Contemporary Alteration approach should respect, and be consistent with, the original design of the building.*
- ☐ *Many modern buildings are old enough to have already undergone renovations, which may not be in character with either the original design, or historic precedent. In such cases, the design of further new work should restore the architectural consistency of the whole.*
- ☐ *In some cases, modern buildings predominantly feature materials that are out of keeping with the local vernacular heritage, such as tile or artificial stone veneer, and tile or simulated tile roofing. Replacement of these materials with more sympathetic ones, when renovations are being undertaken, is encouraged.*

The proposed exterior alterations to the existing building are in-keeping with the guidelines of the KNHCD Plan and are well suited for the immediate neighbourhood as well as the District at large. The elements are complementary to the existing architecture, thus making them consistent with the original design. The proposed new volume of the building offers a much better streetscape balance between the existing two immediate neighbouring buildings.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:

Exterior Finish:

- ☐ *Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent*
- ☐ *Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather.*
- ☐ *Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.*

Exterior Detail: *Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.*

Roofs: *Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style.*

Doors: *Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.*

Flashings: *Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.*

The proposed front and rear additions are respectful of the existing materials and are constructed to be sympathetic and complementary to the existing building. They are in keeping with the KNHCD Plan guidelines.

9.9.2 CHARACTER

In Kleinburg, the village forest appears to spring from the surrounding wooded valleys. Trees seem to encroach on the street from the valleys beyond, appearing behind, beside, or between the buildings. Even when the planting is deliberate, the size and density of the trees and shrubbery creates a continuity with the surrounding natural environment. Particularly on the residential streets, the buildings seem to live in forest clearings.

Guidelines:

- ☐ *Preserve a suitable village forest.*
- ☐ *Maintain health of mature indigenous tree by pruning and fertilizing.*
- ☐ *Over time, remove unhealthy, invasive and non-indigenous species.*
- ☐ *Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees.*

The Arborist Report (see Attachment 7) identifies 3 trees to be removed, and 3 other trees to be injured in order to accommodate the proposed construction. Cultural Heritage is satisfied that the Arborist Report recommendations are conforming to the KNHCD Plan guidelines.

Financial Impact

There are no Financial Impacts associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no Regional impacts or considerations for this application.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed restoration of the existing building and construction of the rear addition conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support a Heritage Vaughan recommendation for Council approval of the proposed development located at 60 Napier Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 60Napier – Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 60Napier – CHIA
- Attachment 3 – 60Napier – Site Plan
- Attachment 4 – 60Napier – Drawing Set
- Attachment 5 – 60Napier – 3D renderings
- Attachment 6 – 60Napier – Sample Board
- Attachment 7 – 60Napier – Tree Inventory Protection Plan

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Shahzad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653