

Heritage Vaughan Committee Report

DATE: Wednesday, May 18, 2022

WARD(S): 1

TITLE: PROPOSED RESTORATION AND NEW ADDITION TO EXISTING BUILDING AT 51 NAPIER STREET IN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

FROM:

Haiqing Xu, Deputy City Manager, Planning and Growth Management

ACTION: DECISION

Purpose

To seek a recommendation from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed demolition of the existing detached garage and restoration consisting of raising of the upper floor ceiling height (and new roof) and the construction of a new attached garage to the existing contributing house located at 51 Napier Street in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District (as shown on Attachment 1) and is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Report Highlights

- The proposal consists of a complete interior renovation, a raising of the ceiling clearance on the upper floor, and addition of an attached garage
- The existing building is considered 'contributing'
- The proposed construction is in keeping with the Objectives, Policies and Guidelines of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan

Recommendations

THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the proposed development as presented, subject to following conditions:

- a) further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;

- b) any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application.

Background

The subject property at 51 Napier Street has a 19th century Victorian style residence with an adjacent 20th century detached garage. The proposal calls for the demolition of the existing garage at the rear of the property, and the restoration of the existing building including a raising of the clear height of the upper floor (and constructing an identical roof to existing), and the construction of a new attached garage. Design for the additions is planned to have similar roof pitches compatible with the Victorian style heritage house.

Previous Reports/Authority

Not applicable.

Analysis and Options

All new development must conform to the policies, objectives and supporting guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

The following is an analysis of the proposed interior renovations and rear 2-storey addition to the existing building located at 17 Napier Street according to the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan ('KNHCD') guidelines.

9.2 ARCHITECTURAL STYLES

Architectural style is a term used to refer to the identifying characteristics of construction as it has evolved under the force of changing technology and fashion. Before the industrial age, even minor details were custom-made for each building, and it would be hard to find even two identical front door designs from the early 19th century. Nonetheless, each period produced buildings that shared a design vocabulary, including elements of massing, composition, proportions, window and door details, and decorative elements. This section shows the principal styles that have appeared in the Kleinburg-Nashville community, both heritage styles and more recent ones. This section is necessarily brief and does not replace the real research needed for work in the District, as described in Section 9.3.2 and 9.5.1.

Additions and alterations to an existing heritage building should be consistent with the style of the original building. New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a

particular style, rather than a hybrid one. Recent developments have tended to use hybrid designs, with inauthentic details and proportions; for larger homes, the French manor or château style (not indigenous to Ontario) has been heavily borrowed from. These kinds of designs are not appropriate for the District.

The proposed front and rear additions are respecting the existing architectural style of the building and add elements that are part of the language of this architectural style. The proposed finished building will look significantly more developed than the existing.

9.3.5 REPAIR AND RESTORATION

Repair and restoration should be based on proper heritage research, and be undertaken using proper heritage materials and methods.

The elements undergoing restoration and renovation are primarily on the interior, with some elements of the existing building's façade and trim to be upgraded.

9.3.6 RENOVATIONS

When a renovation on a heritage building is undertaken, it should be part of the renovation to remove later work that conceals the original design or is unsympathetic to it. Research should be undertaken, and the design of new work should restore the principal architectural features of the original building.

Guidelines:

- Incorporate restoration of original work in exterior renovation projects.*
- Use authentic original materials and methods. For example, when replacing aluminum siding, use wood siding or board and batten.*
- Replace missing or broken elements, such as gingerbread, spindles, or door and window trims.*
- Remove items, such as metal fascia and soffits that conceal original architectural detail.*

The proposed interior renovations modify the plan layout to one that is more functional than the current one. The proposed raised height of the upper floor is in keeping with the proportions of the existing building, and the exterior additions maintain the architectural style language through materials, form, mass, and scale, and do not conceal or undermine any of the existing details of the building.

9.4.1.2 CONTEMPORARY ALTERATION

In some cases, a modern building may be altered in a way that respects and complements its original design. As in every era, modern buildings vary in architectural quality, and some modern homes in the district are quite outstanding. Interest in preservation of the modern architectural heritage is growing, and good modern design deserves the same respect as good design of the 19th century.

Guidelines:

- ❑ *Additions and alterations using the Contemporary Alteration approach should respect, and be consistent with, the original design of the building.*
- ❑ *Many modern buildings are old enough to have already undergone renovations, which may not be in character with either the original design, or historic precedent. In such cases, the design of further new work should restore the architectural consistency of the whole.*
- ❑ *In some cases, modern buildings predominantly feature materials that are out of keeping with the local vernacular heritage, such as tile or artificial stone veneer, and tile or simulated tile roofing. Replacement of these materials with more sympathetic ones, when renovations are being undertaken, is encouraged.*

The proposed exterior alterations to the existing building are in-keeping with the guidelines of the KNHCD Plan and are well suited for the immediate neighbourhood as well as the District at large. The elements are complementary to the existing architecture, thus making them consistent with the original design.

9.5.1 NEW DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW

The overall heritage character of the District is composed of buildings, streetscapes, landscapes, and vistas. This overall character has more significance than any individual building, even if it is one of the finest. Within the design of any individual building, architectural elements contribute to the character of the public realm of the street. Massing, materials, scale, proportions, rhythm, composition, texture, and siting all contribute to the perception of whether or not a building fits its context. Different settings within the district have different characters of siting, landscaping and streetscaping.

New development within the District should conform to qualities established by neighbouring heritage buildings, and the overall character of the setting. Designs should reflect a suitable local heritage precedent style. Research should be conducted so that the style chosen is executed properly, with suitable proportions, decoration, and detail. The following guidelines, describing the dominant elements that contribute to the heritage character of the District, are divided according to the principal settings found in the District.

The proposed demolition of the detached garage, and replacement with the proposed attached garage designed in the same architectural language as the building's existing style and form is an architectural improvement of the heritage quality of the subject property. The proposed new design is in keeping with the vision and intent of the KNHCD Plan.

9.10.1 HERITAGE BUILDINGS APPROPRIATE MATERIALS:

Exterior Finish:

- Smooth red clay face brick, with smooth buff clay face brick as accent
- Wood clapboard, 4" to the weather.
- Smooth, painted, wood board and batten siding.

Exterior Detail: Cut stone or reconstituted stone for trim in brick buildings. Wood shingles, stucco, or terra-cotta wall tiles in gable ends. Painted wood porches, railings, decorative trim, shutters, fascias and soffits. Painted wood gingerbread bargeboards and trim, where appropriate to the design.

Roofs: Hipped or gable roof as appropriate to the architectural style. Cedar, slate, simulated slate, or asphalt shingles of an appropriate colour. Standing seam metal roofing, if appropriate to the style.

Doors: Wood frames; double hung; lights as appropriate to the architectural style. Real glazing bars, or high-quality simulated glazing bars. Vertical proportion, ranging from 3:5 to 3:7.

Flashings: Visible step flashings should be painted the colour of the wall.

The proposed front and rear additions are respectful of the existing materials and are constructed to be sympathetic and complementary to the existing building. They are in keeping with the KNHCD Plan guidelines.

Financial Impact

There are no Financial Impacts associated with this report.

Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations

There are no Regional impacts or considerations for this application.

Conclusion

The Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed restoration of the existing building and construction of the attached garage conform to the policies and guidelines within the KNHCD Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed development located at 51 Napier Street under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

For more information, please contact: Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – 51Napier – Location Map
- Attachment 2 – 51Napier – CHIA
- Attachment 3 – 51Napier – Site Plan
- Attachment 4 – 51Napier – Floor Plans & Elevations
- Attachment 5 – 51Napier – 3D rendering
- Attachment 6 – 51Napier – Materials and Finishes

Prepared by

Nick Borcescu, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 8191

Shahrazad Davoudi-Strike, Manager Urban Design and Cultural Services, ext. 8653